Becoming "business class": educated youth and Pentecostal change in eastern Uganda

Stella Aguti, Sarah Amongin, Ben Jones, Jimmy Ezra Okello and Robert Oluka

QUERY SHEET

This page lists questions we have about your paper. The numbers displayed at left are hyperlinked to the location of the query in your paper.

The title and author names are listed on this sheet as they will be published, both on your paper and on the Table of Contents. Please review and ensure the information is correct and advise us if any changes need to be made. In addition, please review your paper as a whole for typographical and essential corrections.

Your PDF proof has been enabled so that you can comment on the proof directly using Adobe Acrobat. For further information on marking corrections using Acrobat, please visit http://journalauthors.tandf.co.uk/production/acrobat.asp;

https://authorservices.taylorandfrancis.com/how-to-correct-proofs-with-adobe/

The CrossRef database (www.crossref.org/) has been used to validate the references. Changes resulting from mismatches are tracked in red font.

AUTHOR QUERIES

- Q1 The ORCID for "Ben Jones" has been taken from CATS and verified against public API, and was found to be valid. Please Check.
- Q2 Please check whether heading level has been set correctly.
- Q3 The year for "Pype, 2014" has been changed to 2015 to match the entry in the references list. Please provide revisions if this is incorrect.
- Q4 The year for "Corbett, 2004" has been changed to 2007 to match the entry in the references list. Please provide revisions if this is incorrect.
- Q5 Please mention Figure 1 in the text.
- Q6 Please mention Figure 2 in the text.
- Q7 The disclosure statement has been inserted. Please correct if this is inaccurate.
- Q8 Please provide missing Publisher location for the "Bruner, 2017" references list entry.
- Q9 Please provide missing editor name and Publisher location for the "Comaroff, 2015" references list entry.
- Q10 Please provide missing editor name and Publisher location for the "Lauterbach, 2015" references list entry.
- Q11 Please provide missing page number for the "Lindhardt, 2016" references list entry.

- Q12 Please provide missing Publisher location for the "Peterson, 2012" references list entry.
- Q13 Please provide missing editor name for the "Pype, 2015" references list entry.
- Q14 Please provide missing editor name, Publisher name, Publisher location and page number for the "Vigh, 2006" references list entry.
- Q15 Please provide missing editor name, Publisher name and Publisher location for the "Maxwell, 2000" references list entry.
- Q16 Please provide missing editor name, Publisher name and Publisher location for the "Levinson, 1996" references list entry.
- Q17 Please provide missing editor name, Publisher name and Publisher location for the "De Witte, 2018" references list entry.





Becoming "business class": educated youth and Pentecostal change in eastern Uganda

Q1 Stella Aguti^a, Sarah Amongin^a, Ben Jones 🕞, Jimmy Ezra Okello^a and Robert Oluka^a

^aDepartment of Education, Lira University, Lira City, Uganda; ^bSchool of Global Development, University of East Anglia, Norwich, UK

ABSTRACT

Our paper looks at the lives of educated young men in a Pentecostal church in eastern Uganda. The way young men conduct themselves, how they dress, how they speak in church, whether or not they are good with technology, help to define their claims to an educated identity. Youth leaders are valued for the liveliness they bring to church, for the ways they innovate in areas of praise and worship. At the same time, they are often criticised for the way they orient schemes and initiatives to their own advantage, for not being transparent and for 'confusing' others. We adapt Henrik Vigh's conception of social navigation to show how educated young men become 'political navigators' in church. They mix ambitions for personal growth with their contributions to a modern, lively and dynamic church, and in so doing help to make it more 'business class'.

ARTICLE HISTORY

Received 28 November 2022 Accepted 4 November 2023

KEYWORDS

Christianity; education; identity; politics; youth

10

5

15

20

O2 Introduction

It is a Sunday morning, after the first service of the Pentecostal Assemblies of God church in Ngora, eastern Uganda in early 2022. Some of the choir stand outside the church, including Moses the choirmaster, Sharon who leads the singing and Ezra, Robert and Sarah from the study team. As people are talking about the service, Esther, a choir member speaks of how it has been lively and how Sharon, through her singing, has 'made people sweat'. Esther goes onto add that: 'while we sang well, we did not look smart'. There had been a donation of 600,000 shillings (US\$165), from a wealthy member of the church, to purchase uniforms for the choir some months back. Sharon told those of us gathered that 'the youth leaders are the ones with the 600,000', but 'since that time have not sat with us to discuss the uniforms, what type of material, what style of clothing we should have'. She said Ivan had discussed the issue with two other youth leaders, Gilbert and Paul. Gilbert runs a nearby dairy. Paul works for Heifer International, an NGO. Sharon said, 'I am ready to speak to Gilbert, on the subject'. Another member commented 'perhaps we should give up on them, collect our own money and surprise them'.

25

30

35

Youth leaders are often criticised in this way. They are also essential to the success of Pentecostal churches in eastern Uganda. These churches are judged by the liveliness of the 'praise and worship' segment of Sunday services. They lose members if prayers are too 'dull', if the choir is substandard, or if there is no innovation or 'creativity' (Lauterbach 2015; Lindhardt 2012, 2016; Pype 2015). Youth are mainly responsible for this liveliness, which is shown through outward signs – the way the choir sings and dances, how youth members decorate the stage, use technology – which are tied to popular understandings of education and schooling. It is important that this liveliness is 'organised', and professional and much of the work of organising liveliness falls to youth leaders (cf. Lindhardt 2020). Gilbert, a diploma holder, who runs the dairy, for example, has served as an usher with responsibility for setting out chairs, cleaning the church, maintaining the compound, managing the doors, seating new members and, during the COVID-19 pandemic, signing people in and out.

40

45

50

55

60

70

75

80

Pentecostalism is a branch of Christianity that emphasises the believer's direct relationship with God. It is noted for practices that create emotional, affective atmospheres (Anderson 2005; Coleman and Hackett 2015), achieved through speaking in tongues, spiritual deliverance and divine healing, and the use of music and dance (Maxwell 2000; van Dijk and Molenaar 2021). This focus on the charismatic, religious identities of Pentecostal churches, means that it is not always easy to see how changes in the wider landscape, such as the growth of formal education, affect and change Pentecostal congregations over time (cf. Jones 2005). Ngora Central is an established presence in the area, and has grown to the point where there are nine branch churches - outstations under its authority (some of these are 'mango tree' churches, yet to build a permanent structure). The identity of Ngora Central has changed over time from that of a 'throughthe-week' church, with activities on every day, to more of a 'weekend church' with activities concentrated on Saturdays and Sundays. This also parallels the change in membership from an older, less formally educated one to a more 'business class' membership of traders, office workers and students. This helps us take forward Lindhardt's observation about the generational shift in global Pentecostalism, and how each new generation changes the character of church congregations (Lindhardt 2020, 688). In Uganda with its young, increasingly formally educated population, churches are changing in terms of their economy and how they organise themselves. Whereas in the early 2000s a Sunday congregation of two hundred might raise 6000 shillings (\$1.60), Sunday collections in 2022 raised around 100,000 shillings (\$27), but without much expectation of weekday commitments to the church. This shift could also be observed in the changing nature of church leadership at all levels, towards pastors, youth leaders and women's leaders who had more formal education. Those with less competence in written and spoken English had been sidelined, or transferred to one of the rural outstations.

We show how part of this process of becoming a 'business class' congregation can be explained through the different ways young people brought their educated identities into the church (cf. Jones 2023; Levinson and Holland 1996). Those in positions of youth leadership, such as Gilbert, were valued for their ability to innovate, to bring liveliness to the church, and to make worshippers feel that their church was modern, developmental and dynamic. These attributes were closely tied to claims of a school-based education. The organised sociality of choir practice on Saturdays, the use of English rather than Ateso, the language most commonly spoken in the area, the conduct of church members,

90

95

the disciplined Sunday service all related to popular understandings of the school-going experience and what formal education should do to people (Jones 2023, 2-3). Youth leaders valued the church as a space to continue to work on their claims to 'being educated', a context to show leadership in a landscape where salaried jobs were few and far between, and this helped them move forward in their lives more generally. Gilbert's success as a businessman outside church was tied, in part, to opportunities that arose within. We adapt Vigh's concept of 'social navigation' to show how young men engaged as political navigators, and how this changed not only their own lives, but also the identity of the church (2006, 2009, 2010). Vigh's concern with how young people try to work 'towards better positions' through the structures of which they are a part, was a good fit with what we observed in Ngora PAG church (2009, 419).

This article is the product of a collaborative ethnography, led by four educated youths – all of them 'born again' Christians. They were supported in the research by an anthropologist who has worked in eastern Uganda for the past twenty years. We settled on the concept of 'political navigation' based on our shared experience of participating in the life of the Ngora Central over the course of eighteen months. We read Vigh's work together, and appreciated how he conceptualised the way young people work 'to draw and actualize their life trajectories ... in shifting social environment[s]' (Vigh 2006, 55). We felt that the church was one such environment, and in a context where there were many young men with higher levels of formal education, but who did not have salaried work, a place where they could cultivate a sense of purpose. At the same time, there was a sense among us that what we were observing was more than social navigation. Youth leaders found themselves in influential positions, and were busy developing opportunities through managing others. We felt that political navigation better described this. Youth leaders were often one or two 'steps ahead' of others and were able to anticipate opportunities - such as a project or scheme - and how they shaped these opportunities over time. We also came to understand how their political navigation was tied to the ongoing transformation of the church, in its journey towards becoming 110 a more middle class space.

In this way we contribute to the literature on Pentecostalism, by showing how members, rather than charismatic pastors, can help to determine how churches change over time, and by showing that these transformations may only be indirectly related to the religious life of the church (cf. De Witte 2018; Gifford 1994). Instead, we describe the work people do to cultivate their educated identities, and how political navigation and participation in schemes and initiatives changed the identity of a church from one that was popular with older, less formally educated women, to one that was able to appeal to a younger, more formally educated crowd. In reflecting on this transformation church members theorised what was happening as the result of activities that were project based and 'practical': a new scheme, the use of technology, the evaluation meetings that were held after Sunday service. They linked this to the spiritual growth of the church, but understood that growth did not always depend on those with the most obvious spiritual gifts.

Our approach also takes us in a different direction to much of the available work 125 on education and educated identities, where the focus has been on schools and other educational institutions as the places where educated identities are fixed (cf. Levinson et al. 1996; Stambach and Hall 2017). Bourdieu's 'almost exclusive emphasis on

schools' in his work on the sociology of education has encouraged an approach to educated identities that sees the student-in-school as the object of study (Reed-Danahay 2005, 65, cf. Bourdieu and Passeron 1990). Demerath's (1999, 2000) work on students 'acting extra' in Papua New Guinea, or Corbett's (2007) study of students 'learning to leave' in Nova Scotia focuses on the school as the place where young people define their relationship to education. Our case material, by contrast, shows the ongoing work people undertake in adulthood in Ngora Central to lay claim to an educated identity, where, it should be noted, 'youth leaders' could sometimes be in their early forties.

In what follows we discuss the methods behind this collaborative ethnography. We then explain the history and present-day character of the church. Later in the article we discuss two 'political navigators' – Gilbert and Ivan. Gilbert is a businessman and has a diploma in information communication technology from a nearby town, a two-year tertiary level qualification. Ivan was working as a motorbike taximan *boda boda* to support himself and his family, and has a certificate in building construction (a one-year qualification). We describe the participation of Gilbert and Ivan in a four-day 'crusade' (an occasional event where the church 'goes out' into the community to recruit new members). After describing the crusade we look at the church as a site where educated identities are worked on; where educated youth are political navigators; and where educated youth bring liveliness and a new identity to the church.

Methods: joining the choir

This article comes out of a shared ethnographic project. Four of the team members (Stell Aguti, Sarah Amongin, Jimmy Ezra Okello, Robert Oluka) were in their late twenties and early thirties from eastern and northern Uganda. The other team member (Jones) is a social anthropologist in his late forties. All of the younger team members had tertiary-level education – two are degree holders, and two have certificates from a higher education institution. One of the Ugandan team members had formal employment as a secretary in a government hospital. Two worked as market traders selling foodstuffs and second-hand shoes, and one made a living through operating a moneylending business. Jones had worked previously with Aguti and Amongin on a British Academy fellowship in 2018–2019. Okello and Oluka had been volunteering with an NGO in Lira City, some eighty miles away, and joined the research as part of a larger project on youth, education and unemployment, also funded by the British Academy. Aguti, Amongin and Jones already had experience of ethnographic work.

As part of our data collection, interviews were conducted with church leaders, youth leaders and other church members. Most of our information was gathered through participant observation. This meant participating in the life of the church through, for example, joining the choir and going along to Sunday service. Choir practice, on Saturdays, was an opportunity to make friendships while observing the work of the church. Saturdays were also a time when much of the administrative business of the church took place, as well as more mundane tasks such as cleaning the church and going through various duties – setting up the sound system, arranging chairs – that would ensure Ngora Central was prepared to be an organised and lively place for worship on Sunday.



Figure 1. Pentecostal youth watch a film screening in Ngora Central PAG church. The film was shown Q5 by the study team. In the middle of the group you can see one of the members diligently taking notes.



Figure 2. Robert and Ezra from the study team walking past the offices of Ngora county youth SACCO (savings and Credit cooperative). Though the group was open for young people from across the county, its leaders were all members of Ngora Central PAG church. The SACCO had been set up in Q6 response to a government youth scheme known as emyooga.

Working as a team also meant we could build up relationships with a range of young people. This helped us theorise the relationship between liveliness, education, politics and the way the church was becoming more 'business class'. Oluka worked closely with Gilbert, and was interested in Gilbert's skills as a businessman, and started spending time with him during the week, moving our study in ways that went beyond the 'church focus' that is typical of ethnographic accounts of Pentecostalism in Uganda and elsewhere (Gusman 2009; Meyer 2004). It was outside the church, for example, that Robert came to understand how much of Gilbert's identity was tied to his education and his interest in becoming a successful businessman (the entrepreneur Gilbert most admired in the area a hardware wholesaler by the name of Martin - attended the Catholic church). But Gilbert's role in the church could also only be understood by getting to know other members, and in this the research work of Aguti and Amongin was critical in befriending women members. They were able to sit alongside women at public events, and could easily situate themselves within groups of women before or after choir practise, or Sunday service. That Sarah's father had been a pastor in the church some years earlier, and that A4 on the study team was himself interested in becoming a pastor also meant that we were able to think through the relationship between education, politics and the religious identity of the church. Ezra, as with many other educated young people with an interest in developing the church he was in, was keen to show PAG-ers in Ngora Central some of the more 'developed' practises that he was experienced in as a visitor from Lira City.

In our later account of the crusade, our collaborative approach was helpful in studying the same event from different angles. Robert worked closely with Gilbert, doing ushering work, making sure that different participants were in the right place at the right time, directing them to the bathroom as needed, and dealing with the congestion that the event produced on the street. Robert was able to observe Gilbert's work in documenting the details of the new recruits, further developing our understanding of how his formal education shaped the work of the church. Sarah as a young woman, was able to sit with female youth at the crusade, able to listen to the gossip about how different youth leaders were performing. Stella, as the oldest member of the team, was able to sit with older women at such events, where she came to understand some of the criticisms these members had of the direction in which educated youth were taking their church.

As we have already noted, the concept of 'political navigation' emerged in discussions 205 based on our readings. XXXX, who has a background in anthropology, introduced the team to a series of journal articles on education, youth and Pentecostalism. During the fieldwork, we would try to read one text a week – an article from journals such as American Ethnologist, Africa or COMPARE – and would see what resonated with our own findings and what was different. This helped in getting an understanding among the team of certain patterns in the literatures we were going to contribute towards. For example, we were able to discuss the way many scholars of youth and education focused on notions of 'waithood' and 'timepass' to describe instances where young men, in particular, find it difficult to move on from education (Honwana 2014; Jeffrey 2010a, 2010b). We asked ourselves what was similar, and what was different in our study site.

For example we discussed the 'caste-like' system that Daniel Mains describes from his ethnographic work in Ethiopia, and how this makes it hard for educated young men to take on low status work (Mains 2007). This was not such an issue in the Teso region. We

found more similarities with Grace Mwaura's work from Kenya, where she emphasises the way educated young Kenyans took on a number of 'side hustles', while trying to find 220 ways to hold onto their claims to an educated identity (Mwaura 2017). In our case the church was a place to hold on to an educated identity, and to make a contribution, and to do some politics as well.

Context: becoming mainstream and 'business class'

At the time of fieldwork, Pentecostalism was very much part of the life of the area. 225 Alongside pastor-led churches that occupied a single building in the trading centre, there was the Pentecostal Assemblies of God, an international movement, with branches throughout the region. The focus on spiritual growth, the use of media technologies, and the possibility of miraculous healing had also influenced the development of Uganda's historic mission churches, with 'charismatic' Catholics and 'born again' members of the Anglican Church of Uganda emulating Pentecostal ideas and practises. Pentecostal Christians are also present in national and local politics. The 'woman MP' for Ngora District, where our study is located, Stella 'Isodo' Apolot, was a Pentecostal Christian and daughter-in-law of a well-known itinerant pastor, Rev. Leonard Isodo.⁵ The constituency MP for Ngora from 2016–2021 – David Abala – was a regular at Ngora 235 Central and married to a prominent 'born again' Christian working for Compassion International, a US-based Christian humanitarian aid organisation. As Uganda's population has grown more unequal and more urban, Pentecostal churches, particularly those in the cities, tend to focus on a single demographic: businesspeople, students, poorer women. Ngora was a small town, and so this difference also found its expression within Ngora Central church. The first service, in English, popular with students, officer workers and traders was more 'business class', while the second service, in Ateso, was popular with older women, who travelled in from the surrounding villages, had was regarded as more provincial.

The Pentecostal Assemblies of God congregation in Ngora occupies a plot to the south 245 of the main road. Its original location in the 1980s was in a village nearby, but after some land disputes, the pastor purchased a site in town, with the help of supporters from Compassion International. The church we attended (an earlier grass-thatched version had burned down) was a brick T-shaped structure, with a 'mabati' - iron sheet - roof funded by Korean missionaries. The walls were plastered and painted in the tricolour 250 colours of the PAG logo (red, white and blue). The inside of the church was organised around a central stage, in front of which, and to the sides, were rows of plastic chairs. Church leaders sat in 'office chairs' of varnished wood, made locally, behind a desk to the right of the stage. The youth, in charge of praise and worship, were meant to sit to the left of the stage, where keyboards and amplifiers were found. The laptop and projector were 255 situated in the main aisle during services.

A typical Sunday service consisted of an opening hour of praise and worship led by the choir, followed by a second hour of preaching followed by announcements. As conxgregants arrived at the church they were greeted by one of the ushers who directed them to a seat. Ushers were also responsible for making sure the service moved ahead in an 260 'organised' way, that the offertory was collected in a respectful manner, and for ensuring that the congregation behaved appropriately. Ushers had a particular focus on 'visitors' –

cleaning materials.

first-time worshippers such as Okello or Oluka from the study team - following up with them afterwards to encourage their return next week. Ushers gathered after each of the Sunday services to do an 'evaluation meeting'. They reflected on any lapses in behaviour within the team, as well as practical matters, such as making sure there were sufficient

There were a number of ways in which the church worked towards a 'business class' feel. Included in this was the introduction of Gospel songs in English in the Nigerian style, alongside 'back home' songs in Ateso. There was also more emphasis on the use of technology and social media, including the quality of the music system, the use of overhead projectors, and the holding aloft of smartphones by preachers when quoting from the Bible. During the school holidays the church was full of university and high school students, and it was important for the youth leadership to produce a style of praise and worship that felt recognisable to this seasonal audience. The first Sunday service was a space to show that you were cosmopolitan and development-oriented (cf. Ferguson 1999). The focus on deliverance and divine healing had 'gone down' according to many members. 6 Church leaders who struggled with spoken English were encouraged to work in one of the outstations rather than in Ngora Central. The church was also keen to show that it was part of the local political mainstream. It welcomed funds from politicians of all 280 stripes during election season, including a donation from Juliet Achayo the constituency MP who was a wealthy, committed Catholic.

The church has benefited from outside support, including a donation of eleven million shillings (US\$3,000) in 2008 by Korean missionaries to roof the church. Youth in the church have also benefitted from a dairy project supported by Heifer Uganda, a nonreligious NGO. A youth group in church was trained in pasteurising milk and making yoghurt, and there is a stand behind the church that was meant to be the shop for the dairy business. In 2015, youth members in the church where given sheep by the same Korean missionaries who roofed the church. The sheep, an 'improved' breed, were kept by one of the youth leaders. Church members have raised funds for their own projects 290 including a poultry farm, and have sought out donations from church members, including the 600,000 shillings for the choir uniforms. These initiatives are managed by youth leaders under the overall leadership of the church. Youth members are meant to elect committees to manage different projects, though in practice existing leaders tend to assume roles in these schemes without a popular vote. 295

Gilbert and Ivan

Gilbert, our first political navigator, was in his late thirties at the time of fieldwork. His main role in church was in the use of computer technology. He managed an overhead projector, screened Bible verses and displayed the lyrics of songs. His parents were early converts to Pentecostalism and Gilbert grew up in a Pentecostal home. Gilbert was the 300 assistant secretary of the youth wing, and closely shadowed Godwin, secretary and a senior leader in church. His title as 'assistant' does not fully convey his influence in church.

Gilbert's education, similar to many 'educated' young men in the area was a struggle. Gilbert was not from a particularly wealthy family, and his father was a farmer who worked hard to put his children through secondary school. Secondary education in

Uganda involves school fees, and by the time Gilbert entered 'senior 5' to study for his A Levels, Gilbert's mother had to take over responsibility for finding the money to send him to school. She did this through selling foodstuffs, and by buying village produce from others, for sale in Ngora. After A' Levels Gilbert worked as a seller of second-hand shoes, 310 first by working for someone else and then by running his own business. Eventually Gilbert moved to Mukura to work in an internet café because he wanted to learn computer skills, it was from there that he studied for his diploma in ICT, under the sponsorship of the institute's owner.

Gilbert cultivated an educated identity. He dressed in the 'right' way – ironed clothes, 315 regularly changed, well made, and what is described as 'tuck-in' - in church he wore a blazer. Gilbert talked in a measured and polite way, preferring English over Ateso, and socialised with other people who were seen as educated, of his 'level'. He liked taking minutes, keeping records, doing accounts, and any form of bookwork. Gilbert was less likely to phrase things in the sort of religiously-inflected language adopted by some of his peers (the greeting 'praise the Lord brother' spoken by some youths, was not regularly said by Gilbert). Instead, he preferred to talk in the sort of bureaucratic, developmental language of aspiring, educated businessmen.

Gilbert was the co-owner of a small dairy. The dairy originated as a church youth project and was supported by Heifer International. Originally run as a cooperative in the premises of the church, the dairy had through a series of manoeuvres been transferred to a shop nearby. Youth in the church described Gilbert as a 'technical' person, sophisticated in his use of procedures during meetings and active in working behind the scenes. Over time the larger cooperative management structure had dwindled, leaving two youth leaders, Gilbert and David, who were running it as a private business. Gilbert's actions were, for the most part, supported by the church leadership.

Our second political navigator, Ivan Olaboro had had an even more fragmented formal education than Gilbert. He was born out of wedlock, his mother married another man and left Ivan to be raised by relatives. For his primary education Ivan attended Katine Primary School on the northern side of the Teso region, about fifty miles from Ngora. Ivan's aunt was a teacher in the school and his education was relatively straightforward (though as a 'guest' in the house where he stayed, Ivan was expected to do more agricultural work than others, and would often arrive late to school). For his secondary education Ivan attended Orungo Secondary School and stayed with his maternal grandparents. Here things were more difficult, and though Ivan managed to progress to his O' Levels, he often started the school year late, or could be sent home in the middle of the term because his fees had not been paid. Sponsorship for his secondary school education came from an uncle who worked in a bank in the regional capital, Soroti. This line of support ended when the uncle died of an AIDS-related illness in 1999. Ivan's last experience of education was at a vocational school in the regional capital, Soroti where 345 he studied BCP - 'building construction practice' - to certificate level on a one-year course. Ivan was less confident in speaking English than some of the other youth leaders in church.

Like many youth leaders, Ivan was not that young. In his mid-40s at the time of fieldwork he had three children, two girls and a boy. His work was as a motorbike taxi 350 man (boda boda) which had helped Ivan acquire a plot of land in the trading centre in Ngora, where he had constructed a three-roomed house. Ivan spoke of wanting to live in

a 'modern way' making a better job of the house he had built which remained unfinished. Ivan farmed land in his natal village, and rented farmland in Ngora. Ivan guarded his position as zonal choirmaster and managed access to the two keyboards. During the week, Ivan dressed down, wearing sandals, an unironed shirt or T-shirt, unlike Gilbert he did not always 'tuck in'. On Sundays Ivan often wore a flat cap – a look often favoured by politicians - sunglasses and a polo shirt. When compared to Gilbert, Ivan was less studied in how he approached social interactions, and more to the point. He was happy to speak up in meetings where other, more watchful, politicians preferred to sit back.

360

375

390

By now it should be clear that youth leadership in the church tended to fall to men, rather than women (and that some of these men were not particularly young in years). There was a pattern in the area of women becoming active in local politics and community work at a later life stage, often by becoming treasurers on different committees or through joining savings groups, rather than focusing their attention on leadership roles 365 in church (cf. O'Sullivan 2023). While educational reforms in Uganda had opened up opportunities for women, and while the country has been praised for promoting gender equality through reserved positions for women at all levels of government, women embarked on committee careers later than men. Eisenstein suggests why this might be the case, in her work among educated young women from south-western Uganda. Here 370 her interlocutors cultivated respectable identities, through relationships, businesses and friendships, rather than active involvement in politics. These young women spoke of how they were 'willfully waiting', and preferred to build up a business, or to work on relationships and friendships (2021).

Reputational crusades

From May 17th to 20th, 2022, the PAG church of Ngora Central, in partnership with other congregations in the area, held a 'crusade'. Ezra, from the study team, attended the first day of the crusade. Robert and Sarah joined for the remaining three days. Stella joined for the last two days of the crusade when it moved to Ngora market. Crusades are a public display of faith where members of the church go out into the community to bear witness and hopefully recruit new converts. In Ngora, the crusade was organised partly in response to the visit by a group of American missionaries. The first two days of the crusade were held at a place called 'Golden' near to the district headquarters. The second two days moved the crusade to a site opposite the market in Ngora trading centre. Alongside rallies that were organised for the late afternoon, members were expected to go door-to-door evangelising during the daytime. Youth members built the podium, set up the music system, led 'praise and worship', and did the necessary ushering. The crusade gathered four to five hundred people at each of the afternoon rallies, a mix of church members, potential converts, and curious bystanders. Many were attracted by the music, which blasted out from large speakers.

On day one of the crusade, there was a technical problem. The music system, rented for the rally, worked well at the beginning, with youth members from a neighbouring Pentecostal church, dancing in time to some recorded tracks. But when the next part of the programme, a choir performance by Ngora Central, was meant to start, it was discovered that a cable was missing, meaning that the keyboards, brought from the 395 church, could not be channelled through the sound system. When choir members

noticed this problem they informed the church leaders, one of whom was able to get through to Ivan on his mobile phone. (They had expected Ivan to be there during the 'setup', but he was not there, because of a boda boda job he was doing). The leaders agreed that it would take some time for Ivan to come with the missing cables. After thirty 400 minutes of waiting, and when they saw the Americans arriving, they asked another choir to lead a praise and worship session with unamplified local instruments.

Soon after the start of this 'local' performance, Ivan arrived. He was smartly dressed, in an ironed, long-sleeved shirt and 'diplomatic shoes' (meaning that he had gone home between his boda boda job and appearance at the crusade). The impression given was slightly let down by the long cable dangling around his neck. He rode through the crowd to where the music system was located, and connected one of the two keyboards, which was set on top of a hardshell amplifier case. Ivan then looked around for another surface for the second keyboard to be placed on and decided to use his motorbike as a platform. He pushed his motorbike into position next to the amplifier and placed the keyboard on top. When people saw him doing this they smiled, one of them said to Ezra 'Ivan should have carried the keyboard stands from church'. When the American missionaries got up to speak they decided to switch from mains electricity to a generator, as the mains was not strong enough to carry the system they had rented. During this part of the crusade Ivan, a well-respected keyboard player, accompanied the highlights of each speech with 415 a musical jingle. Youths gathered around the motorbike to see him at work. After the Americans left, Ivan also departed, well in advance of the actual end of the rally.

Ivan would later be criticised by another youth leader, who was not there, for 'nearly blowing up the system'. Ezra, who was present at the rally, knew this charge to be unfair – Ivan was not involved in setting up the system on the first day – but Ezra also reflected in conversation with other team members that this sort of criticism showed Ivan's greater vulnerability as someone with a less secure educated identity than others. It was a charge that appeared again, on the third day of the crusade, when another senior youth leader commented: 'I hope Ivan has not tampered with the music system again'. When Robert asked the youth leader what Ivan had done, the reply came: 'Ivan had almost burned the 425 system down on the first day of the crusade'. This explains perhaps why Ivan made such a performance of setting up the system on the later days of the crusade, doing a number of sound checks, and commenting to the people around him on the poor quality of the system that had been rented. At one point, Ivan came over to consult Gilbert about the way he had organised things, seeking approval. Gilbert nodded: 'it is sounding well, 430

At a later point, Ezra and Robert observed Gilbert taking responsibility for registering new members at the crusade (converts needed to be followed-up with as many found their conversion to be an uncertain experience). Gilbert started this activity on his own initiative, as he could see that the leadership had not organised someone to do this. The 435 registration work undertaken by Gilbert involved taking down names, addresses and telephone numbers. Gilbert did this methodically in a book he carried with him. Gilbert could also be seen talking quietly, in these interactions, encouraging these new converts to stick with their faith. Throughout the crusade Gilbert helped manage the organisation of the two crusade grounds - at 'Golden' and in the market. This was a particularly 440 challenging task on days three and four when the crusade moved to the marketplace, and had to fight for its pitch amid the scrum of customers and vehicles. Gilbert conducted

himself in what was, many said, his usual 'polite way' despite the stress of dealing with truck drivers and motorbike taxi men.

Later, once the crusade had ended, Gilbert followed up with the names in his book. 445 Those who came to the Sunday service that followed the crusade would be met by Gilbert after the service. He would introduce the new members to the church leadership, and would encourage them to return again. For those who did not come to church, he phoned them up to ask how they were doing, encouraging them to come to church. For those who attended the crusade from further afield, Gilbert took responsibility for phoning 450 them up to advise them which was the 'right one' for them to worship (converts should attend PAG or PAG-aligned churches). The crusade affirmed Gilbert's status as an educated young man. Smartly turned out, with a book and pen in his hand, and with the manners expected of someone who had been dutiful in school, and with a close and trusted relationship with senior leaders in the church, Gilbert visibly represented popular ideas of education. In the following discussion section we look at what this crusade, and the PAG church in Ngora more generally, reveals about educated identities, how these are adjudged by the liveliness of the church, and how political navigators, like Gilbert and Ivan contribute towards the changing character of the church.

Discussion 460

Crusades, like other aspects of life in Ngora, are sites where educated identities are worked on (Jones 2023). Gilbert was able to show his claims to an educated identity through his book-keeping, traffic management, consultation with church leaders, and in the way he dressed. Here 'being educated' became a sort of active effort, that related to popular understandings of what the schooling experience should do to a person. This was 465 in terms of his self-discipline, good English, an ability to organise his thoughts in a logical way – to 'think A, B, C, D' – and to put those thoughts into practise. The fact that Gilbert had reached diploma level was important, but what made him educated in the eyes of others was the way he was good with a notebook, good with computers, had a good command of English, and wore 'office clothes' (cf. Lindhardt 2020). He was also someone 470 young people might go to for advice, and Gilbert cultivated his claims to an educated identity through the networks and friends he kept.

In this way 'being educated' takes us beyond the school as a site where educated identities are fixed, towards something more open-ended, where educated identities are continuously cultivated. This encourages a view of the Pentecostal church that Gilbert 475 attended as important not only as a religious space, but also as a place where he could continue to develop his relationship to education and from there to politics. The success of the church depended to a large extent on the commitment of its younger members, who took the initiative in running many of the extra-curricular activities in church, and were active when it came to appraising and reforming the style and delivery of Sunday 480 services. Youth members provided most of the elements that made the crusade an appealing event: the singing and dancing, the sound system and ushering.

As Lindhardt found among younger educated Pentecostal Christians in Chile, there was the need for Pentecostal youth to 'carefully balance effusiveness with control' (2020, 671, see also Lindhardt 2016). A good Sunday service in Ngora was one where people 485 'sweated', where liveliness show God's presence in church, but was also one where

youthful energy was seen to help the church move forward in a well-managed, developmental way. Ivan, the choirmaster, regularly told his singers that he always worried about having 'a half-baked Sunday', meaning a Sunday where the choir's performance was not up to standard, or where the liveliness the choir inspired would tip over into being 490 'disorganised'. The relationship between education, organisation and liveliness was reinforced by the value attached to technology by many in the church. As we saw at the crusade the choir was expected to work with a complex sound system (and claims to being organised took a knock when the sound system was not performing well). At Sunday service, lyrics were projected onto the wall so that members of the congregation 495 could learn new songs (itself an expression of the way the church valued literacy and schooling). It was a relationship that had a self-perpetuating quality: the more organised the liveliness, the more church members could feel themselves to be educated, and the more educated they felt themselves to be, the more concerned they were with making sure their church was good at being organised.

In chasing new audiences, using new technologies and organising liveliness it is worth noting that there was some irritation among older, less formally educated members of the church. Not everyone was happy with the changes in Ngora Central as it shifted to becoming a 'business class' church. Older women with less formal education would sometimes say that these young people were taking the church away from 'true worship'. 505 On one occasion when Robert, Ezra and Sarah were in the choir at Sunday service, singing a song that mixed English with a Nigerian language they did not know. An older women commented afterwards that 'no one could know whether the song had the 'right message'. There was the feeling that such songs - spoken in a language that was not understood – would fail to produce the right sort of spiritual connection. More generally older members said that it was difficult for them to make a spiritual connection when English was used. (Younger more formally educated congregants, by contrast, told us that 'local songs' did much less for them, and did not connect them with God in the same way as Nigerian-style gospel songs). The way young women dressed could also be a point of criticism, though here there had been a degree of accommodation between the 515 generations, with trousers, which were once heavily frowned upon by older members, now tolerated as long as they were felt to be 'decent'.

These sorts of criticisms from older, less educated members of the church were less of a concern for youth leaders such as Gilbert and Ivan than was their relationship to other youth members and the church leadership. On a day-to-day bases, it was dealing with 520 committees, crusades, schemes and projects that took time and energy. These offered spaces for political navigation where young men could try to better position themselves. In the meetings we attended, we found youth leaders deploying tactics such as that of, what one church member described to us, 'frustrating others' in their concern with getting ahead. The 'failure' to discuss the donation of 600,000 shillings for choir uniforms, discussed at the introduction to the article, was one such example. 10 There was also a tactic of, what was described to us as 'changing things along the way', a more longterm approach of reworking opportunities - such as new projects or initiatives - to become something other than their original intention. This could take place over a number of months, and might take the form of a development project, such as the 530 dairy, which had moved from being a cooperative, sited on church land, to its later operation as a private business run out of a nearby shop, managed by two youth leaders.

Changing something as visible as Gilbert's dairy 'along the way' required the accumulation of smaller 'frustrations' - a cancelled meeting, a funding crisis, a missed report. But it also depended on a degree of Vigh's concern with self-actualisation, strategy and focus.

Conclusion

Scholarship on Pentecostal Christianity in Africa and elsewhere focuses on churches as sites where new religious identities are cultivated (Gusman 2009; Havnes 2012). In this paper we have explored something different. The way a church in eastern Uganda was a site where members worked on their claims to being educated. The innovations youth leaders were expected to bring to the church - the use of technology, a 'modern' choir, new songs, post-service evaluation meetings - were bound up with popular ideas of what it meant to be educated and to be moving forward in life. In bringing innovations to the church, men, such as Gilbert and Ivan, were also continuing to cultivate their own relationship to education. Well-organised meetings, a successful crusade, neat book 545 work, new styles on the keyboard were all signifiers of an educated identity. It was a sort of 'work' that the church made possible.

One of the reasons educated identities could be worked on was that Pentecostalism was a more competitive space than some others in the area. 11 A church that was too 'dull' or 'disorganised' saw members stay at home or move to another congregation. Critical to the success of PAG Central in Ngora, and its attractiveness to business class residents, was its 'organised' liveliness. This was sustained through a youth leadership that brought a range of technologies to the church. It was also sustained through the way other church members evaluated and accredited what was going on. Youth leaders were conscious of the criticisms that might come their way because of a 'half-baked Sunday', or a 'chaotic' crusade, and worked hard to make the church one that appealed to a 'business class' clientele.

If educated youth were able to bring organised liveliness to the church, they were also able to take something away. The church was a site of political navigation where Gilbert and Ivan could 'actualize their life trajectories' (Vigh 2006, 55). There were schemes and projects, committees and donations. There were material benefits to be had both inside and outside church. 12 The chance to shape an opportunity, or to meet a potential patron was part of Pentecostalism's appeal. Those with an educated identity were good at navigating behind the scenes, good at anticipating the way a meeting might go, or an opportunity might play out. While peers might complain of the way initiatives could be diverted or mismanaged, or a donation 'frustrated' from its original intent, there was also a recognition that the church needed these sorts of navigators if it was to succeed.

Notes

- 1. Pentecostalism has a long history in Uganda, with the PAG church having a presence in the east of the country since the 1930s. It is part of the Assemblies of God global family of 570 churches, and was the result, in Uganda, of a partnership between missionaries from Germany and Canada and local Christians (Barrett, Kurian, and Johnson 2000, 765).
- 2. To calculate approximate US dollar figures in the article we took a five-year average from June 2018 to June 2023. The conversion rate was US\$1: Ush3,646.

615

620



- 3. As Pype observes Pentecostalism generates 'zone of cultural production and creativity' 575 (346–7). This can be seen in the music styles within the church where the beat and melody of reggae which can have associations in Uganda of drug use gets repurposed for 'born again' messages (Pype finds something similarly surprising with the use of hip hop songs in Nigeria) (2015, 350).
- 4. As with earlier Protestant reform movements in Uganda, many younger Pentecostal 580 Christians often understood their relationship to their faith as having an educated edge (Bruner 2017; Peterson 2012).
- 5. There is female representation at all levels of government, including positions reserved for women on the local council system and in parliament, and 'women MPs' elected for every district (around 130 districts at the time of writing) (Mwiine 585 2019).
- 6. This shift to a developmental focus did not result in a particular emphasis on what scholars elsewhere have termed the 'prosperity Gospel' where it is God's will for members to be healthy, wealthy and successful, often through miraculous changes. Instead preaching on economic and material matters tended towards an emphasis on hard work and aligned with government and NGO messages (Coleman 2000; Ukah 2005).
- 7. English takes on particular significance in the Teso region. The language otherwise spoken in the region, Ateso, is unrelated to the majority Bantu languages of central and western Uganda. So English, and the education system that underpins it, is the way people in the Teso region connect into Uganda's wider economy and politics.
- 8. Ivan also worked hard through his leadership of the choir at the crusade, his knowledge of keyboard playing, and his attempts at befriending those who appeared to be more educated at maintaining an educated identity as well. That said, he was not as capable as Gilbert when it came to showing the sorts of behaviours people associated with formal education.
- 9. One of the reasons for this need to liveliness was the competitive nature of Pentecostal Christianity in the area. There were a number of other congregations in the area, and these also welcomed new recruits. There were branches of Christ Embassy and Pentecostal Revival Ministries in Ngora, also in the marketplace for the same sort of educated, youthful clientele that the Pentecostal Assemblies of God congregation at Ngora Central was wanting to attract and keep. On Pentecostalism as a 'marketplace' 605 see (Benyah 2020; Comaroff 2015).
- 10. Or the time when a small donation of 10,000 shillings (\$2.70) was made to the choir for performing well one Sunday. The money was given to the wife of a youth leader who took it as payment for cookies she had already made, rather than using the 10,000 shillings to buy sugar and bread as the choir members had agreed. These small frustrations helped to detach younger church members from the idea that they could influence things.
- 11. The church was in competition with other Pentecostal churches in the area, and made a particular effort at welcoming new members. New arrivals to the area such as Robert and Ezra from the study team received considerable attention from other members of the church, who valued the addition of two educated young men to their ranks.
- 12. The 'emyooga' campaign of the national government of the early 2020s was designed to encourage young people in rural areas to set up savings groups. In the NGora area this was dominated by Pentecostal youths who had organised themselves into leadership positions in a new youth SACCO (Savings and Credit Cooperative Society), which would be the place where youth savings groups would put their money for safekeeping.

Acknowledgments

We are grateful to the people of Ngora for their patience and continued support. I am also grateful for comments received from Martin Lindhardt and participants at a University of East Anglia Research Seminar. All errors and omissions are our own.

Disclosure statement 625

Q7 No potential conflict of interest was reported by the author(s).

Funding

This article was supported by a British Academy mid-Career Fellowship [YF\190162].

ORCID

Ben Jones http://orcid.org/0000-0003-3168-0726

630

650

References

- Anderson, A. 2005. "New African Initiated Pentecostalism and Charismatics in South Africa." *Journal of Religion in Africa* 35 (1): 66–92. https://doi.org/10.1163/1570066052995843.
- Barrett, D. B., G. T. Kurian, and T. M. Johnson, eds. 2000. World Christian Encyclopedia: A Comparative Survey of Churches and Religions, AD 30-AD 2000. New York: Oxford 635 University Press.
- Benyah, F. 2020. "Selling God': Contemporary Ghanaian Pentecostal Christianity in the Marketplace." *The Journal of World Christianity* 10 (2): 170–196. https://doi.org/10.5325/jworlchri.10.2.0170.
- Bourdieu, P., and J.-C. Passeron. 1990. Reproduction in Education, Society and Culture. London: 640 Sage.
- Q8 Bruner, J. 2017. Living Salvation in the East African Revival in Uganda. Vol. 75. Boydell & Brewer. Coleman, S. 2000. The Globalization of Charismatic Christianity: Spreading the Gospel of Prosperity. Cambridge: University Press.
 - Coleman, S., and R. Hackett, eds. 2015. The Anthropology of Global Pentecostalism and 645 Evangelicalism. New York: New York University Press.
- Comaroff, J. 2015. "Pentecostalism, 'Post-secularism,' and the Politics of Affect: In Africa and Beyond." In *Pentecostalism in Africa*, 220–247. Brill.
 - Corbett, M. 2007. Learning to Leave: The Irony of Schooling in a Coastal Community. Hobart: University of Tasmania Press.
- Q17 De Witte, M. 2018. "Buy the Future: Charismatic Pentecostalism and African Liberation in a Neoliberal World." In *Pentecostalism and Politics in Africa*, 65–85.
 - Demerath, P. 1999. "The Cultural Production of Educational Utility in Pere Village, Papua New Guinea." *Comparative Education Review* 43 (2): 162–192. https://doi.org/10.1086/447553.
 - Demerath, P. 2000. "The Social Cost of acting 'extra': Students' Moral Judgments of Self, Social 655 Relations, and Academic Success in Papua New Guinea." *American Journal of Education* 108 (3): 196–235. https://doi.org/10.1086/444243.
 - Eisenstein, A. 2021. "On Waiting Willfully in Urban Uganda: Toward an Anthropology of Pace." *Cultural Anthropology* 36 (3): 458–483. https://doi.org/10.14506/ca36.3.09.
 - Ferguson, J. 1999. Expectations of Modernity: Myths and Meanings of Urban Life on the Zambian 660 Copperbelt. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press.
 - Gifford, P. 1994. "Ghana's Charismatic Churches." *Journal of Religion in Africa* 241–265. https://doi.org/10.1163/157006694X00138.
 - Gusman, A. 2009. "HIV/AIDS, Pentecostal Churches, and the 'Joseph generation' in Uganda." *Africa Today* 56 (1): 66–86. https://doi.org/10.2979/AFT.2009.56.1.66.
 - Haynes, N. 2012. "Pentecostalism and the Morality of Money: Prosperity, Inequality, and Religious Sociality on the Zambian Copperbelt." *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute* 18 (1): 123–139. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-9655.2011.01734.x.

680

685

710

- Honwana, A. 2014. "Waithood': Youth Transitions and Social Change." In *Development and Equity: An Interdisciplinary Exploration by Ten Scholars from Africa, Asia and Latin America*, 670 edited by D. Foeken, T. Dietz, L. de Haan, and L. Johnson, 28–40. Leiden: Brill.
- Jeffrey, C. 2010a. "Timepass: Youth, Class, and Time Among Unemployed Young Men in India." *American Ethnologist* 37 (3): 465–481. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1548-1425.2010.01266.x.
- Jeffrey, C. 2010b. Timepass: Youth, Class, and the Politics of Waiting in India. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press.
- Jones, B. 2005. "The Church in the Village, the Village in the Church: Pentecostalism in Teso, Uganda." *Cahiers d'Études Africaines* 178 (2): 497–518. https://doi.org/10.4000/etudesafricaines.5452.
- Jones, B. 2023. "Education as Identity: The Scaffolding of 'Being educated' in Eastern Uganda." American Ethnologist 50 (2): 285–296. https://doi.org/10.1111/amet.13151.
- Lauterbach, K. 2015. "Religious entrepreneurs in Ghana." In *Cultural Entrepreneurship in Africa*, 33–50. Routledge.
- Q16 Levinson, B. A., and D. Holland. 1996. "The Cultural Production of the Educated Person: An Introduction." In *The Cultural Production of the Educated Person: Critical Ethnographies of Schooling and Local Practice*, 1–54.
 - Levinson, B., A. Douglas, E. Foley, and D. Holland, eds. 1996. *The Cultural Production of the Educated Person: Critical Ethnographies of Schooling and Local Practice.* New York: State University of New York Press.
 - Lindhardt, M. 2012. "'We, the Youth, Need to Be effusive': Pentecostal Youth Culture in Contemporary Chile." *Bulletin of Latin American Research* 31 (4): 485–498. https://doi.org/10. 690 1111/j.1470-9856.2012.00735.x.
 - Lindhardt, M. 2016. "Time to Move On. On Pentecostal Church Shifting and Religious Competition in Chile." In *New Ways of Being Pentecostal in Latin America*, edited by M. Lindhardt. London: Lexington.

Q11

- Lindhardt, M. 2020. "Pushing Pentecostalism Toward the Respectable: On the Mainstreaming of 695 a Countercultural Religious Movement in Chile." *Religion* 50 (4): 671–695. https://doi.org/10. 1080/0048721X.2020.1712054.
- Mains, D. 2007. "Neoliberal Times: Progress, Boredom, and Shame Among Young Men in Urban Ethiopia." *American Ethnologist* 34 (4): 659–673. https://doi.org/10.1525/ae.2007.34.4.659.
- Q15 Maxwell, D., 2000. "Post-Colonial Christianity in Africa." In World Christianities c. 1914-c, 700
 - Meyer, B. 2004. "Christianity in Africa: From African Independent to Pentecostal-Charismatic Churches." *Annual Review of Anthropology* 33 (1): 447–474. https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.anthro.33.070203.143835.
 - Mwaura, G. M. 2017. "Just Farming? Neoliberal Subjectivities and Agricultural Livelihoods 705 Among Educated Youth in Kenya." *Development and Change* 48 (6): 1310–1335. https://doi.org/10.1111/dech.12342.
 - Mwiine, A. A. 2019. "Negotiating Patriarchy? Exploring the Ambiguities of the Narratives on 'Male champions' of Gender Equality in Uganda Parliament." *Agenda* 33 (1): 108–116. https://doi.org/10.1080/10130950.2019.1598273.
 - O'Sullivan, S. 2023. "Refusing Aid: Interdependency and Development in Northern Uganda." *American Ethnologist* 50 (1): 103–114. https://doi.org/10.1111/amet.13116.
- Peterson, D. R. 2012. *Ethnic Patriotism and the East African Revival: A History of Dissent, C. 1935-1972.* (No. 122). Cambridge University Press.
- Pype, K. 2015. "The Liveliness of Pentecostal/Charismatic Popular Culture in Africa." In 715 Pentecostalism in Africa, 345–378. Leiden: Brill.
 - Reed-Danahay, D. 2005. Locating Bourdieu. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.
 - Stambach, A., and D. Hall. 2017. Anthropological Perspectives on Student Futures: Youth and the Politics of Possibility. London: Palgrave MacMillan.
 - Ukah, A. 2005. "Those Who Trade with God Never lose': The Economies of Pentecostal Activism 720 in Nigeria." In *Christianity and Social Change in Africa: Essays in Honor of J.D.Y. Peel*, edited by T. Falola, 253–74. Durham, N.C: Carolina Academic Press.



- Van Dijk, R., and K. Molenaar. 2021. "Pentecostalism and the Arts of Insistence: Examples from Botswana." Journal of Religion in Africa 49 (3-4): 257-288. https://doi.org/10.1163/15700666-12340169.
- Vigh, H. 2006. "Social Death and Violent Life Chances." In Navigating Youth-Generating Adulthood: Social Becoming in an African Context.

- Q14 Vigh, H. 2009. "Motion Squared: A Second Look at the Concept of Social Navigation." Anthropological Theory 9 (4): 419–438. https://doi.org/10.1177/1463499609356044.
 - Vigh, H. 2010. "Youth Mobilisation as Social Navigation. Reflections on the Concept of 730 Dubriagem." Cadernos de Estudos Africanos (18/19): 140-164. https://doi.org/10.4000/cea.110.