A Plumber Who Teaches or Teacher of Plumbing?

A study to inform a strategy for teacher learning and development, designed to provide opportunity for personalised learning and growth of dual professionalism, whilst also enabling achievement of the strategic plan and vision for a college of general further education in Suffolk.

Rachel Kirk

A thesis submitted for the degree of Doctor of Education in the School of Education and Lifelong Learning, University of East Anglia

May 2019

Abstract

This research project explored the approach and engagement with learning and development by teachers in the Education and Training Sector (ETS). The aim was to investigate and propose a strategy for teacher learning and development which might provide opportunity to meet both the aims of the organisation and individual needs of teachers to grow as dual professionals through teacher/employer negotiation. Underpinning this research was the concept that teacher learning and development should be based upon a model of Continuous Professional Learning (CPL) built upon a framework of constructivism (Wilson, 2014) encouraging andragogical learning (Knowles, 1984), through the use of social learning activities (Steward, 2009).

The project was based at one college in Suffolk using action research as the methodology, within the boundaries of case study. The research methods were questionnaires and group discussions with teachers at the Research College, a group interview with senior managers at the Research College, managers of teacher learning and development at another English college and a college of vocational education in Australia. Secondary evidence included documents from meetings at the Research College, notes from conferences and Ofsted reports.

Through the data analysis it became evident that teachers' reflections on their experiences were negative and they saw teacher learning and development as a 'done to' process addressing college need rather than enabling professional growth. Research activity identified the need for organisational learning and development to be on-going but that there should be opportunity to provide learning and development for vocational upskilling and contextual understanding to support growth of dual professionalism. The outcome was a strategy for continuous professional learning which could offer opportunity for personalised and negotiated activity supporting dual professionalism whilst meeting the strategic aims of the college and improving the quality of teaching and learning.

Dedication

This work is dedicated to my father, Bryan Pugh. He was the driving force behind my continued academic achievements, if only because I needed to prove him wrong!

Sadly he died four months after I started on this journey, but I know he's been with me every step of the way.

Acknowledgements

This work has been completed because of the unquestioning support I've had from my family: my mother, June, my husband, Jerry, and my children, Hannah and Joseph. Without them understanding what Sunday afternoons were for, reading my work at times throughout the last four years and acting as sounding boards for me, I could not have got this done.

I would also like to acknowledge the support of my two excellent supervisors at the UEA, Jan and Terry. They have been honest with me in their feedback throughout as well as providing me with support and reassurance at some very difficult times.

Without the willing support of the participants of this project I would not have been able to complete it, therefore I want to acknowledge their part in the outcome of my research and I hope that they will see that their participation was worthwhile.

Acknowledgement must go to my wonderful proof-readers, Kerry and Ruth. Both absolutely excellent in finding the tiniest error.

To you all I say a heartfelt 'thank you'!

Contents

Glossary of Terms

ASQA	Australian Skills Quality Authority
CAVTL	Commission on Adult Vocational Teaching and Learning
CPD	Continuous Professional Development
CPL	Continuous Professional Learning
ETF	Education and Training Foundation
ETS	Education and Training Sector
FE	Further Education
GFE	General Further Education
ITT	Initial Teacher Training
IfL	Institute for Learning
HE	Higher Education
SET	Society of Education and Training
VET	Vocational Education and Training

Chapter One – Introduction and Rationale

1.1 Introduction

A thesis statement or theory is that which is proposed as a concept which should be proved or at least maintained. Or as defined by the Oxford English Dictionary "A statement or theory that is put forward as a premise to be maintained or proved." (2018). In this thesis I am proposing that teacher learning and development is not currently fit for purpose for those teaching in the Education and Training Sector (ETS) [1]. The premise of my thesis statement was that teacher learning and development should be broadened to support teachers to develop their skills both as teachers and as vocational experts, in other words, as dual professionals[2].

1.2 Personal and Professional Context
"Most of us have to work. But is work just a means to an end?" (Sennett, 2008).

Richard Sennett has written about the importance of craftsmanship and the desire to do a job well for its own sake. In addition though I consider that we should do a job well for our own professional pride and self-fulfilment as well as for the benefit of quality of the end product and craftsmanship.

---

[1] The term used to describe the post 16 and Lifelong Learning Sector of education changed to The Educational and Training Sector in 2013, this replaced the term previously used, The Learning & Skills Sector.
[2] Dual professionalism: deep knowledge, conceptual understanding and expertise in teaching and learning processes and contexts, matched with expert subject knowledge and skills (IfL, 2012).

The ambition of the Government of the United Kingdom (hereafter referred to as the Government) for the ETS was that it should grow as a professionally respected sector of education in order to facilitate development of a future workforce capable of competing on the international stage (Wolf 2011). Robson (1998) discussed that the post 16 education sector is the neglected sector, unacknowledged by society and generally overlooked by successive Governments and, whilst there is certainly an urgent need to develop and prepare the young people of today for the workplace and for the global market, I suggest that teachers need to recognise themselves as professionals in order that the expectation of the Government can be met and the professional respect for the Sector can grow.

This view has inspired my thinking and informed the initial seed for my thesis statement which was consolidated by my own experiences as a teacher in the Sector and then as a teacher trainer in the Sector. From starting in the ETS in 1991, I experienced what many new teachers experience, including being put straight into a classroom with students with no prior experience of how to facilitate learning. This experience was compounded because support from my employer for my teacher training and degree was not forthcoming. I completed both despite, rather than because of my employer. Whilst I was in training, between 1992 and 1996, the Sector went through Incorporation[3] and attention on teacher learning and development and teacher training became even less of a focus because college managers prioritised meeting set targets and budgets (Shain and Gleeson, 1999).

As a teacher it was evident to me that there was a need to support the development of teachers, new and existing. They had expertise and skills to share and should be supported to do this effectively and thoroughly. I chose to take this as the focus for my own continuing studies and career direction and in

---

[3] Incorporation in 1993 removed the responsibility of post-16 education from local authority control and put it into the hands of the college corporations. "They became accountable corporate bodies handling multi-million pound budgets" Wallace and Gravells (2007).

2004 moved in to initial teacher training (ITT) and learning and development. As I made this career transition the Government recognised that in order for it to meet the industrial needs of the nation and be able to compete on the international industrial stage it was imperative that development of teachers in the ETS was made a government priority. Following the report from the Department for Education and Skills (DfES) 'Equipping Our Teachers for the Future' (2004), the then Labour Government acknowledged that the Sector was neglected and its teachers unsupported. This report was influential in the adoption in 2007 of legislation which supported, through the Further Education Workforce Regulations, teacher training to the level appropriate for the nature of a teacher's teaching commitment[4]. It also established requirement for learning and development for all teachers, to be undertaken and evidenced through membership of the Institute for Learning (IfL), the organisation set up by the Government to operate as the professional body of the lifelong learning sector, as it was in 2007. The intention was to give teachers in the Sector acknowledgement and status as dual professionals, that is professionals in their vocational field as well as professional educators.

It had been found through research by Robson, Bailey and Larkin, (2004) and Clow (2006) that teachers in the ETS did not recognise themselves as teachers but rather as vocational experts who did some teaching, for instance, 'plumbers who teach'. These teachers did not see the need for teacher training and did not value themselves as professional educators. The intention of mandatory teacher learning and development and engagement with the IfL was to encourage teachers to build professional recognition as an educator, gaining self-respect and respect from others, whilst also retaining a professional standing within their vocational field. Hence the remit of the IfL to establish a professional code of practice, provide support for the mandatory learning and development and requirement for teachers to demonstrate engagement with this through reflective records. This change in Government legislation was encouraging news and

---

[4] The legislation offered either the passport to teach for those with minimal teaching commitment or full Qualified Teacher Learning and Skills (QTLS) status for those in a full teaching role (DfES, 2004).

motivated me to move forward with my career as a teacher trainer and manager of teacher learning and development in the ETS.

Although Government legislation was deregulated in 2012 (Lingfield, 2012) it is my view that the ethos of supporting professionalism should not change. Development of teachers' skills and knowledge are fundamental to successful achievement and maintenance of professionalism and professional recognition. Support for this should be designed to enable the growth of a teacher, legislated or not, providing suitable opportunity for achievement of both knowledge and skill as an expert in a specific field and pedagogy. However having reflected on the approaches used in the ETS towards learning and development, and based on findings from this research project, I question that the Colleges I have been involved with understand what teacher learning and development is, or whether it is actually what is needed to support growth of teachers as dual professionals and, as a consequence support the improvement of quality of teaching and learning for the benefits of the students.

Across the Sector, including the Sector lead body, the Education and Training Foundation (ETF) and colleges generally, teacher learning and development is referred to as Continuous Professional Development (CPD), with this in mind I identified a definition for this term:

> A combination of approaches, ideas and techniques that will help you manage your own learning and growth (CiPD, 2018).

In contrast to this, a definition for the phrase staff development states that it:

> Refers to the process whereby employees of an organisation enhance their knowledge and skills in directions that are advantageous to their role in the organisation" (Marriss, 2018*).*

I have not experienced teachers in the ETS being able to take ownership, in a negotiated manner or otherwise, of learning and development opportunities, as

the CiPD would expect. Often other than learning and development to meet college need, the activity the teachers engage in is self-directed and self-funded, as in my own case and identified by Broad in her research (2015). As found in literature (Robson, et al., 2004 and Scales, Pickering, Senior, Headley, Garner and Boulton, 2011) and the findings from my research, it is more the case that learning and development in the ETS is in line with the definition of staff development: teachers engage in activities that are required by the organisation in order that they meet the expectations of external auditors, or target driven needs (Marriss, 2018).

This raises the questions: what is understood by the term CPD and how does it differ from staff development or continuous professional learning? After all, 'development' is not a word that would usually be used to describe a choice of learning or training, it is more a word used by people when developing 'something' rather than 'someone'. When going through a process of development, the object being developed has little or no say in the process and this certainly seems to be true of CPD at the Research College (Mattson, 2014).

Having identified definitions for CPD and staff development, and the Research College's approach to CPD, I have also reviewed the concept of continuous professional learning (CPL), which lends itself to the development of teachers in order to meet the ever changing landscape of the ETS, whilst also ensuring negotiated opportunity for development of the teachers' skills and knowledge to develop and retain their own dual professionalism:

> On a professional level, continuous learning is about further expanding our skill-set in response to a changing environment and new developments.

> On a personal level, continuous learning is about the constant expansion of skills and skill-sets through learning and increasing knowledge.
> (Talentlms, 2018)

Or, as considered by Mattson citing Martin et al. (2014, in Mattson, 2014, pg. 147) the concept of CPL promotes "ownership over compliance, conversation over transmission, deep understanding over enacting rules and routines and goal-directed activity over content coverage."

CPL has a very clear relationship with professionalism, as identified in the definition and explanation above, and as a concept, professionalism is something that was not a priority for the ETS until the introduction of Equipping Our Teachers for the Future (2004) and dual professionalism. With professional identity being essential for high quality teaching and learning, and providing the Government with the future workforce I went into this action research project with the view that it was an opportunity to address my concerns about support for teachers' professional recognition and the role of learning and development in supporting professionalism. As commented on by Brundrett, McCulloch, Helsby and Knight (2000), learning and development should influence professionalism, providing opportunity for creativity, reflection and informing teaching, learning and assessment.

Through my own experiences, and through literature I have established that dual professionalism is a concept that should be developed and encouraged with teachers engaging in strategies to develop in this way, building on both their existing vocational skills and knowledge and their skills as teachers. However, it is important to understand what being a professional means and how this informs a strategy for learning and development. Therefore the concept and nature of professionalism is key to underpinning a strategy for learning and development and the form this will take, for instance addressing the required development activities to meet organisational need, a negotiated approach to encourage ownership of teachers for lifelong learning, benefitting the teacher, the organisation and the students. On this basis I considered that there is scope for a definition of 'dual professionalism plus'. That is, dual professionalism with additional assumptions of responsibility for supporting successful achievement and positive experience of students, (some would consider they are already

included, by drawing on the use of the ETF Professional Standards for teachers) and sharing achievement of organisational objectives and that a dual professional teacher in the Sector should be able to assume some level of autonomy in order that he/she can negotiate choices and actions to support development and progression of him/herself and the organisation (Steward, 2009).

1.3   The Impact of Circumstances on this Research Project

This project was designed as an action research project and as such its purpose was to solve a problem in my practice as the senior manager for teacher learning and development at the Research College (Coghlan and Brannick 2014). However, during the research phase of this project there were two significant experiences that I needed to address and overcome in order to continue. Both of these, in their own way, could have changed the direction of my research or the methodology had I not reflected on the situations and adapted my work to suit the circumstantial changes. The first was a reorganisation of responsibilities at the Research College which caused me to reflect on my research methodology. When I started this project I was responsible for teacher learning and development, which put me in the perfect position to meet with groups of staff and managers and trial learning and development activity evolving from each cycle of an action research project. However, shortly after starting this, the responsibility for teacher learning and development was moved to the Director of Quality and thus my day to day involvement was much reduced. The Director of Quality was extremely helpful throughout this period and supported my research, providing opportunities for me to meet with staff, managers and herself for research purposes, whenever I needed to do so. As helpful as this was though I found it necessary to reflect on the methodology for my project. If I was no longer the lead for teacher learning and development, was I still engaging in the type of research (action research) outlined in my proposal, or was this now something of a different nature? I was able to meet with teachers and reflect on the outcome of the interviews, however

I was not in a position to trial approaches to learning and development based on the outcome of the interviews.

However, after reflecting on the situation and making minor adjustments to my research activity, I chose to continue with my research as an action research project, the rationale being that the outcome was still going to influence the practice of the organisation at which I worked (Denscombe, 2003). Coghlan and Brannick (2014) explained this further by recognising that it is possible to undertake action research in a situation where the researcher is focussing on a situation within the organisation but, although he/she is an insider, he/she is looking at the issue through the lens of an outsider. I consider this to be the situation I found myself in primarily because I was not engaging in reflection-in-action (Schon, 1983) as part of the research process, although I did draw on reflective thinking between cycles of research. I am aware that the cycles of the project did not follow the true nature of action research cycles, with limited, or no opportunity for testing, however analysis of interviews and questionnaires as well as interpretation of documentation enabled me to move from one stage to the next to ultimately emerge with a suitable outcome and recommendations.

The second situation I found myself in was having to consider the issue of gaining access to hourly paid teachers. My research project involved interviews and questionnaires with sample groups of teachers, representing the typical nature of teachers in the ETS. One group was a group of hourly paid teachers. Access to learning and development for these teachers is a significant barrier because they are largely not available at the times activities are taking place. Hourly paid teachers often have other jobs and family commitments, which means they are unable to come to college for training or any other requirement outside of their teaching timetable. It became apparent when I tried to arrange to meet these teachers as a group, that this was not going to be possible and that I would need to review my approach with this group of staff. As a consequence I elected to design an on-line questionnaire for these teachers to complete, improving both accessibility and participation, as a result. This did

mean that I was not going to acquire as rich a dataset as I had hoped, but their responses to the questionnaire did improve my understanding of their circumstances.

1.4 Summary of the Structure of this Thesis

This thesis contains eight chapters as outlined below:

Chapter 1 – Introduction and Rationale

This chapter has set the scene and context for the research, giving the reader the understanding behind the focus of my research and approach to it.

Chapter 2 – Context, Conceptual and Theoretical Frameworks of the Project

This chapter sets the historical context from which the conceptual frameworks for a successful model of teacher learning and development have emerged and in which the theoretical framework for the research methodology is established.

Chapter 3 – Literature Review

Chapter three is a review of the literature considered and analysed in order to establish the underpinning frameworks of this project. The reading has informed my understanding of learning and development for teachers in post 16 education, the priorities experienced by teachers across the Sector for learning and development and understanding of professionalism in the Sector.

Chapter 4 – Research Methodologies

In this chapter I related my theoretical framework to the research methodology, identifying how the framework has influenced my approach to research. Through this chapter, I justify my chosen methodologies, research methods,

approaches to data analysis and my choices for participant sample groups. I also consider and reflect on the issues of being an insider researcher.

Chapter 5 – Report of the Analysis of Findings

This chapter draws the findings together from all my research activity and displays the data by the themes that emerged through my research activity.

Chapter 6 – Discussion of Findings

The chapter considers the themes that have emerged from my research activity and compares my findings with the views of those discussed in my literature review and my own experiences. It considers how the emerging themes relate to the conceptual and theoretical frameworks underpinning my research.

Chapter 7 – Implications for Practice

This chapter considers the research findings and establishes the outcome and recommendations evolving from the project.

Chapter 8 - Conclusion

In this chapter I review the project as a whole, its contribution to the field of study, an evaluation of the project and identified limitations and I conclude with the next stages for research.

1.5 Chapter One Summary

In summary, my research project was initially founded on my own experiences and observations as a teacher and then teacher trainer in further education. These experiences directly influenced my decision to investigate the learning and development available for teachers in the ETS to develop, gain and maintain

respect as dual professionals. They also informed the conceptual and theoretical frameworks which then underpinned the aim and questions for my research proposal. My project was designed as action research and despite circumstantial changes that I had to make I chose to continue with the project as an action research project in order that I could make real change to the practice at the Research College.

The following chapter gives further explanation of the context of my research, the conceptual frameworks which underpin my rationale and the theoretical framework upon which I have built the research methodology.

Chapter Two - Context, Conceptual & Theoretical Frameworks of the Project

2.1 Introduction

In this chapter I set the scene for the field of research, including the historical context, the specific area of research and the aims and research questions for the project. I explain the conceptual frameworks which underpin my original thoughts and rationale, including existing research, articles and theories and models of learning upon which I consider a programme of learning and development for teachers should be built. I also explain my selected theoretical framework underpinning my research methodology.

Crotty (1998) acknowledged that it is common for a researcher to approach a research project with a 'problem' and ideas for methodology already in mind. He emphasised however, that before a researcher can move forward, it is essential that he/she establishes a robust framework upon which to build the research in order for it to receive the merit and respect deserved.

Therefore, I analysed and reflected on literature, UK Government papers and my own observations of 27 years in the ETS, in order to establish the theoretical framework that has informed my methodology, and the conceptual frameworks of my research focus. I concluded that a constructionist epistemology underpinned my theoretical framework, with an interpretivist view on the reality of the situation which as explained by Crotty (1998), means new thinking is constructed out of something that already exists, based on individual interpretations of that existing information. Using this approach allowed me to build upon existing evidence acquired through reading, discussion and the learning of people's views (Ritchie, Lewis and McNaughton Nicholls, 2014). Papert & Harel (1991) assumed that understanding and meaning were

developed through coordination with other elements or bodies to build upon current knowledge.   Bryman (2012, cited in Crawley 2014) suggested that when planning research it was essential to be familiar with what others have investigated in the specific field and identify the gaps or unanswered research questions accordingly.   Whilst reading research and articles by educational experts and researchers I was able to establish the historical context of the ETS, the approach and priorities for teacher learning and development in the Sector and the attitude of the management of colleges towards professionalism.   From this review of literature I identified the aim of my own research, to develop a model of teacher learning and development with the purpose of supporting growth of professionalism across the Sector.

2.2 Historical Context

It has long been acknowledged that the ETS is considered the 'Cinderella' of education (Randle and Brady, 1997), with the Government and public focus being on schools and universities (Randle and Brady, 1997). I consider that this view also applied to the teachers within the Sector. There was a period in the 1970s and 80s when teacher development in the Sector was well funded and well supported, this was a consequence of the James Report (1972, cited in Broad, 2015) in which it was stated that teachers in the further education sector (now the Education and Training Sector) should be recognised and have access to the same support and opportunities as school teachers. There were excellent opportunities for both vocational upskilling and pedagogical development, with networking both internally and externally. However, with the introduction of Incorporation following the 1992 Further and Higher Education Act, control of management of colleges was moved from the local authorities and into the hands of senior managers of the colleges. This had a significant impact on the Sector and particularly on teacher learning and development opportunities. It was only during the period 2004-2012 that professional respect and standing for teachers in this Sector was brought back to the Government agenda and considered a priority. Since the Second World War, there have been many debates over the professionalisation of teachers in the Post-16 Vocational

Education Sector, but with little commitment to training and teacher learning and development by the Sector management or in some instances the teachers themselves. In fact in 1946 the first centre for teacher training was opened in Bolton but gaining teaching qualifications was not a Government requirement (Bailey, 2007).

Historically, those choosing to teach in the Sector had been employed for the subject expertise they brought with them, their qualifications and competence of their vocational area. When asked to identify their role though, many teachers of plumbing, as an example, would refer to themselves as 'plumbers who teach' (Coles 2004). These people were respected as professionals within their field of expertise, but Robson (1998) argued that they were ill prepared for the role of teacher and, even in the golden era of the 1970s and 80s, they were not required to train to teach or develop techniques and theories that were known to develop students' understanding and skills. Robson (1998) also stated that most Governments were not prepared to invest in the training. The McNair Report in 1944, cited in Robson (1998), reported that it was essential for teachers within the Sector to maintain up-to-date subject competence and skills-based knowledge and that this should take priority over the development of teaching skills. Bailey (2007) explained that following the Second World War, the McNair Committee supported introduction of training for technical teachers, at three centres across the country, but it was very much a low priority compared to the training being offered to ex-forces personnel to become school teachers, Bailey (2007) suggested it was treated as an afterthought. The fact that it was only accessible at three centres suggested to me the low level of priority for such training. Based on Robson's analysis in 1998, it appeared that neither skills development, nor pedagogy, were seen as a priority and those vocational experts moving into teaching in the Vocational Education Sector found themselves with both limited teacher training and vocational upskilling.

Randle and Brady (1997), Spenceley (2006) and Shain and Gleeson (1999) all considered the status of teachers following the Second World War; at this time and well into the 1970s, they were seen as professionals, but specifically as

'public sector professionals'. That is, people who worked in positions of authority but served the community. Public sector professionals were typically from all walks of public sector life (nursing, social work, teaching etc.) and considered to be inherently 'good', as opposed to those who held professional qualifications and were respected for the skills of their profession, for instance medicine or law. These papers reviewed the progress and status of teachers as public sector professionals and analysed and reported on the privatisation and marketisation of the public sector during the late 1970s and early 1980s, causing the removal of teacher autonomy in schools with the introduction of the National Curriculum. Spenceley (2006) and Shain and Gleeson (1999) also reflected on the impact of the Education (Further Education Corporations) Order 1992, leading to the Incorporation of Further Education and marketisation of colleges by moving them out of local authority control.   Both papers considered that these Acts, influenced by Callaghan's criticisms, expressed in his Ruskin speech in 1976 and the decisions of Thatcher's New Right Government, were responsible for the change in the professional status of teachers in post-16 education.

Shain and Gleeson (1999) continued with their review of the historical context by giving an overview of how Incorporation forced colleges to develop a managerialist approach to leadership, with a change of focus and priority away from learning towards meeting market need. However, as Spenceley (2006) suggested, it was a strange approach to marketisation, as the Government still held the purse strings. On the one hand they were encouraging colleges to work with employers and develop skills required by the local industry, whilst on the other, colleges did not have the capacity to fully embrace this; they were tied to the Government and the need to meet the demands of both the Government and funding agencies (Shain and Gleeson, 1999).

Further, Randle and Brady (1997) considered that this managerialist approach was in some way responsible for the deprofessionalisation of the Sector. They explained that the need for marketisation forced senior management teams to

draw on external agencies for mass produced curriculum content and design, taking the responsibility away from teachers and those delivering the curriculum. This observation was reinforced with the response of 84.6% of their research participants confirming that they did not consider that the college management shared the same educational values as the teachers.

2.3   Context of the Research

The evidence which underpinned this research project was based on theories of research (Crotty, 1998) and substantive literature reviewed (Gleeson and James, 2007; Elliott, 1996; Musset, 2010; Robson, 1998; Avis, 2005; Clow, 2006; Fuller and Unwin, 2003; Coffield, 2008; Plowright and Barr, 2012; Lloyd and Payne, 2012. Broad, 2015, Broad, 2018 and Broad and Lahiff, 2019); the 157 Group in conjunction with the Institute for Learning (IfL) and the Institute of Education (IoE), (2012) and the Education and Training Foundation (ETF). These educationalists wrote about the lack of professional recognition, approaches to teacher learning and development and the need for teachers to grow as dual professionals. All recommended that this should be through a programme of teacher learning and development which should support opportunities for engagement with vocational sector organisations and employers (IfL, 2012). In its report to the Government, the Commission on Adult Vocational Teaching and Learning (CAVTL) (2013), suggested that as a Sector the ETS should raise the esteem of and empower, vocational education and training (VET) professionals by encouraging participation in communities of practice, professional enquiry and practitioner research. All would provide the opportunity to relate learning and development to practice, thus informing personal and professional learning of teachers. The purpose of this approach to teacher learning and development was to meet the needs and expectations of the vocational market and support British industry to compete on the international stage (CAVTL, 2013), whilst also motivating further professionalisation of teachers in the Sector.

Supporting this further, the ETF introduced a branch of its organisation to support the professionalisation of teachers within the Sector, the Society for Education and Training (SET). This was in recognition of the fact that, despite the removal of the Further Education (FE) Workforce Regulations in 2012, there remained a need for all teachers and trainers to make a commitment to their teacher learning and development. The SET "expects members to remain in good professional standing by staying up to date with their subject specialism and approaches to teaching and learning" (SET, 2018), in line with most other professional bodies.

Further reading informing my research focussed on teacher learning and development approaches which are used to both engage teachers and promote autonomous thinking: Steward (2009); Scale et al. (2011); Robson (2006); Crowley (2014); Nieto (2003); Coffield (2008); Kennedy (2005); Duncombe and Armour, (2003) and Webster-Wright (2009), researching concepts for developing cognitive and constructivist approaches to learning, to encourage a growth mindset. These articles and books have all reinforced the suggested approaches to teacher learning and development put forward by educational strategy groups and professional and industry bodies, as discussed above. They have informed my thinking around strategies and approaches that could be considered to engage teachers in learning and development, whilst also developing their attitude and approach to dual professionalism and supporting positive outcomes for students. The full review of literature which underpins my conceptual frameworks can be found in chapter three.

2.4 Purpose of the Research

This research explores the hypothesis that current approaches for teacher learning and development in the ETS do not support development of dual professionalism and that an alternative approach to ongoing learning and development might be more appropriate. This hypothesis is based on my own experiences as a teacher and manager in the Sector for over 27 years and a

review of research and articles by educational academics. The research is set in a medium sized College of General Further Education (GFE) in Suffolk and is an applied research project with the intended outcome of providing a strategy for teacher learning and development based on a constructivist framework (building on existing knowledge, skills and experiences). The intention will be to support and encourage growth of 'learning professionals' (Gleeson & James 2007). It should endeavour to enable professional teachers in the ETS to take control of their personal and professional growth for the benefit of their own professional standing, their students and the organisation for which they work (Gleeson and James 2007; Robson, et al., 2004). In the first instance the purpose of the strategy will be to improve opportunity for negotiated teacher learning and development at the Research College but this could then be extended and adopted by other training providers across the ETS. It is intended that the outcome will be a strategy for teacher learning and development that will enable dual professionalism whilst also enabling achievement of the organisational aim and objectives.

Published research considered in this project demonstrated that research has been completed with teachers in the ETS previously and has identified teachers' views about teacher learning and development and how they consider their role as a teacher. It has also identified the weaknesses and common concerns regarding teacher learning and development available within colleges and across the Sector. However, none of this work appears to have identified how teacher learning and development could be improved and managed in order that teachers are supported to maintain their vocational expertise as well as being respected professionally as a teacher and dual professional and changing the view and culture of both teachers and managers.

Through the reading and my experiences I am able to identify that the key areas for this research project are to understand:

- What professionalism means for teachers in the ETS and particularly dual professionalism;

- What teacher learning and development is and what it means to the teachers at the Research College;
- What approaches to teacher learning and development are needed to provide a strategy to support dual professionalism.

When drawing these together I have established that the aim of this project is to:

Develop a strategy of teacher learning and development designed to encourage opportunity for personalised learning and growth of dual professionalism for teachers at a college of general further education in Suffolk (Research College), whilst also meeting the strategic plan and vision for the College.

With the key issues and aim identified the following questions have been designed to firstly gain a better understanding of existing experiences through the lens of the teacher. Secondly, to identify need and purpose of teacher learning and development from the Senior Management Team (SMT) perspective and thirdly, to facilitate consideration of appropriate strategies for teacher learning and development that could be adopted for the future, should they prove to support both the institutional strategic plan and concept of dual professionalism.

There was one primary question underpinning this research, from which five secondary questions emerged:

1) What model of teacher learning and development would enable a negotiated approach to ongoing development, encouraging a growth mindset, autonomy, ownership and dual professionalism for the teacher, meeting organisational needs to develop and respond to Government and stakeholder expectations, whilst supporting its vision for students to develop the characteristics of high achieving young people?

1.1. What are the previous experiences of learning and development for teachers at the Research College?

1.2. What does the Research College Senior Management Team (SMT) expect of a programme of teacher learning and development in terms of meeting the expectations of its vision for students, its Strategic Plan and its stakeholders?

1.3. What does the Research College SMT expect a programme of teacher learning and development to achieve? How can it ensure that it will withstand the rigours of external auditors?

1.4. What are the approaches that other organisations have successfully used for teacher learning and development to the benefit of the organisation, stakeholders and continued professionalisation of teachers?

1.5. What theories should underpin a strategy for teacher learning and development, in order that it is best able to support dual professionalism, whilst meeting organisational needs and vision?

2.5 Specific Focus of this Research Project

Before progressing with this project it was important that I acknowledged that teacher learning and development is a vast subject area and that I needed to identify the specific aspect of this field as the focus of my research. In the ETS teacher learning and development starts with initial teacher training and induction for the new trainee teacher and if managed well should continue throughout the teacher's career (Feiman-Nemser, 2001), evolving seamlessly from initial teacher training. Therefore, for the purpose of this research I have opted to focus on the ongoing development of teachers, post initial teacher training. This period of development should be for a teacher's own professional benefit and for the benefit of the organisation so that it can effectively achieve its strategic objectives and expectations of external auditors. The rationale for this is that teacher training focusses on the first year, or two, of a new teacher's career, it draws on well-respected higher level training and qualifications, in most

cases, colleges support the funding for this and recognise the benefits of teachers undertaking this training. It seems though, through my reading and personal experience that the support does not continue in the same way beyond initial teacher training. Essential teacher learning and development, required to meet regulatory expectations or organisational requirements is usually in place but there is limited focus on developing the individual, either professionally or personally (Robson et al., 2004, Gleeson and James, 2007), this, therefore, in my view, is the essential area for reflection and evaluation when considering teacher learning and development.

2.6 Underpinning Concepts and Theories

2.6.1 Conceptual Frameworks for a Strategy for Teacher Learning and Development

To develop teachers in all aspects of professionalism a teacher should be recognised as a dual professional (ETS, 2019). My conceptual thinking, based on the reading undertaken for this project, and my own experiences, (as outlined in chapter one, section 1.2) is that a professional teacher in the ETS should be defined as a dual professional but that there is much more to this than meeting the IfL definition or being compliant with the professional standards outlined by the ETS. A teacher should also provide holistic support for their students (Clow, 2006) and be prepared to meet the expectations of marketisation (Evett, 2006, Shain and Gleeson, 1999) but in return should be able to expect support for personal and professional growth and autonomy in their practice and professional learning.

This concept of professionalism can be supported through a strategy for teacher learning and development underpinned by a conceptual framework of constructivism. This approach would support participants to build new knowledge on existing experiences (Wilson, 2014). Many educationalists and psychologists, as discussed by Coles (2004) emphasise the importance of

recognising the individual needs in learning and ensuring that new learning is contextualised with the existing knowledge. He espoused that learning within a framework of constructivism provides opportunity for exactly this, as Steward (2009) explained, through the use of conversation, sharing knowledge and collaborative projects. To ensure relevance and engage teachers the strategy should be designed as a model of andragogical learning, as advocated by Malcolm Knowles (1984). Knowles explained that adults learn differently from children and adult learning is based on experiential learning through practice and reflection. Knowles (cited in Robson, 2006) claimed that adults have an existing source of knowledge and experience upon which to build further learning and they come to learning motivated, self-directed and ready to learn. When leading learning through an andragogical model, the experience and existing knowledge of adults should be respected and their learning should be theirs to own. Adults developing skills through andragogical approaches should be expected to take responsibility and ownership for their learning rather than it being a trainer/facilitator led approach. My view, reflecting on reading (Steward, 2009; Scales et al., 2011), is that it is essential that a strategy for teacher learning and development acknowledges this and supports an andragogical approach so that it can truly support the concept of dual professionalism.

This approach to professional learning is something being advocated by Malloch, Cairns, Evans and O'Connor (2010) who describe it as the future of workplace learning. Typically, workplace learning has been known to be the approach used to train individuals in the specific requirements of their job. However Malloch, et al., (2010) advise that with the globalisation of industry, and the high speed growth of technology, there is an increasing need for transferable skills and so workplace learning is drawing on informal approaches to learning, sharing and collaborating with colleagues such as communities of practice and situational learning (Malloch, et al., (2010).

Lave (1988) established, through a model of situated learning, that learning takes place if the learner is provided with the opportunity to learn in a real-world

situation, including interaction with others and should not be separated from other everyday activities. He also emphasised that learning occurs as a by-product of the situation. These approaches fall within the model of Bandura's social learning (Steward, 2009), which encourages learning through collaboration and contextualised activities such as observation, modelling and peer learning, often informally. It provides time to share with colleagues, engage in shared projects and deepen the level of learning by building on the existing knowledge of participants. This approach provides opportunity for teachers to develop expertise, as explained by Broad and Lahiff (2019) and build on their own personal, practical and theoretical understanding through practical activity and engagement through professional associations. Therefore, the concept of social learning theory will also be a key aspect of the conceptual frameworks I have established for this project.

Throughout this project the alternative approaches and definitions of teacher learning and development have been considered to establish which provides the most suitable platform for engaging colleges and teachers in professionalising the teachers in the Sector. Currently Colleges, in my experience, which is reinforced by research by Robson et al. (2004), do not engage in teacher learning and development as defined by CiPD (2018) and certainly not in CPL (Mattson, 2014 and Talentlms, 2018) to support professional and personal growth but they provide opportunity for staff development (Marriss, 2018). I intend to clarify which of these is the most suitable and relate this back to the conceptual frameworks outlined here. Through my research activity I will also consider the culture of the Research College and the impact of this on teacher learning and development.

2.6.2 Research Methodology Theoretical Framework

The choice of methodology for a research project is dependent upon the reality of the existing situation and problem. The methodology is the strategy or plan for a research project which decides the nature of the research, for example qualitative or quantitative and the methods of research used. The methodology

is developed from the theoretical framework that is established prior to starting the research activity.

Crotty (1998) discussed that the theoretical framework of a research project is the philosophical view informing the methodology and giving context to the research. He continues his discussion to explain that the epistemology of a research project is the theory of knowledge, in other words the theory of how we know what we know about something. In his book, Crotty (1998) states that undertaking research has four elements and by addressing each of these four elements the research paradigm is established. He advocates that the epistemology (1) of the research must be established (he incorporates the ontological perspective with this) in order that the theoretical perspective (2) can be identified. When these are in place the methodology (3) can be designed and then the research methods (4) developed. For the purposes of this project, therefore, I used Crotty's four elements model as the basis for establishing a suitable theoretical framework for my research project.

Crotty (1998) explained that it is essential that the four elements were understood and developed correctly for the research to have credibility and be convincing. He also acknowledged that it is quite common for the researcher to approach the project with a 'problem' and ideas for methodology already in mind. However, he emphasised that before a researcher could continue it is essential that he/she established a robust framework on which to build his/her research so that it received the merit and respect deserved.

Unlike Crotty (1998), who incorporated the ontological basis of research into the first element of epistemology, some research experts and authors stated that prior to establishing the epistemology of the research there is a place for understanding the ontology. That is to understand what the nature of the reality is and what is known about it (Punch & Oancea 2014). Crotty (1998) stated that the ontology is concerned with 'what is' and fits alongside the epistemology and together they inform the theoretical perspective (2). However, in order to ensure

a robust methodology is developed for my research project I shall explain both ontology and epistemology and follow with discussions which will encompass both in terms of how they influenced the theoretical framework for my research project.

A definition of Ontology is "the nature of the world and what there is to know about it" (Ritchie et al., 2014, pg. 5). Ritchie et al. continued by outlining two ontological positions, realism and idealism. They stated that the perspective of realism believes "an external reality exists independent of our beliefs or understanding" and that the idealist perspective believes "no external reality exists independent of our beliefs and understandings" (Ritchie et al., 2014, pg. 5).

Epistemology means the theory of knowledge and we all have our own beliefs of what constitutes knowledge. Knowledge can be gained from qualitative data through listening, reading and observing and building on existing knowledge, or it can be gained from quantitative data through analysis of information which is measurable and observable (Wallace 2013). There are also occasions when knowledge could be gained from a mixed approach, drawing on a combination of qualitative and quantitative data. The epistemological basis on which the researcher builds the research will influence the methodology used for the research.

Based on these positions I suggest that the ontological position for myself as a researcher, was that of realism and not idealism. An idealistic view would be something developed as a concept by an individual based on no, or limited evidence. However, interpreting Cohen and Manion's explanation (1994), the focus of this research came from an external, independent existence in that there was a reality that existed in terms of teacher learning and development and the need for professionalisation of teachers in the Education and Training Sector. This was evident through the literature and research available in this area. I acknowledge, though, that my interpretation, based on my experiences and theoretical concepts were individual to me and could be different from others. This then challenged the epistemological approach assumed by Guba

and Lincoln (1989, cited in Crotty 1998) and others such as Cohen and Manion (1994). They argued that the ontological view of realism implied objectivism as the epistemological standpoint. It was assumed that the researcher had an "objective detachment" (Crotty 1998, pg. 8) in order to be able to observe the realities of their research topic. I would disagree that realism implies objectivism, in this instance I do not feel that the topic of my research was something that was waiting to be acknowledged and accepted as fact but to be built upon and developed.

An epistemological approach considered was that of subjectivism, the basis of which is to take the original concept or topic of research as the object and subject meaning to it. Crotty (1998) stated that the view of subjectivism implied the meaning was imposed on the situation, having evolved out of nothing. The research project being considered here does not fall into that epistemological category either as the purpose is not to create a brand new concept but to build on existing knowledge and facts. Therefore, the further, alternative epistemology of constructionism was considered. Constructionism meant new thinking is constructed out of something that already existed (Crotty 1998) and it assumed that understanding and meaning are developed through coordination with other elements or bodies, building on existing knowledge (Papert & Harel 1991).

Crotty (1998) supported the view that realism and constructionism work well together and so I selected that the starting point of the four elements of this research, as defined by Crotty (1998) was constructionism based on the fact that an existing situation was being interpreted in order to build on it and develop it further for a specific environment. Further confirmation that this combination would be effective came from Flick (2013, pg. 70) who stated that constructionism "informs a lot of qualitative research programmes with the approach that the realities we study are social products of the actors, of interactions, and institutions".

As explained previously, epistemology is concerned with how we know and learn about the world. Further investigation into epistemology identified that there are

two views of how we know and learn, one is induction (bottom up) and the other is through deduction (top down). Induction lends itself to the collection of information and evidence and conclusions are drawn from this; this could include evidence acquired through discussion and learning people's views. Deduction uses evidence to support a conclusion, or hypothesis. This evidence would be acquired through more scientific routes such as direct observation. Thereby associating this approach to acquiring knowledge in the positivist way of thinking (Ritchie et al., 2014).

This analysis consolidated my decision that this research was based on a constructionist epistemology to establish what people knew and how they knew it through an inductive approach building on existing circumstances.

Crotty explained that the theoretical perspective, the second element of his model, is the "philosophical stance behind our chosen methodology" (Crotty 1998, p 7). Depending on the epistemological stance identified the theoretical perspective lends itself usually to a quantitative, qualitative or mixed methodology. Crotty (1998) acknowledged that there is a wide variety of philosophical views underpinning a theoretical perspective but he identified five in his example: Positivism (including post-positivism), Interpretivism, Critical inquiry, Feminism and Post modernism. Having considered the range offered I selected to use the theoretical perspective of interpretivism as the philosophy that underpinned this research project. The rationale for this choice was based on the points made by Kant in 1781 (cited in Ritchie et al., 2014) when he argued that there was more than just observation to learn and know about the world. Kant wrote that knowledge came from understanding and this came from reflecting on situations and what happens. In addition, Ritchie et al., (2014) considered that emphasis should be placed on the value of human interpretation of the social world and that significance of both the participants' and investigator's understanding should be considered. On this basis, I intended to focus on understanding existing experiences of colleagues in order to build on these and develop new strategies for supporting their growth as dual professionals in the ETS. In short, I was looking at the effectiveness of teacher

learning and development through the lens of the participants and other external agents.

In this case I established that the research methodology should be of a qualitative design because the epistemology lent itself in this direction with its basis being constructionism. This allowed me to investigate the process and understand the experiences of people and meaning given to these experiences (Hesse-Biber et al., 2006). It was a "knowledge-building process" (Hesse-Biber et al., 2006 pg. 4) with the research process itself at the centre.

Working within a constructionist epistemology I drew on an interpretivist perspective because I wanted to understand the interpretations of all involved and build on these experiences. This theoretical framework encouraged the use of a reflective analysis tool. In this case, the analysis of the data was undertaken by drawing on Srivastava and Hopwood's (2009) model of three questions (chapter four, section 4.9) which provided me with opportunity to reflect on findings whilst also reflecting on my reading and experiences and interpreting, building on and comparing existing knowledge.

Further, this theoretical framework enabled a reflective approach throughout allowing for evaluation of progress and final outcome of the research. This enabled me to identify the elements of the project which were successful, those which could be improved upon and the areas that could form opportunity for further research, strengthening teacher learning and development in the future.

2.7 Chapter Two Summary

This chapter has set the scene for my research project, including the historical context and the current situation regarding support for, and promotion of professionalism across the Education and Training Sector. Through this chapter I have discussed the underlying conceptual frameworks of constructivism built

upon a model of andragogy drawing on social learning theory which has informed the focus of my research topic, including the aims of the research and the questions. This emerged through the literature and research available in this area and my own experiences as an employee of the Sector for 27 years. I have also discussed the theoretical framework of constructionism through an interpretivist perspective which underpins the research methodology and will inform the direction and approach of the research activity.

The purpose of the research activity was to build on other people's understandings and knowledge of the subject matter and make recommendations to the Research College, the Sector and the research field. Through the next chapter I review the work of other educationalists and interpret their understanding of this subject in order to inform my own thinking.

Chapter Three - Literature Review

3.1 Introduction

Having established the conceptual and theoretical frameworks for this project, I reviewed the work that informed these and discuss this in more depth in this chapter. I discuss the historical context of teacher learning and development in the ETS, the current practices of learning and development experienced by teachers and alternative approaches which can offer a more teacher centred approach, based on a constructivist framework (Wilson, 2014), drawing on a model of andragogy and Bandura's social learning theory (Knowles, 1984, Steward, 2009). I also reflected on the professionalism of the Sector, through existing research completed by others and through the lens of the teacher.

To review literature, I used an approach espoused by Slavin, (2007) which included the use of 'best evidence'; in other words, research papers that produced good quality and relevant results which supported each other, rather than looking for their shortcomings.   In order to establish the reliability and quality of the papers reviewed, I drew on Lincoln and Guba's (1985) 'trustworthiness' criteria. This involved four considerations: the credibility of the work, looking, for example, at whether or not there is evidence of extended engagement with the research; transferability, in terms of whether or not the study could be transferred to another context; dependability, pertaining to the research being audited and withstanding challenges from peers; confirmability, in terms of the findings evolving from the data produced, rather than the subjective viewpoint of the researcher. Both the aim of my research and the associated questions were established as a result of the discussions and research of educational experts and Sector or Government papers, supported by my own experiences.

The literature referred to in this chapter was selected for its relevance to the subject, for instance literature which explained, analysed or researched specific subjects: the managerial changes and context of FE since the Second World War and the impact of these on teaching staff; the place and respect for the professionalism of teaching staff and the support and opportunities for teacher learning and development to create a professional status. This also provided me with the opportunity to understand the views of others through an interpretivist lens (Crotty, 1998). All of these sources were based on research undertaken within the Sector, working with teachers in colleges who are typical of the Sector. The research was, in some cases, supported and financed by funding bodies and used to inform national decision-making. The papers reviewed included work by Orr (2008), Webster-Wright (2009), Lloyd and Payne (2012), Robson (1998), Spenceley (2006), Clow (2006), Gleeson and James (2007), Robson, Baily and Larkin (2004), Gleeson, Davies and Wheeler (2005), Shain and Gleeson (1999), Jameson and Hillier (2008), Crawley (2014), Gleeson, Hughes, O'Leary and Smith (2015). In addition to these primary sources of reading, other secondary sources are referenced where I felt they reinforced or challenged arguments.

With the exception of two, the papers read were researched and written since 2000; the two earlier papers are those by Robson (1998) and Shain and Gleeson (1999). Both, however, continue to be relevant in 2019 due to the developments and changes in the ETS and the research into professionalisation of the teaching workforce. Robson and Gleeson are both key academics in the subject of professionalisation of teachers in post-16, vocational education. They have extensive experience and understanding of the Sector and the developments during the last 30 years. Robson is a researcher and writer who has focussed on developments in post-16 education. She was at the University of Greenwich in 1998, but has since been based at the Department of Education Studies at the University of Surrey and now is a writer and researcher, working independently researching areas of specific interest to her or relevant funding agencies. Gleeson is an academic who has led research into sociological issues, but specifically education, over the last 30 years. During this time he has

investigated the professionalisation of the teachers in further education, the nature of vocational education and the issues evident within that Sector; he is now an Emeritus Professor at the Centre for Education Studies at Warwick University and was previously at Keele University.

The rest of this chapter is divided into five sections; the first reviews the historical context which has influenced learning and development of teachers in the ETS; the second reviews approaches and models of teacher learning and development, the third, alternative approaches to be considered, fourth the identified barriers to teacher learning and development and the last, professionalism in the Sector. These sections have been established based on themes emerging from my reading.

3.2 Historical Context of Teacher Learning and Development in the Education and Training Sector

Robson (1998) considered that the change in management style following Incorporation had a significant impact on the structure of colleges and staffing. She pointed out that the priorities of the McNair Report in 1944, that argued teachers should be able to maintain their vocational expertise, became even less important in 1993 following Incorporation and teacher training was never considered a priority. Robson (1998) cited McNair's concern in 1944 that it was not deemed necessary for teachers in this Sector to be trained in pedagogical skills as they were not teachers, but trainers. Teacher training however, was always available to teachers in the post-16 Sector but it was undertaken at the desire of the teacher, rather than a requirement of their employer or the Government (Bailey, 2007).

However, after a number of years of "benign neglect" (Young, Lucas, Sharp, and Cunningham, 1995, pg. 7), with most organisations paying lip service to it, teacher learning and development in the Sector became a Government priority with the development of the strategy, 'Equipping our Teachers for the Future'

(DfES, 2004) and the Further Education Workforce Regulations. This evolved from the Government paper 'Success for All: Reforming Further Education and Training' (DfES, 2002). This paper acknowledged that there were some examples of good practice in teaching and learning in the post-16 environment but these were not consistent across the Sector. It acknowledged that the skills and career development of the teaching workforce had been neglected and there were unhealthy levels of casualisation. Further, there was limited opportunity for improving professional skills or updating subject or occupational knowledge. This legislation was welcomed by the Sector and seen as a turning point in the professionalisation of its teachers.

The Government legislation, Equipping our Teachers for the Future (DfES, 2004) and the Further Education Workforce Regulations introduced dual professionalism and mandatory training and learning and development activity for all teaching staff in 2007 (chapter one, section 1.2). This was to be recorded through the professional body for teachers, the Institute for Learning (IfL). Its priority was to support teachers in the Sector, upholding the professionalism of the teaching workforce and maintaining a code of conduct by which teachers should practice. However, as experienced by myself and teaching colleagues in two colleges, where I was employed during 2004-2015 the legislation appeared to be flawed. For instance, the range of teacher learning and development support required by teachers, to ensure they met all the requirements of dual professionalism, was often not easily available to them; mandatory learning and development days delivered by employers responded to the pressures to meet Government and auditor expectations with focus on development of classroom skills. On reflection, I can confirm that employers did not appear to encourage development of vocational upskilling nor understanding of the teaching context, or participation with the wider post-16 Sector (requirements of dual professionalism).

However despite these shortcomings I noted, as a teacher trainer at the time, that the introduction of the legislation and dual professionalism was seemingly effective and certainly appeared to be improving the professional standards of

teaching and learning in the Sector. Coffied (cited in Lloyd and Payne, 2012, pg. 5) also acknowledged that the reforms for teacher learning and development were long overdue and were a "major advance", and, in 2011, the 157 Group[5] published a report which acknowledged the positive impact of the legislation; it evidenced from Ofsted reports and academic papers that the engagement of leadership in professional learning and development of teachers had improved in terms of the focus on quality of teaching and learning (157 Group, 2012), citing examples of colleges supporting work placements for teachers and vocational upskilling opportunities.

Orr (2008, pg. 103), however, was sceptical about the legislation, suggesting that the dual professionalism model was a "definition of professionalism which is more restricted and prescriptive than in other sectors of education". I agree this might have been the case but as professional recognition was such a new concept for the Sector, I reflect that at that point in time a prescriptive approach to expectations was an appropriate start, giving teachers boundaries and guidance for their development (Boud, 1988).

Despite the positive feedback for this Government initiative, the Coalition Government of 2010-15, on the recommendation of Lord Lingfield (2012), withdrew the legislative requirement for mandatory training and teacher learning and development in 2012. It did however acknowledge that it was essential that teachers should continue to grow as dual professionals. The expectation of the Government was that teacher learning and development should be Sector led. Employers should continue to require teachers to engage with learning and development and continue to support teachers to develop, in a bid to ensure best learning opportunities for all students. As Lingfield had recommended, an employer should be "guided by its own insights and experiences" (Lingfield, 2012, pg. 23).

---

[5] 157 Group was a consortium of influential colleges across the country and commissioned to investigate different aspects of work in the sector. The 157 Group is now known as The Collab.

Gleeson et al., (2015, pg. 1) saw the recommendation of Lingfield as a rather "laissez-faire initiative" which ignored the progress made in the past decade in raising the professional reputation and status of teachers in the Sector. They suggested the risk that without this Government enforcement, there would be limited realistic scope for teachers to be afforded the opportunity to network and engage with communities of practice. This view had previously been expressed by Plowright and Barr (2012, pg. 5) who suggested that there was potential, given the deregulation, for the Sector to develop independent opportunities for dual professionalism, but that there was a greater risk that "[the] employer may resist the development of a profession in pursuit of its own goals".

Following deregulation, the Government published its report, New Challenges, New Chances (2012), which outlined its intention for the ETS to upskill the British workforce for international competition. In response, CAVTL published its report it's About Work (2013), in which it outlined the key requirements and strategies that needed to be adopted by the Sector in order to meet the Government's expectations. One of these key requirements was recognition for a need to support the development of teaching practitioners in both vocational and pedagogic skills as a priority; this was reinforced by the report of the 157 Group (2012).

However, although these reports indicated a commitment to dual professionalism by the Sector I have not seen consistent evidence of this through my practice. My experiences mirrored those described by teachers to Robson et al., in their 2004 research that whilst the ETS encouraged proposals for projects and peer working, as did the DfE and other national organisations, the colleges themselves did not provide sufficient time or opportunity for teachers to engage within their working hours. This situation has not changed in the 15 years since 2004 when Robson et al. wrote their article. It has not been uncommon, from what I have seen, for opportunities for vocational upskilling to be left to the teachers to develop in their own time; this has caused resentment and reluctance to participate. Whilst it is true that as dual professionals teachers

should be given ownership and autonomy to maintain their skills, this should be through a supportive programme which is negotiated with managers. Unfortunately, feedback received throughout my research suggested that managers could not afford to give teachers time to engage in any learning and development other than mandatory activity and from teachers, the typical comment was "I don't have time and I'm not using my holidays". These observations suggested that the Sector was taking the path that Plowright and Barr (2012) feared, that college management teams are focussing on budgetary and academic targets and paying little attention to the need and recommendations for or benefits of professionalisation.

3.3 Existing Approaches to Teacher Learning and Development in the Education and Training Sector

The purpose of teacher learning and development is to equip teachers with skills to teach (Kennedy, 2005; Feinman and Nemser, 2001). Typical approaches in use in the ETS and discussed here (Kennedy, 2005; Broad, 2015; Webster-Wright, 2009; Lloyd and Payne, 2012 and Duncombe and Armour, 2003) do not do this because the approaches are not personalised or in context. All those whose work is reviewed here discuss current strategies for teacher learning and development found across the Sector and they identify that the support and focus of activity is generally the organisational priorities rather than teacher focussed negotiated learning and development. I consider this is short-sighted, by developing the vocational and pedagogic skills of teachers the colleges could be improving the quality of teaching and learning.

Lloyd and Payne (2012), in their research into teacher learning and development in England, Wales and Norway, reviewed that the Foster Report (2005) found major weaknesses across colleges in England, emphasising problems for part time and casual teachers in accessing learning and development and that businesses reported that teachers did not appear to be current in their vocational knowledge. They also discussed that although colleges had reasonable budgets

for teacher learning and development the focus was generalised teaching competence, to meet the organisational needs, or as Broad (2018, pg. 1) put it, "for external compliance requirements". Lloyd and Payne (2012) continued their discussion by citing Coffield (2008) who argued that the funding for teacher learning and development was not being used effectively and there should be spending on opportunities for individual and team activity and reflection that would inform practice. Whilst Orr (2008) was critical of the legislation for mandatory teacher training and learning and development he did acknowledge that the requirement for teachers to reflect on and record their learning and development activity did provide opportunity for them to develop their practice.

Wright-Webster (2009) discussed the concept of professional development, the term commonly used for teacher learning and development, and argued that the term itself is misleading as it implies the 'professional' is deficient and so needs to be developed rather than having an opportunity to engage in self-directed learning. This was also recognised by Mattson (2014) who argued that this interpretation implied that professional knowledge just needed to be 'topped up' with development activities focussing on content through workshops, delivered out of context, or as Wright-Webster (2009, pg. 713) suggested "this perspective reinforces the view of learning as 'filling up' a reservoir of knowledge in a professional's mind that will run dry if left too long".

Analysis of teacher learning and development, by the ETS, in its report on Further Education Workforce Data for England (2017), indicated that, amongst other things, teachers spent on average only 15 hours a year on learning and development and over 60% of teachers reported that they do not engage in any learning and development activity. This was reinforced by the Association of School and College Leaders (ASCL, 2018) which identified through its survey in 2018, Teaching and Learning International Survey (TALIS), that only 50% of teachers in England had reported effective training in their subject fields, internationally the percentage of those satisfied is 71% (ASCL, 2018). The survey also identified that those teachers who engaged in higher quality training,

e.g., active learning, collaborative projects, over an extended period of time was as low as 19% in some regions and increased to only 40% in other areas.

Kennedy (2005) identified nine approaches[6] that together, in her view, formed a good model of teacher learning and development. She argued, as did Feinman and Neimser (2001) that the approaches should be used at different stages of a teacher's career, with opportunity to become more autonomous as he/she progressed. For instance, directed training at the start of his/her career leading to coaching, peer learning, research later in his/her career in order to provide independent and personally relevant opportunity for learning. Whilst all of Kennedy's (2005) nine approaches are known to me, this model as a whole is not currently in place at the Research College, and possibly not across the ETS. Some of the approaches: directed training, standards based learning, cascading and the deficit learning model are evident but as separate entities rather than an on-going programme of learning and development and they are not tailored to meet teacher need but are used for the process of delivering generic development.

Like Kennedy (2005), Webster-Wright (2009) argued that teacher learning and development should be designed for teachers to maintain competence and develop expertise but that success at these is reliant on contextual learning. I acknowledge that development of competence will occur through generic teaching and learning workshops but if it is not situationally focussed building on a social learning model (Steward, 2009) then learning will not be as thorough, or at a deeper level (Schon, 1983, cited in Webster-Wright, 2009) and therefore, opportunities for students will not be improved. In 1983 Schon, as cited in Webster-Wright (2009) challenged the lack of opportunity to relate theory to practice and despite his reputation and influence over education and professional learning the gap between these two concepts still exists. Eraut

---

[6] Kennedy's nine approaches for a good model of teacher learning and development include training, award-bearing qualifications, deficit development, cascade and sharing, standards-based and coaching/mentoring

(1994, cited in Kennedy, 2005) explained that the contexts that are relevant for teacher learning and development should be academic context, institutional context and practice. This is a view discussed by Kwakman (2003), reflecting on experiences of teacher learning and development in The Netherlands. She argued that teacher learning does not take place through transmission of knowledge only, learning needs to be a social learning experience, set in an appropriate context and environment, with teachers taking ownership of the experiences and sharing with others. Putnam and Borko considered (2000, cited in Kwakman, 2002) that learning should be situated in settings in order that the specific goals for the attending teachers can be most effectively achieved. Following this same theme, Tikkanen, Hovdhaugen and Storen (2018) investigated workplace learning, finding that The Netherlands and the Nordic countries are leading Europe in this approach, identifying the significant advantages and benefits of this more informal approach to learning for both the teacher and the employer. In fact Andersson and Kopsen, from Sweden (2015, cited in Broad 2018) argued that for vocational teachers to be experts and maintain expertise in their subject they must engage in informal learning by having ongoing and continuous contact with their vocational sector, sharing with networks or communities of practice to ensure currency in their teaching.

Approaches of teacher learning and development, as discussed here, indicate that Colleges have used activity to ensure that the organisations address and implement auditor and Government reforms in the required competencies (Kennedy, 2005). This, in my view meets the definition for staff development (Marriss, 2018) as explained in chapter one, section 1.2 of this thesis, rather than either the definition for CPD, as defined by the CiPD (2018) or preferably CPL advocated by Mattson (2018) or Talentlms (2018). It demonstrates that the training is required for the teacher to improve to do the job for which he/she is employed rather than to improve his/her personal and professional practice. An example of exactly this approach was shared by Lloyd and Payne (2012), who found, as I have experienced, that it was not uncommon for teacher learning and development to be a mass produced event, through generic whole college staff development days addressing college needs, responding to government or

external auditor requirement. Webster-Wright (2009) argued that to make a change in this approach there was a need to focus on learning rather than the word 'development' so as to move away from the concept that something is being 'done to' the professional and to focus on the professional being engaged in the process and learning through work and with colleagues rather than attending workshops.

3.4 Alternative Approach for Teacher Learning and Development

One approach Kennedy (2005) identified for teacher learning and development was the cascade approach which encouraged sharing amongst colleagues and building on experience. This has not been used effectively in my experience, but if used well could provide teachers with the opportunity to develop professional learning through a constructivist framework (Wilson, 2014).

However, this model of cascading learning is only one aspect of Kennedy's nine approaches model. Research by Duncombe and Armour (2003) outlined further approaches which, as with Kennedy's approaches, supported knowledge and skills development, through a model of continuous professional learning (CPL). They all recognised that effective CPL includes approaches based on constructive learning such as active learning, opportunity for reflection and sharing, learning in situation, ongoing, experimental learning and collaborative learning. These are all essential requirements for any form of workplace learning, in order that people are competent in the future needs of their sector (Malloch et al., 2010). It is acknowledged that teachers are naturally going to become less and less of a vocational expert the longer they work as a teacher, unless they can maintain their network of vocational experts to share with and learn from (Broad and Lahiff, 2019). The concepts of social learning theory and andragogical learning will provide opportunity for teachers to build on existing experiences, experiment with learning and develop opportunity for collaboration, development of communities of practice and situated learning. Teachers would also be able to work together on real life problems within their practice (Webster-

Wright, 2009), enabling them to professionally take charge of their own learning, as suggested as beneficial by Kwakman (2003) and linking learning to practice and updating subject knowledge (Broad, 2018). Two recent research projects by Boocock and O'Rourke (2018) and Tikkanen et al (2018) identify the benefits of drawing on concepts such as those discussed in this thesis, making skills development extremely relevant and effective. Based on this evidence, developing an approach of CPL would enable employers to move away from the knowledge transfer approaches of typical teacher learning and development which are as Kwakman (2002, pg. 150) comments "bound to miss the mark".

Examples of approaches that are advocated as good practice in a model of continuous professional learning each come with its own issues and should be monitored. For instance, teachers involved with communities of practice should be aware of the power struggle that could go on within the community (Webster-Wright, 2009). Situated learning, comes with an assumption that the experiences will be positive, but it is essential that the teacher reflects honestly on these experiences as situated learning, in the work place, might not provide the positive learning outcomes intended due to the combination of teachers involved and their preconceived attitude and views, or levels of experience. When engaging in andragogical learning participants should ensure that they reflect on actions in context as this is the most influential aspect of experimental or andragogical learning (Boud, Cohen and Manion, 1993, cited in Webster-Wright, 2009). However, I consider that being aware of the downside, experiencing and acknowledging the less successful outcomes is in itself a professional learning experience.

It is essential, therefore, that for approaches such as those discussed here to be effective, the organisation supports a growth mindset (Dweck, 2012), encourages experimentation and actively works towards developing a learning organisation culture (Senge, 1992) so that teachers can confidently learn from all types of experience.

Using a framework of constructivism through a model of continuous professional learning requires teachers to critically reflect on learning in order to develop their teaching and collaboration with colleagues (Duncombe and Armour, 2003). By drawing on a simple reflective model such as Kolb's Learning Cycle (Wilson, 2014) teachers have the opportunity to be evolving their own skills, their professional reputation and the quality of teaching and learning for their students. Duncombe and Armour (2003), suggested that reflection provides opportunity for teachers to critically assess the benefits of the CPL activity and develop these approaches as needed to improve future experiences. They also argued that it would provide opportunity to identify where there is a need for a greater level of support for the learning of teachers, through scaffolding or where there is a need to allow greater autonomy. This is what should be expected in a good, high quality model of teacher learning and development, as described by Kennedy (2005) and Feinman and Nemser (2001) and explained previously in section 3.3 of this chapter. The teacher should expect to be able to become more independent in his/her learning, taking on more challenging and complex CPL activity such as research and problem solving projects as he/she progresses through his/her career.

Lloyd and Payne (2012) in their comparative study of further education in England, Wales and Norway experienced a teacher focussed approach, such as continuous professional learning, in Norway. They shared the findings of vocational education teachers who, in Norway, had access to accredited learning for pedagogic development and higher level qualifications in the teacher's areas of professionalism. Across all of the Norwegian colleges they visited they were able to share examples of teacher learning and development which the teachers found beneficial for their own professional gain and the benefit of their students. These included extensive situated learning, opportunities, accredited courses, experimenting with new approaches to teaching and reflecting on their own practice. However, Lloyd and Payne (2012) did emphasise that this was not consistent across their research and amongst the participating colleges across England and Wales there was only one where the teachers were positive about their experiences.

This teacher focussed approach, explained through Lloyd and Payne's research (2012) and advocated by Kennedy (2005) should not be the exception, it should become the norm. Webster-Wright (2009, pg. 1) argued that there needs to be a shift in discourse regarding what constitutes teacher learning and development and a "focus from delivering and evaluating professional development programmes to understanding and supporting authentic professional learning".

3.5 Barriers to Teacher Learning and Development

Through my reading and own experiences there are a number of significant barriers to teacher learning and development which appear not to have been tackled. These include funding for learning and development, cover for teaching; the intense work place dynamics, e.g., additional admin duties, increased expectations of teachers; the attitude and culture of both teachers and an organisation; lack of time for commitment to teacher learning and development and appraisals.

Lloyd and Payne (2012) reported that the teachers who participated in their research from the English colleges identified that the impact of the cost to cover teachers for attending training or development was a barrier. They reported that the cost for learning and development was available but the additional cost of covering the teacher's time out of the classroom was the obstacle. Neither the learning and development budget, nor the curriculum budget was set up to support this kind of expenditure and this meant that often teachers chose not to apply for training because they expected it to be declined. In the same research Lloyd and Payne (2012) gave the example of a college in Norway which supported teachers attending courses on pedagogy during term time and teachers were supported to undertake Masters degrees, taking time out of the teaching periods to complete this.

The decline in funding for teacher learning and development in England has increased since Incorporation and the marketisation of the Sector, as Broad (2015) discussed, there has been a need for increased efficiencies across the Sector due to funding cuts, whilst simultaneously an expectation of an increased curriculum provision. In 2015 the National Audit Office published its report, Overseeing Financial Sustainability in the Further Education Sector. It outlined the financial difficulties ahead for colleges and the need for significant efforts by colleges to reduce costs. This financially difficult situation is visible to staff across the Sector and adds to the need for senior management teams to focus on the 'bottom line' rather than the learning and development needs of teachers. However, the need for negotiated and individually relevant teacher learning and development should still be a priority. After all, the financial crisis across the Sector will only improve when the Sector can support the Government's ambition to upskill the British workforce and it can only do that when it fully supports professionalism and appropriate teacher learning and development.

I have experienced learning and development requests from teachers being declined because they do not directly meet the college's expectations or requirements and, therefore they are not a funding priority. In some instances the teachers have chosen to self-fund the training in order that they can improve and develop their practice. Broad (2015), in her research regarding teachers' perceptions of teacher learning and development, demonstrated that of the teachers interviewed, 14% stated that they chose to self-fund learning and development activity to ensure they could complete it. Others have secured funding through external sources, for example, in the instance of Lloyd and Payne (2012), they noted that the hairdressing teachers often gained sponsorship from product suppliers in order to participate in vocational development opportunities.

Through all the research I have read, time was identified as a significant barrier to teacher learning and development. In fact it was not so much time but the lack of it. Broad (2015) identified that the conditions of work for teachers had influenced this, due to the increased workload and expectations of teachers, including the broadening range of tasks added to teachers' contracts and the

increased teaching hours. She also discussed the change in contracts for teachers, the increase in the casualisation of the workforce with the increase in the number of hourly paid teachers across the Sector, or, as I experienced, the introduction of zero hour contracts. This has had a significantly negative impact on teachers' engagement with teacher learning and development with those on such contracts demonstrating that they were not prepared to commit to additional, often unpaid time at the organisation because they had responsibilities elsewhere. A very significant barrier has been the attitude of employers towards hourly paid or part time teachers and their opportunities for teacher learning and development. Whilst these teachers brought with them the most up to date and current practices in their vocational field they were given limited opportunity to develop their classroom practice because of the delivery constraints of learning and development activity. This was something identified by the Foster Review in 2005 but is still an issue in my experience and was also recognised through research by Jameson and Hillier (2008). Lloyd and Payne (2012, pg. 8) cite one respondent, from an English college as stating that "accessing CPD was a major problem", because of the nature of his/her contract.

Further in their research Lloyd and Payne (2012) identified that teachers had no time to reflect on, or implement, teacher learning and development activity. In my experience teachers do not have time or opportunity to reflect on, or consolidate learning and development. This eventually wears down the motivation and goodwill of teachers and they stop participating. Lloyd and Payne (2012) also identified that although teachers were encouraged to share good practice to support each other they found it difficult to fit this into their working week and consequently reverted to working in silos to meet the essential requirements of their work commitments.

Despite this evidence, some researchers, Webster-Wright (2009) for example, posed the argument that the issue regarding lack of time was actually more to do with the teachers' reluctance to change to meet new expectations. I disagree with this view but do acknowledge that, as Webster-Wright continued, the culture of an organisation can influence teachers' views, perspective and attitude. This,

therefore, influences their commitment to the expectations of their employer (Billett et al., 2006, cited in Webster-Wright, 2009). This is particularly relevant as, in the last 30 years, teachers have seen their job roles changing, their teaching contact hours increasing, holidays being reduced and workload increased (Broad, 2015). They are also dealing with ever increasing social and mental health difficulties in their student groups (Webster-Wright, 2009, pg. 20), all a consequence of the broadening out of the curriculum, lack of training to support these changes and increased demands on colleges since the marketisation of the sector (Lloyd and Payne, 2012). Webster-Wright (2009) cited Hargreaves, (1994, pg. 61) who suggested that the combination of these factors encouraged teachers to have an "implicit rejection of the worth and value of a teacher's repertoire" which clearly summed up the way teachers eventually felt, and also their perceived perception of the view managers might have of teachers.

A further influence affecting teachers' attitude towards teacher learning and development, as recognised by Duncombe and Armour (2003), was that teachers have had many years of poor quality learning and development 'done to them' and are fed up with this approach. Teachers often had little influence on the learning and development they were expected to participate in and it was led by the needs of the organisation rather than their own professional priorities. Broad (2015) discussed that funding was used to fund college required CPD activity and anything else was often self-funded, or, in my experience, did not happen.

A further barrier that I have observed in practice, and has been discussed by Broad (2015) is that of appraisals. Appraisals have been introduced to the Sector through the changes since Incorporation and new managerialism and again, are driven to meet the targets for the organisation rather than the needs of the individual (Gleeson and James, 2007). In my experience appraisals include statistical targets for recruitment, retention and achievement of students and do not address opportunity for negotiating personal and professional goals or learning. Broad (2015) experienced similar responses from teachers in her research who indicated that they had little opportunity to influence their own

learning and development. I consider this to be an important issue because teachers will, over time, lose any respect for the appraisal process and become demotivated in their work if they do not see personal and professional benefits evolving from their appraisal.

3.6 Professionalism

3.6.1 Professionalism in the Education and Training Sector

Professionalism in the ETS has always appeared to be a contentious issue and continues to be so today. Academic writers such as Robson (1998), Gleeson, Davies and Wheeler (2005), Clow (2006), Broad (2015, 2018) and Crawley (2014), have expressed concern about the professional expectations and opportunities for teachers. After the Second World War there was an acknowledged need to develop skills for work and trade; people with relevant expertise were encouraged to train others as the next generation workforce (Robson, 1998). There was an expectation that they should be respected and acknowledged as public sector professionals (chapter two, section 2.2), or as Gleeson and James (2007) refer to them, functionalist professionals, people who have attributes of their role which they share with other occupations and serve in society.

However the challenges to the adopted professionalism of teachers from the Government commenced in 1976, with criticism from James Callaghan; this opened the door to further criticism and continued challenge from the New Right Government in the late 1970s and early 1980s (Shain and Gleeson, 1999). In 1993, Margaret Thatcher's Government introduced Incorporation, which saw the shift in management strategies to a focus on marketisation, although as Spenceley (2006, pg. 296) referenced, it was a "quasi-market place"; the Government still held the purse strings and could steer the Sector in the direction it believed to be the most suitable, whilst placing institutions into a position of competition.

In their 1999 research, Shain and Gleeson discussed the changes in the Sector as a consequence of managerialism and marketisation, recognising that the Sector was in a stage of 'new realism'. They tried to consider the expectations of the teachers, the needs of the Sector and the organisations within it and found that there was a need for teachers to be flexible and reliable, as well as competent in their subject. They identified that in order for colleges to meet the demands of the Government and local market, teachers had to be prepared to broaden their skills base and be much more flexible in terms of their teaching. This took away their sense of professional pride as an expert in their subject, and in fact, as identified by Orr (2008), the driver for teacher learning and development then stemmed from the organisation rather than the teacher, denying the teachers the autonomy a professional might expect. Spenceley (2006, pg. 295) outlined that there was an "increasing emphasis on 'core skills' and the implementation of a 'multi-disciplinary approach to learning' …. rather than a narrow subject expertise", or as Fisher and Webb commented, vocational teachers were now seen as "a Jack/Jill of all trades" rather than a vocational specialist (Fisher and Webb, 2006, pg. 342, cited in Broad, 2018, pg. 12). It continued to be this way, with the recommendations made by the Government advisors such as Leitch (2004), Kennedy (1997), Moser (1999), Foster (2005), Wolf (2011) and most recently Sainsbury (2017), for development of maths and English (core skills) to be at the centre of post-16 education, whether this had been known as core skills, common skills, key skills, functional skills or maths and English GCSEs. The nature of the Sector, as commented on by a colleague of mine, is now seen by some senior curriculum managers as "maths and English with a bit of voc on the side".

Professionalism under new managerialism meant teachers were seen as agents delivering what was required, to a standard judged by others, rather than considered experts in their field (Randle and Brady, 1997). Jameson and Hillier (2008) discussed findings from a survey carried out by the Learning and Skills Sector (LSS) which identified that teachers who responded saw their employers

as 'authority-compliance managers'[7], with a high concern for task and a low concern for teachers. Jameson and Hillier (2006) argued that this approach to management stemmed from the market-led funding principles applied in the decade 2000 -2010. As a teacher in the Sector at that time, I support the respondents' view that the Sector was led in a very autocratic style, with a priority focus on increasing student numbers and associated income. A decade on and some elements of this compliance management style still exist, with the focus continuing to be on income and target setting for teachers through performance management. Anecdotally however, I notice that there is a more supportive approach to management of teachers now in comparison to previous years. This may be because the senior management teams in colleges have started to recognise that the attempt to control teachers does not work with teachers in the ETS "who in many cases, regard themselves as hard-working [vocational] professionals and do not take kindly to over-zealous control by managers" (Jameson and Hillier, 2006, pg. 43). Additionally, on reflection, the senior managers of today were the teachers in 2000-2010 and I like to think that we have learnt from this period and do not want to repeat such an autocratic approach.

In 2007, Gleeson and James reviewed the process of performance management which came with Incorporation. Randle and Brady (1997) explained that initially the appraisal system adopted by the Sector was to review the need for development and training needs and had no connection to salary or reward. However, the system increasingly drew on the quality of student learning with teachers being judged on evidence taken predominantly from quantitative data: success rates; enrolment numbers; observation grades of teaching and learning (Gleeson et al., 2015). A teacher's professionalism was based on (and still is) a grade of 1-4, with the teacher gaining a higher grade if he/she fell in line with the standards and expectations of auditors (internal or external). However, the standards were generic with no differentiation given for the subject matter, level

---

[7] This phrase is taken from the profiles for management established by Blake and Mouton (cited in Jameson and Hillier, 2008).

of students, or nature of the lesson. I know from my own experiences, as did 'Terry' (Gleeson et al., 2015, pg. 83), that if the teacher "knew which boxes to tick" he/she could secure a better grade. I would argue that this did not demonstrate a teacher's professionalism, or quality of teaching and learning, it demonstrated the weaknesses in the system and the teachers' cynicism towards it. Teachers were not being encouraged to develop their values as professionals (those of trust, discretion and competence), or as vocational experts, but, it seemed to me as though the Sector was being de-professionalised (Evetts, 2005; Gleeson et al., 2015), coming back to the point made by Randle and Brady (1997) that teachers did not consider that managers held the same educational values as they did.

Jameson and Hillier's research in 2008 was suggesting this with their argument that UK Government expectations, auditing systems, funding mechanisms and the introduction of managerialism did not allow for trust or autonomy of teachers. Robson et al., (2004) suggested that there was no opportunity for continual development of vocational competence and there was a distinct management shift away from investment in teachers and professional expectations such as autonomy, ownership, responsibility and expert knowledge. Instead, teachers were being steered towards a concept of 'organisational professionalism' (Evetts, 2005). Organisational professionalism does not allow a teacher to practice with autonomy or take ownership of his/her practice, but rather he/she is directed to deliver the expectations of the organisation, as dictated by funding requirements or other constraints (Orr, 2008). With organisational professionalism, as has been reported by Gleeson et al. (2015), came the concept of targets for teachers, grading of teaching practice and judgements of achievement by teachers based on the success rates of their students. This is all organisationally led and so development of the teachers to meet and maintain the required standards are also dictated by this quantitative data. This restricts opportunity for the growth of a vocational expert as a professional teacher within the ETS (Shain and Gleeson, 1999). This has been further reinforced in recent years with the deregulation of mandatory teacher training and learning and development activity for teachers in the Sector (Lingfield, 2012).

3.6.2 Concepts of Teacher Professionalism in the Education and Training Sector

Robson first addressed the issue of teacher professionalism in the post-16 Vocational Education Sector in 1998. She discussed the Sector as being the poor relation in education with a lack of support from the Government or senior management teams. She reflected on the limited progress made in teacher professionalisation during the last 100 years and the lack of professional identity for its teachers. Robson recognised Incorporation to be an outcome of the Sector growing significantly in size, but also one which had no consistent policy for teacher development or professional status (Robson, 1998). This has continued as a theme since and, in fact, in a paper written in 2004, Robson et al. took further the point that teachers in the Education and Training Sector still do not have a professional identity. The discussion has, however, moved beyond the de-professionalisation of the Sector, specifically since Incorporation, to one of what professionalism is and what it means in the ETS. Educational experts and researchers such as Robson et al. (2004), Clow (2006), Colley, James and Diment (2007), Plowright and Barr (2012) and Crawley (2014) write about the typical expectations of a 'professional': respected in the community; working within a code of professional practice; is qualified with Higher Education (HE) qualifications; usually a professional qualification and to put it succinctly, "a distinctiveness …. centred on knowledge, judgement, ethics and self-government" (Hoyle, 1995, pg. 61 cited in Spenceley, 2006, pg. 290). However, owing to the nature of today's ETS, with managerialism, marketisation and the performance management strategies adopted within the Sector, teachers do not typically associate themselves with these characteristics. Therefore in my view, the debate should now progress to one where the question is asked 'what type of professional is a teacher in the ETS, and how he/she can be supported to achieve and maintain this standing'.

In 1996, following Incorporation, Tony Blair's Labour Government prioritised education and acknowledged that teachers in post-16 education should be given their own professional identity. As a result, through the 2004 legislation,

'Equipping our Teachers for the Future' it was mandated that teachers in post-16 education should have their own professional body, the IfL (chapter one, section 1.2). They should comply with a professional code of conduct and mandatory expectation for initial teacher training, along with 30 hours' professional development a year in order to be respected as dual professionals. This was in line with Blair's intention to upskill the British workforce for high level participation on the international stage of industry.

This was the first time any Government had shown this level of commitment, however, its view of professional identity was one of organisational professionalism (as outlined section 3.5 of this chapter), with the IfL being established and led by the Government and employers and expectations being organisational priorities. It was argued by some that this was a problem because it dictated to teachers the expectations for professionalism within the Sector, taking ownership out of the hands of the teachers (Spenceley, 2006; Gleeson and James, 2007; Shain and Gleeson, 1999 and Jameson and Hillier, 2008).

Studies completed by researchers (Shain and Gleeson, 1999; Spenceley, 2006; Gleeson and James, 2007; Robson et al., 2004; and Jameson and Hillier, 2008) supported the notion that teachers in the ETS should be respected as professionals. Each of these studies, however, defined professionalism differently and advocated different recommendations for the nature of the professionalism by which these teachers should be identified. Robson et al. (2004) recognised that professionalism required the teacher to maintain autonomy; they acknowledged that this might be negotiated autonomy, but the concept was central to the identity of a professional. They added that a professional should be respected for his/her specialist knowledge which brought the need for accountability and responsibility and they should be supported to maintain this. It was with this expectation that the teacher needed to be acknowledged as a professional, but that this needed to be negotiated with organisational management in order to ensure that priorities for the organisation and the individual were met.

In her research undertaken in 2006, Clow discussed the nature of a professional in the Sector. She acknowledged that a range of professional types existed within the ETS because the Sector recruited teachers from a range of different vocational backgrounds. All of those people brought with them their existing professional practices, expectations and understandings. Clow espoused that some professionals came into the Sector already recognised within the community as a professional, with what she referred to as 'ex-officio professional standing', that is that their previous role gave them a status in the community. Both Orr (2008) and Clow (2006), reinforced something that I see regularly, that often a teacher's previous profession is the only one he/she recognises; he/she does not see him/herself as a professional educator as well, for example, a plumber who teaches rather than a teacher of plumbing. Orr (2008) considered that this might be why the Government imposed expectations of CPD to support development of dual professionalism on to the teachers.

A further identity described by Clow (2006), was the 'holistic professional'. She suggested that these people tended to be those qualified as school teachers who moved into further education and put more emphasis on the pastoral role than their vocational colleagues. She also separated out the 'supererogatory professional' through her research. Clow explained this was someone who went above and beyond the call of duty. I would disagree with the nature of either of these professional roles as separate identities, I have yet to meet a teacher who does not care about his/her students or their pastoral needs, or would not go beyond the requirements of his/her role for the benefit and best interests of his/her students.

Based on Clow's examples I suggest that all of these separated entities should be combined to form one model of professionalism for teachers within the Sector. I am confident that the teachers do put their students first, carry out their responsibilities for the best of their students and operate autonomously within the boundaries of their subject. What was disappointing however, was that Clow

(2006) and Robson et al. (2004) evidenced that in many cases, the teachers they interviewed did not see that being a qualified teacher was a key requirement for the job. They demonstrated the characteristics of Clow's ex-officio professional, which is that they moved into teaching their vocational subject, however they were reluctant to take up the mantle of 'teacher', or the training that went with this. They saw students' lack of progress as the students' fault rather than their own, due to their lack of professional engagement in their new role (Clow, 2006). This, as Clow put it, was 'restricted professionality' and something that was addressed with the introduction of the legislation for the professionalisation of the Sector in 2004. I support Clow (2006) in her view that teachers who have not mastered the skills of pedagogy and reflective practice are less able to share their expert knowledge effectively. Through reflective practice, teachers are able to recognise and challenge the thinking that a "lack of student progress …. [is] entirely the students' fault" (Clow, 2006, pg. 416).

In 1999, Shain and Gleeson identified that all the respondents in their research had a set of core values that underpinned their vocational subject teaching, including the student learning experience; this stemmed from the values and expectations of their vocation. This was reinforced by Clow (2006) and Robson et al. (2004) in their papers where they also acknowledged that being professional meant different things to different people from different backgrounds. Shain and Gleeson (1999) considered that it was because of this notion that they did not accept that the Sector was yet at the point of having its own professional identity. I agree that in 1999, when Shain and Gleeson carried out their research, the Sector was possibly not ready for its own professional identity. However, I consider that by 2004 and 2006 when Robson et al. and Clow carried out their research and definitely now in 2019, the Sector should support its own professional identity and expectation of teachers. In line with Broad's (2018) view that vocational teachers should show commitment to the requirements of their vocational field and the learning needs of their students, I consider that the professional identity of vocational teachers should include the core values of all the vocational experts and should be underpinned by a sense of pride and self-respect as a teacher with a desire for his/her students to

achieve and commitment to his/her employer. This together with his/her own subject expertise, whatever that might be, should be recognised as the professional characteristics of a teacher in the ETS. This is in fact, the basis of the model of dual professionalism advocated by Robson et al. (2004) as an approach for professionalism in the ETS.

In 2007 the IfL, on behalf of the Government and employers, adopted the concept of the dual professional as its professional identify for teachers. The fact that the IfL was led by the Government and employers raised questions about professional autonomy and accountability by Orr (2008), amongst others. They questioned whether or not the Sector was encouraging development of organisational professionalism or occupational professionalism. However, I think that there is a point where individuals and organisations need to meet and collaborate. As Shain and Gleeson (1999) commented, whilst there was limited collaboration, professionalism could not develop further; teachers need to learn from each other and management needs to negotiate with the teachers in order to enable growth all round. We are now in an era of 'new realism' (Shain and Gleeson, 1999) as part of the marketisation of the Sector and so we are moving away from the public sector professional into a new model, through a period of 'occupational change' (Evetts, 2005). This approach is becoming used increasingly in large service industries, such as the NHS, with a need for identified conducts and practices. Occupational change allows for autonomous professional practice within a network of accountability. We are at the point in the ETS where the Sector deals with market forces competitively and like it or not, organisational professionals as described by Evetts (2005), are what the Sector is looking for. Managerialism steers the professionalism and opportunities for teachers to develop and we must therefore work with this. I consider that this is achievable with an updated version of dual professionalism which incorporates elements of other models of professionalism discussed here.

Lord Lingfield (2012) and his recommendations that the Sector should be self-regulated led to deregulation in 2012, and this was a significant blow to the ETS;

one, which in my view, set the concept of professionalism back 30 years. The change reinforced the organisational professional which Incorporation introduced in 1993 and a standardised approach to teacher training and learning and development changed. What we see now across the Sector is a variety of expectations formed by different employers.

Ideally professionalism in the ETS should be teacher-led, but my own experience and the research of others suggests this is still some way off (Shain and Gleeson, 1999; Spenceley, 2006). Spenceley (2006) argued that within the conventional paradigm of professionality, the professional teacher was seen as the font of subject-related knowledge and that dual professionalism was not needed because being a vocational professional and sharing vocational values with students was enough (Spenceley, 2006). I do not consider this to be the case, the Sector will be even more disparate, teachers will have no common cause, they will be loyal to their subject and their department but not their employer, the Sector or profession and so they would have no sense of belonging. Possibly more importantly, it could lead to inconsistencies in the quality of teaching and learning across the Sector, reinforcing the image of the poor relation.

I consider that the model of dual professionalism adopted by the IfL encapsulated to some extent the elements identified by all of the educational researchers discussed in this chapter. The requirement of dual professionalism to support teachers to be pedagogical experts will support learning, it will help with pastoral care of students and it will broaden a teacher's own thinking and reflective activity, as required by Clow's model of holistic professional (2006) and Shain and Gleeson's identified pedagogical skills need (1999). The second criterion for dual professionalism, maintaining vocational knowledge and skill will ensure the highest quality teaching and training for the workforce of the future and the third criterion, contextual understanding of the Sector, will ensure teachers feel belonging, pride in their role and are motivated to work as professionals within the Sector, thereby removing the ex-officio professional (Clow, 2006). However, the engagement by the employers is essential. The

Sector will not move forward and develop in terms of quality and reputation if there is no investment by both teachers and employers in dual professionalism.

3.6.3 What type of Professional are Teachers?

Although written in 1998, Robson's paper, 'A Profession in Crisis: status, culture and identity in the further education college', is still relevant today. It indicated that teachers' perception of professionalism in the ETS was disappointing in that they generally saw themselves as professionals in their vocational field, rather than professional teachers, or even a dual professional. Or, as I have cited in my research proposal, they are 'plumbers who teach, rather than 'teachers of plumbing' (Coles, 2004). This has long been the case and even back in 1973 Venables (1967, pg. 139, cited in Robson, 1998, pg. 568) identified that until teachers were as well equipped for "solving educational problems as they are about the technical ones" they would not define themselves confidently as teachers, but more as experts sharing their skills. Sadly, the Sector has not prioritised development of vocational experts, and with the deregulation in 2012, investment in teacher training and support by colleges returned to being secondary to meeting funding requirements and targets.

This lack of prioritisation has been detrimental to the Sector, which has consistently seen a high turnover of teaching staff. Colley et al. (2007, pg. 174) reported on research with 24 teachers in the Sector as part of a larger project[8]; the respondents' views of teaching in ETS were that they were "accidental teachers". Sadly, it is not uncommon to see new teachers leaving before they can even develop professional pedagogical skills, because of the demands of the job and the poor treatment they receive when employed in the Sector (Colley et al., 2007). These findings were also identified by surveys undertaken by the Association of Colleges (AoC) in 2001 and Foster in 2005 (both cited in Colley et al., 2007). Both surveys identified a consistently high turnover of teaching staff at 10-11% across the Sector, with many of these teachers returning to their vocational field. Of the 24 respondents in the research by Colley et al., 10 left

---

[8] Transforming Learning Cultures in Further Education (TLC).

FE completely. Reasons for this included introduction of casual contracts and constant fear of redundancy. Whether this was real or perceived fear was irrelevant; Shain and Gleeson (1999, pg. 451) stated that "threats of redundancy have become integral features of college life". When a teacher feels undermined and unimportant, he/she is not encouraged to engage in learning and development and grow as a dual professional, especially when he/she can return to his/her own vocational field as an expert and vocational professional (Robson, 1998).

It is evident now that colleges have to compete in an open market and so must be accountable for financial stability and quality of provision. However this does not mean they have to strip teachers of their professionalism. It is 26 years since Incorporation, the Sector has a new generation of teachers but they still seem to have the same reluctance to develop as dual professionals. This is in part because they still see themselves as vocational experts (Robson et al., 2004 and Spenceley, 2006) but also because they are not being given opportunity or encouragement to grow as dual professionals. Without supporting the ETS teacher and enabling him/her to achieve recognition as a professional, it is my opinion that the Sector as a whole will struggle to progress to meet the requirements and expectations of either the Government or industry.

3.7 Chapter Three Summary

In this chapter I have reviewed literature and research that underpins my conceptual and theoretical frameworks and helped me establish my research questions. The papers reviewed include those addressing teacher learning and development in the ETS over the last 30 years and the alternative concepts of professionalism that have influenced the Sector, both from the view of the Sector and the view of the teachers working in it. Ultimately, I have identified that the processes of teacher learning and development experienced during my time working in the Sector have not supported growth of teachers as professional vocational experts or educationalists and that a programme of continuous

professional learning, delivered through a framework of constructivism drawing on andragogical and social learning theories (Wilson, 2014; Knowles, 1984; Steward, 2009; Malloch et al., 2010; Broad, 2018; Broad and Lahiff, 2019) would be far more suitable, supporting the growth and recognition of teachers as dual professionals.

I have concluded, based on my interpretations from my reading of work by educational academics, that the expectation of a professional in the Sector should build on the concept of dual professionalism but should also incorporate aspects of models identified by Clow (2006), Evetts (2005) and Robson et al. (2004). These will ensure a holistic but focussed approach towards promotion and support for learning by teachers, whilst also ensuring achievement of organisational targets.

The following chapter outlines the research methodology I have used for this project. It is built upon a theoretical framework of constructionism and draws upon an interpretivist perspective to progress through the research and analyse findings as espoused by Crotty (1998).

Chapter Four - Research Methodologies

4.1   Introduction

The purpose of this chapter is to establish and explain the research methodology for this project and how it evolved from the theoretical framework. Having reviewed approaches to research and established my theoretical framework (chapter two, section 2.6.2) and related questions (chapter two, section 2.4), it was clear that my project was a qualitative, insider research project. The research was based at one site, which I felt meant that it was a case study, although this involved three teams of teachers participating from the Research College. This, thereby provided me with three case study groups within the boundaries of one case study.

4.2   Research Paradigm

When planning research the researcher usually has in mind an idea that he/she wishes to follow through. However it is essential that before going on this journey the researcher has established a theoretical framework for the project to ensure it is thought through and has substance.

As discussed in chapter two, section 2.6.2, the epistemological basis of this project was constructionism (Crotty, 1998), which afforded me the opportunity to review existing literature, research and thinking, whilst also drawing from my own experiences. It facilitated me looking for broad views from participants in my research and drawing conclusions through an interpretivist perspective (Crotty, 1998), thus enabling development of concepts which would support formation of the outcome of this project. I believe this led me naturally to the decision that the project was best approached as an action research project

which would inform the practice of the Research College and could inform other colleges of similar size and location across England.

Quantitative methodology is aligned with the positivist theoretical perspective and would be suitable for an objectivist epistemology; it follows a scientific route of inquiry focussing on observation of situations and data analysis, rather than exploring through interaction with people in a bid to understand their perspectives and feelings (Ritchie et al., 2014). Whilst some suggested that this was a suitable approach for research in education (Anselm, Strauss and Corbin, 1990), I reflected that a quantitative methodology would not give me the information and understanding required to develop a new model of teacher learning and development. Qualitative methodology focussed much more on understanding and experiences within the research setting. It is an approach which enables the researcher to understand the experiences of people and the meaning given to these experiences (Hesse-Biber and Leavy, 2006). Qualitative research analyses words and explanations as opposed to numbers and is often considered to be 'soft' research, because it does not measure outcomes as quantitative research would. Qualitative research is a "knowledge-building process" (Hesse-Biber and Leavy, 2006, pg. 4) with the research process itself at the centre of it. Qualitative research is usually undertaken by researchers who are investigating their own area of work as an 'insider researcher'. Experts who support quantitative approaches to research would argue that this leaves the research vulnerable to accusations of bias and being invalid. However, the qualitative approach requires researchers to be open minded throughout, reflexive in their practice as a researcher and use robust strategies to ensure validity and objectivity (Slavin, 2007). A qualitative approach allows for a more creative project as it focusses on responding to participants' feedback and following the direction of the project (Slavin, 2007). My project, therefore, was a qualitative project because qualitative methodology is an approach which enabled me to understand the experiences of people and the meaning given to these experiences (Hesse-Biber and Leavy 2006).

As an alternative, it would also have been possible to use a mixed methodology with interpretivism as the perspective. Hesse-Biber et al. (2006, pg. 316) discussed the mixed methodology as being a "good starting point for beginning [an] inquiry" and that the term "refers to the use of both qualitative and quantitative methods in one study." Greene and Caracelli (cited in Hesse-Biber et al., 2006 pg. 317) argued that by using a mixed methodology the research is strengthened by more comprehensive and insightful findings, thereby providing rigour to the project. However Cresswell (2009) questioned this and argued that consideration should be given to the purpose and priorities of the research and why mixed methodology might be used. For instance, he suggested that researchers should ask themselves whether quantitative data would strengthen qualitative findings.

Both action research and case study are appropriate methodologies for qualitative research, allowing the researcher to actively engage with the research process and participants, whilst establishing the outcomes from this. Yin (2009) acknowledged that case study could be a qualitative methodology based on description, exploration and explanation, although he did state that case study with a more quantitative focus was preferred. Stake (1995) cited in Hamilton and Corbett-Whittier (2013) explored case study from a broad social science perspective and used qualitative methods of research. In the research project being considered here, I saw case study as being a qualitative methodology, in order to understand the experiences of colleagues and develop outcomes at one research site.

The reflective nature of action research, together with the focus being on the journey of research and interpretation of findings to inform that journey, suggests that action research complements the qualitative perspective of research also; this enables the researcher to draw on explanations and interpretations of the participants (Denscombe, 2003). Both action research and case study methodologies are human centred and have holistic and meaningful characteristics relevant to real life research. From both methodologies it is

possible to obtain recommendations and outcomes that are useable in practice and both action research and case study lend themselves to the more analytical questions that will be posed in my research project.

4.3 Research Methodology

Having established that my research came within the constructionist paradigm and should be based on a qualitative methodology, I considered that it was suitable to use action research within the boundaries of case study as my approach. Both action research and case study are appropriate for qualitative research, which enables understanding of the experiences of participants to develop outcomes (Stake, 1995 cited in Hamilton and Corbett-Whittier, 2013).

4.3.1 Case study

There is debate as to whether or not case study is considered a research methodology, Stake (1995) argued that a case study is not a methodological choice but a choice of what is to be studied. Yin, however, commented that case study strategy should be used because the researcher wants to study contextual conditions (cited in Rhee, 2004). Having considered these views I agree with Stake that case study is the choice of what is being studied, however I believe that it is an opportunity for the researcher to focus on a contextual situation, as suggested by Yin (cited in Rhee, 2004). For instance, on this occasion, the project being a case study allowed me to restrict my research to one case (the Research College), focussing on context whilst also being the object of research.

Case study could be based on single cases or multiple cases. I used the Research College as the case study, with teaching teams as multiple cases within the case study. Whether using single or multiple cases, case study is classed as a 'bounded system' (Stake, 2006) which is influenced by the nature of the case(s). The teaching teams participating in my research project, as

multiple cases, were bound by the dynamics of the team and the teachers' roles and responsibilities within the organisation. However the case study itself, the Research College, was bound by the organisational boundaries, policies and procedures established by the Governing body. As I was using the organisation as a case study and teams within the organisation as cases, I needed to consider the policies and restrictions of the organisation, together with the dynamics of the teams with which I worked.

Yin (cited in Denscombe, 2003, pg. 33) explained that the logic for selection of a case comes from the fact that case studies are often used for theory testing as well as theory building and so it was important to test or build the case based on a range of variables. At the Research College all teachers were employed with the same job description and responsibilities, although each team was made up of diverse personalities and operated very differently. Some teams were naturally more positive than others, some more motivated than others. On this basis, using only a single case (one team) would not have been a robust test of a theory or model. I considered that it was necessary to use multiple cases (teaching teams) in the research in order to ensure thorough testing of a model against a range of variables. As Denscombe (2003) commented, the researcher should not select a case purely because of its convenience to the researcher, but should select a case based on its relevance and suitability for the project. Mason (cited in Silverman, 2010) advocated choosing a case which could represent the wider population.

Arthur, Strauss and Corbin (2012) explained that what constituted a case for research purposes was wide ranging. It might be an individual, an event, an organisation, policy or procedure within an organisation. Merriam (1988) recognised this but went further discussing four different types of case study: ethnographic, historical, psychological and sociological. She suggested that an ethnographic case study focussed on institutional culture or particular groups, historical studies were descriptive of phenomena over a period of time, psychological case studies tended to look at one person and the sociological case study researched social structures and the impact on individuals.

Yin (2009) and Stake (1995) also discussed the models of case study that underpin case study research. They agreed on the purpose of these models but they used different terminology. For instance Stake (1995) explained that case studies are either intrinsic, giving a better understanding of a particular case, or instrumental, providing insight into an issue. Yin (2009) discussed case studies as descriptive entities, which compared with Stake's intrinsic case study; he also identified exploratory case studies, to build theories, and explanatory, to test theories. Both of the last two terms by Yin (2009) were comparable with Stake's (1995) instrumental case study. Stake also outlined a further model for case study: multiple/collective case study. He explained that this is used to study a phenomenon, a population or a general condition, that can be on one site or over multiple sites.

In this research project I drew on Stake's (1995) instrumental model, incorporating an element of Yin's (2009) exploratory approach with an ethnographic focus (Merriam, 1988). My rationale for this consideration was that the instrumental model provided me with opportunity to investigate one case study, e.g. the Research College, a good example of a college of general further education (GFE), and so enabled me opportunity to offer findings to other similar colleges across the country. This model also allowed me to investigate from different perspectives, e.g. the teaching teams and their managers (case study groups) so that I had a thorough understanding of the circumstances, demands and political influences on the teachers and therefore, on the learning and development opportunities for teachers. These three groups were selected because they represented typical teacher or manager groups in a GFE college. Through this understanding I had the opportunity to build theories (approaches to teacher learning and development), with the case study groups.

4.3.2 Action Research

Action research is a methodology commonly associated with hands-on small scale research, used by social scientists to solve immediate problems (Coghlan

and Brannick, 2014). As an educationalist John Elliott (1991, pg. 69) described action research as "the study of a social situation with a view to improving the quality of action within it".

Stenhouse (Elliott, 2006) led a project in the late 1960s which was a catalyst for the 'teacher as researcher' movement. Since then, action research has become a popular research methodology for educators. It is enquiry-based, rooted in the practice of the researcher in order to develop his/her own practice. It allows the researcher to engage and participate with research in order to overcome and find solutions to real problems (Denscombe, 2003). Kurt Lewin in 1946 held the view that "research that produces nothing but books will not suffice" (cited in Denscombe, 2003, pg. 74) and argued that the purpose of action research was to enable the researcher to investigate problems within their organisation and work with colleagues to find improvements.

Coghlan and Brannick (2014) discussed four different approaches to, and purposes for action research, they described them as quadrants. Having considered these I have developed this project based on their quadrant two description. That is that there is no intended self-study-in-action with my project, because I was not responsible for teacher learning and development. However, it is a project that is of organisational benefit, addressing an organisational problem which will find solution and improvements for operational action. However, it should also be borne in mind that whilst I consider it to be a quadrant two action research project there was an element of this project which came within the framework of Coghlan and Brannick's (2014) quadrant one. That is that it was a project being completed for an academic purpose. It is of interest to my employers but will be evaluated on the quality and rigour of my academic project rather than the success of it being embedding across the Research College.

The methodology of action research is cyclical in nature, with each cycle being reflected upon and influencing the next cycle of research. The cycles of

research are set in real-time and the purpose of the first is to establish the context of the project (Coghlan and Brannick, 2014). In this instance, with the theoretical framework based on a constructionist epistemology drawing on a perspective of interpretivism, the first cycle of research was informed by the work of others who had already researched this field.

Zuber-Skerritt (1992), and later Coghlan and Brannick (2014) outlined four elements to the cycle of action research: planning, acting, observing and reflecting. McNiff and Whitehead's (2002) common-sense approach to action research was that we review practice, identify how we want to improve, consider a way to move forward, experiment with alternatives, reflect on activities, try it again, evaluate and move forward. Whether I opted to work with Zuber-Skerritt's approach or McNiff and Whitehead's common sense approach, the process would be the same in that the cyclical process alternates between action and reflection and as the cycles progress, a greater understanding of the research matter is developed in order to reach the outcome of the research (Dick, 2002).

Each stage of an action research project goes through these reflective and cyclical elements and the findings of one stage influences or informs where the research goes next. This makes the research extremely responsive to the participants, the researcher and his/her findings. This project included three cycles (or stages) of research. The first was established by the research and writing of educational researchers as discussed in chapter three of this thesis. This work identified the views and experiences of teachers across the ETS over the last 20 years which provided me with the understanding to be able to plan and use an initial questionnaire (stage one) for the teacher groups at the Research College and interviews with managers from other colleges (stage one). In this instance the action stage was the research activity and the reflection or evaluation included the analysis of data as well as reflexive thinking regarding my own impact on the process and participants.

The outcome of stage one identified themes for further investigation. These informed the focus of stage two research activity which included discussions with the teacher groups and the Director of Quality. I also completed an online questionnaire with the hourly paid teachers and analysed documents from the Research College, notes of conferences and Ofsted reports. The themes were established more thoroughly by this stage and allowed me in stage three to look at these from a different perspective, drawing on interpretation of discussions with the Executive Directors at the Research College and further unstructured interviews with teachers and the Director of Quality at the Research College. I consider that in a cyclical research project reflection is crucial to the progress made between the stages of the research activity and steering its direction. Considering the cyclical nature of action research, I worked with my participants through questionnaires and interviews, sharing experiences with the different participants and reflecting on the outcome and feedback before moving on to the next stage.

The reflective approach adopted for my research project was intended to be based on Schon's (1991) 'reflection-on-action', retrospective reflection occurring after the event. However, due to changes and developments throughout my research activity, I found myself also working with Schon's model of 'reflection-in-action', adapting and developing my research activity as I progressed. It should be noted though that this was not only reflection as part of the research process but reflection on the project and its progress (Coghlan and Brannick, 2014). Within both of these frameworks I adopted Mezirow's three forms of reflection (Coghlan and Brannick 2014). Mezirow espoused the use of 'content reflection', allowing the researcher to think about the issues and what is happening; 'process reflection', thinking about strategies and procedures, in other words how things are being done and how they could be improved and the final form, 'premise reflection', critiquing underlying assumptions of the researcher. This is also associated with reflexivity (Coghlan and Brannick, 2014), looking at the processes being used by the researcher in an honest and self-aware way. It should be emphasised that the stages of reflection had a purpose, in that they informed the progress of the research by providing actions which I took forward

to bring about change. These stages provided me with a framework for honest reflection to ensure as objective and unbiased an approach to my research as possible.

It was important that I demonstrated skills as a reflexive researcher, concentrating on the construction of knowledge through the research, considering the effect of my presence as the researcher throughout, monitoring and challenging the process as it unfolded and establishing next actions based on my reflections (Coghlan and Brannick 2014). This took the form of a log of reflective notes, which included my reflections on the impact and influence of myself on the process (Smyth and Holian cited in Sikes and Potts, 2008). These notes were recorded as a method of research, thus informing the progress and direction of my research.

As a member of the Senior Management Team (SMT) at the Research College, I had weekly meetings with the Principal and SMT colleagues, which informed my reflective notes throughout the duration of the project. The meetings provided food for thought around the needs and expectations of the organisation in terms of a robust teacher learning and development programme, which in turn informed the next cycle of research. Understanding the organisational need at operational and strategic level was essential to ensure that a recommended model for teacher learning and development achieved the aims set out in this research (Scales et al., 2011).

Wallace discussed the idea that action research does not have to be only solution focussed but that it is also possible to use it for encouraging social and political change (Carr and Kemmis, 1986 cited in Wallace, 2013). With this in mind and considering Stake's (1995) view that the purpose of using case study is to develop or test theory, my intention was to find a solution and develop a model for improved teacher learning and development and become a model of best practice. The intention was that the outcomes would inform changes to existing practice, thereby incorporating the ethos of both case study and action

research. Both methodologies required engagement with participants and it was hoped that all parties would gain something positive from the experience.

4.4 The Research Participants

Sampling is key to the quality and robustness of a research project because the information gained from the sample groups should be a true interpretation of what the whole population would experience. The population of the research college is approximately 400 teachers and 400 support staff. The focus of this research is the teaching community. Of the 400 most (80%) are employed on full time or part time contracts and the other 20% are hourly paid teachers who teach specialist units on courses, evening classes or on leisure learning courses at the college's outreach centres across the region. It is essential that the sample groups are a true likeness to the whole population as this will influence the validity of the research project (Cohen et al., 2011).

In order that I undertook a worthwhile and purposeful research project that provided me with information to help inform a model of teacher learning and development, it was essential that I established suitable sample groups from the total teaching population (Cohen et al., 2011). In a small scale project such as this it was not feasible to engage with all teachers so I adopted purposive sampling as my approach and created sample groups or case study groups, which were most representative and typical, of the whole population at the Research College (Cohen et al., 2011) (appendix 2).

Bailey (2007, cited in Cohen et al., 2011), argued that it is imperative that the researcher has a good understanding of the nature of the full population so that a suitable sample of that population can be selected as sample groups. As a college of GFE the Research College is not untypical in terms of the make-up of its teaching staff. It employs people who are experienced and experts in their vocational career, whether that be hairdresser, plumber, accountant or musician.

This wide range of vocational professionals all view their role as teacher differently, bringing to it the traits of their vocational expertise. For instance, a hairdresser is usually very customer focussed and keen to do a good job, an accountant will be efficient with a good eye for detail and a musician will have a creative flair and, based on my experience, not inclined to conform. For example, they often will arrange their own learning and development because they find the cross college activity to be irrelevant to them. Additionally, some, for instance the accountant, will teach classroom based learning whereas the hairdresser will lead practical workshops with students developing the skills of hair cutting and styling. Each type of course (practical or theoretical) will require a different approach to teaching and attract a different nature of teacher. Therefore my sampling groups needed to address all of these factors, e.g., include samples of teachers who do not conform, who are creative, logical thinkers, leading practical learning and classroom based theoretical learning, covering full time, part time and hourly paid teachers and be atypical of the range of teachers employed at the Research College and across the Sector (appendix 2).

I was confident that I understood the nature of the population; I had been employed at the Research College for some time and have worked in the Sector as a teacher and manager for over 27 years. I had a very good understanding of the demands on teachers, their working conditions and the political scene in which they worked. This knowledge and understanding made it possible for me to select sample groups which represented the population of the Research College effectively. I was also confident that by selecting sample groups which represented teachers at the Research College, I was also selecting groups which represented the teaching population of similar GFE colleges across the country, thereby, strengthening the generalisability of the outcomes of this research project.

The purposive sampling strategy that I adopted to select the sample groups ensured I considered four criteria: consideration of sample size; the

representativeness of the population; my access to the sample; their access to me and the nature of the research with which I engaged (Cohen et al., 2011). These criterion were essential because I did not want to cause anyone any inconvenience, anxiety or unnecessary work but I did want to get a good understanding of their experiences to ensure they thoroughly represented the nature of the teachers at the Research College. Bryman (2012) argued that there is a risk with purposive sampling because it can be difficult to relate the findings of the sample to the whole population. This is a risk that must be considered when forming the sampling groups and analysing data.

In order to gain a good understanding of prior experiences and perceptions of learning and development and to develop a model suitable for a diverse range of ETS teachers, I chose three teams of teachers from the Research College as my sample of the teaching population. These were hourly paid teachers, the Performing Arts team and the Business and Finance team (appendix 2). All teachers bring with them different work and ethical values, attitudes towards professionalism, experiences and levels of qualification based on the vocational sector from which they have come. Often those employed as hourly paid teachers are active professionals in their own vocational area, for instance law, accountancy, hospitality, performing and fine art, engineering, science. Some are also qualified as teachers of post-16 education but others are not. Those from the Business and Finance team (appendix 2) had been employed previously as business managers, administrators, retail assistants, lawyers and accountants and had chosen to change career; they are also qualified, or in training, as teachers of post-16 education. Teachers from the Performing Arts team (appendix 2) were often still practising performers, musicians or multimedia designers, all highly respected and well qualified in their field and also qualified, or in training as teachers of post-16 education.

This mix leaves a learning and development team with the difficulty that all of these people think and operate in very different ways, with different approaches and attitudes towards their role and responsibilities as a teacher. Often teaching

is a second career and there is a tendency for them to see themselves as 'a plumber who teaches' rather than a 'teacher of plumbing' (Coles 2004, Clow, 2006).

The reason for the selection of these three participant groups was that each represented a section of the teaching population. With the Performing Arts teachers (appendix 2) I was able to ensure that I had representatives of teachers who led practical learning experiences; tended not to conform to college expectations, were creative and often still involved in their vocational field in some way. The Business and Finance teachers (appendix 2) delivered theoretical, classroom based learning; were customer focussed, keen to be efficient and thorough. The hourly paid teachers (appendix 2) were typical of hourly paid teachers from across the college. Typically hourly paid teachers might be people who are still actively involved in their vocational field or they might be school teachers with subject specialisms who have moved from school teaching in to adult education. Through discussion with their line managers I was able to establish that two members of the sample group fell into this latter category and the other three members of the sample group were still employed in their vocational subject, they taught a few hours a week and had excellent vocational skills but needed support in developing pedagogical skills.

All of the sample groups outlined above comprised teachers who were typical of those in a GFE college. They were at different stages of their working life, some qualified as teachers, others not, all with good experience in their vocational field. All had very different demands for a learning and development team. For instance, the Performing Arts teachers needed opportunities to maintain their practical skills and knowledge. The Business and Finance teachers needed to ensure that they could keep up to date with latest legislation, law, industry regulations needed in their various subject areas, as well as accessing the latest equipment and techniques used in their Sectors. Both needed support in on-going development of teaching and learning practices, suitable for the nature of learning typical to their vocational fields.

The hourly paid teachers however, needed to be supported with development of pedagogical, rather than vocational skills. These teachers often only taught one or two hours a week, so it was not realistic for the college to demand they trained to be fully qualified teachers. However, they did need support to plan a good lesson with suitable resources and strategies for effectively assessing learning. Additionally, these three groups comprised very different personalities and had different levels of commitment to their roles as ETS teachers. The combination of the teachers within each group was a typical representation of the range of teachers employed across the college (appendix 2), thereby forming suitable purposive sample groups (Cohen et al., 2011). Two of the sample groups were easily accessible to me for interviews and discussion, the third group, hourly paid teachers, was not as accessible and the majority of my work with this group required me to move from my original plan of group interviews to a more accessible on-line questionnaire (chapter one, section 1.3). It was essential that they were not inconvenienced or put to any unnecessary cost.

I also worked with the Executive Directors of two of the teaching teams at the Research College and the Director of Quality (appendix 2). The Executive Directors had very specific focusses for professional development of teachers; their areas of growth were quite different and these needs influenced their expectations of learning and development. Like their teachers, they were all educated and experts in their own vocational field, but all were qualified to at least first degree level and had participated positively in management training provided by the College. Again, like the sample groups of teachers, the Executive Directors were a true representation of the Senior Management Team at the Research College, or, for that matter, at any GFE college (appendix 2).

In order to compare experiences, I visited another GFE college (College A) with similarities to the Research College in terms of size, student population and rural location. I also visited a vocational education college in Melbourne, Australia (College B) with similar cohorts of students and teachers. The purpose behind

these visits was to understand the strategies and approaches adopted by other similar organisations for their teacher learning and development. At the time of my Research College A was an 'Outstanding'[9] college (Ofsted, 2014) and I considered it would have been useful for my research to be able to understand what the learning and development team had done to support and develop its teachers and to reflect on these activities in the context of the Research College. The Australian Vocational Education Sector has an excellent reputation for the quality of its provision and the teaching and learning. I was interested in understanding how they maintained this high standard and what support they had in place for the learning and development of their teachers.

4.5 Insider Research

There are times, such as in this project, where the researcher is 'inside' the research, this should be acknowledged as part of the research process and the view of the researcher should be considered as part of the findings. Bryman (2012) argued that it is impossible for research to be completely neutral and that the views and values of all participants are important to the interpretation, even the view and values of the researcher.

Despite the circumstantial changes that I had to accommodate (chapter one, section 1.3), this research project was an 'insider researcher' project (Coghlan and Brannick, 2014) although, as discussed in chapter one, I was researching an issue within the Research College but through the lens of an observing manager. Coghlan and Brannick (2014) suggested that this put me in the position of an external researcher. However, in my view, although I can step back and look on the situation with more objective eyes, I do consider that I still have a greater level of understanding of the organisation and the situation than a true outsider would have. This is because I am within it and so consider that

---

[9] Ofsted make judgements of educational providers in order to grade the quality of the provision. The grading is numerical, 1-4 but each numerical grade has an adjective attached to describe it. Grade 1 is Outstanding, grade 2 is Good, grade 3 is Requires Improvement and grade 4 is Inadequate.

during the research activity I was still able to take advantage of being an insider researcher as described by Stenhouse (1975) and Robson and McCartan (1993). For instance as an insider researcher I understood the historical context, the challenges, the current situation and the organisational expectations. Robson and McCartan (1993) also suggested that there were practical benefits in terms of accessing participants, arranging research around the organisational activity and having a greater level of trust from the participants than an outsider might have. In terms of practicalities I certainly experienced the advantages of being inside the organisation. I was in a position to adjust my meetings in order to fit in with the timetables of the teachers and meet them in their areas of the college to ensure they felt comfortable and in control of the situation, or they had the power in the situation (Merriam, Ming-Yeh, Youngwha, Gabo, Mazanah, 2004).

Merriam et al (2004) explained there are issues of insider research to be considered and they refer to these as positionality and power. These form the basis of some disadvantages that must be considered. For instance, with regard to positionality, Merriam et al (2004) discussed that just because the researcher is like the participants there should not be an assumption made that the participants will see this as a positive. In their article they reflected on case studies completed by Johnson-Bailey (1999 cited in Merriam et al, 2004) where participants did not trust the researcher because although she tried to empathise with them and show the connection she had with them with regard to culture, ethnicity and upbringing, they did not believe she came from the same background and culture as them and so were suspicious of her. Relating this to my own situation, I might consider myself an insider researcher because I have been a teacher and understand the teachers' situation (in my mind). However the teachers probably saw me as an outsider because they had never known me as a teacher but only as a senior manager. I reflect that this will have influenced the attitude of teachers towards me and the level of honesty that I could have expected from them.

Robson and McCartan (1993) suggested that a further issue relating to positionality is one of over-familiarity, meaning that participants might try to take advantage of the project, they do not take the research seriously; or dealing with sensitive situations with colleagues could cause difficulties with maintaining objectivity. In my experience I did not find participants being over familiar or trying to take advantage of the situation and I would suggest that the participants were not more trusting of me or my intentions. In fact, on reflection I can recognise that in the second stage of research activity responses from some of the teachers and the Director of Quality were not as honest as I would have hoped and more honest responses were gleaned from the third stage interviews. For example, in the first interview with the Performing Arts teacher group, they were very positive about an opportunity they had for one of their team to go to London on a two week industrial placement with an animation company. They explained the experience and the benefits for them all, commenting on what the teacher brought back to the team, benefiting both themselves and the students. Similarly, the Director of Quality, during her first interview with me was very supportive and positive about the College's approach to teacher learning and development. She talked about the wide range of learning and development available for teachers, the opportunities she made available and the commitment to learning and development by the SMT.

I did consider that I was being told what participants thought I wanted to hear and that they were being cautious about how open they could be with me during these first interviews but I chose at that stage not to challenge it. There was a gap of approximately four months between the stages of research and during this time participants had seen that there had been no detrimental effect evolving from my research, I had not reported my findings to SMT, no one had got into trouble and nothing had changed in their working patterns. As a consequence, participants seemed to be more relaxed and open with me in the stage three interviews. I believe that by this stage the participants recognised that I was a practitioner "trying to develop …. practice" (Munn-Giddings, 2012, cited in Arthur et al, 2012, pg. 71). In the next round of interviews the teachers were critical about the strain on the team with one member being away for two weeks.

However they did acknowledge that the benefits far outweighed the disadvantages and that they would work together to do this again. The Director of Quality was also more open in the third stage interview, acknowledging that the SMT member directly responsible for teacher learning and development paid lip service to it, that the reports to Governors were written with a positive slant to show a lot of activity but that this was not a true reflection of learning and development activity. Again, I believe this more relaxed approach was because she had not seen any change in circumstances at the college during the period between our interviews.

A further concern being raised by Merriam et al (2004), was that of power. They discussed that power should be a positive outcome of a research project, giving the participants power to influence aspects. However, they also discussed the impact of power as a result of the role or position of the researcher. They described the power they had in their research, in their positions as 'professors' which gave them access to participants more easily than otherwise. This is something that I had to consider in my project. As a senior manager at the Research College I was able to use my power, if I wished, to select the groups of teachers and colleagues I wanted to meet with. Whilst I worked hard not to use this power, I had to acknowledge that it was more than likely that those who did participate felt some level of obligation initially because it was a senior manager asking them to be involved. Reflecting on this risk, I encouraged teachers to take ownership and use their power to arrange the interviews and their participation around their schedule and availability, reassuring them that I would fit in with them. In fact, in terms of the hourly paid teachers I changed my approach completely so as not to inconvenience them. This was my attempt to put the power into their hands (Merriam et al, 2004).

Munn-Giddings (2012, cited in Arthur et al, 2012) highlighted further problems that might occur if the insider researcher came across stressful, sensitive or difficult situations during the research activity and Robson and McCartan (1993) suggested there were issues around remaining objective and managing this

whilst working in close proximity with the participants. I addressed these concerns by adopting Robson and McCartan's (1993) view of trying to foresee issues of conflict, or stress and finding approaches and strategies to deal with these before they became an issue. I was also fortunate in that operationally I did not have day to day engagement with the participating teachers and so this enabled me to be one step removed and remain as objective as possible.

Despite the acknowledged issues associated with insider research, I would argue that research in education should be carried out by the practitioner as this will increase the chance of it being useful and productive for the researcher, the participants and the employers (Stenhouse, 1975). It might influence how the teacher develops his/her practice, interacts with his/her student group or approaches to learning to meet the needs of his/her students. In this instance, as an insider research project it was possible for me to investigate experiences of practitioners from across the organisation, providing me with the depth of understanding to establish outcomes and recommendations for changes that were not only specific to the case study groups, but relevant to the wider population. Insider research does however bring with it the risk of bias and subjectivity; it was essential to scrutinise results throughout the process to ensure objectivity. This was managed by sharing transcripts with participants for their review and comments (Silverman, 2010).

4.6 Risks, Validity, Reliability and Objectivity

Due to the fact that action research and case study are often used for small scale research, they bring with them associated risks (Denscombe 2003). One such risk is that the findings might not be considered relevant to other organisations in a generalisable way. Denscombe (2003) suggested that neither action research nor case study methodology are suitable for generalisation of research findings because of the small scale nature and scepticism from others about the findings. Thomas (cited in Arthur et al., 2012) challenged the rationale that a case study can be representative, arguing that the case study will be

relevant to a specific context and so has limited relevance to others. Yin (2009) was also sceptical and did not believe that the findings of a case study could be used to generalise for a population because in his view, a case study should be testing something that is specific to the research or funding organisation. Stake identified that case study could provide naturalistic generalisation or "conclusions arrived at through personal engagement in life's affairs" (Stake, 1995 pg. 86). In response to sceptics such as Yin and Thomas, I would argue that the anticipated outcome of my project would not only be relevant to the Research College but would be suitable for consideration by other similar sized GFE colleges across England. These colleges have the same purpose as the Research College and they all employ the same diverse range of teaching staff. This view is reinforced by Niederkofler, cited in Swanborn (n.d.), who argued that if the case study is to be taken as research methodology based on constructionism, as mine was, then the researcher is looking to "expand rich theoretical frameworks …. useful in analysing similar cases".

A further risk to my chosen methodology was that as an 'insider researcher', it was unlikely that I was totally detached and impartial in my approach to the research, giving a high risk of bias (Cohen, Manion and Morrison, 2011). This and potential subjectivity could have put the credibility of the research at risk. In any qualitative research but particularly one with an interpretative perspective there is a high risk of confirmation bias; as the researcher is relying on the experiences and explanations of participants and his/her own interpretation of these. It is easy to become attached to a view that supports the hypothesis or desired outcome of the research, or interprets information that confirms a pre-existing belief of the researcher (Cohen et al., 2011). It was essential that I understood the inherent biases, emphasised and acknowledged these and minimised the effects as far as possible (Shuttleworth, 2015). It was also important to note that bias was not only a risk due to my preconceived view as the researcher, but also through each aspect and research method employed throughout the research project (Cohen and Manion, 1994). On this basis, bias needed to be addressed and reassurances given through the use of both valid and invalid findings (Gomm, Hammersley and Foster, 2011). It was essential

therefore that both subjectivity and bias were acknowledged and that strategies to check the validity of my work were rigorous (Denscombe, 2003). Gomm et al. (2011) explained the importance of identifying the invalid as well as the valid findings, stating that this allowed the researcher to explain both sides of the story, whatever the outcome. Yin (2009) reinforced this viewpoint by suggesting that there was a risk of bias only if the researcher used the findings to substantiate their existing point of view. Bennett's solution to this risk was that if research contradicts your experience, use it as an opportunity to reflect on what you already do (Bennett, 2013, pg. 60).

Norris (1997) identified that quantitative and qualitative methodologies are very different, with different outcomes and so it is inevitable that the approaches to validity and reliability for either would be different. Cohen et al. (2011) explained that validity of quantitative research should be faithful to the positivist principles of quantitative methodology in that there is evidence of controllability, that it is without context and there is possibility of replicability. Whereas, validity of qualitative research is measured through the description of the context of the research, the role of the researcher within the project and the strength and rigour of the processes used to undertake the research rather than purely the outcomes. The data is analysed in an inductive manner from the perspective of the participants and presented from their viewpoint, rather than that of the researcher's. Maxwell (cited in Cohen et al., 2011) argued that validity should be about proving authenticity and relevance to the context, rather than measuring and analysing statistical data.

As my research was based on a qualitative methodology, the focus on validity and reliability demonstrated the recognition of the need for investigation; the authenticity of my research practice was addressed through the use of an open and honest approach with participants. The initial need was identified through the reading completed to establish the conceptual frameworks, demonstrating validity initially for the project. To demonstrate validity throughout the project, I used research methods that encouraged participants to express opinions of their

real experiences within the context of the Research College; all transcripts were shared with participants to check for accuracy (appendix 1). It was intended that the findings from the research would reinforce the validity of the research process in that they would provide useful and relevant information on which to build a model of teacher learning and development. This approach was designed to validate that the research findings truly represented the phenomena, were fit for purpose and that they were reliable because they were consistent (Hammersley, 1990). Beyond this, it was also essential to consider that this research was an insider research project and so inevitably had a risk of bias, therefore further efforts to demonstrate validity were deemed necessary.

Guba and Lincoln (cited in Denzin and Lincoln, 1994) proposed two criteria for assessing validity in a qualitative study: credibility, whether the findings are believable or transferability and whether the findings applied to other contexts. The suggestion of credibility can be met through reflection and consideration of both valid and invalid outcomes of the research, and the issue of believability could be addressed by establishing the generalisability of the findings to colleges of GFE across England.

Reason (1999, cited in Coghlan and Brannick 2014, pg. 15) advocated the use of reflexivity, responding to findings as they evolve and allowing for the influence of the researcher on the process. Silverman suggested two different forms of validation for qualitative research. The first is triangulation, comparing different kinds of data taken from at least two different research methods, for example, observation and interview and using these to corroborate the findings, checking for emerging themes and patterns, similarities and differences. The second is respondent validation taking findings back to the participants for their view and comments (Silverman, 2010).

Smyth and Holian (2008, cited in Sikes and Potts, 2008) discussed whether or not insider research can be objective. They argued that if it is based on a qualitative paradigm and constructionism as an epistemology, then the

researcher will inevitably be embedded in the research and cannot be seen as separate from it. It was inevitable that as an 'insider researcher' my own cultural understanding of the organisation and the Sector was subjective and so influenced my interpretations of participants' comments and experiences. Smyth and Holian (2008, cited in Sikes and Potts, 2008) pointed out however, that an 'insider researcher' has the luxury to participate in, reflect and report on events as they naturally occur, allowing for greater understanding to inform the outcome. The researcher would need to ensure that he/she was reflexive. That is, that he/she responded to naturally occurring findings directly relevant to participants, whilst also taking account of the impact and influence of him/herself in the process. As discussed previously (chapter 4, section 4.3.2), Mezirow's three forms of reflection (1991, cited in Coghlan and Brannick, 2014), if used honestly, provide opportunity for reflexivity. I incorporated all three of Mezirow's forms of reflection through Schon's (1991) models of 'reflection-on-action' and 'reflection-in-action' and considered the approaches, the outcomes and further strategies in order to move the research on to the next cycle.

Validity, reliability and objectivity of the research were all essential components if the outcomes are to be taken seriously by either the Research College or the Sector. In this instance, as a qualitative research project, focus of validity and reliability was to demonstrate that the findings were believable and transferable and so could apply to other contexts (Denzin and Lincoln, 1994). In an attempt to validate findings I intended to follow three strategies, credibility, based on analysis of valid and invalid findings advised by Gomm et al. (2011) to ensure objectivity; Reason's recommended approach to reflexivity and Silverman's model of respondent validation.

These methods complemented each other in that they considered a combination of outcomes, reflections, opinions and thoughts of participants. Those who have written about reliability (Hammersley, 1990; Denzin and Lincoln, 1994; Silverman, 2010; Bapir, n.d.) all agreed that a consistent approach through a variety of research methods would strengthen the reliability of a research project, thus making it credible and offering wider relevance. Silverman's (2010)

recommendation of triangulation evolved through this project naturally to some extent, because of the range of research methods used. It was not, however, a deliberate approach to checking validity. I considered that triangulation was more suitable for a mixed methodology research project, where there was greater opportunity for a range of research methods to provide alternative forms of data for analysis, e.g. quantitative and qualitative data.

4.7 Research Methods

When working with action research and case study methodology, there are a broad range of methods of research which are suitable for a constructionist approach. Both Crotty (1998) and Cohen et al. (2011) advised a variety of methods which can support each other and enable reflective development of the research cycles. Having considered a range of methods of research, I came to the conclusion that those proposed for this project needed to be designed to gain a sense of understanding and experience from the participants. This would help me draw on the interpretivist perspective, building on the combined knowledge and experience of participants (Ritchie, et al., 2014). These methods included questionnaire, group interviews with teachers and managers, visits to other education providers and analysis of documentary evidence. I also maintained my own reflective notes of the research project.

After the review of literature to provide the basis of planning for my research the next stage (one) was a questionnaire completed by all teacher participants. This was supported by gaining an understanding of teacher learning and development activity at other organisations, through discussions and visits to other educational providers. Having completed this cycle, I reflected on the responses from the questionnaires and visits to inform an approach to learning and development. The next stage (two) of research comprised interviews with the case study groups of teachers and separately with the Director for Quality to establish the requirements of learning and development, from both the perspective of the organisation and its teachers. Once again, reflection at this

stage informed the next stage (three) of activity, which included further interviews with teachers and the Director of Quality, as well as interviews with Executive Directors and an on-line questionnaire with the hourly paid teachers. Alongside this, I continued my reflective notes reviewing the progress, outcomes and next steps.

4.7.1 Questionnaires

Questionnaires were used in two different formats, the first was face to face with the teachers of Business and Finance and Performing Arts and secondly, in the form of an on-line questionnaire for the hourly paid teachers (appendix 6a and 6f).

In the first instance, questionnaires were distributed to participant teachers to establish their expectations and current perception of learning and development. The second questionnaire was distributed as an on-line questionnaire, the purpose of which was to understand the hourly paid teachers' experiences of learning and development. In both there was some limited quantitative data collected, but I was looking for qualitative information. These tools were based on Schon's (1983) approach to 'problem setting' questionnaires, in that the questions were designed to gain an understanding of where participants were in terms of their attitude, opinion and experience of learning and development. As explained in section 4.3.2 of this chapter, the first cycle of action research is informed by external information to set the context of the project (Coghlan and Brannick, 2014). In this instance, it enabled me to develop a research methodology that provided me with opportunity to draw on an interpretive perspective of the work, opinion and experiences of others (Crotty, 1998). Therefore, having considered and reflected on literature by educational researchers I was able to use this information to focus the questionnaires of this project. From both questionnaires (teacher questionnaire and hourly paid teacher online questionnaire) I wanted to be able to understand the experiences of participants, this was so that I could then compare the findings with the knowledge I had already gained from my reading and pull together common

emerging themes for the subsequent cycles of research. Cohen et al. (2011) reinforced my thinking that drawing on prior understanding to develop questionnaires could be useful in providing a structure to a research project.

The design of the questionnaires was considered very carefully; Cohen et al. (2011) suggested that a questionnaire is always an intrusion into the life of participants, even if only because it takes time for them to complete. Consideration was given to keeping the questionnaires simple, short, to the point and sensitive to the circumstances of participants (Cohen et al., 2011). These authors/researchers emphasised the need to consider the purpose or aim of the questionnaire carefully and the influence of this on the structure of the questionnaire. For instance, they suggested a questionnaire should be sectioned with broad themes feeding into specific questions around the theme, in order that useful data can be gained from it. Wilson and McLean (1994) discussed an alternative approach to designing a questionnaire, which involved identifying the research problem and designing the questions to draw out the relevant information, in a bid to give the researcher a greater level of understanding. Both approaches, Cohen et al. (2011) emphasised, expected that the questionnaire should be clear in its purpose and ask appropriate questions. Wilson and McLean's (1994) approach to questionnaire design reinforced my own decision to follow the Schon (1983) 'problem setting' approach to questionnaire design for both tools. This helped draw out information to provide me with a thorough level of understanding of the teachers' experiences and views of learning and development.

Both questionnaires used in my research were distributed to small groups of people, either face to face (teaching teams) or by email (hourly paid teachers) and were of a semi- structured style, using open questions seeking qualitative, rather than quantitative responses in the most part (Cohen et al., 2011). It was important that questions did not lead respondents or make presumptions about understanding or prior knowledge. This was particularly difficult in the situation of 'insider research,' but was essential so that the credibility of the research could not be in question. One approach that I adopted, to avoid any

presumptions or misunderstandings, was to pilot the first questionnaires with a small group of teachers prior to distributing it to the participants of this research. This was to ensure that I had worded the questions so that I was not leading or influencing the participants, the questions could be understood by the participants, they were appropriate and addressed the specific areas needed and nothing that was unnecessary, whilst also ensuring that the instructions on the questionnaire were clear and easy to follow (Cohen et al., 2011). By piloting the questionnaires I was also able to trial the analysis tool that I adopted for this project. Finally, piloting of the questionnaire strengthened the validity of my research because the pilot demonstrated that the questions had been designed and redesigned to address specific, key areas of interest to the research, without misleading the participants or presuming any prior knowledge (Wilson and McLean, 1994 cited in Cohen et al., 2011).

Design and structure of the questionnaire was crucial in terms of encouraging a good response rate (Cohen et al., 2011). Consideration was given to when and how the questionnaires were distributed. I recognised that there were associated difficulties with using questionnaires, particularly for instance, that the response rate to questionnaires such as this was often low (16% cited in an EdD Study Block lecture). However, with over 25 teachers included in the sample groups, I considered that this was the most time effective approach to gain a general perception of attitude towards learning and development. To overcome the issue of low response rate, I distributed the questionnaire face to face in meetings with the Performing Arts and Business and Finance teachers.

In terms of making contact with the hourly paid teachers, because of their work and life commitments it became apparent early on in the research that an on-line questionnaire was going to be the most direct approach and the most effective. I used the same principles in designing this as I had when designing the teacher questionnaire. However, I did not distribute the on-line questionnaire until the end of the stage two research activity and so used information gained from stage one to inform it. The on-line questionnaire was distributed to nine hourly paid teachers, five completed it.

4.7.2 Interviews

Group interviews were used for the ongoing progress reviews with the Performing Arts and Business and Finance case study groups (appendix 6c and 6d). These interviews were face to face. To ensure consistency in the research method, the interviews were conducted as group interviews and I made suitable arrangements to conduct these in a way that was convenient for the case study group members. This required me to complete the Business and Finance interviews in two small groups, because their timetables did not afford me the opportunity to see them all together.

There are different approaches that can be taken for group interviews: structured, semi structured or unstructured. It was my intention that I would use unstructured interviews, or as Lavrakas (2008) describes these, conversational interviewed; as Punch (2009) explained, these were open ended with a broad overview of the purpose and focus of the interview, as opposed to structured interviews where pre-established questions are used and responses to each question noted. Punch (2009) identified that unstructured, ethnographic interviews are becoming increasingly popular in educational research, as they open up the opportunity for extremely rich data. I considered them to be suitable for my research because as Slavin (2007 pg. 149) stated, "this in-depth type of interview attempts to capture the perspectives of various participants ….." It was exactly these perspectives from the range of participants that I needed to understand, in order to progress my research. The same approach was used with the Executive Directors, again using open-ended unstructured topics, with the intention that they were open discussions and enabled a broad range of views and opinions (Cresswell, 2009). These interviews provided opportunities to identify and reflect on the operational needs for learning and development to meet the demands of the College's Strategic Plan and vision for its students and stakeholders (appendix 6e).

As with questionnaires, it was essential that during interviews I did not lead the participants with my themes, but allowed discussions to flow in a natural direction. I could not presume any level of prior knowledge or understanding and I ensured that participants were given fair opportunity to respond as they saw fit. Participants needed to be able to express opinion in an unstructured group interview, particularly if I wanted to gain an honest view (Punch, 2009). Whilst unstructured interviews did not have questions to follow, for the purposes of validity and objectivity I had a range of topics as a focus for each interview, which enabled me to hear what participants had to say on specific topics of relevance in an unrestricted manner. This approach was managed by gently guiding the participants if they were drifting away from the main purpose of the interview (Slavin, 2007).

In addition to group interviews with case study groups and Executive Directors, I also interviewed learning and development managers from other educational organisations (appendix 6b). The purpose of these interviews was to understand different learning and development plans so that I could compare approaches. This helped me reflect on the strategy for learning and development adopted at the Research College to meet expectations of stakeholders and external auditors, whilst also supporting growth of dual professionals. These were one-to-one interviews but were still intended to be unstructured in order that I could gain open views and opinions of participants. As with all of the interviews, these were based on identified themes so as to provide some focus (Cohen et al., 2011).

4.7.3 Documentary Data

Punch (2009) suggested that documents are a rich source of data for social science research and I would consider that this also applied to educational research. These were opportunities in my project for me to incorporate information gained from meetings, reports, feedback from observations of teaching, learning and assessment, Ofsted inspections, internal quality reviews and staff surveys. As case study was the overarching framework of my research

project, Hammersley and Atkinson (2007, cited in Punch 2009, pg. 159) suggested that documentary data could provide a "rich vein of analysis". This was certainly the case in this project; for example, a recent Ofsted inspection identified priority areas for learning and development for teachers at the Research College, as did the organisation's self-assessment report (SAR). The UCU Staff Survey gave an indication of teachers' views towards learning and development and ongoing observations of teaching, learning and assessment, informed the basic teaching and learning training requirements for individual departments. Some might question the validity of inclusion of this documentary data, but I would argue that these documents are secondary data, used to reinforce and validate the primary sources of evidence.

4.8 Ethical Considerations

Ethical consideration must be given to research before a project can commence and, therefore, it was necessary to submit an ethical application (appendix 3) for my research to the Ethics Board at the UEA and gain permission from my employer to undertake the research. Within the application I clarified that I was seeking voluntary informed consent from participants based on my disclosure of actions and activities at every step and how I would use the data (appendix 4 and 5). I needed to anticipate the risks and tensions I might experience and have strategies in place to manage these in order to avoid causing harm or embarrassment and ensure credibility of the research (Smyth and Holian, 2008).

The research methods themselves were considered ethically to ensure that they did not cause offence, the nature of questions in questionnaires and the focus for interviews were sensitive to the participant groups, they were free of bias, not misleading and were explained clearly to the participants (Cohen et al., 2011). Participants were advised that the research avoided putting them in an embarrassing or difficult situation and they were advised of the time commitment needed by them. All participants had capacity to give consent, they were all professional adults, over the age of 18, all worked in the ETS in a position of

responsibility. Participants were encouraged to acknowledge whether they were voluntarily participating or feeling obliged to take part in the research and for them to withdraw if they felt they were not fully volunteering (Hamilton and Corbett-Whittier, 2013). They were made aware that they had a right to withdraw at any time and all participants were fully briefed prior to any activity on this project. They were advised of their rights as participants, which included confidentiality of information, for example my assurance that I would not disclose any personal details. I did not consider that it was realistic to offer full anonymity to participants, as the research was taking place in one organisation and it was quite feasible that terms used by some participants would be recognised and they would therefore be identifiable (BERA, 2011). To ensure transparency in my research, consideration was given to ethical implications throughout the research project. All participants were offered the opportunity to review the data obtained at each stage of the project to ensure validity and ethical conformity (Coghlan and Brannick, 2014), (appendix 1).

As a researcher engaging in insider research (Coghlan and Brannick, 2014), consideration was given to issues associated with researching colleagues as participants and also the needs of the College and its stakeholders; as an employee of the organisation at the heart of this research I needed to be mindful of both commercially and personally confidential information, I needed to be aware of not divulging potentially embarrassing information relevant to any participant, the organisation or its stakeholders (Coghlan and Brannick, 2014).

Ethical risks associated with the proposed research fell into three categories, firstly the risk for the participants; the risk here was the potential for emotional distress and frustration. This was mitigated against by managing an open and honest project, ensuring transparency at every stage. The second area of risk was to the Research College; these risks included the risk of negative impact on the College as an employer, reputational risk within the Sector and among its stake holders. By reflecting on each stage of my research, this risk was either avoided or pre-empted. The third risk was to the project itself and included reluctance by case study groups to participate, withdrawal by participants and

the research organisation putting an embargo on publication of any research findings beyond the boundaries of the organisation. In the first two scenarios I planned that reluctant participants would be asked to participate in an informal exit interview to establish their views of the project to that point. This information would then be included in analysis of final data and findings, ensuring an objective approach through the use of valid and invalid findings (Gomm et al., 2011). The risk of the College putting an embargo on publication of research would be mitigated against by reflecting thoroughly at stages throughout the project in order to identify issues of risk or concern and taking steps to overcome any risks.

4.9   Data Analysis

Data analysis is a fundamental part of a research project and should be undertaken rigorously and thoroughly. It is essential that analysis of data can confirm validity and reliability of the data and that the methods used are suitable for the nature of research, that is that the method is complimentary to the theoretical framework, providing opportunity to support the expectations of this. The analysis of data should be able to provide responses to the research questions and should demonstrate how the research undertaken in this project compares to the literature reviewed to inform the conceptual frameworks (Ritchie et al., 2014).

Reflective cycles of learning underpin action research in order to develop practice (Lewin, 1946) and it is necessary that the analysis of data undertaken at each stage or cycle of research, is completed so that findings can inform the next stage, or cycle. It is also important that the approach sits well with the theoretical framework. Therefore, in order to develop my research thoroughly and move it forward it was essential that each stage evolved out of the last through my findings and my own reflective thinking and provided opportunity for me to draw on an interpretivist perspective (Crotty, 1998) to understand and interpret the experiences of participants (Coghlan and Brannick, 2014). The

nature of qualitative analysis is that it is "fundamentally an iterative set of processes" (Berkowitz, 1997, cited in Srivastava and Hopwood, 2009, pg. 3). This means it is a reflexive process, building on themes evolving from each stage of the research, leading to fine-tuned insights. This seems to complement action research and its cyclical and reflective nature. However, when reading Srivastava and Hopwood (2009) I was reminded that in order to be a reflexive researcher, it was essential that in addition to reflecting on findings I was aware of my own views and the influence of these on the research process and data analysis.

Punch and Oancea (2014, pg. 219) stated that "qualitative analysis is a process of continuous search for patterns and explication of their meanings, …… which aims to generate rich accounts of the phenomena studied (and liken them to literature)". I considered, when reading about data analysis, that this seemed to sum up the process quite simply and therefore when considering approaches to data analysis, I selected the straightforward approach advocated by Srivastava and Hopwood (2009). This method focused on the need to visit and revisit data through the use of three questions. This allowed me to achieve a deeper level of understanding and interpret and reflect on the data to be able to understand and develop a theory based on the feedback of participants (Crotty, 1998). Srivastava and Hopwood's (2009) three questions are: 'what is the data telling me?' (Subjective lens), 'what is it I want to know?' (research objectives), and 'how are the two linked?' By underpinning my analysis with this model, I was able to look closely at what was being said (question 1) and how it related to the conceptual frameworks thereby ensuring objectivity (question 2). This second question also enabled me to bring my findings back to my research questions and Srivastava and Hopwood's (2009) third question, 'how are the two linked?' allowed me to compare data with my questions and find the gaps. These gaps then formed the basis of the next cycle of research. This approach complemented the interpretivist perspective of my theoretical framework (Crotty, 1998) and ensured my analysis of data was valid and objective.

Within the boundaries of Srivastava and Hopwood's (2009) straightforward approach to understanding data, as described above, I found it necessary to use a method which brought structure to this analysis and created a logical basis for my understanding and interpretation. With this in mind, I considered approaches by a variety of theorists including Miles and Huberman's interactive model of analysis (2009, cited in Punch and Oancea, 2014); Tesch's 10 principles of qualitative data analysis (1990, cited in Punch and Oancea, 2014) and Wellington's six stages of analysis, also cited in Punch and Oancea (2014). I also considered whether or not to analyse data manually or use an electronic tool such as NVIVO. However, having investigated the advantages and disadvantages of using such a tool, I elected to analyse data manually. The main reason for this decision was that use of electronic analysis tools is of benefit to large scale projects with more than one researcher involved in collecting evidence (Guest, MacQueen and Namey, 2012). My project is a small scale project with relatively straight forward methods of research being undertaken by myself.

Ultimately, I based my method for analysis on thematic analysis. Huxham (2003, in Coghlan and Brydon-Miller, 2014) offered thematic analysis as the most appropriate approach of data analysis for action research. The purpose of this method of data analysis was that it grouped findings into themes that occurred through the different methods of research used. By using this approach I was able to analyse the findings from questionnaires and interviews completed in the first stage and this information informed the next stage. Coghlan and Brydon-Miller (2014) considered this to be the formative analysis of the data which would ultimately inform the summative analysis at the end of the project. Eventually themes would be used to verify my conceptual frameworks and conclusion (Bryman, 2012).

I developed a matrix to record emerging themes, as suggested by Bryman (2012) because it was a straightforward approach to "ordering and synthesising data" (Ritchie, 2003, pg. 219, cited in Bryman, 2012, pg. 579). The matrix provided a methodical aspect to my analysis and supported the iterative reflexive

approach advocated by Srivastava and Hopwood (2009). As a result, I was able to consider the identified themes and develop my knowledge, from that of others, as with the interpretivist perspective of my theoretical framework.

A thematic analysis matrix was a useful process which helped me categorise and understand the data and make some sense of it. In this instance, I adopted a matrix which allowed me to count the number of responses to each theme, recognise and develop patterns, group themes and relate my findings back to the conceptual frameworks and research questions. Robson and McCartan (1993) identified seven stages to theming which included counting occurrences, patterning and recurrences, grouping themes, regrouping, relating variables, creating networks and then relating the findings to the conceptual frameworks. I recognised that when analysing the data, these stages occurred, but it was not in such an explicit manner.

In the case of my research, theming took place at each stage, in order that themes could be identified and used to inform the next stage of research. I used this not only to develop the focus for group interviews, but to also monitor the value and relevance of my original questions and validate the themes.

Whilst thematic analysis is useful for understanding and finding themes from interviews, questionnaires, observations or other methods associated with people, I recognised that Slavin's (2007) recommendations for documentary analysis also had to be adopted. Slavin (2007) advocated a "systematic study of documents" which required thorough understanding of key aspects of the documents in order to recognise the context, so that they could be interpreted correctly (Jupp, 1996 cited in Punch and Oancea, 2014). To achieve this and to ensure validity, I based my documentary analysis on Hammersley and Atkinson's (1995, cited in Punch and Oancea, 2014) series of questions used for organising documents: How are documents written? How are they read? Who writes them? Who reads them? For what purposes? On what occasions? With what outcomes? What is recorded? What is omitted? What assumptions are

made by the writer about the reader? I incorporated these questions into my analysis and like my analysis of interviews and questionnaires, the findings from these were included in my data analysis matrix, in order to give an overall picture of the themes and findings as they emerged.

Using this method provided me with the opportunity to collect evidence of reported practice at the Research College, the findings of external auditors, as well as conference notes relevant to my research topic. I compared these with findings from group interviews to provide supportive or contradictory evidence, which gave an indication of the success and effectiveness of current practice. I ensured that I also considered Srivastava and Hopwood's (2009) model of reflexive questions so that the themes could be compared across all data.

Alongside my matrix I annotated my notes from interviews, the questionnaires and any documents to ensure that these could be reviewed and understood by myself in future reference and also help others who might consider my findings for generalisable use (Wisker, 2001, pg. 253). Analysis of data through these methods for text and field work ensured that I continuously reflected on the relationship with my conceptual frameworks and brought my analysis and findings back to my research questions, supported identification of gaps and ultimately, outcomes.

4.10 Chapter Four Summary

The original proposal for my research project was based on it being an action research project. I intended to use this methodology to empower the teachers by participating in the research to find their own solutions and develop a personalised model of professional development. Having read Yin (2009) and Stake (1995) however, I recognise that case study also has its place in my research.

Wallace discussed that action research does not have to be only solution focussed, but can be used to influence social and political change (Carr and Kemis, 1986 cited in Wallace, 2013). Based on this view, I considered that whilst my research project was fundamentally solution focussed, its purpose was to also develop a theory or model of best practice, changing existing practice, interpreting and building on experiences and views of participants through an interpretivist perspective (Crotty, 1998). Action research enabled ongoing investigations into experiences and approaches of teacher learning and development and building upon these to develop a new model. This was strengthened by being carried out within the framework and boundaries of case study, which focussed on testing and building on theories (Yin 2009). This combined approach gave me scope to test a theory or model of teacher learning and development, in order to help find possible solutions to a problem within the Research College. The research therefore fell into the multiple/collective case study model, drawing on an instrumental, or exploratory and explanatory model (Stake, 1995 and Yin, 2009). It had an ethnographic focus (Merriam 1988) and enabled me to understand how different aspects of a model or theory of learning and development could work for different cases.

By using action research with case study as an approach to insider research, it was possible for me to investigate experiences of practitioners from across the organisation whilst providing opportunity to reflect on progress and respond to outcomes. This allowed me to delve deeply to understand the detail and complexities of relations and processes, whilst establishing the intricacies of why something did or did not work. The combined methodology allowed me depth of understanding and facilitated outcomes and recommendations for changes that were specific to the cases involved in designing a suitable model of teacher learning and development. This provided me as the researcher and my colleagues as the participants, with some level of ownership of the outcome (Denscombe, 2003), thereby ensuring a robust and relevant approach to qualitative research within a constructionist framework.

The following chapter identifies the themes emerging through data analysis and the key data informing these themes.

Chapter Five – Report of the Analysis of Findings

5.1 Introduction

In order to develop my research in line with the theoretical framework of constructionism, it was important that I had opportunity to engage in research activity that supported inductive research methods and drew on interpretation of views of the situation and experiences of others (Crotty, 1998). To this end, what follows is the outcome of the analysis of my research findings concluding with a summary of the key points that have emerged as a result of my analysis.

As an action research project my research activity was undertaken in cyclical stages with the outcome of one stage informing the next. Data for stage one of the research was collected via a questionnaire (appendix 6a) and interviews with managers (appendix 6b) of teacher learning and development at other organisations in England and Australia. The outcome of this informed stage two interviews with teachers at the Research College (appendix 6c) and interviews with the Director of Quality (appendix 6c) which then informed stage three, further interviews with teachers and the Director of Quality (appendix 6d) and interviews with two senior managers at the Research College (appendix 6e). Alongside this I managed an on-line questionnaire with hourly paid teachers (appendix 6f), and drew on information from a range of document sources. Nineteen respondents completed the initial teacher questionnaire, of these, nine continued as participants in the research and engaged in group interviews.

The interviews were carried out in two groups: the first was with teachers from the Business and Finance department (four participants) and the second was with the Performing Arts teachers (five participants). In both instances, I met with teachers following a day at work and encouraged an informal group discussion. I wanted the group interviews to be informal, because I was keen for

the teachers to be honest and speak openly. I considered that this would be more effective than a more structured approach (Punch and Oancea, 2014).

Interviews with the Director of Quality, responsible for learning and development at the Research College, the Head of Teacher Development at another English College (College A) and the Vice Principal for Curriculum at a college of vocational education in Melbourne, Australia (College B) were all one to one, conversational interviews (Lavrakas, 2008), following an unstructured format with themes to guide the discussions rather than a series of questions, as you might expect in a more formal interview (Punch and Oancea, 2014). The interviews with the Director of Quality at the Research College and the Head of Teacher Development at College A followed the same line of enquiry, which was to establish the purpose of teacher learning and development for the organisation, the college priorities, how the college supports vocational upskilling and barriers to teacher learning and development that teachers might experience.   The purpose of the interview at College B was to understand support for teachers and learning and development in post-16 education in another part of the world, for comparison purposes. Australia, and the State of Victoria particularly, has a good reputation for vocational education with College B being "a leading Victoria vocational education provider known for its collaborative and creative approaches to education" (SI, 2015).

Due to work commitments and workload, I was only able to meet two of the four curriculum Executive Directors, who are members of the Extended Senior Management Team (SMT). I chose to proceed with this small group interview in order to be able to continue with my research in a timely manner. As with the other interviews in stage two of my research, the themes that were the focus of the meeting were: dual professionalism; vocational upskilling; approaches and planning of CPD; barriers to CPD for teachers and the organisation.

Similarly, due to other commitments, instead of interviewing some of the hourly paid teachers at the Research College I settled for an on-line questionnaire to

gain understanding of their experiences of learning and development. This was completed during the second stage of my research because of the difficulties of making contact with them rather than because I wanted to pick up on the themes of the previous stage of research.

As a secondary form of evidence I collected documentary data for analysis. It included reference to the 2016 Ofsted report for the Research College, internal reports on the observation of teaching, learning and assessment, reports on teacher learning and development, my own reflective notes maintained throughout this project, my notes and those of colleagues written up during the Research College's Ofsted inspection and my own notes of a key note presentation at an Association of Colleges (AoC) conference in 2015. As with all other findings from this research and in-line with the framework of action research (Coghlan and Brannick, 2014), the data from these documents were analysed and informed the next stages of my research. In addition, I analysed research recently undertaken by the Education and Training Foundation into workforce development.

The themes emerging from my questionnaires and group interviews with teachers have been strengthened by their appearance as themes in interviews with the teacher learning and development managers of the Research College, College A and College B. These themes are: college need, with the sub theme of planning and on-going learning and development; appraisals/performance management; approaches to effective learning and development; allocation of time; vocational upskilling; dual professionalism. Whilst there were different phrases and terms used by participants I was able to group these into specific themes. Each theme that emerged from the first stage of my research was quite independent of the others; no overlaps occurred and no redundant or disappointing strands emerged. All the themes emerging were reinforcing themes identified in research I had read and so were reinforcing the conceptual and theoretical frameworks that I had drawn upon to inform and underpin my research.

By focussing further on the themes identified, my hope was to understand the teachers' interpretation of dual professionalism and their expectations of it. I also hoped to establish what they saw as their responsibility for maintaining dual professionalism and gain some thoughts about how best it could be developed and maintained. I intended to challenge teachers and managers on the priorities of teacher learning and development and how the focus could be moved to vocational upskilling.

My analysis of the data was based on the reflective model of three questions established by Srivastava and Hopwood (2009), as discussed previously (chapter four, section 4.9). I analysed each method of research following this reflective model and created a table of responses, identifying themes that were emerging from each question based on the principles of thematic analysis (Bryman, 2012). Although my research activity was cyclical with one stage of research informing the next, the analysis of the data is shown here by theme, identifying emergence of the themes and how these were informed.

5.2 Approaches to Teacher Learning and Development (including on-going Learning and Development and Training)

5.2.1 College need

This theme has been identified at every stage of the research activity and can be found through the questionnaires, interviews and documentary evidence. The theme evolves from feedback which suggests the college prioritises its organisational need for development over the personal and professional need of individuals and relates to my research questions 1.2, 1.3, 1.4 and 1.5. The evidence to underpin this is:

- Eighty nine percent (seventeen) of participants felt that they had access to a range of CPD activity that was focussed on meeting their perception of the college priority, which is to achieve an Ofsted Grade 1, or Outstanding outcome;

- Seventeen respondents (89%) consider college CPD activity to be generic and irrelevant to them;

- 50% agreed some team activity has been useful in the past when it was planned for a specific college initiative;

- All respondents commented that on-going CPD activity, e.g. courses and workshops with specific purposes have been useful and beneficial to both teaching and learning and vocational development;

- One respondent commented CPD activity is reactionary to external influences;

- Eighty nine percent (seventeen) of respondents commented negatively stating CPD was tick box, blanket, dull, generic and compliance based.

Interview - College A

- CPD is designed on a three year basis, with a plan which is reviewed annually, it is informed by the self-assessment report, quality assurance requirements and strategic objectives of the Governing body and prioritises feedback from Ofsted and other external auditors and Government legislation. Three themes are taken from this each year and developed across the college;

- The college has an annual conference which includes reputable key note speakers but focuses on the annual themes;

- The college has a week in July for cross college CPD;

- College need dominates CPD activity.

Interview - College B

- All CPD is negotiated and is designed to meet the ASQA Standards for the teachers and the college. Attendance at CPD is included in the teachers' scheduled duties;

- Maintenance of the ASQA basic skills set for subject competence and teaching competence must be met and maintained.

Interviews - Research College Director of Quality

- CPD plan is in place but is reactionary;
- Aim is to achieve Ofsted grade 1;
- All college CPD is focussed on TLA to be 100% good or better;
- Four days a year for CPD activity;
- Regional conference which all staff are expected to attend.

Interviews – Business & Finance (B&F) and Performing Arts Teaching Teams

- B&F team frustrated by the approach used on cross-college CPD days – tending to focus on compliance or Ofsted requirements.

Documentary Data

- Staff Development Report 2017 - a broad range of CPD available for teachers to address TLA need in response to Ofsted report and other auditors, e.g. observers, external verifiers etc. Also extensive programme covering college initiatives;
- Ofsted feedback notes - need for on-going CPD in basic classroom practice, e.g. target setting, challenging questioning.

Interviews – Executive Directors

- College need too generic – should be developed to meet team needs, responding to team self-assessment reports;
- Team self-assessment reports do not inform college CPD.

Responses to this theme seem to be in line with each other in that college priority is the dominant influence on teacher learning and development planning and activity. However, it does seem as though teacher learning and development is generic and too broad reaching which suggests it does not address the needs of all teachers. College B does not appear to have the same issues as those colleges in the UK because of the legislation in place directing the expectations of learning and development for colleges and teachers.

5.2.2 On-going Teacher Learning and Development

As with other themes identified through this research, this theme has been discussed at every stage. The responses from the different groups all show a similar picture of the limited effectiveness of cross college learning and development and the benefits. In contrast the College B interviewee focussed on a supportive approach to learning and development. The themes relate to my research questions 1.1 and 1.5. The evidence to underpin this is:

Teacher Questionnaire

- Five respondents found internally planned and purposeful CPD to be useful; in this instance they were referring to specific college sessions to develop skills for embedding maths in vocational lessons;

- The majority of respondents (seventeen) identified that activity which was not generic but had been negotiated and planned to meet specific team or individual needs, was far more beneficial;

- Seventeen teachers confirmed they attended the college CPD events and eleven (58%) of those respondents found the college CPD to be either very useful or of some use;

- One teacher had completed action research as CPD in 2015 and found it to be extremely beneficial to her teaching and personal growth;

- Whilst the respondents did not appreciate the blanket approach to cross college CPD activity, citing it to be "generic" and of "little relevance", they did appreciate the opportunity to network;

- All respondents acknowledged the importance of vocational upskilling and five also recognised the importance of continuing to develop their pedagogic skills;

- None of the respondents listed cross college CPD as a way to develop their own skills; One hundred per cent of respondents showed a preference for a greater use of peer review, specific training workshops and cross-college networking and sharing;

- Two respondents listed the need for CPD on college systems;

- One person commented that he/she was happy with the CPD available.

Interview - College A

- Team research projects have been run in the past to develop skills/knowledge/practice within team selected subject areas but most didn't complete;
- Research activity was repeated for a second year, research subjects decided by SMT - uptake was very poor, completion also poor;
- College A has tried to run weekly CPD workshops but they were unsuccessful;
- College A offers cross-college CPD activity during a training week in the summer and a Teaching and Learning conference in February;
- CPD Plan should be informed by the Teaching and Learning Group comprising teachers. However, the group is led by the Principal and Head of Teacher Development feels that the teachers are cautious about what they say or suggest;
- Remission of time is not available to support CPD activity;
- Payment for teachers to attend CPD is not available.

Interview - College B

- Development of teachers' academic skills is recognised as a priority at College B, with grants being available for practitioner-led research. Grants range from $3,000-$5,000 (£3,000-£8,000 approximately);
- Teachers are encouraged to engage in exchange visits, industry secondments, vocationally specific qualifications and postgraduate study, including PhDs;
- On-going programme of CPD for teachers through the Teaching and Learning College, a centre within the organisation that has a team of teacher educators and coaches for both classroom based learning and e-learning;
- Teachers are paid to attend CPD workshops in the Teaching and Learning College, or they can access on-line CPD sessions or webinars;
- Teachers are supported through group activities or one to one coaching sessions, as is deemed most appropriate;

- Teaching and Learning Enhancement team run level 4 Cert (mandatory minimum requirement) and Level 4 Dip and mentoring and coaching for all teachers;

- Master classes available in both teaching, learning and assessment and subject specific. Available as groups or 1:1 - as part of mentoring/coaching programme;

- Innovation Learning Centre provides training in technology and related subjects e.g. blended learning, on-line learning, ICT;

- Innovation Learning team develop all CPD into online learning for staff to access;

- Teaching and Learning College to become a one-stop-shop for all teaching, learning and assessment needs;

- Annual teaching, learning and assessment symposium - half a day. Key note speakers and workshops run as master classes.

Interviews - Research College Director of Quality

- One hundred and six workshops available but only 12 people have attended any of these this year;

- Festival of Learning - regional conference organised first in 2016. Organised by external company and aimed at all education providers across the region. Key note speakers and a range of different workshops addressing all aspects of TLA;

- In 2015 maths and English were involved in action research, working with an external agency but did not complete, this opportunity has not been offered again;

- Remission of time is not available to support CPD activity;

- Payment for teachers to attend CPD is not available;

- Maths and English teams had opportunities to undertake action research in conjunction with an external agency. Unfortunately none of those involved completed the projects. In further discussion during both interviews, the common theme preventing completion was lack of time;

- CPD events should include celebration of success - acknowledge good practice, strengths and share with colleagues;

- Importance of teachers maintaining professional membership of vocationally relevant professional bodies. The Director of Quality believed that the college should support membership of professional bodies, support achievement of qualifications and vocational skills with commitment to fees;

- CPD should also include celebration of success of teachers, acknowledging good practice, strengths and sharing with colleagues;

- Encourage team building and make CPD fun and worthwhile;

- There should be an objective and an outcome with an element of reflection and evaluation for all CPD activity, but it should be enjoyable.

Interviews – Business & Finance (B&F) and Performing Arts Teaching Teams

- Cross college CPD activity designed to meet compliance needs and teachers turn up so that a box is ticked;

- It was agreed by three of the four teachers present that a lot of sessions are not directly relevant to them and they would like to see more CPD focussing on the relevance of learning in industry and outside;

- All members of Performing Arts group agreed that college organised CPD activity was not relevant to them;

- One member of the B&F group and two members of the Performing Arts group considered there was something to be gained from participating in cross college CPD activity;

- All four members of the B&F group recognised that there was a place and a need for the cross-college CPD activity to ensure that the college met legislative need, auditors' requirements and could achieve its own strategic objectives;

- Everyone agreed that an on-going programme of CPD activity throughout the year would be more useful and could be used to meet college, department and teacher needs;

- All B&F group members talked very positively about the benefits of the half-termly CPD sessions organised by their manager. These have an agenda, with one session leading on from the last;

- Performing Arts proposed the development of a CPD website with a notice board, blog facility, access to online training and opportunities to share experiences;

- All participants acknowledged that sharing with colleagues from across the college was beneficial and that having an ongoing programme of CPD would be a much better way of running the CPD activity;

- All members of the Performing Arts group agreed that an on-going programme of CPD activity should be planned and should come out of their teaching hours;

- The Performing Arts group members agreed that a planned CPD programme should be managed by each department to suit their needs;

- One member of the B&F group commented that he engaged in research activity because of the funding bids he's involved with but would like to see more CPD focussing on research opportunities;

- Discussion point in the B&F group - CPD does not always have to be in a meeting room, or classroom, it could be delivered through technology, so that an organisational message is got out there;

- Performing Arts team agreed that they have started to organise (under the radar) their own team CPD activities on CPD days! Much more useful;

- CPD should include networking across the college to share. Sharing is an excellent approach to CPD;

- Generally staff view was that one model doesn't fit all, planning should be by department needs;

- Delivery for good CPD is crucial;

- Performing Arts agreed that a couple of hours a week rather than 4 days a year would be more useful. It could be used to attend workshops, self-directed study, working with colleagues;

- Weekly CPD should be managed by each department to suit their needs;

- CPD days should still be in place. Focus should be different though - college systems, tools, IT to help teachers understand how to do their job and respond to what the support departments need of us.

<u>Interview - Executive Directors</u>

- Both agreed CPD has got to be negotiated with the teacher generally but the teacher has to take responsibility for some of it;
- The Executive Director for the B&F group suggested the teacher should bring to Spotlight meetings identified CPD and we should be able to agree on what's needed and then support them to ensure they get the right training;
- It was agreed that College need must be considered and the college has to lead on this development;
- CPD should provide motivation for staff and demonstrate commitment to their development;
- Both agreed that the college should offer higher level qualifications which we would support with remission and/or contribution to fees;
- CPD should be more specific to curriculum/team need and supportive for individuals, move away from 'done to' approach;
- Celebrate achievement;
- Both felt there is essential training but that cross college workshops were not the way to move forward with this;
- They suggested that these workshops should be negotiated with teams and curriculum areas, using strategies and approaches that best suited the specific teams, such as peer learning, coaching, workshops or various other approaches;
- Both Executive Directors agreed that CPD activities of any kind should be negotiated with individuals or teams;

<u>Questionnaire - Hourly Paid Teachers</u>

- All five respondents identified positively to Q8, that they engage in external CPD activity, ranging from professionally accredited training, reading, visits and networking in their related subject;
- All five respondents acknowledged the need for development of pedagogic skills in responses to Q9;
- Two respondents commented they would need to be paid to attend college CPD events (Q10);

- Two commented that they would appreciate online access, or events organised and delivered at the out-reach centres at which they worked (Q10);
- Three commented they would like CPD which built on their technical skills in teaching (Q10);
- One made the point that he/she would require CPD to be time effective (Q10);
- One respondent identified that having the opportunity to share with colleagues was really helpful in seeing the broad range of skills across the college;
- Three respondents identified specific CPD activities which would support their pedagogical development;
- One teacher recognised that the most effective training he/she had participated in was coaching;
- 40% (two of five) responded confirming they attend cross college CPD (Q3);
- Two respondents commented on the lack of usefulness of cross college CPD (Q4);
- One commented that he/she only attends when it's mandatory and it's not that useful (Q5);
- One respondent did acknowledge that attending the CPD events was good for networking (Q5);
- In response to Q5 (Do you use the information you gain from the cross-college CPD days in your teaching?), two commented that he/she sometimes used the learning and one responded that he/she never used anything from attending CPD events;
- Three respondents (66.67%) stated they did not find CPD very useful (Q6). The other two respondents did not answer this question.

The indicators from the responses to this theme are that cross college learning and development activity is not meeting the needs of either the teachers or the managers. Again it seems that this is not uncommon to the English colleges but if I reflect on the support and activity in Australia there is a far more positive

picture for teacher development. All teachers and managers responding at the Research College have reinforced the point that department and individual level learning and development programmes should be in place in order for teacher learning and development to be effective.

5.2.3 Vocational Upskilling,

Vocational upskilling was discussed in all interviews and was a question in the teacher questionnaire. College B was again able to give indicators of expectations and support for this area. This theme was clearly a concern for all teachers and managers. The emergence of this theme addresses questions 1.1, 1.3, 1.4, 1.5 demonstrating the lack of support available for vocational upskilling and the self-directed development in this area by the teachers.

Questionnaire – Teachers

- Eighteen respondents (95%) agreed that they did engage in vocational upskilling or subject specific CPD activity but that there was no, or very little support from the organisation for the development of vocational and subject skills;

- All respondents commented that they do not submit applications for upskilling because they do not think they will get what they ask for;

- Those who have had the opportunity have found it extremely worthwhile (Performing Arts, Media);

- 100% of respondents felt there was need for vocational updating and/or upskilling opportunities. One did not seem to recognise that he/she could ask for this.

Interview – College A

- All teachers must be vocationally competent and vocationally current. We should encourage them to provide evidence of attending workshops, being involved with vocational networks and undertaking industry placements;

- Teachers could submit a request to complete vocational development during the summer training week, but this often does not happen;
- There is limited opportunity for engagement with vocational upskilling for teachers.

Interview – College B

- All teachers must be vocationally competent and current – must meet ASQA standards and re-register every 7 years;
- All teachers must be competent at level of teaching, but preferably level above;
- Teachers must prove competency and currency with evidence of attending workshops, being part of networks and maintaining vocational skills;
- Study leave is granted - paid or non-paid depending on the project.

Interview – Research College Director of Quality

- Two departments had encouraged teachers to engage in vocational upskilling but this was arranged on an adhoc basis within their teams, not through the CPD team;
- There is not consistent practice across the college;
- College need takes priority;
- Cost is an issue - cost to cover teaching but budget is there;
- Staff don't submit applications;
- Responsibility should be shared between teachers and managers to negotiate vocational upskilling;
- It is an essential component of CPD and should be negotiated and reviewed during Spotlight sessions;
- It is important that teachers should maintain professional membership of vocationally relevant professional bodies and that the college should support membership of professional bodies and vocational skills with commitment to fees;
- It is important to maintain vocational skills and knowledge in order to provide best learning opportunities for students;

- College should introduce 'Back to the Floor' days, teachers need to be involved in vocational upskilling to ensure their teaching is current, particularly.

Documentary Evidence

- Research College's Staff Development Report in July 2017 made reference to a range of activities that it considered to be vocational upskilling. In the true sense of the phrase, of the twenty five references included, approximately 30% were directly relevant to vocational upskilling and of those, all were organised by the teachers in their own time;

- The report does not include a breakdown of how many staff attended or achieved;

- The report indicated that of the 16 curriculum areas only 8 had staff on vocational skills development programmes;

- Notes from AoC Conference - Principal of Gateshead College explained that part of her strategy to move from Ofsted Grade 3 to Ofsted Grade 1 was that all teachers were given the opportunity for vocational upskilling, in order that they understood success in the workplace.

Interviews – Business and Finance (B&F) and Performing Arts Teaching Teams

- All members of the Performing Arts group agreed that they engaged in vocational upskilling and/or team subject specific development, but that none of this is organised through the College. It is all self-arranged;

- Business and Finance teachers discussed the vocational upskilling they engaged with, one member of the group explained that he goes back to his old employer for a week in the summer holidays in order to update his knowledge and skills and has been shocked by how out of touch he had become. This is self-organised activity;

- The manager of this department was praised by the group for being proactive in terms of CPD and encouraging all teachers to maintain their vocational skills;

- The manager also encouraged teachers to attend any lectures for student groups, led by guest lecturers from industry;

- All group members of both groups agreed that CPD activity is not shared as much as it could be to inform practice;

- Group members agreed that they had to initiate vocational upskilling and complete this, generally, in their own time;

- All members of the Performing Arts team engage in vocational upskilling and/or team subject specific development. None is organised through the college, all self-arranged;

- Performing Arts view - people should be expected to go back to industry all the time;

- The performing arts team supported one member of the department to have two weeks back in industry. This was tough on rest of the team because they had to cover for him but it was worth it because he brought so much back to share with them as well as industry experts to come in as guest speakers to the students;

- Both teams agreed that the college should allocate time to vocational upskilling;

- All members of both groups interviewed, appreciated the idea of time being allocated for mandatory vocational upskilling;

- Business and Finance group suggested that there was need for a culture shift, with businesses and colleges working together in order to create these opportunities;

- One member of the teacher interviews commented that often teachers do this independently and it would be a luxury to have input from discussions with our manager;

- Generally the view of those in the interviews was that funding would not be available to backfill staff;

- Respondents in both interviews recognised that supporting each other would provide opportunities to bring currency, initiatives and contacts in to the college;

- The Performing Arts team did express concerns that planning this kind of CPD takes time to put together, making contacts, nurturing these and unless the college is committed, they were concerned that even if time was made available by the college it would be taken over by other things.

Interviews – Executive Directors

- Both Executive Directors agreed that teachers should be able to keep their vocational skills up to date in whatever way is best for their role at the College;
- Both Executive Directors agreed that opportunities for vocational upskilling should be mandatory each year and teachers should be supported to take opportunities for national and international exchanges, work placements and networking groups.

This was a significant theme at every stage of the research activity. It was an emotive topic for teachers particularly and it emerged that often teachers engage in vocational upskilling but at their own cost. Other colleges in England have recognised the importance of vocational upskilling and seen the positive impact of supporting this.

5.3 Dual professionalism

Dual professionalism was the focus of the interviews in stage two of the research. The interviews were very informative regarding the support for dual professionalism and the commitment by the Research College. The questions addressed through this theme include 1.4 and 1.5 because of evidence of the understanding for the importance to support dual professionalism even from those who initially were unfamiliar with the concept.

Interview – College A

- The interviewee understood the importance of vocational upskilling alongside the development of pedagogic skills and was very positive about the benefits of dual professionalism and the legislation underpinning this between 2004 and 2012;
- He recognised the need for mandatory membership to a professional body;

- He argued that maintenance of dual professionalism should be reinstated, based on the IfL model;

- The IfL approach to dual professionalism was great, this should be the focus of CPD in education - to develop a dual professional. Drawback was need to maintain reflective journals;

- Teams recognise the importance of professional attitude and dual professionalism but teachers do not demonstrate professional attitude and college does not encourage it;

- Teacher can submit proposal for alternative CPD to support dual professionalism during training weeks but do not, probably because they know the college need will take priority.

Interview – College B

- Onus is on the organisation to make sure staff are professionally competent in TLA and voc. ASQA standards require this.

Interview – Research College Director of Quality

- There is no attempt by the college to encourage or promote vocational upskilling, or for that matter contextual, Sector understanding;

- Teachers are not reminded of their responsibilities as both a professional educator and a vocational professional;

- It is the attitude of the teacher that prevents people from recognising themselves as a dual professional;

- Staff can submit proposals for dual professional CPD activity (upskilling) but don't;

- Some directors recognise the need for vocational upskilling but it tends to be those who lead departments where it's a professional body requirement, e.g. hair dressing, health care;

- Staff often use vocational background as a reason for not being able to do something, e.g. "I'm only a hairdresser";

- Difficult to manage because of lack of cover;

- Three aspects to dual professionalism, essential to understand context, achieved through best practice sharing across the sector, with other colleges, sixth forms, prison ed etc;

- Support should be given for staff to develop as dual professionals and the college has a responsibility to support this through opportunities relating to all components of being a dual professional;

- CPD cannot cover all of these things on its own and there needs to be some ownership and responsibility taken by the course team and the line manager. Teams need to work together to support each other in attending CPD opportunities and then cascade the training to the whole team.

Interviews – Business and Finance (B&F) and Performing Arts Teaching Teams

- Keeping a reflective journal like in IfL days was really useful;

- Business - huge benefit - opportunity to find out directly from the employer how to do something;

- Should be joint responsibility of teacher and employer;

- Teachers should also be a member of their professional body and do the required CPD to maintain this;

- Input on context would be really helpful. Often asked to do things without really understanding why;

- Have come back from holidays in summer to find changes taken place but don't know the reasons why;

- only one person of the nine interviewed had previously heard the term 'dual professionalism' and had an understanding of what this was;

- All agreed that dual professionalism is something that teachers should be encouraged and supported to both achieve and maintain;

- All appreciated the third element of dual professionalism, which is to maintain understanding of the context in which they work.

Interviews – Executive Directors

- One Executive Director was able to explain that dual professionalism was to be vocationally competent and qualified as a teacher. The other commented that it was to be able to keep up with vocational skills and knowledge. Neither were fully familiar with the concept of dual professionalism;

- Neither participant was aware that there was an element of contextual understanding as a requirement of dual professionalism;

- Both considered dual professionalism to be important and could understand the benefits of this awareness on the curriculum design and planning within their departments;

- Both Executive Directors had weekly meetings with their teams and there was also the weekly curriculum managers' forum, where managers share developments in teaching, learning and assessment and expectations. They acknowledged that assumptions were made regarding topics being shared consistently and in a timely manner with teachers;

- One Executive Director commented that she puts on training for staff to visit specialist companies, or to go to employers to see what's happening in the workplace;

- Second Executive Director in the meeting explained he meets with staff regularly and they share links to sites, details of vocational information and CPD experiences;

- This executive director supports teachers going back into the workplace during the summer break.

It was evident in discussions around this theme that dual professionalism is not supported fully and there is scope to develop this further for the benefit of the teachers and the organisation.

5.4 Barriers to Teacher Learning and Development

Barriers to learning and development emerged as a theme in the research through the first and second stage interviews, initially with the teachers. Participants expressed their views on barriers or obstacles to learning and development and discussions continued with the managers to triangulate the feedback from teachers. The barriers are all valid and were recognised by all participants. The questions informed thinking regarding questions 1.3, 1.4 and

1.5 because respondents outlined issues that prevent engagement with teacher learning and development. Examples were given of good practice in Australia.

Interview – College A

- Time.

Interview – College B

- We are supported to remove barriers - paid or unpaid study leave is available, depending on the circumstances and it is the responsibility of the organisation to ensure compliance with these ASQA standards.

Interview – Research College Director of Quality

- Staff attitude is a barrier. Reluctance to participate because they think they know what's needed and CPD is a nuisance which takes up their valuable time;
- Barriers are perceived;
- Lack of understanding of what CPD is. People have this idea that it's about attending workshops when in fact it could be anything from having a professional conversation, reading an article and sharing, attending a conference or doing a qualification;
- Timetables can be a barrier, covering someone;
- Financial is also a barrier - cost of external training;
- Overcoming these is about being creative - work as a team to support someone going on CPD and then cascade the training with the whole team;
- For financial barriers - use reciprocal arrangements with other organisations - go and shadow at other colleges, do exchanges with other trainers or even employers. Send one person to a conference not three - they should share findings from the event;
- Time is a perceived barrier;
- Cost and funding for CPD is a perceived barrier;
- A key barrier was the lack of understanding of what CPD is;

- Help to solve barriers to CPD - Guidance on what CPD is, motivational because teachers don't seem to understand what CPD encompasses;

- Evaluate CPD through Spotlight, have 'my CPD log' on intranet showing count down of hours clearly visible. This could motivate people to take responsibility;

Interviews – Business and Finance (B&F) and Performing Arts Teaching Teams

- Accountancy CPD tends to be expensive so college tends to take cheaper option so I pay for myself;

- I'm doing MSc in order to increase teaching range. It's self-funded but the job needs me to have it;

- CPD is based on compliance and its top down, information cascading which is pretty straight jacketed - this is a weakness, how can we call it CPD if it's just fitting in;

- Teachers' attitude is a barrier but the whole culture is a barrier because teachers feel they're being done too;

- Blanket CPD - aimed at whole college because a few parties have not done something correctly. One size doesn't fit all. Staff very different, departments very different. CPD in this way is a waste of time for most of us;

- CPD is based on lesson observations, this isn't right;

- Time;

- "Teachers' [dismissive] attitude is a barrier";

Lack of time for CPD

Time was raised as an issue by all respondents, certainly at the Research College and also at College A. College B provide time for CPD and it is an expected element of a teacher's responsibility. It is an issue at the Research College which is causing a considerable amount of resentment and anxiety amongst the respondents of this research:

Questionnaire

- 100% of respondents agreed that time is the main thing that prevents them taking on vocational upskilling opportunities.

Interview - College A

- Teachers were expected to participate in a whole organisational approach to research but time was not provided for them to undertake the research. Incentive was that if they participated in research they would not have a management observation that year;
- Staff do not have time to commit to CPD and make it worthwhile.

Interview - College B

- Staff are paid to attend CPD workshops in the Teaching and Learning College, or they can access online training;
- Time is made available because CPD is a government requirement, organisation and teachers are monitored every seven years.

Interview - Research College Director of Quality

- The Maths and English team did not complete their research projects and the manager recognised this was probably due to the teachers not being given time to participate effectively;
- Increase in contact hours has made it hard for CPD at times other than cross college events. There are not enough teachers to ensure cover is available.

Questionnaire – Hourly Paid Teachers

- Two of five respondents commented on the question 'Do you find the scheduling of CPD activity helpful'; one respondent found timing of CPD to be something that will always be difficult; the second respondent commented that he/she should be paid to attend CPD but he/she recognised that the College varied the day of the week for cross college CPD to make it accessible to as many people as possible.

- In both groups it was made clear by all that time was an issue for them. Finding time to participate in CPD activity, other than the four planned days, was virtually impossible because of teaching cover needs and the cost implications;

- Generally all teachers want to engage in CPD, particularly vocational upskilling but cannot get the time during term time and, whilst some do return to industry, or participate in vocational upskilling, most resented this;

- All participants are aware that they can attend relevant off site CPD but this is limited because it is so difficult to arrange cover for their teaching;

- One member of the performing arts team did take a two week internship in London, this was difficult for the team to cover and caused a number of difficulties during the time he was absent. The team did acknowledge that it was extremely beneficial to the team and students.

Interviews - Executive Directors

- Both acknowledged that teachers find it difficult to find the time and cover to attend CPD activity, other than the four CPD days but also argued that this was something that could be overcome if the attitude towards it was different.

Lack of time to fully engage in learning and development and then use it effectively is an issue amongst the teachers, this is recognised by the managers who participated in the interviews. College B interview provided options to work around this issue however this also is influenced by the culture at the Research College, both of teachers and managers.

Barriers to learning and development was a focus for heated discussions in all interviews. Teachers identified lack of time as the key barrier but also felt that funding and lack of financial support for learning and development was a second significant barrier. The attitude of teachers and culture of the college was discussed and considered a barrier by all.

Overcoming barriers:

Through interviews at the Research College it was interesting to be able to identify ways of overcoming barriers, either creatively established by the teachers, or set up by the managers. In fact, it became clear that on some occasions teams were already doing this.

- Performing Arts teachers identified that to overcome barriers CPD days should be used for teams to put time into things that are important and relevant to them;
- Introduce more informal events, more celebratory events, a day made of themes and ideas from teachers;
- Compromise with managers - top down themes but organised and led by teachers;
- Lots of cross college stuff - coming out of your department and seeing what is done and how in other areas;
- Peer review projects, on-going across the college;
- Exchanges between departments, e.g. business teacher teaching entrepreneurship in art and design.

Interviews – Executive Directors

- The two senior managers interviewed recognised that from their perspective, the key barrier to CPD for teachers was the cost of backfilling to enable teachers to have time out for CPD. However, both recognised that this was crucial to the development of their curriculum provision and that they should lead on creative thinking around enabling CPD activity.

5.5 Appraisals and Performance Management

This theme has been identified at each stage of research, including the questionnaires, interviews and documentary evidence. The responses which established this as a theme all suggested that appraisals do not inform learning and development activity, other than at College B where there is a robust system

in place. The theme evolves from feedback which suggests the Research College prioritises its organisational need for development over the personal and professional need of individuals and relates to my research questions 1.2, 1.3, 1.4 and 1.5. The evidence to underpin this is:

Questionnaire (comments)

- CPD does not allow for training needs to be met;
- Appraisals do not allow for discussion of CPD needs or targets for teachers to be set;

Interview - College A

- Annual appraisals include review of CPD but do not inform the CPD plan;
- Teachers have annual appraisals which should review the training need of teachers. Outcomes of these appraisals did not reach the Head of Teacher Development.

Interview - College B

- Teachers make 'accountability plans' with their manager at start of the year. This is monitored and signed off by manager and informs CPD plans.

Interview - Research College Director of Quality

- Annual appraisal system reviewed following Ofsted in 2016. Now have regular review system (Spotlight);
- Managers not using the Spotlight system effectively, they do not set training objectives, The Spotlight system does not inform CPD, it should do;
- Teachers should be required to reflect on CPD activity through the Spotlight system.

Interviews - Business and Finance (B&F) and Performing Arts Teaching Teams

- Both groups agreed that the CPD activity organised by the college is not informed by appraisals;

- Spotlight process provides opportunities for on-going reviews of targets for performance and training, which should be negotiated between the manager and the teacher but it does not get recorded;

- None of the participants had experienced CPD, or training targets being set at appraisal that had then been supported through the college CPD system;

- Usually they have had to progress own training themselves;

- Two members of the Business and Finance team did acknowledge that their manager shares CPD opportunities with them, he discusses their needs with us and supports us to achieve this;

- Performing Arts group commented, planning for CPD should include the outcome of appraisals - currently it doesn't all of our vocational upskilling is self-organised, self-directed it isn't part of targets set in appraisals;

- Keeping a reflective journal like in IfL days was really useful.

Documentary evidence

- Ofsted feedback meeting notes (May 16) - appraisal system not providing action planning - inconsistency of appraisals and target setting and monitoring. Not informing CPD;

- Ofsted report - high expectations of SMT/CMT is not cascaded to teachers. Objectives in appraisals should indicate the high expectations;

- QIP July 2017 - actions following Ofsted include improved performance management - report indicates that progress on this is slow and not yet being utilised effectively.

Interviews - Executive Directors

- Both Executive Directors agreed that CPD activities of any kind should be negotiated with individuals or teams. This should be through the Spotlight process but the system needs to be more flexible and responsive to needs, negotiated with the teacher, who must take responsibility for maintaining the Spotlight records. They have to take ownership;

- Executive Directors took this further by also suggesting that CPD should be motivational for staff and that it is their (the Executive Directors') responsibility to show commitment to the teachers' development.

The data collected regarding the theme of appraisals and performance management indicates that the appraisal process is ineffective from the point of view of all parties. Again the Australian system in place at College B appears to be an example the Research College could follow.

5.6 Chapter Five Summary

The research activity used for this project has enabled me to address the questions established from my conceptual frameworks (Chapter 2), which have emerged from reading research by others around the subject of professionalism in post 16 education and approaches to teacher learning and development for this market. The research questions were used as the basis of my research activity and informed the discussions and questionnaires that were completed. The inclusion of all questions was validated by the participants' responses and apparent understanding of the ethos behind the research questions. Through my research activity I was able to address and positively respond to each question and establish possible areas for development and growth for the benefit of teachers and the organisation. It is intended that these developments will provide teachers with an opportunity to grow as autonomous dual professionals, whilst also providing opportunity to meet employer need and ensure the organisation can demonstrate robust responses to external auditors and employer challenges.

A range of key points emerged from the findings:

- The main purpose of teacher learning and development is to meet College need;
- There is no organisational commitment to dual professionalism;
- Teachers participation in any vocational upskilling is self-motivated, self-organised and often self-funded;
- Appraisals do not inform teacher learning and development plans;
- Learning and development is not accessible for all teachers;

- There are three significant barriers: lack of time; cost; attitude and culture of teachers' and the organisation.

The findings and themes identified from my research activity have been outlined here and will help to inform a strategy for teacher learning development. This will be formed based on knowledge from sources of existing information drawing on a constructionist framework of research with an interpretivist perspective (Crotty, 1998). These findings have informed the next chapter of this thesis where I draw upon all of the data, including the literature review to provide me with the opportunity to reflect on my conceptual framework and establish the recommendations from this project.

Chapter Six – Discussion of Findings

6.1 Introduction

In this chapter I draw together my research findings and discuss this in consideration with the literature and research reviewed in chapter three in order to come to my conclusion and recommendations. To be able to develop a strategy of teacher learning and development for the Research College I have drawn on a theoretical framework which enabled opportunity to review and reflect on findings through an interpretivist lens (Crotty, 1998). This allowed me to construct my thoughts on the experiences and work of participants and educational experts. The discussions of my findings are based on the themes that have emerged from my research activity, as outlined in chapter five and I consider that my original research questions have been addressed. Following the analysis of findings and subsequent discussions and considerations I am confident that I can progress to develop a strategy for continuous professional learning (CPL) for the Research College, as outlined through my conceptual framework discussed in chapter two. This strategy will be underpinned by a framework of constructivism (Wilson, 2014), encapsulating an andragogical approach to learning (Knowles 1984) drawing on social learning and modelling examples of workplace learning activities (Steward, 2009, Malloch et al., 2010) such as situated learning (Lave, 1991), communities of practice (Lave and Wenger, 1991), practitioner research (Jones, 2015) and contextualised formal or informal learning activities (Steward, 2009). This will be proposed to the Research College and will be designed to provide every opportunity to support achievement of the strategic objectives of the college, meet the requirements of auditors and facilitate teachers to develop as dual professionals.

6.2 Approaches for Teacher Learning and Development

6.2.1 College Need

Through the teacher questionnaire, 89% (seventeen) of those who participated indicated that they had access to a range of teacher learning and development activity that was, in their opinion, aimed at meeting the college priorities, e.g. to achieve an Ofsted Grade 1, or Outstanding outcome and external auditor compliance. This is an outcome also identified by Robson et al. (2004) and Lloyd and Payne (2012). In both projects the researchers found a common response from teachers was the focus on college need for teacher learning and development. In my research these views were returned to at both first and second stage interviews and through the questionnaire completed by hourly paid teachers. Findings from this questionnaire replicated experiences shared by Jameson and Hillier (2008) in their work with hourly paid teachers. They suggested that the Government auditing systems forced Colleges to prioritise organisational need for teacher learning and development. Robson et al. (2004) extended this point by discussing the lack of opportunity for vocational upskilling as it was not a priority for external auditors and so was not addressed as ongoing college learning and development. These experiences were reiterated by the hourly paid teachers in their questionnaire where two of three responses to question 5 (Do you use the information you gain from the cross-college Professional Development days in your teaching?), were that he/she sometimes used learning and the third responded that he/she never used anything from attending learning and development events. The additional two respondents to this question did not comment. I took this to suggest that they did not attend cross college Professional Development activity. This is not unusual and reflects findings of Broad (2015), that the casualisation of contracts for teachers means that these events are often not accessible to hourly paid teachers. This poor, but not surprising response was further reinforced by the Director of Quality during our interview and the Head of Teacher Development at College A. Both agreed that they managed learning and development through generic, whole

college activities, in order to meet SMT objectives and fit into the College calendar.

This approach at the Research College is evidently the cause of frustration for the teachers.   The seventeen respondents to the teacher questionnaire used phrases such as 'tick box', 'blanket', 'dull', and 'generic' when referring to cross college professional development activity.   One respondent summed up the experiences of learning and development as "often patronising, lacked specialist training".   It was also recognised as an issue by the Executive Directors in their interview, both of whom felt these events were essential but not the best way for development of classroom practice.   Shain and Gleeson (1999) identify that this focus on college need stemmed from the managerialistic approach adopted across the Sector following Incorporation.   Not only were colleges required to meet targets and budgets but they were also challenged to broaden the skills base of teachers, requiring them to teach subjects such as maths and English as well as their vocational subject.   Following deregulation in 2012, the CAVTL Report (2013) evidenced that the need for vocational upskilling was a priority for the Sector.   Despite this colleges continued to require teachers to be multiskilled, Orr (2008) argued that this was in part responsible for the decline in teacher autonomy and respect for their professionalism.

The participants in Business and Finance interviews all agreed that there was little creativity about cross college professional development days. The Performing Arts teachers, however, recognised the need for these days to ensure that the college met legislative and auditors' requirements and could achieve its strategic objectives. Teachers, however, wanted to see a broader purpose to the days. The Business and Finance teachers wanted to have opportunity to have time to work on collaborative projects whilst the Performing Arts teachers discussed the benefit of using the time to provide training in areas such as the college systems, which often changed over the summer. This would certainly be a beneficial strategy for professional development days, providing opportunity for teachers to meet one of the three aspects of the responsibilities

of a dual professional (IfL, 2012). Performing Arts Teachers also considered that they did not teach in the same way as the rest of the college and so the content of cross college professional development days was not relevant to them. I consider that no subject teacher will deliver learning in the same way as any other and as Marriss (2018) reflected, teacher learning and development in this generic approach is really just 'topping-up' the knowledge of teachers, which is out of context and therefore not digested or used effectively by anyone.

Despite their view though, the Performing Arts teachers did acknowledge that sharing and networking with colleagues from across the college was beneficial. This was reiterated, during the Business and Finance interview (stage two) when it was agreed that "sharing is an excellent approach to CPD", as also acknowledged in the questionnaire completed by hourly paid teachers. The mixed sessions on professional development Days do encourage this, although I believe by chance rather than design. By building on this aspect and designing something purposeful, the concept of a framework of constructivism could be developed, giving teachers the opportunity to engage with colleagues (Wilson, 2014), building on existing knowledge and experience (Knowles 1984), share with colleagues through situated learning (Lave, 1991) and broaden knowledge and skills through participating in communities of practice (Lave and Wenger, 1991), collaborative projects and practitioner research (Jones, 2015). A framework such as this would enable teachers to focus on and develop their own learning in an approach that suits them and supports the learning of their students. As recognised by Gleeson & James (2007), Broad (2018) and Robson, et al. (2004) teachers see the benefit of learning and development if they can see the impact on their students. Webster-Wright (2009) identified the importance of teacher learning and development being contextualised and personally relevant, advocating a social learning model. This informal approach to learning, as she discussed, offers a deeper level of learning rather than the shallow learning achieved through formal generic workshops (Schon 1983; cited in Webster-Wright, 2009). This was referred to and commented upon through the teacher questionnaire. The majority of respondents (seventeen), identified that activity which was not prescriptive or generic but had been negotiated and

planned to meet specific team or individual needs, was far more beneficial and effective.

In contrast to the experiences discussed in the two interviews at English colleges (the Research College and College A), the interview with College B in Melbourne, Australia, outlined the priorities for the development and support of teachers within post-16 educational organisations in Australia. There is a requirement for all organisations and teachers to be registered with the Australian Skills Quality Authority (ASQA) to maintain the required standards; both need to be able to re-register every seven years. Part of the requirement of ASQA is that all teachers must be vocationally competent and vocationally current and both need to be evidenced by teachers. In order to achieve this, paid or unpaid study leave is available, depending on the circumstances and it is the responsibility of the organisation to ensure compliance with these ASQA standards, by both itself and its teachers. This model supports a teacher centred approach to learning and development which all parties (teachers, employers and students) benefit from. It is a model advocated by Webster-Wright (2009) stating that learning should be situated in context with specific goals to be achieved. A view supported by others researching the same subject of continuous professional learning including Kennedy (2005) and Dunmoore and Armour (2003). In England maintenance of competency and currency is recommended and desired by the ETF and Ofsted but, in my experience, and the experiences of the participants of this project, teachers do not get the support to facilitate this.

6.2.2 Vocational Upskilling

In 1944 the McNair Report stated that teachers in the FE sector should be provided with opportunity to maintain their vocational skills in order to train the workforce of the future (Bailey, 2007; Robson 1998). In more recent years this was introduced as a requirement for dual professionalism (IfL, 2012) (chapter three, section 3.2). However, it is a concept which in my experience over 27 years has not been consistently adhered to and has been neglected at both the

Research College and College A since the deregulation of mandatory teacher learning and development in 2012 (Lingfield, 2012). It is this lack of support combined with focus on college need learning and development that supports my point in chapter one, section 1.2 that the Research College provides access to staff development as defined by Marriss (2018) rather than the CiPD's (2018) definition of continuous professional development or Marris's (2018) model of Continuous Professional Learning (CPL).

Eighteen respondents (95%) to the teacher questionnaire in this project agreed that they did engage in vocational upskilling or subject specific learning and development activity. The range of activity that people participated in was broad, including lighting design and stage management, "ongoing classes in own subject area" (ballet, Pilates), returning to the workplace during the holidays, team development sessions, peer reviews, online training, reading and external action research projects. This list indicated that teachers were aware of what vocational learning and development included and that some of it was easily accessible, for example reading journals, peer reviews, accessing on-line training. However, it was small numbers of respondents (ones and twos) listing each activity. Amongst the responses were comments which suggested that teachers received little or no support for vocational upskilling "I have put in for CPD but have been told there isn't money", or that activities are arranged within the team, by team members "we sometimes arrange department relevant stuff". Ninety-five percent of respondents also outlined examples of where the college had not supported the growth of vocational skills and teachers have taken on that responsibility personally. This is not unique to the Research College. It is a factor identified at College A and through research by other educational researchers, including Broad (2015) and Lloyd and Payne (2012) and demonstrates the motivation of teachers towards their subject, for the achievement of their students, to enhance learning of their students and for their own credibility (Broad, 2018).

This experience was reinforced in the teacher interviews through discussion about the lack of opportunity for vocational upskilling and reinforces findings by Robson et al. (2004) when, in their research, teachers commented on lack of support for vocational upskilling.   It was agreed by both teacher groups in this project that vocational upskilling was an essential element of learning and development that to date, had been left to chance and teacher initiative, rather than planned activity. Broad (2015) and Lloyd and Payne (2012) experienced, in their separate research projects, that teachers often fund their own vocational upskilling, or, as Lloyd and Payne (2012) were informed, hairdressing teachers would turn to product suppliers for sponsorship of vocational upskilling. A member of the Business and Finance team at the Research College also informed me that she is funding her own post graduate degree and her own return to work activity.

In her research, Broad (2018) found that teachers of vocational education often took their own path to vocational upskilling, in fact, on many occasions they took multiple paths, some formal, some informal, to develop their knowledge and skills. Similarly, in my research I established that all members of both teacher interview groups agreed that none of the vocational upskilling undertaken by any of them was organised through the College, it was all self-arranged. For example a Business and Finance teacher goes back to his old employer for a week in the summer holidays in order to update his knowledge and skills. However, the manager of this team was praised for being proactive in supporting learning and development and encouraging all teachers to maintain their vocational skills. Despite the positive support though, the group members did not recognise that they had to initiate vocational upskilling and complete this in their own time, they were not being guided or practically supported by their manager.

The Performing Arts team explained at stage one and stage two interviews how they had supported a colleague to undertake a two-week block placement back in industry, "This was tough on the rest of the team because we had to cover for

him …. but it was worth it because he brought his learning back and shared with colleagues and students". Again, Broad (2018) gave examples of teachers who similarly had collaborated with colleagues to provide shared opportunity for development of subject knowledge. In the instance of the Performing Arts teachers, the initiative and support all came from within the team, demonstrating the teachers' own sense of professionalism. This approach, as mentioned previously, demonstrates the passion the vocational teachers have for their subject and success of their students and whilst working as professional associate takes preparation and planning it is beneficial to all. This collaborative approach is an excellent example of Bandura's social learning in place (Steward, 2009), developing through an andragogical approach by building on existing knowledge and skills, testing different experiences and encouraging learning from each other, as advocated by Knowles (1984) through his five concepts model of andragogy: self-directed, solution focussed and applied, internally motivated and with a readiness to learn. However, whilst this team should be applauded for their creative thinking and initiative, it is disappointing that the Research College does not acknowledge the benefits and support such activity.

In discussion with both the Head of Teacher Development at college A and the Director of Quality at the Research College, regarding vocational upskilling and dual professionalism, neither interviewee was able to demonstrate a consistent approach to supporting vocational upskilling within their organisations. The Head of Teacher Development at College A though, did explain that teachers could submit a request to complete this during the summer training week. However, when challenged further he admitted that this often did not happen: "there'll be an insistence on prescribed training". At the Research College, the Director of Quality explained that two departments had encouraged teachers to engage in vocational upskilling but this was arranged on an adhoc basis within their teams, not through the learning and development team or as a consistent approach across the college. Teachers complained that when they had applied through the college system they had been turned down for vocational upskilling due to lack of funds and the time it takes to set up. Teachers are convinced that unless the college is committed it will not happen; the Director of Quality insisted

though that the money is there to fund it, but teachers do not submit applications. It seems, based on my interview with her and discussions with the teachers that the priority for SMT is college need, which underpins the concerns of teachers. This reflects the experiences identified through research by Robson et al. (2004) and Broad (2015) where teachers also confirmed that vocational development was undertaken in their own time and at their own expense. This situation seems very short sighted considering the Research College's aim is to provide Outstanding education. As identified by the Principal of Gateshead College, and recognised by Harper (2013) the way to achieving an Ofsted Outstanding grade is to support teachers in being the best in their vocational field and being able to share this with students.

Interestingly, at the AoC Conference for Teaching, Learning and Assessment, 2016 the Principal of Gateshead College explained that part of its strategy to move from Ofsted Requires Improvement to Ofsted Outstanding was that all teachers were given the opportunity for vocational upskilling. The Principal used her contacts to make this possible and over 90% of teachers took up the opportunity. This comes back to a point raised in the discussion with the Business and Finance teachers, that there is need for a cultural shift so that all teachers and management support vocational upskilling and acknowledge the benefits of it. As discussed previously in this chapter, Shain and Gleeson (1999) argued that the reason for a lack of support for vocational upskilling was a consequence of changes in managerialism across the Sector and the colleges. Whilst this supports flexibility and responsiveness of an organisation, it is not a positive situation for the teachers. They receive limited personal, professional teacher learning and development (Shain and Gleeson, 1999) and are finding themselves having to teach subjects in which they are not confident (Spenceley, 2006, Fisher and Webb, 2006 cited in Broad, 2018). In order to encourage motivation and positive engagement of teachers, colleges should create opportunities for development negotiated between employer and employee, with both taking responsibility for the outcome, as discussed by teachers in stage three interviews. This is a similar picture to that painted by Robson et al. in 2004, who identified that whilst national funding was available for teacher

learning and development projects, very few colleges took it up because it did not fit with day to day college operations. Certainly, based on experiences at the Research College and College A, support from SMT was not forthcoming. This indicates a cultural issue which prevents a proactive strategy for teacher learning and development and will perpetuate the current low engagement in learning and development, as evidenced by both the ETF in its 2017 Workforce Data Report, and the Association of School and College Leaders in its 2018 TALIS report. Until SMTs see the benefit of these national projects, and opportunities for networking, teachers are never going to see a positive cultural shift by colleges.

All managers interviewed at the Research College and College A recognised the importance of maintaining vocational skills and knowledge in order to provide best learning opportunities for students. They agreed that vocational upskilling should be an opportunity for teachers to keep their vocational skills up to date in whatever way is best for their role at the College. All agreed that vocational upskilling should be mandatory each year and teachers should be supported to take advantage of national and international exchanges, work placements and networking groups, as discussed with the Vice Principal Quality and Curriculum at College B.

6.2.3 Approaches to Effective Teacher Learning and Development

The final question of the teacher questionnaire asked respondents to identify what would be useful learning and development. One hundred per cent of respondents referred positively suggesting the use of peer review, focussed training workshops and cross-college networking and sharing. All of these are activities that have been known to work and support a constructivist framework (Wilson, 2014) for teacher learning and development and particularly pedagogical development (Steward, 2009). All respondents commented on the importance of vocational upskilling, but only five of the 19 respondents recognised the importance of continuing to develop their skills of pedagogy. This was a disappointingly small number of respondents but is not surprising

when considering findings by Clow (2006). She identified the reluctance by teachers in the ETS to engage in pedagogical training, or recognise its value. When reflecting on the experiences of teachers at the Research College, in respect of development of classroom skills, I do understand why they do not see this as important, or of no interest. As mentioned previously, sessions to develop classroom skills tended to be cross college events, generic and completely without context, or the other experiences teachers have had have been one to one coaching as a result of a poor observation outcome. Although this activity would be in context it would bring with it a feel of being 'done to' for the teacher.

College A, has an on-going three year plan for teacher learning and development activity with three themes as priority areas each year. The plan is informed by the college Self-Assessment Report (SAR), Quality Assurance requirements, and the strategic objectives of the Governing body and with input from a teacher group led by the Principal. However, the interviewee did indicate that the teachers' involvement in the plan is limited. He felt that the teachers are cautious about what they say or suggest in front of the Principal. The Research College also has a plan for teacher learning and development, although it is reactionary. I find it interesting to note that at neither college did the plan provide negotiated or supported development through varied approaches to facilitate a constructivist framework as advocated by Duncombe and Armour (2003), Webster-Wright (2009) or Kennedy (2005).

In an ideal situation approaches to teacher learning and development would be modelled on approaches such as those espoused by Kennedy (2005): scaffolded learning designed for the different stages of a teacher's career. This would be an on-going programme including a variety of contextualised opportunities for individual and team development. Both the Business and Finance and the Performing Arts teams reported on the benefit of contextualised learning and development rather than four days a year. However, the Head of Teacher Development at College A stated that they had tried to run weekly

learning and development workshops but they were unsuccessful, "no one attended". Similarly, the Director of Quality at the Research College explained about a programme of 106 sessions that were available for teachers to attend throughout the year, but only 12 people had attended these in the academic year (2016-17).

The significant point here though is the relevance of these sessions to the teachers and teams. Workshops organised as generic sessions to improve pedagogy are not likely to be any more effective than four days a year cross college activity. For instance, during the Business and Finance team discussions I noted the point that activity which was not prescriptive or generic but had been negotiated and planned to meet specific team or individual needs, was far more beneficial. Members explained that they had half-termly learning and development sessions organised by their manager. These had an agenda, with one session leading on from the last. All participants in the interview were very positive about these events, one participant commented that "this works really well because we can prioritise whatever the focus is for the department at each session, sometimes it'll be classroom stuff, other times it'll be vocational stuff". All agreed that a planned programme should be department led, providing situational and contextualised learning (Broad, 2018), "college wide CPD should be a planned programme to meet all the different needs. One model doesn't fit all, …. CPD should be managed by a department to suit their needs", a view also shared with Shain and Gleeson (1999), who recognised that organisationally led formal teacher learning and development, addressing priorities informed by quantitative data was not an effective approach to improving quality of teaching and learning, or supporting teachers professionally.

Cross college, formal events typically provide opportunities for surface-level learning where depth of knowledge is not essential (Schon, 1983). There is a place for this but the alternative, informal, workplace learning, enables people to learn to a deeper level (Schon, 1983) which for some skills is important, approaches might include use of peer reviews or lesson studies to develop

practice. Both of these approaches encourage reflective activity between peers based on testing, trailing, observation and professional discussion. Informal learning falls within the top end of Kennedy's (2005) model for more experienced teachers and if managed well Steward (2009) suggests that such activities will provide opportunity for teachers to work collaboratively on projects, developing teaching and learning, or sharing subject knowledge and skills. Collaborative, approaches to learning and development will provide opportunity to experiment, work in communities of practice and problem solve through situated learning, constructing new learning from existing knowledge and experiences of others (Wilson, 2014; Webster-Wright, 2009; Duncombe and Armour, 2003; Lave, 1991 and Lave and Wenger, 1991).

The importance of an informal, collaborative approach to pedagogical skills development was emphasised through responses to the hourly paid questionnaire when only three respondents answered Q6 (Do you find the range of CPD activity useful?), and two of the three found the learning and development activity to be 'not very useful'. In response to Q9 (What would be useful CPD for you?), all five respondents related to the need for development of pedagogic skills. As specialist practitioners these people are often unqualified teachers but specialists in their vocational subject and still working in that Sector, with teaching being a second job. Access to pedagogical training would be far more useful to these teachers than some of the activity that is organised.

Access to teacher learning and development was a key topic for consideration with all teachers involved in this research. Two hourly paid teachers commented they would need to be paid to attend. Two commented that they would appreciate online access, or events organised and delivered at the outreach centres at which they worked. All respondents to questionnaires and interviews agreed that on-going learning and development activity should be planned and should come out of their teaching hours, rather than being added on as four additional days a year, the view of one was that "a couple of hours a week rather than four days a year would be better". Based on the experiences at College B

149

in Australia it does seem that an on-going programme of development opportunities, negotiated to meet individual needs and accessible at suitable times and in suitable formats would be an effective approach to consider, and certainly supports a model of CPL, providing teacher focussed and negotiated opportunity (Duncombe and Armour, 2003).

Overall, the experiences of the hourly paid teachers reinforced the responses of teachers in research undertaken by Jameson and Hillier (2008) where respondents expressed similar experiences. They discussed the issues that hourly paid teachers struggled to access learning and development because of other commitments in their lives, they also found that the broad ranging, generic learning and development activity did not address their specific needs. This was something reported on in the Foster Review in 2005 as an area for improvement across the Sector and the situation has not changed.

Practitioner research was an approach to teacher learning and development that was referenced in the teacher questionnaire by two respondents and at interview teachers were keen to discuss further. They expressed an interest in funded projects, providing scope to network and share practice, something that has been available nationally (Robson et al., 2004) but has not been well supported at the Research College, or College A. Sadly during the interview with the Executive Directors neither suggested research as a learning and development activity. When interviewed, both the Director for Quality at the Research College and the Head of Teacher Development at College A pointed out that when given the opportunity to engage in team research, the teachers were unable to complete the projects. Both interviewees discussed interesting opportunities to encourage practitioner research and opportunities for teachers to develop projects through their teaching, but both expressed disappointment at the failure of these projects. At College A, there was a whole college approach to research but none of the projects were completed. Similarly, the Research College established opportunity for the maths and English teachers to undertake action research projects but none was completed.

It is concerning that both colleges had experienced such disappointing outcomes from research project opportunities, however feedback from teachers was that they did not have time to complete the projects, write up findings, present their work or put findings into practice. They cited issues which reflect the changes enforced since Incorporation as the reason, including increased workload and teaching hours, cuts in holiday and casualisation of the workforce (Broad, 2015).

However, teacher research practice is something recognised as being an essential element of the teachers' role (Jones, 2015). In fact teacher research activity is supported by BERA to enable evidence based learning and problem solving in the classroom (Jones, 2015). It is also an element of the teachers' role that should support their professional reputation and status and provides opportunity for teachers to share and broaden knowledge in collaboration with others (Steward, 2009). It seems to me that research activity for teachers is beneficial to their own development, the learning opportunities of the students and the reputation of the organisation. It also provides opportunity for teachers to network and broaden their connections across the Sector, meeting expectations of the responsibilities of a dual professional.

In contrast to the Research College and College A, College B delivers an on-going programme of learning and development for teachers through its Teaching and Learning College, a centre within the organisation that has a team of teacher educators and coaches for both classroom based learning and e-learning. Their role is to support teachers in areas of pedagogical and vocational development. Individual support needs are identified with line managers, as are approaches to participating in learning and development, e.g. through coaching, attending workshops or engaging with webinars or on-line learning. This approach models a framework of providing accessible teacher focussed and contextualised learning (Duncombe and Armour, 2003) as one would expect through a model of continuous professional learning as defined by Mattson (2014). It focusses on providing opportunity for teachers to learn rather

than being developed (Webster-Wright, 2009). As discussed by Duncombe and Armour (2003), teachers have opportunity for skills and knowledge sharing through a constructivist learning opportunity, e.g. experiential learning, active learning (Wilson, 2014; Steward, 2009). During the interview with the Vice Principal at College B it was evident that providing this approach was essential for effective teacher learning and development and was significant in maintaining high quality teaching and learning. In contrast to this, all five respondents to the hourly paid teacher questionnaire gave a different response to Q2 (What experiences of CPD have worked best for you?). One respondent identified that having the opportunity to share with colleagues and to see the broad range of skills across the college was really helpful. Three others identified specific activities that were the most useful learning and development activity and one recognised that the most effective training he/she had participated in was coaching. This evidences that each person had a very different need for learning and development, reinforcing the effectiveness of constructivist methods designed for personal need (Webster-Wright, 2009).

One stage of Kennedy's (2005) nine approaches model of CPL included achievement of accredited training. When interviewed, the Executive Directors acknowledged the importance of encouraging higher level qualifications, this could improve moral and motivation of teachers, whilst also broadening the scope for levels of delivery and as a consequence, increase student numbers. As one executive director commented, "we should support higher level qualifications with remission and/or contribution to fees. At the moment we don't offer any support at all". The Perry Beeches Academy adopted an approach of supporting achievement of higher level qualifications after gaining a Grade 4 (inadequate) in an Ofsted inspection. The outcome was improved motivation of teachers, understanding of lifelong learning by students and an improved Ofsted grade to Grade 1 (outstanding) (Ofsted, 2013). Similarly, Lloyd and Payne (2012) reported on opportunity at Norwegian colleges for accredited training and the positive impact this had on staff moral and self-respect as well as a positive attitude towards learning and achievements by students. Development of teachers' academic skills is also recognised as a priority at College B, with

grants being available for practitioner-led research and post graduate study. Grants range from $3,000-$5,000 (£3,000-£8,000 approximately) and teachers are encouraged to engage in exchange visits, industry secondments, vocationally specific qualifications and postgraduate study, including PhDs. An excellent example of supporting opportunities for development through communities of practice, experiential learning and practitioner research.

6.2.4 Dual Professionalism

During the stage two interviews with teachers I was shocked to find that despite everyone in both groups agreeing that vocational upskilling was essential only one person of the nine interviewed had previously heard the term 'dual professionalism' and had an understanding of what this was. One teacher commented "is this something you practice and then teach?" Although, in fact, I should not have been surprised as Robson (2006) and Clow (2006) had identified through their research that teachers often still consider themselves as vocational professionals, rather than educational professionals, or dual professionals. Spenceley (2006) suggested that vocational teachers need to be experts in their field but that needing to be acknowledged as a professional educator as well was not important. I disagree with this, teachers need to have commitment to both aspects of their role if they are to be respected as a professional in the ETS. Although, it is also a poor indictment of the Research College that it is not encouraging teachers to develop as dual professionals.

All members of both groups recognised the importance of dual professionalism when it was explained and all agreed that this is something that teachers should be encouraged and supported to both achieve and maintain. Although this is made more difficult these days, as discussed in chapter 3, section 3.6, because teachers are directed to teach outside of their areas of expertise (Spenceley, 2006; Orr, 2008; Fisher and Webb, 2006, cited in Broad, 2018). In addition to feeling a lack of opportunity for vocational upskilling, the perception by teachers was that they are not supported by the Research College to develop an understanding of the wider post-16 Sector, also required of dual professionalism.

This analysis reflects research by Robson et al. (2004) who established that colleges did not support teaching staff in finding the time or opportunity to engage in communities of practice or opportunities to externally network. This is despite research and reports by the CAVTL (2013) and the 157 Group (2012) recognising the importance of supporting teachers in the development of both vocational and pedagogic skills as a priority (chapter two, section 2.3). This is short-sighted and does not support a progressive model of teacher learning and development as discussed by Webster-Wright (2009) and Duncombe and Armour (2003) which would promote respect for dual professionalism.

Executive Directors discussed how best to support teachers with contextual understanding; the view of both was that they had meetings with their teams, where managers shared developments in teaching, learning and assessment, awarding organisation updates and expectations. They acknowledged that assumptions were made regarding topics being shared consistently and in a timely manner with teachers. It seemed when discussing this with teachers that information either was not shared or it was shared after the event, as identified in the Performing Arts interview, "initiatives being developed over the summer but rolled out without training". This, reinforces the concerns of Plowright and Barr (2012), that colleges will prioritise the organisational needs rather than reviewing needs more broadly, but in addition it does not show a sense of respect for the teachers as educational professionals and so they cannot be blamed for potentially developing feelings of mistrust and reluctance to commit to developing beyond the essential requirements of their work (Evetts, 2005; Gleeson et al., 2015).

Executive Directors considered they provided support for teachers to develop as dual professionals. One Executive Director commented that she provided time for teachers to visit specialist companies, or to employers to see what is happening in the workplace. She continued by commenting that "I do this for staff, over the cross-college CPD sessions in college because I think this is more important". I agree that this is important, however I consider there are two

issues associated with this comment. Firstly, I would argue that teachers do need to be continually reflecting on and developing their pedagogical practice. If these are themes on which Professional Development days focus and there are no other opportunities, then to some extent it seems that her teachers are missing essential training opportunities. I also agree with Steward (2009) and Scales et al. (2011) that a visit to an employer, as a whole group, once or twice a year does not constitute dual professionalism, although it is at least a start. It would be far more suitable to ensure that vocational upskilling should be tailored to meet the needs of the individual and facilitated throughout the year. The Executive Director seemed to recognise this, when we discussed it further, she even acknowledged that support should be given for teachers to develop as dual professionals and the college has a responsibility to support this. In my view, in the scenario outlined above I agree with Kwakman (2003) that teachers should be able to take charge of their own learning.   He/she should be able to negotiate appropriate teacher learning and development to address his/her needs, pedagogic, vocational and contextual, but the Executive Directors must support this happening.

The second Executive Director explained how he meets with staff regularly and they share links to sites, details of vocational information and learning and development experiences. He also explained how he supported teachers going back into the workplace during the summer break. This supports the feedback given at interview by the Business and Finance teachers, but it is interesting that he supports vocational upskilling during the teachers' summer holiday rather than negotiating a time that provides support and opportunity for all, which can be readily shared.

It is good that the Executive Directors support vocational upskilling to some extent, but as with the SMT of the Research College, they both appear to be encouraging the concept of organisational professionalism (Evetts, 2005). That is that they do not support teachers to develop and practice with ownership but they direct the teachers to engage in learning and development that meets the

needs of the organisation. To support dual professionalism, as both Executive Directors believed they do, Robson et al. (2004) argued that they should be encouraging autonomous thinking, even though this might be negotiated autonomy, in order that both personal and organisational priorities could be met. Robson et al. (2004) continued by discussing that this approach would meet the need for vocational experts to network and share experiences, supporting the concept of continuous professional learning.

If supported well, dual professionalism will ensure that teachers have an opportunity to develop and maintain their pedagogic skills, their vocational expertise and form an understanding of the Sector within which they work (Robson, 2006). It is a model which provides opportunity and framework for teachers to develop professional respect and recognition by conforming to the professional standards for teachers in the Sector, e.g. negotiating training and learning opportunities for their own personal and professional gain whilst also developing their teaching for the benefit of the organisation and its stakeholders.

6.3 Barriers

Barriers to learning and development were discussed in all interviews at stage one and stage two and also through the questionnaire of hourly paid teachers. The Director of Quality recognised the barriers that teachers had identified, which included: lack of time, cost restrictions (funding) and attitude and culture. She stated that the teachers' attitude was a significant barrier to learning and development because they would not review how they did things. She commented that they would not think creatively to support learning and development opportunities taking place, it was easier to claim they "weren't allowed". She did, however, acknowledge that the attitude of teachers could be due to fear of having to cascade to colleagues, particularly in areas where they were not confident for example the expectation for them to teach other subjects as previously identified by Spenceley (2006) and Shain and Gleeson (1999).

Further discussions with teachers referred to the lack of time and the impact of this and the perceived negative attitude of teachers because of the demands by the organisation. Teachers generally work extremely hard and long hours, they are often using time at home to mark and plan whilst their time in college is dedicated to supporting students, delivering lessons and keeping on top of the organisational demands and requirements (Bloom, 2018). The majority do cope with this workload but it is a strain and they do become very negative about perceived misuse of their time. In my experience, and comments from interviews suggested the way learning and development has been delivered over the years had caused teachers to see it as an intrusion on their time which, in their mind could be better spent. This was identified as a significant barrier in research completed by the SET and reported on in its InTuition magazine in 2017.

As a manager, though, I also understand that the demands on the employers by Government legislation and the cuts to funding have caused these issues to become more significant (Shain and Gleeson, 1999; Spenceley, 2006). However, for teachers to see personal and professional learning as a benefit to themselves and worth investment of their time there is a need for both teachers and the organisation to be supportive and think creatively. It is true that organisational demands are dominant and take up valuable time of teachers but Anderson's view (2002, cited in Steward, 2009), that the issue of time is often used as an excuse by teachers for not engaging, should also be considered. Similarly, Webster-Wright (2009) suggested that lack of time as a barrier to learning and development is an excuse for resistance to change, or as a Principal once said to me, "time is attitudinal, when someone *wants* to do something they are able to find the time". However to change the attitude of teachers the CPL activity needs to be worth their investment of time. This is true of hourly paid teachers as well who consider that by attending CPL they are giving up time that they would usually be giving to something else.

I suggest also that the attitude of teachers' stems from their views that learning and development at the Research College was 'sheep dip' and 'generic', being 'done to', and that they are not given opportunity and support to develop as professionals (Robson et al., 2004). The general tone of all teachers' interviewed was negative, one teacher from Business and Finance made the remark that the "teachers' [dismissive] attitude is a barrier, but the whole culture is a barrier, because teachers feel they're being 'done to'. Teachers get fed up with the approach so they become negative". This reinforces Duncombe and Armour's (2003) comment that teachers are fed up with the many years of being 'done to'. Webster-Wright (2009) discussed the negative impact the culture of an organisation can have on a teacher's motivation if he/she does not feel supported, but put upon, he/she will eventually withdraw from engagement. This certainly seems to be the case at the Research College if the responses of the teachers are anything to go by. This is something that would need to be challenged for teacher learning and development to be effective. As Webster-Wright (2009) comments, effective, social learning will be at risk if the attitude and culture is negative.

It is also identified that as a consequence of Incorporation and marketisation teachers have seen changes in working conditions, casualisation of the workforce, reduction in holiday periods and increase in teaching contact hours (Broad, 2015). This is all bound to have an impact on the attitude and motivation of teachers. The Director of Quality at the Research College cited experiences she had had with teachers: "Why should I change what I'm doing?"; "I don't think I need to .....". The view of the Director of Quality was very much that there is a reluctance to participate because teachers think they know what's needed and learning and development is a nuisance which takes up their valuable time. Taking this to the next level, she did express a view that "some people are fundamentally lazy or arrogant. They think they know everything. Might be fear, for instance developing IT skills, makes them feel out of their depth". I do not think that the teachers are necessarily lazy, although I do agree that there can be an element of arrogance amongst some teachers. There are certainly some, in my experience, who think they know better or do not need to participate in

learning and development. In fact, in some cases, this is reinforced by their manager, but maybe these views stem from the teachers seeing themselves as vocational experts and professionals, rather than educational professionals (Clow, 2006; Robson et al., 2004). For example, I am aware of an engineering teacher who has a PhD and was highly regarded in the motor industry as a designer. He has never completed any teacher training because he does not see the need. I know of another who is an experienced Barrister and does not see the need for her to do any teacher training. In the minds of both of these people they are highly regarded professionals in their field. Spenceley (2006) would see this as being acceptable but I consider that their views reinforce my discussion that they do not see themselves as teachers but as professionals who teach (Clow, 2006, Robson et al., 2004) and this impacts on their own approach to teaching and learning and the respect for them as professional educators, as well as potentially impacting on the outcome for their students.

The teachers interviewed demonstrated a fixed mindset (Dweck, 2012) and were finding reasons for not being able to participate in learning and development rather than solutions to overcoming problems. This probably stems from their lack of positive gain from learning and development, the fear of having to share new learning and initiatives, and the on-going feeling of being overwhelmed by the demands put upon them over the years (Broad, 2015). I do, however, also agree with other researchers, particularly Colley et al. (2007) and more recently, Broad (2015), who identified, through research, that teachers feel permanently anxious about their jobs because of continuous redundancies across the Sector and the introduction of casual contracts. This type of vulnerable situation does not encourage teachers to commit to developing skills in order to be a good teacher and in fact evidence shows it is causing new teachers to leave prematurely (Colley et al., 2007).

During the discussions with both groups of teachers it was made clear that lack of time for useful learning and development was an issue for them. The consensus of opinion from the teachers was that there was a desire to engage in

learning and development, particularly vocationally related learning and development, but they felt that this needed to be completed in their own time, or was a significant task for the team to accommodate, a similar view was identified in research by Robson et al. (2004). Both the Director of Quality at the Research College and the Head of Teacher Development at College A, in their separate interviews, acknowledged that time was an issue for teachers which prevented them from engaging fully in learning and development. At the Research College, the Director of Quality stated that time was an issue because "lack of cover is the main sticking point" (because of lack of availability of cover teachers). This mirrors statements made by teachers in the group interviews and also the findings of Robson et al. (2004) and Lloyd and Payne (2012).

As in the work by Robson et al. (2004) and Broad (2015), I am aware that teachers do attend other learning and development activity off site at different times of the year but this is limited due to the additional costs of arranging cover for teaching and is often self-funded. My consideration regarding this is that the teachers suggested that all learning and development should come out of college time and that employers are reluctant to provide teachers with time or cover to fully engage in learning and development. I do not accept that this is completely the case. I understand, from seeing financial reports from the Research College and reading articles (Martin, 2017, Hughes, 2017, Fullfact, 2018, DfBIS, 2015, Coughlan, 2015), that the funding is restricted and the demands of the syllabus on an organisation are so great that colleges cannot afford to give time for learning and development beyond what they feel is essential. This view has been supported in a recent on-line blog by David Hughes at the AoC, in which he commented that "public investment in colleges has been hit harder than any other part of the education system in the last decade. Between 2009 and 2015 colleges dealt with a 27% real terms cut in funding" (Hughes, 2017). A further reflection on this matter, is that professional teachers should be able to expect autonomy and opportunity for ownership of their learning and development (Steward, 2009). This brings with it though an expectation that they will engage in learning and development in their own time as well as college time.

The view of the Director of Quality was very much that the learning and development budget could not cover all of the demands of teachers on its own and there needs to be some ownership and responsibility taken by the teachers, the course team and the relevant line manager. She suggested that teams need to work together to support each other in attending learning and development opportunities and cascade back to the whole team. This will enable growth of individuals whilst strengthening the team because of the benefits of collaboration, sharing and learning as a community of practice (Kennedy, 2005; Lave, 1991). Broad (2018) refers to this as professional association and through this research I was able to identify a good example of this happening in the Performing Arts team with the collegiate activity that enabled one member of the team to take a two week industry placement. His teaching was covered by other team members, arranged by the team members themselves. This, the team admitted, was a struggle to organise and manage but the benefits to the team and students made it worthwhile.

For hourly paid teachers, the barrier of timing of learning and development was significant, as was acknowledged in research completed by Jameson and Hillier (2008). Sixty per cent indicated that they did not attend Professional Development Days because they were not able to, due to other commitments and 67% of those who did attend did not find them useful and so are not inclined to make the effort to attend again. I acknowledge that time for learning and development is a commitment of valuable time for these teachers and it could be costing them money, for instance, they might need to turn down other work for the duration or pay for childcare. However, through the questionnaire with hourly paid teachers, only three respondents completed Q7 (Do you find the scheduling of CPD activity helpful?). One found the timing of learning and development to be something that would always be a difficulty, but acknowledged that the one event they had attended at the start of the year was sufficient for their needs. A further comment was made which implied that hourly paid teachers should be paid to attend learning and development activity and a

third comment acknowledged that Professional Development days are varied, with the college doing its best to accommodate as many people as possible.

The final barrier to be mentioned by both groups of teachers was that of financial support for learning and development. It was commented on in the Business and Finance stage one interview that the cost of accountancy learning and development tends to be expensive and the college would look for a cheaper alternative. This caused the teacher to elect to pay for the training herself. She also gave the example that the college does not support the cost of higher level qualifications, citing her experience that she is doing an MSc in order to broaden the levels at which she can teach and is funding this herself, despite the fact that the college will benefit from this.

Interestingly, most teachers interviewed did agree that they undertook vocational upskilling but this was self-funded, undertaken in their own time and on their own terms. They claimed a barrier was that the college would not support the cost of this activity. This was a barrier identified by Broad (2015), Broad and Lahiff (2019) and Lloyd and Payne (2012) who challenged, citing Coffield (2008), that funding could be used better and more creatively in order to inform practice. I agree with this and, in fact, cite the learning and development activity of the Performing Arts team as an example of how this can be achieved.

The issue of cost of learning and development is a perception that needs to be changed at the Research College, argued the Director of Quality. In interviews it was evident that teachers believed that the money was not available to cover the cost of them engaging in vocational upskilling. My interviews with the Director of Quality and Executive Directors all confirmed that funds are limited, particularly with so many cuts in recent years (Fullfact, 2018; Broad, 2015). However, this is a barrier the college can overcome through using its own resources creatively for the benefit of CPL, including the resources of curriculum teams. For example, draw on its own teaching expertise to lead training sessions, develop an approach for peer working, support and observation,

encourage collaborative projects, access opportunities for external funding and where appropriate, teams pulling together to creatively enable cover for lessons.

6.4 Performance Management

The Director of Quality at the Research College and all teachers interviewed in stage two of my research activity agreed that the learning and development activity organised is not informed by appraisals. Whilst none of the teacher respondents discussed the content of their appraisals, it was apparent that their appraisal meetings focussed on the needs and targets of the organisation rather than the organisation *and* individual. This was an issue identified and discussed by Shane and Gleeson (1999) and further by Gleeson and James (2007) when reviewing the impact of Incorporation. They recognised that performance management became a key aspect of managerialism and the priorities were organisation-led, target and data driven. However with the introduction of mandatory learning and development in 2007, there was the perfect opportunity to establish an expectation for reflective practice which could inform planning for learning and development (Orr, 2008). If this had been established, we might, today, be seeing a far more productive appraisal system across the Sector.

Through the second stage of interviews with Executive Directors and the Director of Quality, all recognised that vocational upskilling should be a learning and development priority but also that this should be negotiated through the College appraisal process and supported by the College. All agreed, as did Robson et al. (2004), Clow (2006) and Shain and Gleeson (1999), that the teachers should take ownership of this learning and development, however the support at the Research College is evidently not in place.

In the interview with the Head of Teacher Development at College A it was explained that teachers have annual appraisals which should review their training need, however, outcomes of these appraisals did not reach the Head of Teacher Development. A similar picture was painted by the Director of Quality

at the Research College. It had recently moved from an annual appraisal system to a performance review system, 'Spotlight', with regular (at least termly) reviews, providing opportunities for on-going review of targets for performance and training. This was introduced following an Ofsted inspection in 2016 where gaps were identified in the appraisal system. As identified by the Director of Quality, this new approach should have been far more supportive and developmental, providing opportunity for teachers to 'own' their plans for learning (Kwakman, 2003). However, she confirmed that up to the time of our discussion she had not seen evidence of these reviews informing learning and development. It seems as though, at both the Research College and at College A, there was still the habit of performance management being led by the needs of organisational targets, based on information gleaned from quantitative data (Gleeson et al., 2015) or, as Jameson and Hillier (2008) discussed, the requirements of market-led funding principles and compliance management, with all teachers directed to meet the needs of the organisation with limited opportunity to develop their own skills and meet their own needs.

At College B individual support needs are identified through the Accountability Plan that teachers make with their managers at the start of each year. This is monitored and signed off by the manager on completion. Teachers are paid to attend learning and development workshops in the Teaching and Learning College, or they can access on-line learning and development sessions or webinars. Teachers are supported through group activities or one to one coaching sessions, as is deemed most appropriate. In other words, a personalised programme of learning and development is designed for each member of teaching staff, through their Accountability Plan, building on existing knowledge, sharing and experimenting through coaching, peer learning and research (Steward, 2009, Scales et al., 2011), an approach advocated by Kwakman (2003) as something which allows teachers to take responsibility for their learning and development, drawing on contextualised, informal approaches to learning.

As with any strategy for constructivist learning or development, teachers should be encouraged to take ownership of their learning but there is a need for targets, be they individual or organisational, to be achieved through both formal and informal approaches to learning (Colley et al., 2002 cited in Steward, 2009). Adaption of this approach to performance management would support a framework for CPL with all aspects of learning based on the identified needs of individual teachers, curriculum teams and the organisation.

6.5 Chapter Six Summary

Based on the findings from this research, it is evident that the generic learning and development workshop approach, used commonly across the ETS, is not effective; it does not inspire teachers to improve their practice, or feel motivated to take professional ownership of their learning and development (Scales et al., 2011, Steward, 2009). Therefore, based on the interpretation of my research data, and the subsequent discussions, I intend to propose that the approach to support teacher learning and development should be designed to meet specific needs of departments, teams and individuals rather than the current practice of generic cross college workshops. A proposal will draw on methods which support individuals to grow through experimental and evidence based practice, underpinning a positive framework for continuous professional learning for growth of dual professionals (Webster-Wright, 2009; Duncombe and Armour, 2003).

To ensure barriers are overcome however, and teachers enter into collaborative CPL positively there is a need for a social learning model to be adopted which will support the concept of constructivism through andragogical learning opportunities such as experimental learning and knowledge sharing (Wilson, 2014). However, it is also essential that the Research College thinks creatively about teacher development, the funds available and prioritising key aspects of learning that will support dual professionalism and ensure improved teaching and learning for the students' experience. The two Executive Directors

interviewed recognised that from their perspective, the key barrier to learning and development for teachers was the cost of backfilling to enable teachers to have time out for development. However, both recognised that this is crucial to the development of their curriculum provision and that they should lead on creative thinking around enabling learning and development activity.

It was suggested by the Director of Quality that the college should use learning and development time to celebrate achievement and that it should move away from the current 'done to' approach. This would certainly go some way towards encouraging the necessary attitude shift of teachers. A further step would be for the Director of Quality to work with teams and develop learning opportunities that are both relevant and worthwhile to the team. However, there is also a place for cross college activity and all teachers in the group interviews appreciated the opportunity to network and share across the organisation during cross college professional development events.

There are three barriers identified in this research which teachers believe prevent them from engaging in effective and purposeful learning and development. These are lack of time, attitude of teachers and college culture and funding. I consider all are related and to some extent stem from teachers' perception. Teachers perceive they are not given time, that the college looks for the cheaper option and so have a closed mindset, or attitude. Their perception has some basis which is the struggle the college has with funding cuts, however, resolution is in the approach used. If the approach to enabling learning and development is creative and allows opportunity for teacher focussed and negotiated learning and development, then motivation and attitude will improve (Webster-Wright, 2009).

It is essential though that if there is to be a shift to provide opportunity for effective teacher learning and development then there needs to be a cultural shift. This can only be done if the appraisal process, Spotlight, is in place and working properly. Targets for all aspects of a teacher's role should be

negotiated, agreed and monitored through this process and as with college B, only signed off by the manager when successfully completed. As with a programme of continuous professional learning, the negotiated discussions and agreed targets will be based on a constructivist framework (Wilson, 2014) with the teachers being given opportunity to develop through contextualised, supported learning in areas of skill, knowledge and expertise.

In the following chapter I explain the outcome of this project and the details of the recommendations to be made as a consequence.

Chapter Seven – Implications for Practice

7.1 Outcomes and Recommendations

As outlined in chapter two, section 2.6.2, this research project was underpinned by a theoretical framework of constructionism drawing on an interpretivist perspective (Crotty, 1998). This allowed me scope to carry out research activity using a methodology which facilitated interpretation of data through the three questions model presented by Srivastava and Hopwood (2009), a model which required the use of reflective thinking to consider and interpret views of others.

Using the interpretivist approach, and following the analysis of my findings I have identified the key issues that have emerged from this research project:

- The main purpose of teacher learning and development is to meet College need;
- There is no organisational commitment to dual professionalism;
- Teacher participation in any vocational upskilling is self-motivated, self-organised and often self-funded;
- Appraisals do not inform teacher learning and development plans;
- Learning and development is not accessible for all teachers;
- There are three significant barriers: lack of time; cost; attitude and culture of teachers' and the organisation.

All of these can be addressed and overcome through a strategy for continuous professional learning establishing and formalising my conceptual framework as explained in chapter two, section 2.6. It is essential that I should not lose sight of the fact that this strategy should meet the needs of the organisation as well as the teachers, therefore a strategy will be proposed to the Research College which will provide opportunity to address issues identified by external auditors

and changes from Government legislation, as well as providing the opportunity for teachers to take ownership of their own learning needs and develop as dual professionals. It will also encourage promotion of and support for dual professionalism, encouraging autonomy within a framework of accountability.

The strategy to be submitted to the Research College is designed in response to all those who participated in this project and informed by reading from a range of educational experts. It will be underpinned by a framework of constructivism, supporting andragogical learning through a model of social learning (Wilson, 2014, Knowles, 1984, Steward, 2009). This approach will provide opportunity to overcome barriers to CPL and promote ownership in order that teachers can develop and maintain vocational skills and pedagogical skills, as would be expected of someone in a professional teaching capacity (Robson, 2006). The intention is that it will underpin the development of a professional attitude of dual professionalism supported and promoted by the college and expected of all teachers. The strategy will be based on a model of professional learning building on work by Kennedy (2005) and Feiman-Nemser (2001), using a scaffolded programme extending from entry into teaching with scaffolding being gradually removed as a teacher gains experience. Thereby promoting and expecting autonomy and ownership by the teachers. This research project has informed the aspect of the strategy which focusses on CPL for teachers following initial teacher training.

7.2 Rationale for a Strategy for Continuous Professional Learning

Dual professionalism, as outlined in chapter one section 1.2, was a model promoted in 2007 for all teachers in the ETS and is the model which this research project has identified as being a suitable approach upon which to build a strategy for CPL. Dual professionalism will ensure that teachers have an opportunity to develop and maintain their pedagogic skills, their vocational expertise and form an understanding of the Sector within which they work (Robson, 2006). It is the model which will provide the College with the tools to

change the mindset and professional values of vocational teachers, supporting them to develop and become a teacher of plumbing, rather than a plumber who teaches. However, it is a model which has capacity to be developed further to ensure success for teachers, students and an organisation.

As I discuss in chapter three, section 3.7, I recognise that in order for both the Research College and the teachers to gain from a Strategy for CPL, there needs to be a compromise in the approach to professionalism. I consider dual professionalism to be an appropriate model of professionalism for teachers in the ETS but suggest modification to include elements of other previously discussed models of professionalism, including the old public sector professional, (Shain and Gleeson, 1999), offering the respect and values of a public sector employee serving his/her community; the organisational professional (Evetts, 2005), to ensure that organisational targets are shared and acknowledged as the responsibility of management and staff alike; the holistic professional, as described by Clow (2006) and an expectation of teachers for maintaining vocational and pedagogical skills alike, including the adoption of reflective practice, in order to provide the best opportunities for their students (Clow, 2006, Shain and Gleeson, 1999). In my view, these elements combined form a model which will allow the organisation to ensure its CPL needs are addressed, whilst also giving opportunity for teachers to develop as autonomous, professional practitioners with a sense of responsibility for the organisations. Autonomy, as considered by Robson et al. (2004) would inevitably need to be negotiated autonomy in order that targets for individuals and the organisation are considered and met and there is an element of accountability on all sides.

Only one teacher interviewed for this research project was familiar with the concept of dual professionalism. However when it was explained, all of those interviewed understood its purpose of supporting teachers to maintain their vocational professionalism, whilst also developing professionally as a teacher. Dual professionalism brings with it an expectation of professional behaviour and

acceptance of professional responsibility as set out by the ETF Professional Standards, but in return teachers should be able to expect professional autonomy. By developing a strategy for CPL with this revised model of dual professionalism at its heart, the College will be able to support the growth of dual professionalism for its teachers through which both teachers and employers can grow in skill, knowledge and reputation. This will ensure a scaffolded programme, as advocated by Kennedy (2005) and Feinman and Nemser (2001) and include a support network for this development; afterall expecting autonomy of its teachers immediately is irresponsible as this is a mature step which some will need to learn to take, as Boud (1988, pg. 29) comments, when becoming independent there is a reliance on senior managers to provide guidance and support and so "interdependence is therefore an essential component of autonomy in action".

7.3 Underpinning Conceptual Framework

Teachers in post-16 education have often entered it from another profession; they are employed because of the vocational skills and expertise they bring to their teaching. The initial responsibility then of the employing college, is to provide training to ensure that the new teachers can transfer their own knowledge to their students. From then on, the college should take on the responsibility of supporting teachers to continually develop a range of skills, in order to teach their specialist subject, and be respected as dual professionals.

To develop teachers in all aspects of dual professionalism, the CPL strategy will be substantiated by a framework of constructivism (Wilson, 2014) as discussed as a key element of my conceptual frameworks (chapter 2, section 2.6). Constructivism would enable teachers, new or experienced, to develop from their own starting point, drawing on vocational and teaching experiences and reflecting on these in order to expand their skills-set and knowledge through a supportive approach that is appropriately scaffolded for teachers at different stages of their career (Kennedy, 2005; Feinman and Nemser, 2001). As the

strategy for CPL is designed to support the learning of its teachers, who are all adults, it is essential that a suitable approach to their learning is adopted. In my view, as outlined in chapter 2, section 2.6, this would be most effective through a model of andragogical learning, as advocated by Knowles (1984). As he explained, adults learn through experience and practice, building on their existing knowledge, through collaboration and opportunity to take ownership of their learning.

By designing a programme of CPL based on a framework of constructivism and drawing on andragogical and social learning models a deeper level of learning will be achieved. When a school in the USA adopted this approach, teachers appreciated the time to collaborate with peers, experiment with communicative methods and student engagement improved (Burke, 2013). Based on my interviews with teachers, and the outcome of a recent University and College Union (UCU) survey at the Research College (February 2018), adoption of this approach is essential if the College is to see improvement in the quality of teaching and learning and improvement in the morale and motivation of its teachers. This approach supports opportunity for Schon's (1983) deeper level of learning which ensures true digestion of learning and development of knowledge and skills (Wilson, 2014). Currently, generic workshops will not satisfy this need because they are too broad reaching to provide deeper level learning (Wilson, 2014).

Through my research activity, I established that teachers at the Research College want to engage in learning in order to support the achievement of their students. It seems to me, therefore, that a strategy such as that discussed here would enable the teachers to consolidate and reinforce existing and new knowledge by participating in activities which evolve from the theory of social learning (Steward, 2009), for example, collaborative projects, communities of practice and situated learning, practitioner research and problem solving activities. Such activities will enable contextualised, work place learning and motivate teachers to be involved in their own learning and support improvement

of their student achievement (Broad, 2018). Drawing on approaches such as these will provide opportunity for the teachers to be at the centre of their own learning and ensuring CPL is negotiated with the teachers, either as individuals or as a team, allowing them to choose the most appropriate path, or paths for them (Broad and Lahiff, 2019). These approaches will ensure that teachers can be active in their learning, developing through a sense of belonging and ownership (Coffied, 2008), experimenting in ways that work for them and then enabling further learning opportunities (Duncombe and Armour, 2003; Webster-Wright, 2005; Steward, 2009). They will provide teachers with the opportunity to move their learning from the surface level of learning to a deeper level of learning, providing opportunity for consolidation of learning and engage in evidence based practice (Coffield, 2008), being particularly effective if it is in context (Scales et al., 2011). Not only will this deeper level of learning provide opportunity for more meaningful CPL, it will also provide opportunity for teachers to develop a more reflective approach to their practice, thereby informing the next stages of their development (Scales et al., 2011).

7.4 Professional Learning

Taking into account the concepts of professional learning compared to professional development (chapter one, section 1.2), I will be presenting a strategy for continuous professional learning to the Research College, rather than a strategy for continuous professional development. This change of focus will be the first step in encouraging the cultural shift that will be needed to encourage teachers to support and engage with this strategy and for an effective outcome from it. Without this change of approach and culture shift the strategy will be ineffective (Webster-Wright, 2009, Steward, 2009, Scales et al, 2011).

In order for teachers to accept the strategy for CPL, it is essential that the Research College promotes the concept of professional learning (Steward, 2009). 'Development' is not a word that should be used to describe a choice of learning or training (chapter one, section 1.2), it is more a word used by people

when developing 'something' rather than 'someone' (Mattson, 2014). When going through a process of development, the object being developed has little or no say in the process and this certainly seems to be true of teacher learning and development at the Research College currently. In my experience, and the experience of those interviewed for this project, teacher learning and development is often a top down, 'done to' process, which creates a negative reaction from teachers. It has been delivered on the basis that teachers need "direct instruction about how to improve ...." (Martin et al., 2014, pg. 7 cited in Mattson, 2014). As evidenced by my findings, the Professional Development days at the Research College are generic and delivered on the basis that one size fits all. This is certainly not the model that encourages professionals to change their practice and does not model good practice of teaching and learning. Therefore, the concept of professional learning is a far more motivating approach to improving the quality of teaching practice and teacher skills. It focusses on ownership of the training/learning with negotiated targets or goals and is designed to develop a deeper level of understanding. Professional learning is an approach which supports the long-term learning of teachers (Mattson, 2014), providing opportunity for collaboration through research, evidence based practice, development through experimentation and opportunity to consolidate learning through practice.

As with any strategy for CPL, whilst teachers should be encouraged to take ownership of their learning, there will be a need for targets, be they individual or organisational, to be achieved through both formal and informal approaches to learning (Colley et al., 2002 cited in Steward, 2009). The Spotlight process must be developed to provide scope for CPL target setting which actually inform the CPL plan for individuals, teams and departments; but it should also provide opportunity and space for teachers to add reflection on their CPL activity into their Spotlight for review with their line manager.

Formal and informal learning should not be seen as separate entities, but seen to work alongside one another, depending on the purpose for CPL. When

interviewed, the teachers recognised the need for college-wide formal learning events (CPL Days), however, they also indicated that they learnt a great deal from the less formal activity of discussion groups and sharing with colleagues (Kennedy, 2005). In this new strategy, I consider that the formal learning will address the organisationally required learning to meet Government legislation, or external demands and it might also be required on occasions for team development, when cross college training needs to be contextualised to suit the different teams of teachers. For instance, how can a team of engineering teachers be expected to engage in learning and achieve the outcomes of the learning, if it is being delivered in the same way for them as it is delivered for the hairdressing teachers? The strategy for CPL being proposed to the Research College will accommodate the need to understand and adapt to suit the audience. After all, the commitment to change shown by a teacher will be influenced by how worthwhile he/she believes the change to be and what the benefit will be to his/her students. If the teacher is expected to attend a generic cross-college training event, then his/her engagement will not be as focussed as it would if he/she attended training which is contextualised to his/her situation and students (Steward, 2009; Duncombe and Armour, 2003; Webster-Wright, 2009).

A further aspect of the strategy for CPL being offered to the Research College must have the teachers at the heart of it. Therefore, following the practices of College B I shall be proposing that there should be a Teaching, Learning and Research Centre at the College which all teachers will see as being their space for learning. Teachers should be at the centre of planning CPL activity, within their teams and centrally, this could be as a group, as explained by the interviewee from College A (chapter six, section 6.2.3) but should be led by someone other than the Principal in order that teachers share their ideas. Further, the strategy will promote on-line access to CPL and opportunity for teachers to participate in post graduate study and funded projects.

7.5 Chapter Seven Summary

Having completed the research activity and analysed my findings I have been able to positively confirm that the original conceptual framework of my research project has proved to be the appropriate approach for a strategy of continuous professional learning at the Research College. My findings have supported the development of a programme of CPL underpinned by a framework of constructivism, prioritising social learning (Steward, 2009), developed within a model of andragogy (Knowles, 1984). It should be modelled on a scaffolded approach by Kennedy (2005) and Feinman-Nemser (2001), and should be a continuum from teacher training onwards. The strategy developed as a result of this research, supports a programme of CPL by providing a range of activities evidenced by research (Kennedy, 2005; Webster-Wright, 2005; Duncombe and Armour, 2003) which enable a teacher to develop as a professional practitioner, within the scope of an updated, revised model of dual professionalism but also provides opportunity for the CPL to be informed by organisational need and the performance review programme, Spotlight. Teachers will be required to reflect on their learning and build on experiences in order that they are continually improving both personally and professionally. The organisation will see quality of its provision improve and identify that it is facilitating the achievement of its vision to provide outstanding education for the local community and employers.

The following chapter will reflect on the whole study with a view on what subsequent research and next steps should be established.

Chapter Eight – Conclusion

8.1 Introduction

In concluding my research project I will reflect on the contribution my research has made to the field of study, identify what the next steps should be in terms of development for the Research College, further actions and further research opportunities. I will also identify what worked and what, on reflection could have been managed differently in this project. In addition I will summarise the final outcome of this research project.

There is evidence of research dating back to the late 1990s (Robson, 1998, Shain and Gleeson, 1999) which supports my original concepts of a need to explore developments of a negotiated approach to teacher learning and development to support dual professionalism for teachers in post 16 education. The Sector was encouraged in 2007 when the Institute for Learning was formed and teacher training and teacher learning and development became a mandatory requirement for the Sector. Teachers employed within it considered that at last the Sector was to be respected and supported to ensure development of young people as the next generation of the British workforce. It was disappointing, when in 2012, the legislation and requirements for training were deregulated and the Sector saw indications of regression back to previous practices. This left teachers with either no, or little learning and development or the priority for learning and development meeting the needs of the organisation and auditors' rather than to develop the skills and professionalism of its workforce (Shain and Gleeson, 1999). In more recent months there has been further research completed by the ETF through its professional membership arm, the SET to try and understand the issues and be able to support learning and development more effectively. The research was based on responses from SET members and it identified that over 60% of teachers did not participate in

learning and development and those who did participate only managed to achieve 15 hours a year (ETF, 2017).

8.2 My Contributions to the Knowledge of the Field

At the time of writing, research completed by other researchers and educationalists has informed practice by identifying areas of challenge for teacher learning and development, what is lacking, or what professionalism in the ETS should look like (Spenceley, 2006; Shain and Gleeson, 1999; Jameson and Hillier, 2008; Clow, 2006; Robson, 1998; Broad, 2015; Broad, 2018 and Broad and Lahiff, 2019) (chapter two, section 2.3 and 2.4). However, as identified by Roesken-Winter, Schuler, Stahnke and Blomeke, (2015), and reinforced by my own experiences, previous research has not significantly changed practice in terms of approaches to teacher learning and development (chapter two, section 2.4). It does not appear to have identified a suitable solution to the issue of lack of opportunities for development of dual professionalism in the Sector, nor does it appear to have influenced organisations to recognise the importance of dual professionalism in meeting the expectations of external agencies, or the national need to upskill the workforce. Instead, as Plowright and Barr (2012) feared, the influence of Government demands and expectations of external auditors seem to dominate organisations' strategic thinking and objectives and these tend to direct organisations' demands for teacher learning and development. The ETS has also seen significant changes in the last nine years as a result of Government cuts in funding and changes to funding mechanism (Fullfact, 2018 and Hughes, 2017). This has meant that teacher learning and development has had to be curtailed and significant Government changes to curriculum demands have meant teachers have had less time to dedicate to development of their own skills.

It is based on the findings of my own research, the findings of research undertaken by others and examples of best practice that I consider that unlike the previous research referred to, the outcome of this project has the capacity to

change practice. Rather than identifying the issues and problems I have had the opportunity to confirm what these issues are and offer a solution to the Research College to overcome these.

My project has been carried out using an interpretivist perspective (Crotty, 1998) and as a consequence of considering and building on the knowledge and experiences of other educationalists and the participants of this project, as expected of this methodology, I am able to offer a contribution to the Education and Training Sector as a whole which could provide a solution to the difficulties of development and maintenance of dual professionalism. The strategy being made available to the Research College could be adapted to be generalisably accessible (Denscombe, 2003) for any general further education college of a similar size and setting in England.

I intend to offer a strategy that will address issues and concerns identified in this project and in the research from which my conceptual framework evolved. It is a strategy that will make a difference to teacher engagement and ownership of dual professionalism, whilst also providing organisations with an opportunity to develop the skills of their teachers and meet the external demands placed upon them. My research has shown me issues and barriers for both teachers and organisation and approaches to learning and development which have proved to be effective, I have also acknowledged the issues that colleges have to address and the personal and professional demands of teachers and as a result I have been able to develop a strategy for CPL which supports the promotion of a change of culture and autonomous learning. Therefore, my contribution to the field of study will be a strategy for continuous professional learning incorporating approaches for innovative and inclusive CPL to encourage teachers to take ownership for their own training and development in order to practice as, and be recognised as dual professionals. Thereby responding positively to the questions of my original research proposal and affirming my original conceptual frameworks, as explained in chapter two, section 2.6, that teacher learning and development should be underpinned by a framework of constructivism (Wilson,

2014) and draw on a model of andragogical learning (Knowles, 1984) that is informed by social learning theory (Steward, 2009).

By developing a professional learning programme based on my proposed strategy the Research College will be setting the right environment for teachers to develop as dual professionals, becoming teachers of plumbing and moving away from being plumbers who teach. However, this will not be achievable unless two final hurdles are overcome; that of cultural attitude and acknowledgement and support for an updated model of dual professionalism.

Currently the culture of the college, as with all colleges I have experienced, is one of high demand, poor use of time and a generally fixed mindset amongst the teachers in terms of their own growth and development. This is due to the feeling of their goodwill being abused (UCU, 2018). Until this culture changes and teachers can see their working and professional life through the lens of a growth mindset (Dweck, 2012), the development of a motivated teaching force will struggle to succeed.

The development of a growth mindset (Dweck, 2012) and a culture shift can be encouraged and achieved if the college not only supports dual professionalism but adopts the updated model that I have advocated through this research, also a new contribution to the field of study and the Sector. As explained previously (chapter three, section 3.7 and chapter seven, section 7.2), for successful growth of professionalism and therefore quality of teaching and learning, expectations of dual professionalism should become the norm but these should be expectations of the updated model I have discussed in this thesis. It should be based on the IfL requirements of dual professionalism but incorporate elements of the old public sector professional, (Shain and Gleeson, 1999), the organisational professional (Evetts, 2005) and Clow's (2006) holistic professional, as explained in chapter seven, section 7.2. This will be reinforced by teachers being able to demonstrate the SET Professional Standards and leading students to successful academic outcomes and an understanding of

professional behaviour. As Sheran Johnson comments "basically, by investing in teachers the college invests in the learner experience and in employers. ….. it is as much about supporting the teachers and not losing valuable people" (SET, 2012).

8.3 Next Stages

In order for the strategy being proposed here to succeed, the College needs to lead and cultivate a shift in culture towards a solution focussed, open mindset; one which gives teachers permission to acknowledge their areas for change or development and supports them in wanting to try new things with a 'can do' attitude, or as Mary Dweck (2012) refers to it, a growth mindset. Teachers need to be engaged in their own career development, they need to want to develop and improve but this can only be achieved if the teachers see that the organisation supports that same view and has the same values and ethos for change and professional learning (Senge, 1992). The college also needs to recognise that this new strategy for CPL is a significant step towards the cultural shift needed, it requires teachers to take ownership of their continuous learning and managers to recognise that they must provide and support opportunity. However, the college cannot expect that it can introduce a new strategy, no matter how well it will be received and expect the teachers to be able to make the shift needed without support; this brings me back to Boud's comment, "interdependence is .... an essential component of autonomy in action" (1988 pg. 29), the college needs to support the development of teachers' acceptance of this strategy and of a growth mindset. Therefore, there are four different directions in which to go from this project.

The first is to develop a next stage research project, investigating approaches to embedding a growth mindset across the organisation. This project should investigate adjusting attitudes into a 'can do' culture where it is recognised that talent and success are not a given, they come with hard work and commitment,

in fact as Syed (2011), the Commonwealth table tennis champion and broadcaster comments "talent [on its own] is vastly over rated".

The second is that the college needs to be seen to invest in the practicalities of the new strategy for CPL. For instance, establish a physical Teaching, Learning and Research Centre with a focus on teacher-research, experimental and collaborative practice in order that the college can be seen to be moving on from communities of practice to supporting development of communities of exploration, and taking the college, its teachers and the students to the next level (Crowley, 2014). This could then be used as the basis for a further research project in developing a research culture in the ETS.

The third step from this project will be to re-establish this project as a true action research project by introducing a further cycle of action research (McNiff and Whitehead, 2005). This would include a review of the findings from this research, monitor the development and test the use of the strategy which has emerged from this project, reflect on the activities and develop the strategy further to meet new outcomes (Denscombe, 2003).

There is a fourth step that could also now be taken and that is to broaden out the research completed in this project by investigating practice more rigorously at a range of colleges so as to move the project from a small scale research project to a large research project, thereby strengthening the generalisability of the findings from this project.

8.4 Limitations of Study

There were aspects of this study which required me to review my approach and be flexible in how I interacted with my colleagues participating in the project. For example, I had difficulties trying to arrange focus groups with teachers because they are so highly timetabled.   To be able to move forward with my research

activity I made arrangements to meet fewer of the teachers from the Business and Finance team and the Performing Arts team in smaller groups, rather than the large groups that I would have preferred. I also arranged for the hourly paid teachers to complete an online questionnaire rather than trying to meet up with them all because of their varied timetables and other commitments. This adaptation to my approach was particularly pertinent because one of the main points made by the hourly paid teachers was that learning and development at the college is organised at times that they are not able to attend, therefore they do not benefit from any learning and development activity as well as they might.

Having made the changes to the data collection I was able to then gain valuable data which gave a robust view of the experiences across a college of general further education. However, the research was a small-scale project and only involved two small groups of teachers; one small team of hourly paid teachers, three senior managers and two senior managers from other colleges. Whilst experts would suggest that this provides the basis for generalisable findings (Cohen et al., 2011), there are critics who would argue that this study is not robust enough to be considered generalisable (Cohen et al., 2011). My view based on my experiences, is that the outcome of this project could be adapted by any general further education college of a similar size and nature. However, I recognise that the generalisability of the findings and outcome would be strengthened if I had worked with a broader and larger range of participants, hence the suggestion mentioned above, of extending this project to include a group of colleges.

8.5 Project Summary

In summary I have presented to the Research College a strategy for CPL which is based on a framework of constructivism (Wilson, 2014), providing opportunity for experiential learning, reflection and development of practice. It is intended that this strategy will stimulate teachers to engage in CPL from three perspectives, that of pedagogical skills development, vocational upskilling and

developing and building on their understanding of the context in which they work. This combination of approaches will support the development of dual professionalism incorporating aspects of professional expectations of a public sector professional, organisational professional and a holistic professional as outlined in chapter three, section 3.7 and chapter seven, section 7.2 (Shain and Gleeson, 1999; Evetts, 2005 and Clow 2006). This approach will ensure teachers engage with effective CPL, that the strategic aims of the organisation are shared, owned and met by all and that the student experience is of the high quality required for an Outstanding provider.

This approach to CPL will be based in a Teaching, Learning and Research Centre with learning and development led by the initial teacher training team and a team of teaching and learning coaches. Through this support and physical provision teachers will have the opportunity to participate in a programme of learning, based on a constructivist framework (Wilson, 2014). This strategy has been informed by reading around this subject, understanding strategies and approaches adopted by other organisations and input from the teachers at the Research College.

I acknowledge that funding in post-16 education is limited currently, and in fact has been in decline since 2009 (Fullfact, 2018) but investment into CPL is something that must be considered by the Research College if it really wants to see a significant change in the quality of teaching and learning. In 2015 the Principal of Gateshead College accepted this commitment and saw the positive impact of this on the College's achievements with an Outstanding grade from Ofsted. It is possible to engage with this proposed strategy with a limited budget but it will be necessary to think creatively, for instance, responsibilities being shared, teams being encouraged to support each other to facilitate vocational upskilling opportunities and other CPL participation.

By accepting commitment to the strategy for CPL, the Research College will be building capacity to enhance the quality of student learning and achievement

and commitment to addressing the national need to upskills the workforce of the future. It will support professional learning and dual professionalism through a blend of activity to motivate and develop skills through positive learning opportunities and a cultural shift, which will support individuals, teams and the whole college to sustain high quality learning (Stoll, Bolan, McMahon, Wallace and Thomas, 2006). This same strategy and model for a learning organisation will be able to be adapted by any general further education college of similar size and nature, thereby making it of general relevance to the Education and Training Sector and a significant contribution to knowledge of the field and the Sector.

This project was informed by a conceptual framework which outlined the need for continuous professional learning within a framework of constructivism (Wilson, 2014) drawing on an andragogical approach to learning (Knowles, 1984) and a social learning model (Steward, 2009). The outcome of the research has emerged to follow these concepts as the most effective way forward for teacher learning and development at the Research College. This outcome has been achieved by developing a methodology for research based on an epistemology of constructionism which was informed through an interpretivist lens (Crotty, 1998). These conceptual and theoretical frameworks enabled me to consider sources of reading and findings from my own research activity and interpret these to build on existing knowledge and experiences. Therefore I am confident that the outcome of this project is robust and should be able to support development of teachers as dual professionals both at the Research College and across the wider Education and Training Sector.

References

157 Group, (2012), *Leading Learning and Letting Go*. London: IfL

ASCL, (2018), *Continuous Professional Development and Learning,* https://www.ascl.org.uk/utilities/document-summary.html?id=4D36F75E-CA69-4159-9CA25400CCEEF3B1 [accessed 18.12.18]

Anselm, L., Strauss, J. and Corbin, J.M., (1990), *Basics of Qualitative Research: Grounded Theory Procedures and Techniques*, New York: Sage.

Arthur, J., Waring, M., Coe, R. and Hedges, L., (eds.), (2012), *Research Methods and Methodologies in Education*, California: Sage

Bapir, M.A., (ND), *Is it Possible for Qualitative Research to be Properly Valid and Reliable*,

Bailey, B., (2007), *The Establishment of Centres for the Training of Teachers in Technical and Further Education in England, 1933-1950*, Journal of Vocational Education and Training, 59:3, 279-294, DOT: 10.1080/13636820701520260

Bennett, T., (2013), *Teacher Proof*, Oxon: Routledge.

BERA, (2011), *Ethical Guidelines for Educational Research*, London.

Bloom, A., (2018), *Teachers Work More Overtime than Most Other Professionals in Britain*, https://www.tes.com/news/school-news/breaking-news/teachers-work-more-overtime-most-other-professionals-britain [accessed 24.2.18]

Boocock, R., C. and O'Rourke, R. K., (2018), *Workplace Learning and Career Progression: Qualitative Perspective of the UK Dietitians*, Journal of Human Nutrition and Dietetics, 31, pp. 704-711

Boud, D., (ed.), (1988), *Developing Student Autonomy in Learning,* (2nd Ed). London: Kogan Page

Broad, J., (2015), *So Many Worlds, So Much To Do: identifying barriers to engagement with continued professional development for teachers in the further education and training sector*, London Review of Education, 13:1, 16-29

Broad, J., (2018). 'Pedagogical issues in vocational teachers' learning: The importance of teacher development'. In S. McGrath, M. Mulder, J. Papier and R. Stuart (Eds), *International handbook of vocational education and training for the changing world of work*: Springer

Broad, J. and Lahiff, A., (2019). 'Capturing the elusive: How vocational teachers develop and sustain their expertise'. In L. Unwin and D. Guile (Eds), *The Wiley handbook of vocational education and training*: Wiley Blackwell

Brundrett, M., McCulloch, G., Helsby, G. and Knight, P., (2000), *The Politics of Professionalism: Teachers and the Curriculum (Review article)*, School Leadership and Management, 21, (2), pp. 240-241

Bryman, A., (2012), *Social Research Methods*, (4th Ed), Oxford: Oxford University Press

Burke, B. M., (2013), *Experiential Professional Development: A Model for Meaningful and Long-Lasting Change in Classrooms*, Journal of Experiential Education 36:3, 247 –263, SAGE Publications

CiPD, (2018), *About CPD*, https://www.cipd.co.uk/learn/cpd/about, [accessed 29.11.18]

Clow, R., (2006), *Further Education Teachers' Constructions of Professionalism*, Journal of Vocational Education and Training, 53(3), pp.407–19.

Coffield, F., (2008), *Just Suppose Teaching and Learning Became a First Priority,* London: Learning and Skills Network

Coghlan, D. and Brannick, T., (2014), *Doing Action Research in Your Own Organisation,* (4th Ed.) London: Sage.

Coghlan, D. and Brydon-Miller, M., (eds.), (2014), *The SAGE Encyclopaedia of Action Research*, London: Sage.

Cohen, L. and Manion, L., (1994). *Research Methods in Education,* (4th Ed.), New York: Routledge.

Cohen, L., Manion, L. and Morrison, K., (2011), *Research Methods in Education,* (7th Ed.) New York: Routledge.

Coles, A., (ed.), (2004), *Teaching in Post Compulsory Education: Policy, Practice and Values*, London: David Fulton Publishers.

Colley, H., James, D. and Diment, K., (2007), *Unbecoming Teachers: towards a more dynamic notion of professional participation*, Journal of Education Policy, 22:2, 173-193, DOI: 10.1080/02680930601158927

Commission on Adult and Vocational Teaching and Learning, (2013), *It's About Work: Excellent Adult Vocational Teaching and Learning,* London: LSIS

Coughlan, S., (2015), *Meltdown Warning in FE College Finances*, www.bbc.co.uk/news/education-33595027 [accessed 25.8.17]

Crawley, J., (2014), *How can a Deeper Understanding of the Professional Situation of the LLS Teacher Educators Enhance their Future Support, Professional Development and Working Context?*, Bath: Bath Spa University

Cresswell, J., (2009), *Research Design Qualitative, Quantitative and Mixed Methods Approaches,* (3rd Ed.), Thousand Oaks: Sage.

Crotty, M., (1998), *The Foundations of Social Research: Meaning and Perspective in the Research Process,* London: Sage.

Crowley, S., (ed.), (2014), *Challenging Professional Learning*, Abingdon: Routledge

Denscombe, M., (2003), *The Good Research Guide: For Small Scale Action Research,* (2nd Ed.), Maidenhead: Open University Press.

Denzin, N.K. and Lincoln, Y.S., (1994), *Handbook of Qualitative Research*, Thousand Oaks: Sage.

Department for Business, Innovation and Skills, (2012), *New Challenges, New Chances.* London: Dept. for Business, Innovation and Skills

Department for Business, Innovation and Skills, (2015), *Overseeing Financial Sustainability in the Further Education Sector*, London: National Audit Office

Department for Education and Skills, (2002), *Success for All: Reforming Further Education and Training,* London: DfES

Department for Education and Skills, (2004), *Equipping our Teachers for the Future*, London: DfES

Dick, B., (2002), *Post Graduate Programmes Using Action Research*, The Learning Organisation, 9(4), pp.159–170.

Duncombe, R. and Armour, K. M., (2003), *Enhancing Teachers' and Pupils' Learning in Primary School Physical Education: The Role of Collaborative Professional Learning*, Edinburgh: British Education Research Association

Dweck, C., (2012), *Mindset How You Can Fulfil Your Potential*, London: Robinson

Education and Training Foundation, (2017), *Further Education Workforce Data for England*, London: Frontier Economics

Elliott, J., (1991), *Action Research for Educational Change*, Buckingham: Open University Press.

Elliott, J., (1996), *Changing Teacher Roles, Identifies and Professionalism*, Available at:
http://www.tlrp.org/themes/seminar/gewirtz/papers/seminar8/paper.elliott.pdf [accessed October 27, 2015]

Elliott, J., (2006), *Changing Teacher Roles, Identifies and Professionalism*, Available at:
http://www.tlrp.org/themes/seminar/gewirtz/papers/seminar8/paper.elliott.pdf [accessed 24.2.18]

Evetts, J., (2005), *The Management of Professionalism: A Contemporary Paradox*, Nottingham: University of Nottingham

Feinman-Nemser, S., (2001), *From preparation to practice: designing a continuum to strengthen sustain teaching*, Teachers College Record, 103 (6): 1003-55

Flick, U., (2013), *Introducing Research Methodology*, London: Sage

Foster, A., (2005), *Realising the Potential: a review of the future role of further education colleges*, Annesley: Department for Education and Skills

Frontier Economics (2017), *Further Education Workforce Data for England, Analysis of the 2015-2016 Staff Individualised Record (SIR) data*, London: Education and Training Foundation

Fullfact, (2018), *Spending for Adult Skills fell by 40% between 2010 and 2015*, https://fullfact.org/education/spending-adult-skills/_[accessed 24.2.18]

Gleeson, D. James, D., (2007), *The Paradox of Professionalism in English Further Education: a TLC project perspective*, Educational Review, Vol 59 No 4, pg. 451-467,

Gleeson, D., Davies, J. and Wheeler, E., (2005), *On The Making And Taking Of Professionalism In The Further Education Workplace*, British Journal of Sociology of Education, 26:4, 445-460, DOI: 1080/01425690500199818

Gleeson, D., Hughes, J., O'Leary, M. and Smith, R., (2015), T*he State of Professional Practice and Policy in the English Further Education System: a view from below,* Research in Post-Compulsory Education, 20:1, 78-95, DoI 10.1080/13596748.2015.993877

Gomm, R., Hammersley, M. and Foster, P., (eds.), (2011), *Case Study Method*, London: Sage.

Guest, G., MacQueen, K. M. and Namey, E. E., (2012), *Applied Thematic Analysis*, Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications

Hamilton, L. and Corbett-Whittier, C., (2013), *Using Case Study in Education Research*, London: Sage.

Hammersley, M., (1990), *Reading Ethnographic Research: a Critical Guide*, London: Longmans.

Harper, H., (2013), *Outstanding Teaching in Lifelong Learning*. McGraw Hill Open University: Maidenhead

Hesse-Biber, S. N. and Leavy, P., (2006), *The Practice of Qualitative Research*, Thousand Oaks: Sage.

Hughes, D., (2017), *Decades of Cuts Cannot Continue,* https://www.aoc.co.uk/blog/decades-cuts-cannot-continue [accessed 22.9.17 and 7.4.18]

Institute for Learning, (2012), *Professionalism: Education and Training Practitioners Across Further Education and Skills*, London: IfL

Intuition, (2017), *Qualifications Key to Career Progress*. InTuition, 29, 26. London: SET

Jameson, J. and Hillier, Y., (2008), *Nothing will Prevent me from doing a Good Job. The professionalisation of part-time teaching staff in further and adult education*, Research in Post-Compulsory Education, 13:1, 39-53, DOI: 10.1080/13596740801903521

Jones, (2015), *The BERA / RSA report on Research and the Teaching Profession,* BERA, 2014, https://www.bera.ac.uk/wp-content/uploads/2013/12/BERA-RSA-Research-Teaching-Profession-FULL-REPORT-for-web.pdf [accessed 24.2.18]

Kennedy, A., (2005), *Models of Continuing Professional Development: A Framework for Analysis*, Journal of In-Service Education, 31:2, 235-249

Kennedy, H., (1997), *Learning Works, widening participation in further education*, Coventry: Further Education Funding Council

Knowles, M., (1984), *Andragogy in Action: Applying Modern Principles of Adult Learning*, San Francisco: Jossey-Bass

Kwakman, K., (2003), 'Factors Affecting Teachers' Participation' in *Professional Learning Activities*, Teaching and Teacher Education 19, 149-170

Lave, J., (1991). 'Situating learning in communities of practice*'* In L. Resnick, J. Levine, and S. Teasley (eds.), *Perspectives on socially shared cognition* (pages 63-82). Washington, DC: APA.

Lave, J., (1988), 'Cognition in Practice: Mind, Mathematics and Culture' in *Everyday Life (Learning in Doing)*, New York: Cambridge University Press

Lave, J. and Wenger, E., (1991) *Situated Learning: Legitimate Peripheral Participation*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press

Lavrakas, P. J., (2008), *Encyclopedia of Survey Research Methods*, http://methods.sagepub.com/reference/encyclopedia-of-survey-research-methods/n107.xml [accessed 11.8.18]

Leitch, S., (2004), *The Leitch Review of Skills,* London: HMSO

Lewin, K., (1946), *Action Research and Minority Problems*, Journal of Social Issues, 2, 34-46. http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1540-4560.1946.tb02295.x [accessed 25.8.17]

Lincoln, Y. S. and Guba, E. G., (1985), *Naturalistic Inquiry*, Beverly Hills: Sage

Lingfield, R., (2012), *Professionalism in Further Education*, Final Report, London: DfBIS

Lloyd, C. and Payne, J., (2012), *Raising the quality of Vocational Teachers: Continuing Professional Development in England, Wales and Norway*, Research Papers in Education, 27:1, 1-18, DOI: 10.1080/02671522.2010.483524

Lumby, J. and Foskett, N., (2005), *14-19 Education: Policy, Leadership and Learning*, London: Sage

Malloch, M., Cairns, L., Evans, K. and O'Connor, B. N., (eds), (2011), The Sage Handbook of Workplace Learning, London: Sage Publications Ltd

Marriss, D., (2018), *Chapter 1, Academic Staff Development*, https://uk.sagepub.com/sites/default/files/upm-binaries/36170_McIntosh_II_Proof.pdf*,* [accessed 29.11.18]

Martin, W., (2017), *Struggling Colleges Given £4m in Exceptional Financial Support*, London: Times Educational Supplement

Mattson, K., (2014), *Professional Development Verses Professional Learning* https://drkmattson.com/2014/07/19/professional-development-vs-professional-learning/ [accessed: 10.2.18]

McNiff, J. and Whitehead, J., (2005), *Action Research for Teachers: A Practical Guide*, London: David Fulton Publishers.

Merriam, S.B., (1988), *Case Study Research in Education: A Qualitative Approach*, San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Merriam, S. B., Ming-Yeh, L., Youngwha, K., Gabo, N. and Mazanah, M., (2004), *Power and Positionality: Negotiating Insider/Outsider Status Within and Across Cultures*, International Journal of Lifelong Education, 20 (5), pp.405–416

Moser, C., (1999), *Improving Literacy and Numeracy: a fresh start*, London: Department of Education and Employment

Munn-Giddings, C., (2012), 'Chapter 8.Action Research' in Arthur, J., Waring, M., Coe, R. and Hedges, L.V., (2012), (eds.), *Research Methods and Methodologies in Education*. London: Sage

Musset, P., (2010), 'Initial Teacher Education and Continuing Training Policies' in 'A Comparative Perspective: Current Practices' in *OECD Countries and a Literature Review on Potential Effects*, OECD Education Working Papers, No. 48, OECD Publishing, Paris, https://doi.org/10.1787/5kmbphh7s47h-en [accessed 10.2.18]

Nieto, S., (2003), *What Keeps Teachers Going*, New York: Teachers College Press

Norris, N., (1997), *Bias and Validity in Qualitative Research,* Educational Action Research, 5(1), pp.172–176.

Ofsted, (2013), *Further Education and Skills Inspection Report: Perry Beeches, The Academy*, Ofsted

Ofsted, (2014), *Further Education and Skills Inspection Report: York College*, Ofsted

Ofsted, (2015), *Further Education and Skills Inspection Report: Gateshead College*, Ofsted

Orr, K., (2008), Room for improvement? *The Impact of Compulsory Professional Development for Teachers in England's Further Education Sector*, Journal of In-service Education, 34:1, 97-108, DOI: 10.1080/13674580701832627

Oxford University Press, (2018), *Oxford English Dictionary,* Available at: https://en.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/thesis [Accessed July 2018]

Papert, S. and Harel, I., (1991), *Situating Constructionism,* Available at: http://www.papert.org/articles/SituatingConstructionism.html [Accessed February 20, 2015].

Plowright, D. and Barr, G., (2012), *An Integrated Professionalism in Further Education: a time for prognosis?* Journal of Further and Higher Education, Vol 36 No 1, 1-16

Punch, K. F. and Oancea, A., (2014), *Introduction to Research Methods in Education*, (2nd Ed.), California: Sage

Punch, K.F., (2009), *Continuing Professional Development in the Lifelong Learning Sector*, London: Sage.

Randle, K. and Brady, N., (1997), *Managerialism and Professionalism in the 'Cinderella Service'*, Journal of vocational Education and Training, 49:1, 121-139, DOI: 10.1080/13636829700200007

Rhee, Y., (2004), *The EPO Chain in Relationships Management: A Case Study of a Government Organisation.* Unpublished doctoral dissertation.

Ritchie, J., Lewis, J., McNaughton Nicholls, C. O. R., (eds.), (2014), *Qualitative Research Practice* (2nd Ed.), California: Sage

Robson, J., (1998), *A Profession in Crisis: status, culture and identity in the further education college*, Journal of Vocational Education and Training, Vol 50, No 4, pg. 585-607

Robson, J., (2006), *Teacher Professionalism in Further and Higher Education,* Abingdon: Routledge

Robson, J., Bailey, B. and Larkin, S., (2004), *Adding Value: investigating the discourse of professionalism adopted by vocational teachers in further education colleges*, Journal of Education and Work, 17:2, 183-195, DOI: 10.1080/13639080410001677392

Robson, C. and McCartan, K., (1993), *Real World Research*, London: Wiley and Sons

Roesken-Winter, B., Schuler, S., Stahnke, R. and Blomeke, S., (2015), *Effective CPD on a large scale: examining the development of multipliers*, ZDM Mathematics Education, 47:1, 13-25, available at https://doi.org/10.1007/s11858-014-0644-5 [accessed Sept 2018]

Scales, P., (2012), *Considering CPD Matter,* InTuition, 8, 16. London, SET

Scales, P., Pickering, J., Senior, L., Headley, K., Garner, P. and Boulton, H., (2011), *Continuing Professional Development in the Lifelong Learning Sector,* Maidenhead: McGraw Hill Open University Press

Schon, D., (1983), *The Reflective Practitioner: How Professionals Think in Action*, New York: Basic Books

Schon, D., (1991), *The Reflective Turn: Case studies in and on educational practice*, New York: Teachers College Press

Senge P. M., (1992), *The Fifth Discipline: The Art and Practice of the Learning Organisation*, New York: Doubleday

Sennett, R., (2008), *The Craftsman*, London: Penguin Group

Shain, F. and Gleeson, D., (1999), *Under New Management: changing conceptions of teacher professionalism and policy in the further education sector*, Journal of Education Policy, 14:4, 445-462, DOI: 10.1080/026809399286288

Shuttleworth, M., *Research Bias Arthur,* Available at: https://explorable.com/research-bias [Accessed May 16, 2015]

SI News, (2015), *Vocational Education and Training in Victoria, Australia*, https://www.studyinternational.com/news/vocational-education-training-in-victoria-australia/#BWrMihWjWuFE9ue6.97 [accessed: 25.8.17]

Sikes, P. and Potts, A., (eds.), (2008), *Researching Education from the Inside*, Abingdon: Routledge

Silverman, D., (2010), *Doing Qualitative Research* (3rd Ed.), London: Sage

Slavin, R., (2007), *Educational Research in an age of accountability*. USA: Pearson Education

Society for Education and Training *What is ATS?*, Available at: www.set.et-foundation.co.uk/professionalism/cpd/, [accessed 24.2.18].

Society of Education and Training, *Professionalism*, Available at www.set.et-foundation.co.uk/professionalism/cpd/, [accessed 7.1.18].

Somekh, B., (1995), *The Contribution of Action Research to Development in Social Endeavours: A Position Paper on Action Research Methodology,* British Educational Research Journal, 21(3).

Spenceley, L., (2006), S*moke and Mirrors: an examination of the concept of professionalism within the FE Sector*, Research in Post Compulsory Education, 11:3, 289 302 DOI: 10 1080/13596740600916534

Srivastava, P. and Hopwood, N., (2009), *A Practical Iterative Framework for Qualitative Data Analysis,* International Journal of Qualitative Methods: Alberta, IIQM, University of Alberta

Stake, R.E., (1995), *The Art of Case Study Research*. Thousand Oaks: Sage

Stake, R.E., (2006), *Multiple Case Study Analysis*, New York: The Guildford Press

Stenhouse, L., (1975), *An introduction to curriculum research and development*, London: Heinemann

Steward, A., (2009), *Continuing Your Professional Development in Lifelong Long Learning.* London: Continuum

Stoll, L., Bolan, R., McMahon, A., Wallace, M. and Thomas, S., (2006), *Professional Learning Communities: A Review of the Literature*, Journal of Educational Change, 7, 221-258, DOI 10.1007/s10833-006-0001-8

Swanborn, P., (ND) *Case Study Research, what, why and how?*, London: Sage

Syed, M., (2011), *Bounce: The Myth of Talent and the Power of Practice*, London: Fourth Estate

Talent LMS, (2018), *Continuous Learning*, https://www.talentlms.com/elearning/continuous-learning [accessed 30.11.18]

Tikkanen, T., Hovdhaugen, E. and Storen, L. A., (2018), *Work-related Training and Workplace Learning: Nordic Perspectives and European Comparisons*, International Journal of Lifelong Education, DOI: 10.1080/02601370.2018.1554721

Tough, P., (2014), *How Children Succeed*, USA: Arrow.

Wallace, S., (2013), *Doing Research in Further Education and Training*, London: Learning Matters (Sage)

Webster-Wright, A., (2009), *Reframing Professional Development Through Understanding Authentic Professional Learning*, Review of Educational Research 79.2, 702-739

Wenger, E., (1998), *Communities of Practice: Learning, Meaning and Identity*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press

Wilson, L., (2014), *Practical Teaching* (2nd Ed). Andover: Cengage Learning

Wilson, N. and McLean, S.I., (1994), *Questionnaire Design: A Practical Introduction*, Belfast: University of Ulster

Wisker, G., (2001), *The Postgraduate Research Handbook*, Basingstoke: Palgrave MacMillan

Wolf, A., (2011), *Review of Vocational Education: the Wolf report*, London: Department for Education

Yin, R., (2009), *Case Study Research: Design and Methods* (4th Ed.), Thousand Oaks: Sage.

Zuber-Skerritt, O., (1992), *Action Research in Higher Education - Examples and Reflections*, London: Kogan Page.

Appendices

1   Sample Transcript Feedback from Interview Participant

2   Participant Sample Groups

3   Ethical Approval Application and Information

4   Adult Opt in Information Statement and Consent (example of form to external participants, teachers, managers)

5   Hourly Paid Teacher Consent Email

6a   Initial Research Instrument – Questionnaire

6b   Initial Research Instrument – Stage One Interviews (other colleges)

6c   Initial Research Instrument – Stage Two Interviews

6d   Initial Research Instrument – Stage Three Interviews

6e   Initial Research Instrument – Themes for Group Interview with Executive Directors (SMT)

6f   Initial Research Instrument – Hourly Paid Teacher Survey

Sample Transcript Feedback from Interview Participants

RE: EdD Research Activity

████████████████████████████████████

Reply|

Wed 06/07/2016 11:25

To:

Rachel Kirk (EDU)

Inbox

Hi Rachel,

Thanks for sharing your transcript and reflective notes. I have looked through them and feel the transcript is a true record of our discussion. I don't see anything in your reflective notes that is inaccurate.

Thanks again, and keep up the good work!

Regards

██

~~~

███████

Head of Division: Education, Training and Learning Development

███████████████████████████████

█████████████████████

From: Rachel Kirk (EDU) [mailto:Rachel.Kirk@uea.ac.uk]
Sent: 1 July 2016 18:40
To: ████████████████
Subject: EdD Interview

Hi ████

I am emailing to thank you for meeting with me, I found our discussions really useful and interesting. I have tidied up the notes of our discussion and attached them here for you to look through and check for accuracy. I have also written up my own reflective

thoughts from the meeting which are also attached for you to look through. Feel free to make comments if you think that I have misunderstood or got the wrong idea of something.

I would like to discuss with you further the outcome of your CPD day in February and the impact of the external speakers attending. Maybe this could be done by phone at some point in the near future.

Thank again for meeting with me.

Kind regards
Rachel

Rachel Kirk

Sent from Windows Mail

From: ████████████████████████

Sent: 12 February 2017 16:02

To: Rachel Kirk (EDU - Postgraduate Researcher)

Subject: Re: Research Project Interview

Hi

Thanks for sending me the transcript for our interview. I can confirm that I am happy with what you've written and have nothing I want to change or comment on.

Thanks

██

From: ████████████████████████

Sent: 11 February 2017 12:14

To: Rachel Kirk (EDU - Postgraduate Researcher)

Subject: Re: Research Project Interview

Hi

I have read the transcript of our interview and its fine. Thank you very much for sharing it.

Best wishes

██

From: ████████████████████

Sent: 12 February 2017 09:10

To: Rachel Kirk (EDU - Postgraduate Researcher)

Subject: Re: Research Project Interview

Hi

Thank you for sharing the transcript. I think that you have captured the discussions well and there is nothing that I feel needs to be changed or removed.

Best wishes

████████████

From: ████████████████████████

Sent: 11 February 2017 12:21

To: Rachel Kirk (EDU - Postgraduate Researcher)

Subject: Re: Research Project Interview

Hi

Thanks for the transcript. It seems good to me. The point about the team covering for one person I want to just confirm that this was for two weeks.

Thanks very much

██████

Hi

I have looked through the transcript and I am happy with what you've written.

Thanks for sharing

██████

Original email asking for transcript approval:

On Mon, Feb 5, 2017 at 1:37 PM Rachel Kirk (EDU - Postgraduate Researcher) <Rachel.Kirk> wrote:
Hi
Thank you very much for meeting with me this week for the first interview for my research project.

As I mentioned, I would appreciate your feedback on the transcript, in order to ensure that I have interpreted your comments accurately.

I have attached here, can you please let me have your approval, or comments within the next 7 days. If I haven't heard from you by the end of the day on 12th February then I will work on the basis that you have no comments to make and that you're happy with the content.

Thanks again for your help and I'll see you in a few months when I move on to stage 2 of my research.

Best wishes
Rachel

Participant Sample Groups

Business & Finance Teacher Group

Teacher	Subject	Experience	Teaching Qualification	Nature
Teacher 1	Travel & Tourism	Under 10 years in FE, from T&T industry (10 years)	PGCE	Student focussed, positive attitude towards CPD and delivering best quality TLA. Returns to sector in holidays
Teacher 2	Accountancy	5 years in FE Qualified accountant	PGCE	Organised, compliant, keen to do best for students. Funding own MA Still operating as accountant for private clients
Teacher 3	Business Management	Over 15 years in FE, business development management background	PGCE	Actively engages in self-directed research Feels restricted by CPD approach Questions management
Teacher 4	Business Management	4 years in FE worked for Peter Jones then for PJ Training organisation	Cert Ed	Compliant, doesn't challenge Goes back into vocational area during holidays

Performing Arts Teacher Group

Teacher	Subject	Experience	Teaching Qualification	Nature
Teacher 1	Media	Under 15 years in FE, from media industry (10 years) A number of years working in social services dealing with youth offenders	PGCE	Student focussed, positive attitude towards delivering best quality TLA. Doesn't take opportunity to update vocational skills because feels unsupported by CPD Questions the approach to CPD, too generic, however, wants to be involved in improving it by supporting teachers across college as a coach.
Teacher 2	Animation	5 years in FE 10 years in animation and film industry	PGCE	Took two weeks out to return to industry, supported by colleagues, talks a lot about the benefits of this. Doesn't comply with college expectations for management of provision for CPD.
Teacher 3	Dance	Over 10 years in FE, from dance sector, stage and cruises	PGCE	Actively engages in self-directed CPD, e.g. attending dance classes, courses etc. Feels restricted by CPD approach – doesn't see that generic CPD on cross college days are

				relevant to performing arts staff.
Teacher 4	Media	3 years in FE	No teaching qualification	Compliant, follows the lead of the rest of the team, has avoided teacher training, and doesn't think it's relevant to him! Not maintaining vocational skills, opportunities haven't been available for him.
Teacher 5	Performing Arts	3 years in FE	PGCE	Very positive about high quality TLA and student experience. Attends cross college CPD but doesn't see relevance. Is continuously engaged in own CPD through involvement with local theatre and comedy groups.

Hourly Paid Teachers

Teacher	Subject	Experience	Teaching Qualification	Nature
Teacher 1	ESOL	Under 10 years in FE Started as an ESOL teacher and then assistant in ESOL lessons	Enrolled on CELTA	Wants the best for her students Doesn't attend CPD – not relevant to her and at times she can't make
Teacher 2	Maths	5 years in FE School teacher	PGCE	Organised, compliant, keen to do best for students. Attends CPD but doesn't feel she gains useful information for her role.
Teacher 3	Spanish	Over 15 years in FE	No teaching qualification	Actively engages in self-directed CPD by working as translator and travelling between England and Spain regularly Doesn't attend college CPD
Teacher 4	Yoga	7 years in FE Works as yoga instructor at various sports centres etc	No teaching qualification	Has attended some college CPD but doesn't see the relevance
Teacher 5	Pottery	4 years in FE Works as a potter in the region	No teaching qualification	Doesn't engage in any college activity other than his teaching

Executive Directors

Director	Subject	Experience	Teaching Qualification	Nature
Director 1	Business & Finance	12 years in FE Started as a Hospitality teacher Background in hotels and restaurants	PGCE MBA	Extremely organised, high expectations of teachers Supports vocational upskilling but in holiday periods Runs regular department meetings with CPD sharing on the agenda
Director 2	Performing Arts	18 years in FE Drama and performance background	PGCE	Recognises the importance of CPD but if she doesn't see relevance of CPD days to her team she will arrange departmental CPD Doesn't actively support vocational upskilling but does support staff who arrange their own.

Ethical Approval Application

UNIVERSITY OF EAST ANGLIA

SCHOOL OF EDUCATION AND LIFELONG LEARNING RESEARCH ETHICS COMMITTEE

APPLICATION FOR ETHICAL APPROVAL OF A RESEARCH PROJECT

This form is for all staff and students across the UEA who are planning educational research. Applicants are advised to consult the school and university guidelines before preparing their application by visiting https://www.uea.ac.uk/research/our-research-integrity and reading the EDU Research Ethics Handbook. The Research Ethics page of the EDU website provides links to the University Research Ethics Committee, the UEA ethics policy guidelines, ethics guidelines from BERA and the ESRC, and resources from the academic literature, as well as relevant policy updates: www.uea.ac.uk/edu/research/researchethics. If you are involved in counselling research you should consult the BACP Guidelines for Research Ethics: www.bacp.co.uk/research/ethical_guidelines.php.

Applications must be approved by the Research Ethics Committee before beginning data generation or approaching potential research participants.

- Staff and Postgraduate (PGR) student applications (including the required attachments) must be submitted electronically to Dawn Corby d.corby@uea.ac.uk, two weeks before a scheduled committee meeting.
- Undergraduate students and other students must follow the procedures determined by their course of study.

APPLICANT DETAILS	
Name:	Rachel Kirk
School:	Education
Current Status:	**PGR Student** **(delete as applicable)**
UEA Email address:	**Rau06qgc@uea.ac.uk**

If PGR Student, name of primary supervisor and programme of study:
Dr Jan Watson,   Doctor of Education

If UG student or other student, name of Course and Module:

The following paperwork must be submitted to EDU REC **BEFORE** the application can be approved. Applications with missing/incomplete sections will be returned to the applicant for submission at the next EDU REC meeting.

Required paperwork	✓ Applicant Tick to confirm
Application Form (fully completed)	✓
Participant Information sheet (EDU template)	✓
Participant Consent form (EDU templates appropriate for nature of participants i.e. adult/parent/carer etc.)	✓
Other supporting documents (for e.g. questionnaires, interview/focus group questions, stimulus materials, observation checklists, letters of invitation, recruitment posters etc)	✓

2. PROPOSED RESEARCH PROJECT DETAILS:	
Title:	Working title –**From A Plumber who Teaches to a Teacher of Plumbing:** A model of continuous professional development to support dual professionalism for teachers in the Education and Training Sector
Start/End Dates:	January 2016-July 2018

3. FUNDER DETAILS (IF APPLICABLE):	
Funder:	N/A

	Has funding been applied for? NO Application Date:
	Has funding been awarded? NO
Will ethical approval also be sought for this project from another source? NO	
	If "yes" what is this source?

4. APPLICATION FORM FOR RESEARCH INVOLVING HUMAN PARTICIPANTS:

4.1 Briefly outline, using lay language, your research focus and questions or aims (no more than 300 words).

The aim of this research is to develop and evaluate a model of professional development designed to encourage personalised continuous professional development (CPD) for teachers at a college of general further education in west Suffolk (research site). It is intended that, whilst supporting the research site to meet the aims of its Strategic Plan and vision for its students, the expectation is the model will enable teachers to take control of their personal and professional growth as dual professionals.

The research aims to

- Explore and test concepts and models of negotiated CPD which support development of professional autonomy for the teacher as dual professionals.
- Investigate models of CPD which allow teachers to experience different approaches and build on these experiences. They will:
    - Allow for professional growth of teachers through investigation and exploration of practice contextualised to their own vocation and the Education and Training Sector (ETS).
    - Develop existing provision of teaching, learning and assessment for the research site, robust enough to withstand the rigours and expectations of external auditors.
    - Enable the research site to respond positively to the demands and needs of its stake holders, for instance employers, the community, parents and the students.
    - Enable the research site to support its students in embracing the open mindedness and characteristics of independent young people with high expectations for their own success.
- Recommend approaches that could be adopted for CPD incorporating scope to meet institutional needs as well as supporting personal professional growth of teachers, both at the research site and across the ETS.

4.2 Briefly outline your proposed research methods, including who will be your research participants and where you will be working (no more than 300 words).

- **Please provide details of any relevant demographic detail of participants (age, gender, race, ethnicity etc)**

This research will be an action research project within the framework of a case study. Three teaching teams from the research site will be the case study groups.

The teaching teams will be sessional teachers, the Performing Arts team and the Building & Construction team, other participants will include members of the Senior Management Team (SMT), College Management Team (CMT) and CPD managers at other organisations in both within the UK and internationally (probably in Melbourne, Australia).

Research methods used include questionnaire, group interviews with teachers and managers, an initial pilot project, visits to other education providers and an extended trial of CPD activity for an academic year. I will also have access to external surveys completed by teachers at the research site.

Interviews with members of SMT will establish what their expectations are for a robust CPD programme for the organisation in order to achieve the Strategic Plan and vision for students. These will be enhanced by half termly one to one meetings with Curriculum Directors which will identify the operational needs for Professional Development.

Findings from the questionnaire and interviews with the case study groups will provide cumulative data to inform the initial pilot project to be tested with two case study groups. The outcome of this will inform a trial for all case study groups to engage with. Further group reviews with case study groups will inform an extended trial, again for all case study groups.

4.3 Briefly explain how you plan to gain access to prospective research participants. (no more than 300 words).

- **If children/young people (or other vulnerable people, such as people with mental illness) are to be involved, give details of how gatekeeper permission will be obtained. Please provide any relevant documentation (letters of invite, emails etc) that might be relevant**
- **Is there any sense in which participants might be 'obliged' to participate – as in the case of students, prisoners or patients – or are volunteers being recruited? How will you ensure fully informed and freely given consent in the recruitment process? Entitlement to withdraw consent must be indicated and when that entitlement lapses.**

All the participants are employees of the research site, some are hourly paid and others on permanent contracts.

All participants will be members of the three teams mentioned previously, managers at the research site and CPD managers from other organisations, within the UK and abroad (Australia). They will be encouraged to participate but they will not be obliged to take part. However, it is acknowledged that some might feel obliged because the whole teaching team will be invited to participate and they might not want to let their colleagues down. I will meet with each team of teachers to discuss the project and their participation before the research starts. At this point each team member will be given the opportunity to opt in or out. They will be made aware that they have a right to withdraw at any time and will be reassured that there will be no negative consequences if they chose not to take part.

I shall clarify that I will be seeking voluntary informed consent from participants based on my disclosure of actions and activities at every step and how I will use the data.

4.4 Please state who will have access to the data and what measures will be adopted to maintain the confidentiality of the research subject and to comply with data protection requirements e.g. will the data be anonymised? (No more than 300 words.)

All participants will be briefed prior to any activity on this project. They will be advised of their rights, which include confidentiality of information. I do not consider that it's realistic to offer full anonymity as the research is taking place in one organisation and it is feasible that terms used by some participants will be recognised and so they will be identifiable. Participants will be advised not to make reference to named individuals during interviews and discussions, however if a participant should do so then the names will not be transcribed or used in the findings of this research.

All participants will be offered the opportunity to review the data at each stage of the project to ensure validity.

All data will be stored on to an external hard drive which will be secured with a password for access. A back up of all data will be stored on the research site network which is fully secured from external access and password and login details are needed to access each personal area of this site. Interviews and focus groups will be recorded on to a digital recorder. These files will be uploaded to the external hard drive within 24 hours of the event and deleted from the digital recorder. I will conform with the ethical requirements of researchers at the UEA in that all data will be stored for 10 years.

4.5 Will you require access to data on participants held by a third party? In cases where participants will be identified from information held by another party (for example, a doctor or school) describe the arrangements you intend to make to gain access to this information (no more than 300 words).

It will not be necessary to have access to information held by a third party.

4.6 Please give details of how consent is to be obtained (no more than 300 words).

Copies of proposed information sheets and consent forms, written in simple, non-technical language, MUST accompany this proposal form. You may need more than one information sheet and consent form for different types of participants. (Do not include the text of these documents in this space).

Consent will be gained through face to face meetings where the project will be explained. All participating teachers will be asked to sign the same consent form which will explain their part in the research and their opportunities to withdraw. The consent form will also explain the intention for confidentiality and anonymity and include information about the research.

There will also be face to face meetings with managers to explain the project and a consent form relevant to their part in the project will be discussed. At these meetings a consent and information document will be provided together with an appropriate.

All participants will be fully briefed prior to any activity on this project. They will be reminded of their rights as participants.

Participants will be advised they can withdraw from the project before or after the initial survey but no later than that.

4.7 If any payment or incentive will be made to any participant, please explain what it is and provide the justification (no more than 300 words).

N/A

4.8 What is the anticipated use of the data, forms of publication and dissemination of findings etc.? (No more than 300 words.)

The primary use of the data will be to inform the research site of a model for continuous professional development that will enable dual professionalism within its organization and ensure outstanding teaching and learning for all its students.

Secondary uses of the data will be that other organisations of similar size, body and socio economic community will use the model or elements of it to improve the provision at their organisations.

The work will be shared with the other organisations that participate, e.g. a college and sixth form centre.

I hope to share the findings with sector organisations such as the Association of Colleges and the Education and Training Foundation.

4.9 Findings of this research/project would usually be made available to participants. Please provide details of the form and timescale for feedback. What commitments will be made to participants regarding feedback? How will these obligations be verified? If findings are not to be provided to participants, explain why. (No more than 300 words.)

All participants who are involved in questionnaires and interviews will be offered the opportunity to review the data obtained at each stage of the project to ensure validity and ethical conformity. They will be advised that they will have the opportunity to view the transcripts and data within four weeks of the event taking place and should provide feedback within two week. All participants will be advised that they can ask for changes to be made and specific sensitive data to be anonymised, or removed if necessary. On transcripts participants can add track changes if they feel that something doesn't state quite what they wanted it to state.

4.10 Please add here any other ethical considerations the ethics committee may need to be made aware of (no more than 300 words).
- **If you are conducting research in a space where individuals may also choose not to participate, how will you ensure they will not be included in any data collection or adversely affected by non-participation? An example of this might be in a classroom where observation and video recording of a new teaching strategy is being assessed. If consent for all students to be videoed is not received, how will you ensure that a) those**

children will not be videoed and/or b) that if they are removed from that space, that they are not negatively affected by that?

It is possible that some teachers in any of the three teams being included as case study groups might not want to participate in this research. In this instance they will not be obliged to and will not be expected to attend review meetings or interviews that will take place with other members of their teaching team.

Those teachers who choose not to participate in this research project will not be negatively affected in terms of their CPD opportunity. The college offers a programme of CPD every year, some of which is mandatory and all staff are expected to participate. Those teachers who do not participate in this project will still be expected to participate in the usual college wide CPD activity. They will not be expected to participate in any CPD activity that the rest of their team might choose to organize as part of this project.

4.11   What risks or costs to the participants are entailed in involvement in the research/project? Are there any potential physical, psychological or disclosure dangers that can be anticipated? What is the possible harm to the participant or society from their participation or from the project as a whole? What procedures have been established for the care and protection of participants (e.g. insurance, medical cover, counselling or other support) and the control of any information gained from them or about them?

A possible, low level risk for the participants is embarrassment. This will be mitigated against by ensuring meetings and any CPD activity the teacher participates with will be negotiated with them and the project will be managed in an open and honest project manner, ensuring transparency at every stage.

Further areas of risk is to the research site and is a result of possible inappropriate behaviour of participants when engaging in external CPD activity, or by myself as the researcher when interviewing representatives of other organisations. These risks can be avoided or pre-empted by discussing the expectations of professional behaviour when representing the college, both by participants and myself.

The research methods themselves have been considered ethically to ensure that they do not cause offence, the nature of questions in questionnaires and interviews will be sensitive to the participant groups, they will be free of bias, not misleading and will be explained clearly to the participants. Participants will be advised that the research will avoid putting them in an embarrassing or difficult situation and they will be advised of the time commitment needed by them.

4.12   What is the possible benefit to the participant or society from their participation or from the project as a whole?

The benefit to the participants is that they will be able to give feedback on approaches to professional development and be involved first hand in designing a programme that meets the needs of teaching staff and the organization, enabling development of dual professionalism and relevance to their vocational updating.

The benefit to the research site is that it will have a robust, tested programme of CPD which supports the Strategic Plan and vision and supports staff to work towards these goals.

4.13   Comment on any cultural, social or gender-based characteristics of the participants which have affected the design of the project or which may affect its conduct. This may be particularly relevant if conducting research overseas or with a particular cultural group
   - **You should also comment on any cultural, social or gender-based characteristics of you as the researcher that may also affect the design of the project or which may affect its conduct**

All participants of this research are employed as teachers or managers in educational organisations, either the College at the centre of this research or another General Further Education College or a Sixth Form in a school in the UK or a College of Technical and Further Education in Melbourne, Australia. The participants are well balanced in terms of gender and cultural background and their selection has not caused the need for any changes or modifications to be made to the design of the research methodology.

The only issue that has caused a change to the research methods is that the sessional (hourly paid) teachers will need to be contacted and interviewed by phone, video call or email because they are not based on one site and are not at work at the same time as each other. Unlike the Performing Arts team or the Building and Construction teams who are all based at the college and working full time.

All participants will have capacity to give consent, they are all professional adults, over the age of 18, all working in the Education and Training Sector in a position of responsibility.

4.14   Identify any significant environmental impacts arising from your research/project and the measures you will take to minimise risk of impact.

There is no environmental impact arising from this research project

4.15   Please state any precautions being taken to protect your health and safety. Have you taken out travel and health insurance for the full period of the research? If not, why not. Have you read and acted upon FCO travel advice (https://www.gov.uk/foreign-travel-advice)? If acted upon, how?
- **Provide details including the date that you have accessed information from FCO or other relevant organization**
- **If you have undertaken the EDU Risk Assessment form for Field Study activities, please indicate if this was approved and date of approval**

I have business travel insurance which will cover me for travel to and from other organizations that might be involved in this research.

4.16   Please state any precautions being taken to protect the health and safety of other researchers and others associated with the project (as distinct from the participants or the applicant).

N/A

4.17 The UEA's staff and students will seek to comply with travel and research guidance provided by the British Government and the Governments (and Embassies) of host countries. This pertains to research permission, in-country ethical clearance, visas, health and safety information, and other travel advisory notices where applicable. If this research project is being undertaken outside the UK, has formal permission/a research permit been sought to conduct this research? Please describe the action you have taken and if a formal permit has not been sought please explain why this is not necessary/appropriate (for very short studies it is not always appropriate to apply for formal clearance, for example).

N/A

4.18   Are there any procedures in place for external monitoring of the research, for instance by a funding agency?

No, this is a research project for the Doctorate of Education and will be monitored by my supervisors.

5. DECLARATION:

Please complete the following boxes with YES, NO, or NOT APPLICABLE:

I have read (and discussed with my supervisor if student) the University's Research Ethics Policy, Principle and Procedures, and consulted the British Educational Research Association's Revised Ethical Guidelines for Educational Research and other available documentation on the EDU Research Ethics webpage and, when appropriate, the BACP Guidelines for Research Ethics.	yes
I am aware of the relevant sections of the Data Protection Act (1998): http://www.hmso.gov.uk/acts/acts1998/19980029.htm and Freedom of Information Act (2005).	
Data gathering activities involving schools and other organizations will be carried out only with the agreement of the head of school/organization, or an authorised representative, and after adequate notice has been given.	yes

The purpose and procedures of the research, and the potential benefits and costs of participating (e.g. the amount of their time involved), will be fully explained to prospective research participants at the outset.	yes
My full identity will be revealed to potential participants.	yes
Prospective participants will be informed that data collected will be treated in the strictest confidence and will only be reported in anonymised form unless identified explicitly and agreed upon	Yes
All potential participants will be asked to give their explicit, written consent to participating in the research, and, where consent is given, separate copies of this will be retained by both researcher and participant.	yes
In addition to the consent of the individuals concerned, the signed consent of a parent/carer will be required to sanction the participation of minors (i.e. persons under 16 years of age).	yes
Undue pressure will not be placed on individuals or institutions to participate in research activities.	yes
The treatment of potential research participants will in no way be prejudiced if they choose not to participate in the project.	Yes
I will provide participants with my UEA contact details (*not* my personal contact details) and those of my supervisor, in order that they are able to make contact in relation to any aspect of the research, should they wish to do so. I will notify participants that complaints can be made to the Head of School.	yes
Participants will be made aware that they may freely withdraw from the project at any time without risk or prejudice.	yes
Research will be carried out with regard for mutually convenient times and negotiated in a way that seeks to minimise disruption to schedules and burdens on participants	Yes
At all times during the conduct of the research I will behave in an appropriate, professional manner and take steps to ensure that neither myself nor research participants are placed at risk.	Yes
The dignity and interests of research participants will be respected at all times, and steps will be taken to ensure that no harm will result from participating in the research	Yes
The views of all participants in the research will be respected.	yes
Special efforts will be made to be sensitive to differences relating to age, culture, disability, race, sex, religion and sexual orientation, amongst research participants, when planning, conducting and reporting on the research.	Yes
Data generated by the research (e.g. transcripts of research interviews) will be kept in a safe and secure location and will be used purely for the purposes of the research project (including dissemination of findings). No-one other than research colleagues, professional transcribers and supervisors will have access to any identifiable raw data collected, unless written permission has been explicitly given by the identified research participant.	Yes
Research participants will have the right of access to any data pertaining to them.	yes
All necessary steps will be taken to protect the privacy and ensure the anonymity and non-traceability of participants – e.g. by the use of pseudonyms, for both individual and	Yes

institutional participants, in any written reports of the research and other forms of dissemination.

I am satisfied that all ethical issues have been identified and that satisfactory procedures are in place to deal with those issues in this research project. I will abide by the procedures described in this form.

Name of Applicant:	Rachel Kirk
Date:	28 February 2016

PGR Supervisor declaration (for PGR student research only)

I have discussed the ethics of the proposed research with the student and am satisfied that all ethical issues have been identified and that satisfactory procedures are in place to deal with those issues in this research project.

Name of PGR Supervisor:	Dr Jan Watson
Date:	28 February 2016

Name of PGR Supervisor:	Professor Terry Haydn
Date:	28 February 2016

EDU ETHICS COMMITTEE 2014/15

Adult Opt In Information Statement and Consent (example of form to external participants, teachers, managers)

Rachel Kirk
Doctorate of Education, Student
March 2016

School of Education and Lifelong Learning
University of East Anglia
Norwich Research Park
Norwich NR4 7TJ
United Kingdom

Email: rau06qgc@uea.ac.uk

Working title –**From A Plumber who Teaches to a Teacher of Plumbing:**
A study to inform a strategy for teacher learning and development designed to provide opportunity for personalised learning and growth of dual professionalism at a college of general further education in Suffolk, whilst also enabling achievement of the strategic plan and vision for the college.

PARTICIPANT INFORMATION STATEMENT

(1) What is this study about?

You are invited to take part in a research study the aim of which is to develop a model of professional development designed to encourage personalised continuous professional development (CPD) for teachers at a college of general further education in west Suffolk (research site). It is intended that, whilst supporting the research site to meet the aims of its Strategic Plan and vision for its students, the model could enable teachers to take control of their personal and professional growth as dual professionals. Data collected from your participation in this research will contribute to the development of a model of continuous professional development as the final outcome of this research. You have been invited to participate in this study because I would like to have an understanding of the professional development activity at other, similar organisations. This Participant Information Statement tells you about the research study. Knowing what is involved will help you decide if you want to take part in the research. Please read this document carefully and if you want to find out more about the project please contact me at rau06qgc@uea.ac.uk.

Being in this study is completely voluntary and you do not have to take part. Your decision whether to participate will not affect your current or future relationship with me, West Suffolk College or anyone else at the University of East Anglia.

By giving your consent to take part in this study you are telling us that you:
- ✓   Understand what you have read.
- ✓   Agree to take part in the research study as outlined below.
- ✓   Agree to the use of your personal information as described.

(2)   Who is running the study?

The study is being carried out by Rachel Kirk, a student on the Doctorate of Education (EdD) programme at the University of East Anglia (UEA). In addition I am the Assistant Principal Quality Improvement at the College but this research is being carried out in my capacity as an EdD student.

(3)   What will the study involve for me?

This project will span two years, starting in April 2016. You will not be expected to write reports, fill in forms or keep records. All of that will be done by me! However, I will need you to take part in some research activity. If you agree to participate in this study you will be asked to engage in informal interviews at intervals throughout the next two years. These interviews will usually be one to one interviews and will focus on your organisation's approach to professional development and how this evolves over the two year period. These interviews will usually take place during or at the end of a working day and will be face to face, by telephone or by video conferencing. The interviews will also be recorded on a digital recorder so that I can make sure I have got everything that is said and write a transcript from the recording. The recording will be deleted as soon as I have finished writing up the transcript and you will be given a copy of the transcript to check for accuracy.

(4)   How much of my time will the study take?
My intention is that this project will take very little additional time out of your working week. I intend that the interviews we have will be held during your usual working week and should take no more than 60 minutes.

(5)   Can I withdraw from the study once I've started?
If you decide to take part in the study and then change your mind later, you are free to withdraw at any time. You may refuse to answer any questions that you do not wish to answer during an interview.
You can withdraw by emailing me at rau06qgc@uea.ac.uk.

(6)   Are there any risks or costs associated with being in the study?
The risk to you as a participant in this research project is limited but should be acknowledged. The risk that might exist is one of embarrassment. This risk could be through embarrassment in interview, for instance through insensitive questions. To avoid this risk I will make sure that I am open and honest with you at all times, I will make sure that any data analysis and findings related to you are shared with you at every stage of the project and that you have opportunity to feedback on these to confirm accuracy.

A further area of risk is to the research site and is the risk result of possible inappropriate behaviour of participants when engaging in external CPD activity, or by myself as the researcher when interviewing representatives of other organisations. These risks can be avoided or pre-empted by discussing the expectations of professional behaviour when representing the college, both by participants and myself.

You will not incur any financial costs as part of this project.

(7)   Are there any benefits associated with being in the study?
The significant benefit for you and your organisation is that you will be part of a research project that could provide you with outcomes that can be useful to your ogranisation. The final findings will be shared with your organisation for your review and use.

(8)   What will happen to information about me that is collected during the study?
The information that is collected during the study will not be personal information but will be information about your CPD expectations for the organisation and teams to meet the high aspirations for students and staff alike.

During the course of the research all interviews and discussions, whether they're group or individual discussions will be recorded on a digital recorder. These recordings will be uploaded to an external hard drive within 24 hours of the interview or discussion. This external hard drive will be password

protected to ensure confidentiality. At this point the digital recorder will be cleaned of any recordings. All digital records will be transcribed and analysed and these written reports will also be stored on the external hard drive. The external hard drive will be backed up on to the College network which also requires a login and password to access it.

Any transcripts and data analysis will be shared with the relevant participants within two weeks of writing up so that the participants can give feedback on accuracy. No information will be shared with anyone it does not directly relate to and who is not a participant in the project, other than with my supervisors at the UEA.

All information will be stored securely and your identity/information will be kept strictly confidential but I cannot guarantee anonymity, because everyone involved in this research project works for the same or associated organisations and it is possible that at a local level terminology and language will be used that will give an indication of who they are.   Although every effort will be made to protect your identity, there is a risk that you might be identifiable in publications due to the nature of the study and/or the results

The final outcome of this research project will be part of the final thesis for my Doctorate in Education. In addition though I will keep the information I collect for this study, and I may use it in future projects. By providing your consent you are allowing me to use your information in future projects. I don't know at this stage what these other projects will involve. With this in mind, data will be stored for a period of 10 years and then destroyed.   I will seek ethical approval before using the information in these future projects.

By providing your consent, you are agreeing to us collecting personal information about you for the purposes of this research study. Your information will only be used for the purposes outlined in this Participant Information Statement, unless you consent otherwise. Data management will follow the 1998 Data Protection Act and the University of East Anglia Research Data Management Policy (2013).

(9)   What if I would like further information about the study?

When you have read this information, I will be available to discuss it with you further and answer any questions you may have. If you would like to know more at any stage during the study, please feel free to contact me (rau06qgc@uea.ac.uk) or my supervisors, Dr Jan Watson (jan.watson@uea.ac.uk) or Professor Terry Haydn (terry.haydn@uea.ac.uk).

(10)   Will I be told the results of the study?
You have a right to receive feedback about the overall results of this study. You can tell me that you wish to receive feedback by ticking the relevant box on the consent form. This feedback will be in the form of a one page summary of the final findings together with a full copy of the thesis if you require it. You will receive this feedback after the study is finished.

(11)   What if I have a complaint or any concerns about the study?
Research involving humans in UK is reviewed by an independent group of people called a Human Research Ethics Committee (HREC). The ethical aspects of this study have been approved under the regulations of the University of East Anglia's School of Education and Lifelong Learning Research Ethics Committee.

If there is a problem please let me know. You can contact me via the University at the following address:
    Rachel Kirk
    School of Education and Lifelong Learning

University of East Anglia
NORWICH NR4 7TJ
rau06qgc@uea.ac.uk

If you would like to speak to someone else you can contact my supervisor:
Dr Jan Watson
School of Education and Lifelong Learning
University of East Anglia
NORWICH NR4 7TJ
Tel: 01603 592868
jan.watson@uea.ac.uk

Professor Terry Haydn
School of Education and Lifelong Learning
University of East Anglia
NORWICH NR4 7TJ
Tel: 01603 593150
Terry.haydn@uea.ac.uk

If you are concerned about the way this study is being conducted or you wish to make a complaint to someone independent from the study, please contact please contact the Head of the School of Education and Lifelong Learning, Dr Nalini Boodhoo, at n.boodhoo@uea.ac.uk.

(12)   OK, I want to take part – what do I do next?
You need to fill in one copy of the consent form and either email it to me at rau06qgc@uea.ac.uk
Or give it to me at our first meeting in April. Please keep the letter, information sheet and the 2nd copy of the consent form for your information.

PARTICIPANT CONSENT FORM (1st Copy to Researcher)

I, ... [PRINT NAME], agree to take part in this research study.

In giving my consent I state that:

✓ I understand the purpose of the study, what I will be asked to do, and any risks/benefits involved.

✓ I have read the Participant Information Statement and have been able to discuss my involvement in the study with the researchers if I wished to do so.

✓ The researchers have answered any questions that I had about the study and I am happy with the answers.

✓ I understand that being in this study is completely voluntary and I do not have to take part. My decision whether to be in the study will not affect my relationship with the researchers or anyone else at the University of East Anglia or at West Suffolk College now or in the future.

✓ I understand that I can withdraw from the study at any point.

✓ I understand that I will need to participate in one to one or group discussions or interviews meetings at intervals during this project in order to share my views and experiences of my organisation.

✓ I understand that personal information about me that is collected over the course of this project will be stored securely and will only be used for purposes that I have agreed to. I understand that information about me will only be told to others with my permission, except as required by law.

✓ I understand that the results of this study may be published. Although every effort will be made to protect my identity, I may be identifiable in these publications due to the nature of the study or results.

I consent to:

Audio-recording	YES	☐	NO	☐
Reviewing transcripts	YES	☐	NO	☐

Would you like to receive feedback about the overall results of this study?

YES	☐	NO	☐

If you answered **YES**, please indicate your preferred form of feedback and address:

☐ Postal: _____

☐ Email: _____

....

Signature   **PRINT name**

Date

Hourly Paid Teacher Consent Email

From: Rachel Kirk
Sent: 12 November 2017 18:47
To: ████████████████████████
██
████████████████████████████████████

Subject: Participation in Research to develop Teacher CPD

Hello

I hope you don't mind me emailing you, I have been given your email address by ████████ because I would like to ask you to consider taking part in a survey I am undertaking as part of my research into CPD for teachers in further and adult education.

I am employed by West Suffolk College and part of my responsibilities is to develop a strategy for CPD for teacher development at the college. Alongside this I am also undertaking a Doctorate of Education and my research for my thesis is to investigate and develop effective strategies for CPD for teachers in further and adult education. As part of this project I want to invite hourly paid teachers to give their views of CPD because I am aware that you are often disadvantaged by the way CPD is designed and delivered.

I hope, on completion of my research I will be able to design a new strategy for CPD which will make it more accessible and relevant to all types of teachers.

To do this though, I would really appreciate your help by completing a short survey which I can send you by email. It shouldn't take you more than 10 minutes to complete.

Attached is a letter of consent which details the research I am completing and your part in this research, if you agree to participate. Your responses will be confidential and will not be shared with the college, other participants or readers of my research.

If you do not feel able to participate then please let me know by Monday 20th November. If I haven't heard back from you by then I will assume your consent to participate and send you a separate email with the survey attached.

If you have any questions at all about this research then please get back to me and I will be happy to answer any of your questions.

Thank you in advance for your help and participation.

Kind regards

Rachel

Rachel Kirk

Initial Research Instruments - Questionnaire

Doctorate of Education Research Project – Questionnaire

Teacher of Plumbing or Plumber who Teaches?

The following questions are designed to provide an indication of people's views of continuous professional development (CPD) at the College at which they work.

Can I please ask that you answer truthfully, adding any comments that you feel are relevant.

1   What do you consider the purpose of CPD to be? *Please select as many options as you need to and add comments in the box below.*

   a.   To reward staff for working well
   b.   To make teachers work the way the organisation wants them to work
   c.   To support teachers in developing their skills to teach their subject, and develop as a professional
   d.   Other (please comment)

2   What are your experiences of CPD as a teacher?

3   What experiences of CPD have worked for you, eg they've helped you to develop as a professional teacher?

4   Do you find CPD at the College to be of use? *Please select one of the options below and add any comments.*

   Very useful   of some use   not very useful   completely useless

   Please add a comment to explain your view

5   Do you attend the cross-college CPD days?

   Yes/no

6   If you do attend the cross-college CPD days, how useful are they and why, or how

7   Do you use the information you gain from the cross college CPD days in your teaching?
        Please select one of the options below and add any comments.

        Always   sometimes   occasionally   never

8   Do you take part in any other CPD activity?   Yes/no

        If yes, what do you do?

        If no, why don't you?

9   What would be useful CPD for you?

Thank you very much for completing this questionnaire, I appreciate your time and contributions.

                                                                                Rachel Kirk

Initial Research Instrument - Stage One Interviews (Other Colleges)

First interviews with CPD managers

Themes for informal interviews with CPD teams from other organisations and CPD manager at the research college

- Approach to leading CPD – mandatory/personalised/research based etc

- Planning CPD – influences

- Vocational upskilling?

- Barriers to CPD?

Initial Research Instrument - Stage Two Interviews

First group interview with teachers

The themes below are given as a guidance for discussion points for the first round of group interviews with teaching teams.

- CPD - What should be included

- Timing/commitment/funding

- Personalised – what should be included

- Team/department/organisation activity

First Interview - Director of Quality at the Research College

Themes included:
- What is the purpose of CPD

- What does the college the purpose to be

- How does the college support voc development

- What are your priorities for CPD – what does SMT and CMT expect

- What barriers do you think teachers have

- To develop CPD – what should be included

Initial Research Instrument - Stage Three Interviews

Stage Three Teacher Interview Themes

The following are the themes which will form the basis of second stage interviews with teachers at the research college:

- Dual professionalism
  - What is this to you? What does it mean?
  - Responsibility – college/teacher

- Vocational upskilling – what? How? When?
- How can you, individually, or as a team, develop opportunities for vocational up skilling?
- Cross college TLA CPD   how? When? What?
- Barriers to college CPD   how to overcome and find way to engage teachers
- Contract states 30 hrs CPD commitment. Does this happen?

Stage Three Director of Quality Interview

The following provide the themes for discussion in a second interview with the Director of Quality at the research college, the curriculum directors of the teaching teams participating and the Exec Curriculum Director to gain senior management thoughts.

- Dual professionalism
- Vocational upskilling – appropriate expectation, responsibility, what's involved/look like
- Approaches to supporting dual professionalism
- Management of vocational upskilling
- Cross college TLA CPD or not
- Barriers to college CPD
- What stops staff attending
- Encouraging commitment & engagement

Initial Research Instrument - Themes for Group Interview with Executive Directors (SMT)

- Dual professionalism
  - What is this to you? What does it mean?
  - vocational and contextual CPD
  - Responsibility?

- CPD management
  - negotiated
  - spotlights

- cross college TLA CPD
  - best approach

- Barriers to college CPD

- Team, develop opportunities for vocational up skilling

Initial Research Instrument - Hourly Paid Teacher Survey

1. What do you consider the purpose of CPD to be? Please select an option and add comments in the box below. Other (please comment)

2. What experiences of CPD have worked best for you, eg they've helped you to develop as a professional teacher?

3. Do you attend the cross-college CPD days?

4. If you do attend the cross-college CPD days, how useful are they and why?

5. Do you use the information you gain from the cross college CPD days in your teaching? Please select one of the options below and add any comments,

6. Do you find the range of CPD activity at the College useful? Please select one of the options below and add any comments.

7. Do you find the scheduling of CPD activity helpful? Please add any comments

8. Do you take part in any other CPD activity (either organised by yourself or by other organisations you're associated with)?

9. What would be useful CPD for you?

10. How can CPD be scheduled so that it is possible for you to participate?