

The effect of land-use change on soil CH₄ and N₂O fluxes: a global meta-analysis

M.D. McDaniel^{1,*}, D. Saha², M.G. Dumont³, M. Hernández⁴, and M.A. Adams^{1,5}.

1. Centre for Carbon Water and Food, Faculty of Agriculture, University of Sydney, Camden, New South Wales 2570 Australia
2. Department of Plant Science, Pennsylvania State University, University Park, PA 16802, U.S.A.
3. Centre for Biological Sciences, University of Southampton, Southampton, SO17 1BJ United Kingdom
4. Max Planck Institute for Terrestrial Microbiology, Marburg, D-35037, Germany.
5. Swinburne University of Technology, John St, Hawthorn, Victoria 3122, Australia.

*Corresponding Author:

Department of Agronomy

Iowa State University

2517 Agronomy Hall

Ames, IA 50011

Phone: (515) 294-7947

Email: marsh@iastate.edu

Running head (45 characters including spaces): Effect of land-use change on soil CH₄ and N₂O fluxes

1 **Abstract (Max 300 words)**

2 Land-use change is a prominent feature of the Anthropocene. Transitions between
3 natural and human-managed ecosystems affect biogeochemical cycles in many ways, but soil
4 processes are amongst the least understood. We used a global meta-analysis (62 studies,
5 1670 paired comparisons) to examine effects of land conversion on soil-atmosphere fluxes of
6 methane (CH₄) and nitrous oxide (N₂O) from upland soils, and determine soil and
7 environmental factors driving these effects. Conversion from a natural ecosystem to any
8 anthropogenic land use increased soil CH₄ and N₂O fluxes by 234 kg CO₂-equivalents ha⁻¹ y⁻¹
9¹, on average. Reversion of managed ecosystems to that resembling natural ecosystems did
10 not fully reverse those effects, even after 80 years. In general, neither the type of ecosystem
11 converted, nor the type of subsequent anthropogenic land use, affected the magnitude of
12 increase in soil emissions. Land-use changes in wetter ecosystems resulted in greater
13 increases in CH₄ fluxes, but reduced N₂O fluxes. An interacting suite of soil variables
14 influenced CH₄ and N₂O fluxes, with availability of inorganic nitrogen (i.e. extractable
15 ammonium and nitrate), pH, total carbon, and microclimate being strong mediators of effects
16 of land-use change. In addition, time after a change in land use emerged as a critical factor
17 explaining the effects of land-use change – with increased emissions of both greenhouse
18 gases diminishing rapidly after conversion. Further research is needed to elucidate complex
19 biotic and abiotic mechanisms that land-use change, and in particularly during this initial
20 disturbance when greenhouse gas emissions are increased the most relative to native
21 vegetation. Efforts to mitigate emissions will be severely hampered by this gap in
22 knowledge.

23 **Keywords:** afforestation; climate change; cultivation; deforestation; global change;
24 greenhouse gas emissions; methane; nitrous oxide;

- 25 **Abbreviations:** carbon, C; carbon dioxide, CO₂; greenhouse gases, GHG; methane, CH₄;
- 26 land use change, LUC; mean annual temperature, MAT; mean annual precipitation, MAP;
- 27 nitrogen, N; nitrous oxide, N₂O; response ratio, RR;

28 **Introduction**

29

30 Producing food and fibre for 9 billion people by 2050 will be one of this century's
31 most critical and formidable challenges (Godfray and others 2010). Past solutions to the on-
32 going challenge to produce more food has been to convert more natural ecosystems to agro-
33 ecosystems, a type of land-use change (LUC). Many now question the sustainability of
34 continuing LUC to increase food and fibre supply (e.g. Brussaard and others, 2010; Power,
35 2010; Mueller and others, 2012), in large part due to both known and unknown consequences
36 for ecosystem attributes (e.g. soil structure, carbon storage in soil and vegetation,
37 biodiversity) and processes (e.g. nutrient cycling, water yield and quality, primary
38 productivity). Soil greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions are an obvious and important example
39 of the latter. The importance of soils in global cycles of C and N, highlight the need to more
40 fully understand the consequences of LUC.

41 Soils in natural and intensively managed ecosystems differ in many ways. Some of
42 the more significant differences are: i) lasting physical effects of the initial disturbance when
43 a natural ecosystem is converted to a managed agroecosystem, ii) flora or fauna in managed
44 systems are often markedly different to natural systems (and often have reduced diversity),
45 and iii) external inputs of nutrients (e.g. fertilizer) are usually much larger in managed
46 systems. There are also secondary effects, such as prolonged disturbance (i.e. tillage, use of
47 heavy machinery) or introductions of flora with different biophysical characteristics (e.g.
48 introduced annuals or legumes). All have the potential to significantly alter GHG fluxes
49 between soils and the atmosphere.

50 Amongst the better-known effects of LUC on soils is change in soil carbon (C) stocks
51 (Guo and Gifford 2002; Nyawira and others 2016). Nonetheless, actual changes in soil C
52 depend on the type of LUC. Native forest converted to tree plantations decreased soil C by

53 13%, while conversion to crops decreased soil C by 42%. On the other hand, a native forest
54 converted to pasture resulted in an increase in soil C (+8%, Guo & Gifford, 2002). These
55 changes in soil C can be reflected in changes in CO₂ fluxes after conversion to human uses
56 (Dale and others 1991; Raich and Schlesinger 1992; Tate and others 2006). Non-CO₂
57 greenhouse gases of biogenic origins – methane (CH₄) and nitrous oxide (N₂O) – are
58 sensitive to LUC, because both soil CH₄ and N₂O fluxes are regulated by highly-specialized
59 groups of microorganisms (Firestone and Davidson 1989; Conrad 2009; Tate 2015).

60 Globally, soils are a net source of atmospheric CH₄ as a result of emissions from
61 flooded soils where anoxic conditions lead to methanogenesis; a microbial process that
62 reduces CO₂ to CH₄ under anaerobic condition. On the other hand, methanotrophic (CH₄-
63 oxidizing) bacteria mitigate CH₄ emissions by consuming endogenous CH₄ before it is
64 released to the atmosphere. Up to 80% of the upward diffusive flux of CH₄ can be consumed
65 by methanotrophs before reaching the atmosphere (Conrad and Rothfuss 1991). Furthermore,
66 well-drained aerobic (upland) soils are a known sink for atmospheric CH₄ (Harriss and others
67 1982) and make up an estimated 6% of the total global CH₄ sink (Smith and others 2000;
68 Solomon 2007). This is largely due to the abundance and activity of CH₄-oxidizing bacteria
69 in these soils (Bender and Conrad 1992; Kolb 2009; Knief 2015). This small, yet important
70 sink is also highly sensitive to anthropogenic activities (Tate 2015), and likely a result of the
71 sensitivity of the high-affinity CH₄ oxidizers to a range of environmental factors (Dunfield
72 2007).

73 LUC can increase CH₄ fluxes, or decrease the strength of the CH₄ sink in upland soils
74 (Keller and others 1990; Priemé and Christensen 1999; Nazaries and others 2011). Other
75 studies have reported that LUC reduces fluxes (Verchot and others 2000; Galbally and others
76 2010; Mapanda and others 2010; Benanti and others 2014). Within land-use categories, such
77 as croplands or pastures, practices like tillage and fertilization have significant effects on CH₄

78 sinks (Ball and others 1999; Venterea and others 2005; Sainju and others 2012), but the
79 direction (increase or decrease) and magnitude of change varies strongly from study to study.

80 Nitrous oxide - a GHG 300 times more potent than CO₂ (Solomon 2007) - is produced
81 during both nitrification and denitrification processes (Firestone and Davidson 1989). As
82 with CH₄, some soils also act as sinks for N₂O (Chapuis-Lardy and others 2007). Even
83 pristine ecosystems can be significant contributors of N₂O to the atmosphere depending on
84 climate, soil type, and vegetation. Forested ecosystems in the tropics, for example, are often
85 strong contributors of N₂O to the atmosphere (Keller and Reiners 1994; Verchot and others
86 2000). Fertilizer nitrogen (N) addition to agroecosystems are amongst the strongest drivers
87 of increased global emissions of N₂O (van Lent and others 2015; Stehfest and Bouwman
88 2006; Liu and Greaver 2009; Aronson and Allison 2012; Shcherbak and others 2014). A
89 previous meta-analysis showed that CO₂ sequestration via increased biomass, may be offset
90 by as much as 53-76%, if emissions of CH₄ and N₂O are increased by additions of fertilizer
91 N (Liu and Greaver 2009). But what other features of LUC could alter CH₄ and N₂O
92 emissions?

93 Much like the LUC effect on methanotrophs, we poorly understand the LUC effect on
94 soil microorganisms that regulate N₂O. Many LUC studies have shown opposing trends for
95 fluxes of CH₄ and N₂O. In other words, LUC can result in greater contributions to the
96 atmosphere of one gas, while reducing contributions of the other (Keller and Reiners 1994;
97 Galbally and others 2010; Livesley and others 2011; Carmo and others 2012; Benanti and
98 others 2014). Recently, machine learning algorithms and regression tree analyses have been
99 applied to predicting GHG outcomes of complex, interacting soil processes (e.g. Saha and
100 others 2017). The striking inconsistencies in effects of LUC, and lack of understanding of
101 driving mechanisms, further emphasise the need for a comprehensive, quantitative review.

102 We used a global meta-analytical approach to help resolve key critical questions surrounding
103 land-use change effects on upland soil CH₄ and N₂O fluxes. In particular:

- 104 1. What are the overall LUC effects on soil CH₄ and N₂O fluxes and can they be
105 reversed?
- 106 2. Which land-use change causes the greatest change to soil CH₄ and N₂O fluxes, and
107 which ecosystems are most vulnerable to LUC?
- 108 3. What variables regulate LUC effects on soil CH₄ and N₂O fluxes?

109 This meta-analysis differs from others in seeking to elucidate mechanisms underpinning
110 observed CH₄ and N₂O fluxes, and how LUC alters soil processes, (Question #3). We thus
111 collated a large suite of environmental and soil data, along with CH₄ and N₂O flux data, in
112 order to explore the LUC effect on these two greenhouse gases (Table 1).

113 **Materials and Methods**

114

115 *Literature Search and Data Collection*

116

117 We searched ISI Web of Science in 2014 for the operators (*soil AND (methane OR*
118 *CH₄)) AND (soil AND (“nitrous oxide” OR N₂O))*) for all of the manuscripts containing soil
119 CH₄ and N₂O fluxes (8,593 results). Then we narrowed this selection with the refining
120 operators - *“land use change” OR “land use”* (353 results). These results were then
121 screened to 62 studies that met our criteria. These criteria included: 1) measured soil CH₄
122 and/or N₂O from at least two land uses, and 2) studies that had at least one treatment
123 representing native vegetation or a natural ecosystem that had not been recently converted, or
124 a human land use (e.g. agriculture). These studies were often ‘side-by-side’ or paired land
125 use comparisons, typically comparing a human land use to that of a natural ecosystem. There
126 are also a number of studies of reversing from human land use back to ‘natural ecosystems’.

127 We included a handful of studies that have experimentally manipulated conversions of land
128 use, and then measured the effects on GHGs immediately afterward. 3) Finally, we focused
129 on upland soils due to their importance as a global CH₄ sink (Tate 2015). We thus excluded
130 wetland studies. We only included peer-reviewed literature, and ‘grey literature’ was not
131 included due to it being difficult to find (not appearing in ISI Web of Science), and also often
132 not having the scientific rigor of peer-reviewed publications. In addition to a broad search
133 and selective screening, we used publications’ reference sections as a guide to further
134 potential publications.

135 Our primary data set consisted of soil CH₄ and N₂O fluxes. We included additional
136 soil properties, moderating variables, and study characteristics that might influence land use
137 effects on soil GHG emissions (Table 1). We thus collected data on eight soil variables that
138 are commonly measured in coordination with GHGs. We divided these variables into two
139 types: slow-changing and fast-changing. Slow-changing variables are those that are unlikely
140 to change within one year (or perhaps a decade or more), such as total organic carbon (TOC),
141 total nitrogen (TN), soil pH, and bulk density (BD). The fast-changing variables are those
142 that change from day to day, or perhaps even within one day. These include soil temperature,
143 soil moisture, and extractable inorganic N (or ammonium and nitrate). Soil moisture (Moist)
144 was reported in papers as % gravimetric water content, water-filled pore space, and
145 volumetric water content. Since we are concerned with changes due to LUC, we represent all
146 measures of soil moisture as relative ratio or change (unitless) as a result of LUC.
147 Moderating environmental variables were defined as those that influence effect sizes in other
148 soil meta-analyses (Tonitto and others 2006; Aronson and Allison 2012; Dooley and Treseder
149 2012; McDaniel and others 2014b); mostly climate variables and soil type (commonly
150 approximated by texture). All data were collected either from text or tables or were extracted
151 from graphs using GetData Graph Digitizer 2.26 (Sergei Fedorov, Russia).

153

154 CH₄ and N₂O data were first converted to common units (μg GHG m⁻² h⁻¹). Once
 155 converted, a land-use response metric was calculated for each individual observation for each
 156 gas. In order to cope with both negative and positive fluxes of CH₄ and N₂O, that invalidate
 157 the use of a ‘response ratio’ as a metric of effect size (Koricheva and Gurevitch 2014), we
 158 used the metric U_{GHG} (U_{CH₄} and U_{N₂O}, van Groenigen and others, 2011).

$$159 \quad U_{GHG} = GHG_{new} - GHG_{prev}$$

160 U_{GHG} is the difference between the flux for a new land use (GHG_{new}) and the previous
 161 (GHG_{prev}). This metric remains in the common units of gas flux. For non-negative soil
 162 variables, we calculated a land-use effect via the response ratio (RR).

$$163 \quad \ln RR_{soil} = \ln X_{new} - \ln X_{prev} = \ln \frac{X_{new}}{X_{prev}}$$

164 Where RR_{soil} is the response ratio between means either at the observation level or between
 165 the new and previous land use.

166 A weighted approach was used to calculate effect sizes at the comparison level. This
 167 weighting approach incorporated replication and the number of observations for each
 168 comparison. Weightings were used owing to the variation in numbers of replications and
 169 observations. We gave more weight to studies with greater spatial or temporal replication.
 170 We gave less weight to individual studies with large numbers of comparisons so as to not
 171 have a disproportionate effect on global means. Similar to van Groenigen and others (2011),
 172 we weighted by replication with $W_R = (n_{new} \times n_{prev}) / (n_{new} + n_{prev})$, where n_{new} and n_{prev} are
 173 the replication in the new and previous land uses. Then we weighted by number of
 174 observations per comparison $W_{F,i} = W_R / n_c$, where the final weights (W_F) are calculated by

175 dividing the number of i^{th} observations. Then the mean effect sizes for each comparison (\bar{U})
176 were calculated as:

$$177 \quad \bar{U} = \frac{\sum_i (U_i \times W_{F,i})}{\sum_i W_{F,i}}$$

178 Where \bar{U} is the mean effect size for each gas. Mean effect sizes were then used in the overall
179 meta-analysis, whereas observation effect sizes were used only for correlations with fast-
180 changing soil variables, where these variables were measured in coordination with each
181 greenhouse gas measure. Global warming potential (GWP) was calculated for each gas using
182 the ratios of 34 and 298 for CH₄ and N₂O, respectively (Myhre and others 2013).

183 Final mean effect sizes and 95% bootstrapped confidence intervals were calculated
184 using MetaWin v2.1 (Rosenberg and others 2000). All categorical comparisons conducted in
185 MetaWin were set on random effects and the 95% bootstrapped confidence intervals (CI)
186 were calculated with 9999 iterations. The overall effect was deemed significant if the CI did
187 not overlap with zero. Total group heterogeneity (Q_T) was partitioned into within-group (Q_w)
188 and between-group (Q_b) heterogeneity, similar to partitioning of variance in ANOVAs. A
189 minimum of five comparisons were used to calculate Q_b , and differences between groups (or
190 comparisons) were deemed significant if the CI did not overlap.

191 *Factors controlling LUC effects on CH₄ and N₂O fluxes*

192

193 Univariate correlations among effect sizes of soil variables with GHGs were
194 conducted in SAS 9.3 (SAS Institute, Cary, NC) with *proc corr* and Pearson correlation
195 coefficients are reported. We also used non-parametric Random Forest analysis to
196 understand the variables, and their interactions, that best explain the variations in CH₄ and
197 N₂O fluxes as influenced by LUC (Breiman 2001). The relative change (RC), or per cent
198 change, in a soil variable was calculated with respect to the control treatment as $(\text{GHG}_{\text{new}} -$

199 $\text{GHG}_{\text{old}}) / \text{GHG}_{\text{old}} \times 100$. The $\text{RC} > 0$ indicates greater value of the variable under
200 consideration in the converted LU, or new, than that in the control, or old LU. Missing data
201 were imputed by *missForest* package in R (Stekhoven and Bühlmann 2011). Out-of-bag
202 error estimates of the imputation method was 0 (proportion of falsely classified entries) and
203 0.28 (normalized root mean square error) for the categorical and continuous variables,
204 respectively. The *randomForest* function from R *randomForest* package (Liaw and Wiener
205 2002) was used on the imputed data with the control parameters *ntree* = 500 (number of
206 trees) and *mtry* = 3 (number of variables considered for splitting at each node). Explanatory
207 variables considered in the analysis were: direction of LUC (neutral, converted, and reverse),
208 time since LUC (years), fertilization (yes/no), mean annual temperature (MAT, °C), mean
209 annual precipitation (MAP, mm), soil clay (%), and relative changes in soil pH (RC_pH), soil
210 ammonium (RC_NH₄), soil nitrate (RC_NO₃), total N (RC_TN), total soil organic carbon
211 (RC_TOC), soil moisture content (RC_Moist), soil bulk density (RC_BD), soil temperature
212 (RC_Temp). The *importance* function in R *randomForest* was used for variable importance
213 scores. Importance for a variable is interpreted as increase in mean square error (%IncMSE)
214 due to random permutation on that variable. The R *tree* package was used to construct
215 conditional inference tree for U_{N₂O} and U_{CH₄}. Upon satisfaction of each node, the tree moves
216 to the left branch to the next node. Each terminal node represents average U_{N₂O} or U_{CH₄} and
217 number of observation corresponding to that node (n).

218 **Results**

219

220 *Effects of LUC on CH₄ and N₂O*

221

222 The 62 studies included in this meta-analysis spanned all six inhabited, continental
223 regions – 5% Africa, 11% Asia, 15% Australia & New Zealand, 21% Europe, 33% North
224 America, and 15% South America (Table S1). The studies included broad ranges in climate:

225 mean annual temperatures (MAT) from 2.2 - 27.8 °C, and mean annual precipitation (MAP)
226 from 97 – 3962 mm. More than 70% of the studies that reported soil classification data, were
227 from within eight of the 12 USDA soil orders (absent were Gelisols, Spodosols, Vertisols,
228 and Mollisols). Soils ranged in clay content from 2 to 58%. We classified studies according
229 to land uses: cropland, tree plantations, pastures, and urban (Fig. 1). There were very few
230 studies that had urban land uses (n = 4), but urban ecosystems would be characterized as
231 being in highly-populated residential areas, urban or suburban, with lawn or turf and
232 ornamental trees. The time after land-use change ranged from 0.33 to ~200 years. We could
233 not determine the exact time elapsed since LUC for several longer-term studies.

234 There was large variability in CH₄ and N₂O fluxes (Fig. 1, Fig. S1). Methane fluxes
235 ranged from -322 to 588 μg CH₄ m⁻² h⁻¹ across all land uses. The greatest CH₄ uptake (most
236 negative flux) was recorded for a loamy grassland (Boeckx and others 1997), while the
237 strongest contribution to the atmosphere was recorded for a 20 year-old pasture (Stuedler and
238 others 1996). N₂O fluxes ranged from -194 to 1063 μg N₂O m⁻² h⁻¹, albeit that both extreme
239 values were measured in the same bamboo plantation in China (Liu and others 2011). Forest
240 soils generally consumed atmospheric CH₄ - median (-28) and mean (-35 μg CH₄ m⁻² h⁻¹)
241 fluxes reflecting the dominance of negative fluxes in forests (~95% of studies, Fig. 1).
242 Overall, pastures were also sinks for CH₄ (median flux = -0.01 μg CH₄ m⁻² h⁻¹, mean flux = -
243 2 μg CH₄ m⁻² h⁻¹). We grouped all herbaceous-dominant ecosystems (shrubland, savannah,
244 and grasslands) into one category: herbaceous ecosystems. Herbaceous ecosystems produced
245 the smallest median and mean N₂O fluxes (1 and 4 μg N₂O m⁻² h⁻¹). Urban soils produced
246 the greatest median N₂O flux (35 μg N₂O m⁻² h⁻¹), and tree plantations had the greatest mean
247 flux (62 μg N₂O m⁻² h⁻¹). All 40 measurements of urban soils were derived from just two
248 studies (Kaye and others 2004; Chen and others 2014).

249 Changing land uses from a ‘natural’ system to any human use, increased CH₄ fluxes
250 by 14 μg CH₄ m⁻² h⁻¹, and N₂O fluxes by 7 μg N₂O m⁻² h⁻¹ (Fig. 2). Comparisons among
251 studies suggest that reversing land use (to a more ‘natural ecosystem’) could reduce CH₄
252 fluxes by 11 μg CH₄ m⁻² h⁻¹. However, reversion had little effect on N₂O fluxes. N₂O fluxes
253 actually increased when land use was reversed to that resembling a natural system, by an
254 average of 6 μg N₂O m⁻² h⁻¹, but not significantly (CI overlaps with zero). Changing from
255 one intensive land use to another tended to reduce CH₄ fluxes (but not significantly, based on
256 four studies or 32 observations), and there were too few data to assess this influence on N₂O
257 fluxes (Fig. 2).

258 We adopted the widely used weighted approach for meta-analysis. This approach
259 allows for the wide range of experimental designs and replication across the 62 included
260 studies. Nonetheless, there are arguments for and against this such approaches (Gurevitch
261 and Hedges 1999; Philibert and others 2012; Koricheva and Gurevitch 2014). For example, a
262 common issue in meta-analyses is whether or not to give extra emphasis on studies with more
263 precision, if variances are known. We present the calculated, global warming potential due to
264 LUC (GWP, from CH₄ and N₂O) in both weighted and unweighted format (Table 2) so that
265 readers may thus choose their preferred approach. Weighting mostly reduced mean GWPs,
266 consistent with a conservative approach to estimating overall effects of LUC. Conversion of
267 land from a state of ‘natural ecosystem’ to intensive human use, resulted in a net increase of
268 234 kg CO₂-equivalents ha⁻¹ y⁻¹ (or 376 if unweighted, Table 2). Reversing this conversion
269 also increased GWP by 132 kg CO₂-equivalents ha⁻¹ y⁻¹ (or 104 if unweighted), albeit this
270 result was not significantly different to zero.

271 The type of the original ‘natural’ vegetation, had very little effect on both greenhouse
272 gases (Fig. 2). Only when the final land use was tree plantations, was converting forests to
273 human uses more significant for CH₄ fluxes than converting herbaceous ecosystems (+13 and

274 $-8 \mu\text{g CH}_4 \text{ m}^{-2} \text{ h}^{-1}$, respectively, Fig. 2). Conversions among previous and current land uses
275 (forest or herbaceous) had no effect on N_2O fluxes (Fig. 2), albeit largely due to variability
276 and the small number of studies of N_2O fluxes relative to CH_4 fluxes.

277 Pooling prior land uses revealed few differences in CH_4 fluxes among new land uses –
278 irrespective if the new use was either intensive management or a restored natural use (Fig.
279 S2). Of four contrasts combining ‘natural systems’, only changes in herbaceous ecosystems
280 to a pasture ($+25 \mu\text{g CH}_4 \text{ m}^{-2} \text{ h}^{-1}$), had a significantly greater effect than a change to tree
281 plantations ($-8 \mu\text{g CH}_4 \text{ m}^{-2} \text{ h}^{-1}$, $P = 0.008$, Fig. 2). Cropping system type had little effect on
282 CH_4 fluxes (Fig. S2), although converting to barley ($24 \mu\text{g CH}_4 \text{ m}^{-2} \text{ h}^{-1}$) had a greater effect
283 than converting to wheat ($-1 \mu\text{g CH}_4 \text{ m}^{-2} \text{ h}^{-1}$). Many studies did not report if fertilizer N was
284 included in the human land use (nearly 50% of studies). When that data were available, there
285 was a marginally significant effect ($+13 \mu\text{g N}_2\text{O m}^{-2} \text{ h}^{-1}$) of added N on N_2O emissions ($P=$
286 0.053 , Fig. S2).

287 *Drivers of LUC effects on CH_4 and N_2O*

288

289 Effects of “elapsed time since land-use change” on GHG emissions were significant
290 ($P_s < 0.014$) for conversions from natural forests to human land use (Fig. 3). The best fit
291 model for both GHGs was exponential decay. Mean U_{CH_4} was $\sim 50 \mu\text{g CH}_4 \text{ m}^{-2} \text{ h}^{-1}$
292 immediately after conversion, but this then declined by about $0.1 \mu\text{g CH}_4 \text{ m}^{-2} \text{ h}^{-1}$ per year.
293 After roughly 30 years, modelled fluxes stabilized and remained about $28 \mu\text{g CH}_4 \text{ m}^{-2} \text{ h}^{-1}$
294 above that of the previous land use. Mean $U_{\text{N}_2\text{O}}$ was $27 \mu\text{g N}_2\text{O m}^{-2} \text{ h}^{-1}$ immediately after
295 conversion, and then declined more quickly, by about $0.2 \mu\text{g N}_2\text{O m}^{-2} \text{ h}^{-1}$ per year before
296 stabilizing after ~ 40 years. At that point, N_2O fluxes were roughly equivalent to those of the
297 previous land use.

298 Univariate analysis shows that amongst climate and edaphic factors, MAP had the
299 clearest influence on CH₄ fluxes (Fig. 4). The LUC effect on CH₄ was positively related to
300 precipitation ($P < 0.001$), while reversion to ‘natural’ land uses was negatively related ($P <$
301 0.001). N₂O fluxes were negatively related to MAP ($P = 0.011$) when land use changed to
302 cropland or plantations. Soil texture (% clay) had no influence on the role of LUC in fluxes
303 of either gas, however, there was a marginally significant (negative) correlation between
304 U_{CH₄} and % clay ($P = 0.052$, Fig. 4). We also examined interactions of MAT and MAP on U
305 using contour graphs (Fig. S3). When natural vegetation was converted, CH₄ fluxes
306 increased most in cold-wet and warm-wet conditions, whereas N₂O fluxes increased most at
307 moderate MAT and MAP (15-20 °C, 1500-2500 mm) and cold-dry conditions. Reversion of
308 land use to ‘natural ecosystems’ had greatest effects on CH₄ fluxes under moderate MAT and
309 dry conditions; while N₂O fluxes respond most strongly on warm and wet sites.

310 There were unexpected and inconsistent univariate relationships among slow-
311 changing variables and effects of land use change on soil CH₄ and N₂O fluxes. For example,
312 LUC had effects on soil pH (Fig. 5), but gas fluxes showed divergent responses – U_{CH₄}
313 increased while U_{N₂O} decreased with pH. Effects on CH₄ fluxes resulting from reversing
314 LUC were negatively related to effects on total organic C (TOC, $P = 0.036$) – land uses that
315 increase TOC reduce CH₄ fluxes. However, there was no relationship between LUC effects
316 on total soil nitrogen and fluxes of either gas. Although there was no clear linear relationship
317 with soil bulk density (Fig. 5), where LUC results in increased bulk density CH₄ fluxes are
318 mostly increased (except for three observations – Simona and others, 2004; Mapanda and
319 others, 2010; Galbally and others, 2010).

320 Land-use effects were best correlated with fast-changing soil variables (Fig. 6).
321 Changes in use that increased soil temperature, on average increased CH₄ fluxes by 0.34 μg
322 CH₄ m⁻² h⁻¹ per °C increase in soil temperature ($P = 0.034$). Even so the strongest effect of

323 LUC was through its influence on soil moisture ($P < 0.0001$, Fig. 6). For every 1 % increase
324 in soil moisture, CH₄ fluxes increased by 0.65 μg CH₄ m⁻² h⁻¹. LUC effects on N₂O were also
325 closely related to soil moisture ($P < 0.001$), albeit negatively. Concentrations of extractable
326 inorganic N (nitrate, ammonium) in soils were clear drivers of the LUC effects on both CH₄
327 and N₂O fluxes (Fig. 6). LUCs that increased soil NH₄⁺ increased fluxes of the two
328 greenhouse gases – U_{CH₄} marginally ($P = 0.092$) and U_{N₂O} significantly ($P = 0.024$).
329 Reversion of land use produced a negative correlation between NH₄⁺ and U_{CH₄} (Fig. 8, $P =$
330 0.077) and U_{N₂O} (Fig. 8, $P = 0.004$). If LUC reduced concentrations of soil NO₃⁻, then CH₄
331 fluxes increased ($P = 0.004$). Extractable NO₃⁻ had a different relationship with LUC and
332 N₂O fluxes. U_{N₂O} was positively related to the LUC effect on NO₃⁻ for conversions from
333 natural to intensive uses ($P < 0.001$, Fig. 6).

334 Using multiple interacting variables within a regression tree model, again shows that
335 fast-changing variables such as soil NH₄⁺ and NO₃⁻ are key drivers of LUC effects on CH₄
336 and N₂O emissions (Table 3). Predicted U_{CH₄} and U_{N₂O} were significantly correlated with
337 observed values ($R^2 > 0.90$, $P < 0.05$). The regression tree model underestimated at higher
338 ranges of U_{CH₄} and U_{N₂O} (Fig. S4) yet still explained 58% of the variation in observed U_{CH₄}
339 and U_{N₂O}. Regression tree analyses provided a classification of the LUC effect on GHG
340 emissions. Changes in soil mineral NH₄⁺ and NO₃⁻ due to LUC produced clear bifurcation in
341 both U_{CH₄} and U_{N₂O} regression trees (Fig. 7 and 8). If there are reductions in soil NO₃⁻
342 associated with converting one intensive land use to another, or with reversion of a land use
343 to natural conditions, then CH₄ uptake is increased (Nodes 1 and 2, Fig. 7). In general, and as
344 expected, LUCs that increase soil NH₄⁺ and NO₃⁻ also increase N₂O fluxes (Nodes 3 and 5-8,
345 Fig. 8).

346

347 **Discussion**

348

349 Land-use change is just one direct way in which humans are altering soil processes.
350 In the Anthropocene, however, many human activities now have a global reach so that even
351 what appear to be ‘natural’ ecosystems (which humans have not begun to physically manage)
352 are now in some way affected by human activities (Wohl 2013). Nonetheless, drawing
353 conclusions about impacts of LUC on GHG fluxes from soils, based on comparisons with so-
354 called ‘natural’ or ‘undisturbed’ ecosystems, must be conditioned by recognition that human
355 influence is not restricted to land use. Pollution and invasive species, for example, are just
356 two ways humans indirectly influence all ecosystems (Akimoto 2003; Vilà and others 2011;
357 Cronk and Fuller 2014). Our analysis is focused on synthesizing and quantifying broad
358 effects of LUC on soil-atmosphere CH₄ and N₂O fluxes, *beyond* those caused by indirect
359 human activity.

360

361 *What are the overall LUC effects on soil CH₄ and N₂O fluxes and can they be reversed?*

362 Converting land to more intensive uses increased CH₄ fluxes by 14 μg m⁻² h⁻¹, and
363 N₂O fluxes by 7 μg m⁻² h⁻¹ (Fig. 2). When converted to CO₂-equivalents, the LUC effect on
364 N₂O was nearly three times that of CH₄ (Table 2). Conversely, when land use reverts to more
365 natural conditions, gas fluxes often remained greater than under the original use (Table 2).
366 However, active reversion of land use (e.g. from agriculture to native forest) remains a likely
367 means of regenerating net CH₄ uptake primarily via increased oxidation (Figs. 2 & 3, Table
368 2; see Priemé and others 1997; Hiltbrunner and others 2012). On the other hand, N₂O fluxes
369 increased after LUC *and* after reversing or restoring native vegetation (Fig. 2 and S2).
370 Although, there are studies which show that converting cropland back to native vegetation
371 could reduce N₂O emissions (by up to 29%, Robertson and others 2000). Our meta-analysis

372 demonstrates that simply reverting back to ‘natural’ ecosystems may not always mitigate soil
373 GHG emissions.

374 The differences between LUC effects on CH₄ and N₂O fluxes are not fully
375 understood. Persistent changes in N₂O fluxes have been discussed mostly in terms of overall
376 changes in the N cycle (Erickson and others 2001; Scheffer and others 2001; Hiltbrunner and
377 others 2012), and as legacy effects of N addition on nitrification and denitrification. A recent
378 analysis of LUC effects on N₂O emissions in Brazil speculated that changes in soil micro-
379 aggregate structure, might explain a new “steady state” (Meurer and others 2016). This long-
380 term change in soil structure could have cascading effects on soil water content and
381 movement, and thus also impact GHG emissions.

382 Changes in the fluxes of both gases were greatest in first ten years after a change in
383 land use (Fig. 3), and an exponential decay model best explains the global patterns in this
384 period. We compared our global N₂O model to Meurer and others (2016) and Neill and
385 others (2005) studies which focus on Brazilian ecosystems (Fig. 3). Both show rapid declines
386 in the LUC effect on N₂O fluxes (also confirmed by conceptual curve in van Lent and others
387 (2015)). Our global synthesis suggests that LUC will result in N₂O fluxes that approach that
388 of native vegetation (or $U_{N_2O} = \sim 0 \mu\text{g m}^{-2} \text{h}^{-1}$) at around 12 years after conversion. Meurer
389 and others (2016) and van Lent and others (2015) model suggest that if subtropical forest
390 land is converted to pasture, N₂O fluxes will eventually be lower than had the land remained
391 forest ($U_{N_2O} = \sim -15 \mu\text{g m}^{-2} \text{h}^{-1}$). A general problem with LUC studies is that selection of the
392 ‘reference’ (or native) land use, can dramatically change the outcome. For example, some
393 tropical forests are known for their fast rates of N turnover and relatively high N₂O emissions
394 (discussed further below). By contrast, the pastures created by converting such forests can
395 quickly become degraded, seldom receive N fertilizer, and can have low N₂O emission
396 relative to native tropical forests (Meurer and others 2016).

397 Forest harvesting studies have some relevance to the issues of LUC discussed here.
398 Harvesting-induced changes in fluxes of N₂O are greatest within the first few months
399 (Steudler and others 1991; Keller and others 1993; Tate and others 2006; McDaniel and
400 others 2014a). During this period, when a flush of carbon and nutrients is added to the soil in
401 vegetation debris, soil microbial activity is stimulated by warmer and wetter conditions in
402 the absence of plant 'sinks' for N and water – such that nitrification and denitrification are
403 enhanced (Hendrickson and others 1989; Johnson 1992; Mariani and others 2006). In a
404 meta-analysis restricted to tropical forests, van Lent and others (2015) showed a similar trend
405 with N₂O fluxes peaking at ~ 4 kg N₂O-N ha⁻¹ y⁻¹ shortly after harvest, then declining over 50
406 years to < 1 kg N₂O-N ha⁻¹ y⁻¹. Saha and others (2017) also observed increased N₂O
407 emissions in the second year after LUC. Effects of LUC on total soil N₂O (and CH₄) fluxes
408 are likely underestimated if this initial period is not properly considered. Consistently
409 declining effects of LUC on CH₄ and N₂O fluxes also suggests that subsequent management
410 actions (e.g. tillage or fertilization) may not be as important as the original disturbance.

411

412 *Which land-use change causes the greatest change to soil CH₄ and N₂O fluxes, and which*
413 *ecosystems are most vulnerable to LUC?*

414

415 Somewhat surprisingly, our synthesis suggests that LUC effects on fluxes of CH₄ and
416 N₂O (especially) are largely independent of both final land use (Fig. 2), and previous land use
417 (Fig. 2 and S2). The exception to this is conversion effects on CH₄ fluxes in herbaceous
418 ecosystems. For instance, herbaceous-to-cropland and herbaceous-to-pasture conversions
419 increased CH₄ emissions by +16 and +26 μg CH₄ m⁻² h⁻¹, on average, versus herbaceous-to-
420 plantation which decreased emissions by -8 μg CH₄ m⁻² h⁻¹ (Fig. 2). The most likely
421 explanation for this finding are changes in soil moisture or quantity/quality of C inputs to

422 soils. Methane fluxes are tightly linked to soil moisture and even changes to land uses that
423 are managed more intensively that might decrease soil moisture (e.g. via changes to leaf area)
424 might be expected to decrease CH₄ fluxes, mostly through increased CH₄ oxidation (Keller
425 and Reiners 1994; Steudler and others 1996; Hiltbrunner and others 2012). Changing from
426 natural herbaceous vegetation, to woody trees will undoubtedly change distribution, quantity
427 and quality of C inputs to soils. There is now good evidence showing CH₄ oxidation is linked
428 to labile soil C (Sullivan and others 2013). Both of these factors, soil moisture and changes
429 in soil carbon, will be discussed further below.

430 We are limited in predicting sensitivity of GHG emissions from natural to managed
431 ecosystem for many reasons (some discussed further below); but this is especially the case for
432 N₂O which had fewer studies and amongst the studies we included there was much more
433 variation than CH₄. This is unfortunate due to N₂O's outsized contribution to overall GHG
434 emissions (Table 2). Furthermore, some important land uses are notably underrepresented
435 here – like urban and suburban land uses (just four studies), which rapidly replacing native
436 vegetation and agricultural land uses worldwide (Foley and others 2005). Urban land use has
437 the potential to be a major contributor to overall GHG fluxes (Fig. 1), especially since even
438 conversion from agricultural use to urban increases CH₄ emission by 9.5 μg m⁻² h⁻¹ and N₂O
439 emissions by 6.2 μg m⁻² h⁻¹ (Fig. 2).

440

441 *What variables moderate LUC effects on soil CH₄ and N₂O fluxes?*

442

443 Our approach to address this question includes both univariate and multivariate non-
444 parametric analyses. Across the 62 studies included in this meta-analysis, a range of edaphic
445 and climate variables modified effects of LUC on CH₄ and N₂O. No single variable, nor even
446 pair of variables (Fig. S3), had identical influence on both GHGs, and their interactions were

447 complex (Figs. 7 and 8, Table 3). However, soil extractable inorganic N and soil moisture
448 emerged as two of the most salient drivers of LUC effects on both gases through both
449 univariate and multivariate regression approaches.

450 Mean annual precipitation (MAP) exerted a strong and distinct relationship with LUC
451 effects on CH₄ fluxes (Fig. 4). Apart from its direct influence on soil microbial activity, soil
452 moisture often dictates rates of O₂ diffusion is critical to both rates of CH₄ production and
453 oxidation. Relationships between CH₄ and soil moisture can fluctuate with time (Verchot and
454 others 2000) and are often strongly dependent on soil texture, as reflected in our regression
455 tree analysis (Table 3). For CH₄ fluxes, LUC effects were strongest in wetter ecosystems – or
456 more positive when converting to intensive land uses (+50 μg CH₄ m⁻² h⁻¹) and more negative
457 when reversing to ‘natural’ vegetation (-50 μg CH₄ m⁻² h⁻¹). These trends emphasize the
458 critical role of soil moisture in CH₄ dynamics (Keller and Reiners 1994; Steudler and others
459 1996; Carmo and others 2012; Hiltbrunner and others 2012; Tate 2015).

460 N₂O fluxes, as affected by LUC, were much more variable with MAP, and arguably
461 better related to the direct controlling influence of NO₃⁻ production/consumption (i.e.
462 nitrification and denitrification) rather than land use itself (Figs. 6 & 8). Indeed, while
463 negative relationships between LUC effects on N₂O fluxes and MAP might seem counter-
464 intuitive (Fig. 4), primary tropical forests (Reiners and others 1994; Arai and others 2014), as
465 well as late-successional tropical forests (Erickson and others 2001), can be significant global
466 sources of N₂O, as are many tropical soils (Reay and others, 2007). Our data synthesis
467 suggests a mean rate of emission of 25 μg N₂O m⁻² h⁻¹ from all forests (Fig. 1). Such high
468 N₂O fluxes in ‘natural’ forests, but especially in wetter ecosystems (> 2000 mm), ensures that
469 any LUC to human land use will be lower (on average). This statement must be cautioned,
470 however, since many studies do not account for N₂O pulse seen after initial conversion, nor
471 do they accurately account for periodic ‘hot moments’ like fertilization or tillage events.

472 Other gaseous N losses, like NO emissions (Neill and others 2005), remain too poorly studied
473 to be included here. The effects of LUC on N₂O fluxes in drier ecosystems appears greater
474 than that in wet systems (Kaye and others 2004; Scheer and others 2008; Mapanda and others
475 2010). This may be largely due to actually accounting for these “pulses” of N₂O emission
476 after rain events in drier ecosystems. Such pulses comprise a large proportion of annual N₂O
477 emissions in drier ecosystems (Davidson 1992; Kessavalou and others 1998).

478 Generally speaking, our results suggest that when conversion of land increases soil
479 mineral N availability, increases of both CH₄ and N₂O fluxes also follow (Figs. 6, 7, 8). We
480 must concur with Liu and Greaver (2009). In a global meta-analysis, they found N additions
481 increased CH₄ emission by 97% (reducing CH₄ uptake by 38%), and increased N₂O
482 emissions by 216%. Increased mineral N supply can negatively affect N₂O reduction to N₂
483 and increases N₂O emissions (Weier and others 1993; Gillam and others 2008). Greater
484 mineral N availability (from N fertilization) has also been reported to slow CH₄ uptake by
485 inhibiting methanotroph activity (Steudler and others 1989; Wang and Ineson 2003).
486 Methane oxidation is N-limited in some cases, but inhibited by N in others (Bodelier and
487 Laanbroek 2004; Aronson and Helliker 2010), with the response determined by many site-
488 specific factors as well as the type and amount of fertilizer N applied.

489 Using soil NH₄ and NO₃ as proxies for any fertilization, along with any other LUC
490 features affecting N dynamics, allowed us to evaluate the two N species importance in
491 regulating GHG emissions (even though many studies did not include fertilization
492 information). Converted-to and reverted-from managed ecosystems showed opposite,
493 divergent relationships with mineral N and N₂O emissions (Fig. 6). Land use changes that
494 increased N availability, either NH₄ or NO₃, increased N₂O emissions when transitioning
495 from natural-to-human land uses *but* decreased emissions when reversing (human-to-natural
496 or reversed). Even in unfertilized soils, concentrations of NH₄⁺ and NO₃⁻ in soil reflect a

497 range of competing processes by plants and soil microbes (Kaye and Hart 1997; Schimel and
498 Bennett 2004), and our data show clear opposing trends when land is either converted to and
499 reversed from a managed ecosystem (Fig. 6). This finding highlights the complexity of N
500 cycling, and arguably reflects long-term consequences of N fertilizers for microbial
501 processes.

502 Soil C and pH have well-established links to CH₄ and N₂O emissions, and here we
503 provide some supporting evidence that concomitant changes in these soil properties and GHG
504 emissions from LUC are related (Fig. 5). The effect LUC has on both of these soil properties,
505 and subsequent effect on GHG emissions, could be through an altered soil microbial
506 community. At the global scale both soil C and pH have shown strong relationships diversity
507 and abundance of soil microbes (Fierer and others 2009; Lauber and others 2009) – this can,
508 for example, be extended to methanotrophs and N-cycling bacteria and archaea. Another
509 possibility, is that changes in soil pH or C quantity or quality, via LUC, increase the activity
510 of methane oxidation or N cycling with little to no effect on abundance or diversity of
511 organisms. Some high-affinity CH₄ oxidizers may use acetate as a substrate (Pratscher and
512 others 2011), and that there is a positive relationship between dissolved organic C and CH₄
513 oxidation (Sullivan and others 2013). Nitrous oxide emissions can be dually regulated by: 1)
514 enhanced decomposition of soil organic matter and thus increased gross N mineralization
515 either from increased C inputs from greater gross primary production (Benanti and others
516 2014) – leading to larger pools of NH₄⁺ and NO₃⁻ to be converted to N₂O, or 2) possible
517 reductions in soil pH, especially from coniferous trees, where acidification can inhibit the last
518 step in denitrification leading to more N₂O relative to N₂ (Firestone and others 1980; Šimek
519 and Cooper 2002; Wang and others 2018). Resolving which of these factors is driving the
520 increase in N₂O is difficult since nitrification frequently covaries with pH. Further research
521 into the driving mechanisms for both gases are needed.

522 Finally, a subset of our studies (n = 8) measured soil microbial functional genes
523 (*pmoA*, *nirK*, and *nirS*) involved in soil GHG emissions (Table S2). Seven studies assessed
524 abundance of the *pmoA* gene, which encodes the β -subunit of the particulate methane
525 monooxygenase enzyme, and is the most common, and perhaps only genetic marker available
526 for detection of all atmospheric CH₄ oxidizers. *pmoA* genes associated with atmospheric CH₄
527 oxidizers are typically referred to as upland soil clusters, of which there are several. A strong
528 negative relationship between LUC effect on the *pmoA* gene and CH₄ fluxes highlights the
529 importance of these organisms in regulating LUC effects (Fig. S5). Many authors of studies
530 of soil CH₄ fluxes have speculated that these organisms are particularly sensitive to
531 disturbance. This meta-analysis provides some cross-study evidence for such sensitivity, but,
532 again, we lack knowledge at the finer scale.

533 *Limitations of meta-analysis – Spatiotemporal variability of soil greenhouse gas emissions*

534

535 There is large variation in the experimental designs and methods encompassed here
536 (Table 1 and S1). Temporal and spatial variability remains a major limitation in all studies of
537 soil-atmosphere fluxes of GHG (Velthof and others 1996; Barton and others 2015;
538 Kravchenko and Robertson 2015; McDaniel and others 2017). Nearly all of our 62 studies
539 used paired-site approaches, or reported GHG emissions from two or more sites in close
540 proximity. Paired sites were generally replicated four times (range 1 to 15), while sampling
541 frequency was typically once per month (range: 1 to 8 measurements/week). Spatial and
542 temporal variability of CH₄ and N₂O fluxes can be extreme (Barton and others 2015;
543 McDaniel and others 2017) and all included fluxes could be significant over- or under-
544 estimates. For instance, McDaniel and others (2017) showed that spatial variability in a 16
545 ha agriculture field can rival that of five months of temporal variability within the same field.
546 To reduce the standard error in reported GHG fluxes to within 10% of their mean values

547 would have required nearly 2000 measurements for CH₄ and over 8000 measurements for
548 N₂O. Barton et al. (2015) reported that daily measurements of N₂O were essential given the
549 known temporal variability, and the uncertainty of flux estimation extends to the methods
550 used in individual flux measurements too (Levy and others 2011; Jungkunst and others 2018).

551 Spatial and temporal variability limits our ability to detect treatment effects. This is
552 especially the case for critical periods, such as immediately after fertilizer application. N₂O
553 fluxes in this period are frequently many fold, or even order of magnitude, larger than at other
554 times, so not capturing these data could severely underestimate fluxes (Barton and others
555 2015; Guardia and others 2016). We must thus place greater emphasis on the relatively few,
556 well-replicated studies that capture such events. For example, studies by Dobbie and others
557 (1995, n = 15) and Merino and others (2004, n = 56) are highly valuable. Many studies
558 included here (15 of the 62) had spatial replication of n=3 or less, and half of all included
559 studies (31) had temporal replication of 2 or less. Future studies should explicitly
560 acknowledge the problems of spatiotemporal variability, and utilize known solutions via
561 appropriate sampling and statistical techniques (Barton and others 2015; Kravchenko and
562 Robertson 2015; McDaniel and others 2017; Saha and others 2017a).

563 **Conclusion**

564
565 It seems inevitable that land uses will continue to change around the globe, and that
566 some soils currently under natural vegetation will be converted to the production of food,
567 fibre, and fuel. Converting more land to production could increase fluxes of methane (CH₄)
568 and nitrous oxide (N₂O) by 234 kg CO₂-eq ha⁻¹ y⁻¹ (95% confidence range: 84-447). While
569 this is small relative to total CO₂ losses that emanate from LUC (~ 2%, Hansen 2013), our
570 meta-analysis suggests that restoring these lands to 'natural' vegetation would have little
571 effect, at least on decadal time scales. Land management practices that serve to increase CH₄

572 oxidation or reduce N₂O emissions are good options for land under human use (including
573 further converted land). Future research that focuses on a better understanding of the
574 proximal biotic drivers of the responsible processes seems to be of greater value than more
575 studies quantifying fluxes alone.

576 **Acknowledgements**

577

578 MAA acknowledges the support of the Australian Research Council. We would like
579 to thank Drs. Lachlan Ingram, Feike Dijkstra, and Alberto Canarini for helpful discussion
580 over the data and meta-analyses. We thank Drs. Klaus Butterbach-Bahl and Monica Turner,
581 and three anonymous reviewers, for helpful comments and suggestions that have improved
582 this manuscript.

583 **Tables**

584

585 Table 1. Soil properties, environmental moderating variables, and site and treatment
586 characteristics for studies included in this meta-analysis.

587 Table 2. Overall effects of land-use change on CH₄ and N₂O greenhouse gas global warming
588 potential (GWP).

589 Table 3. Importance of interacting variables to effects of LUC on fluxes of CH₄ and N₂O.

590 **Figures**

591 Figure 1. Box plots of soil methane (CH₄) and nitrous oxide (N₂O) fluxes. Herbaceous
592 vegetation includes: shrubland, savanna, and grasslands. Box plots show mean (dashed line),
593 median (solid line), 5th percentile (circle), 10th percentile (whisker), 25th percentile, 75th
594 percentile, 90th percentile (whisker), and 95th percentile (circle). Natural vegetation shown in
595 blue, and converted land uses are in red. The number in parentheses are number of
596 observations from the ecosystem or land-use types.

597 Figure 2. Effect of land-use change on soil methane (CH₄) and nitrous oxide (N₂O) fluxes.
598 The overall data (filled symbols) and data separated by type of land use (open symbols).
599 These data are further separated by two ecosystem types: Forests and herbaceous ecosystems
600 (shrubland, savanna, and grasslands). U is the difference in greenhouse gas flux between the
601 new and previous land use. The numbers in parentheses are number of overall comparisons.

602 Figure 3. The effect of land-use change on soil methane (CH₄) and nitrous oxide (N₂O)
603 expressed over the number of years since conversion to the new land use. U is the difference
604 in greenhouse gas flux between the new and previous land use. Herbaceous ecosystems are
605 shrublands, savannahs and grasslands. Natural-to-human (Converted, red circles) and human-
606 to-natural (Reversed, blue triangles) land use changes are shown. Significant ($P < 0.05$)
607 correlations are shown with exponential decay trend lines. Data from Meurer and others
608 (2016) and Neill and others (2005), focused on pasture conversions from Brazilian forests,
609 were adapted to fit our UN₂O format for comparison.

610 Figure 4. Correlations among land-use change effects on soil methane (UCH₄) and nitrous
611 oxide (UN₂O) with environmental variables: mean annual temperature (MAT), mean annual
612 precipitation (MAP), and percentage of clay in the soil. U is the difference in greenhouse gas
613 flux between the new and previous land use. Natural-to-human (Converted, red circles) and

614 human-to-natural (Reversed, blue triangles) land use changes are shown. Significant ($P <$
615 0.05) correlations are shown with linear trend lines.

616 Figure 5. Correlations among land-use change effects on soil methane (CH_4) and nitrous
617 oxide (N_2O) with slow-changing variables: total organic carbon (TOC), total nitrogen (TN),
618 pH, and bulk density (BD). RR is the response ratio of that soil variable to land use change –
619 a positive value is increase from new land use, negative is a decrease from the new land use.
620 U is the difference in greenhouse gas flux between the new and previous land use. Natural-
621 to-human (Converted, red circles) and human-to-natural (Reversed, blue triangles) land use
622 changes are shown. Significant ($P < 0.05$) correlations are shown with linear trend lines.
623 Significant ($P < 0.05$) correlations are shown with linear trend lines.

624 Figure 6. Correlations among land-use change effects on soil methane (CH_4) and nitrous
625 oxide (N_2O) with fast-changing or dynamic variables: temperature (Temp), soil moisture
626 (Moist), ammonium (NH_4), and nitrate (NO_3). RR is the response ratio of that soil variable
627 to land use change – a positive value is increase from new land use, negative is a decrease
628 from the new land use. U is the difference in greenhouse gas flux between the new and
629 previous land use. Natural-to-human (Converted, red circles) and human-to-natural
630 (Reversed, blue triangles) land use changes are shown. Significant ($P < 0.05$) correlations are
631 shown with linear trend lines.

632 Figure 7. Random Forest regression tree analysis for the land-use change (LUC) effects on
633 methane (U_{CH_4}). U is the difference in greenhouse gas flux between the new and previous
634 land use. Nodes in the tree are moderating variables expressed as relative change (RC) in
635 percent, which was calculated as: $\text{new LU} - \text{old LU} / \text{old LU} \times 100$. Variables in this tree
636 include: soil nitrate (NO_3), land use change direction (LUC), and soil total organic carbon
637 (TOC). To read the tree, at each node if the LUC effect is true (e.g. $< \text{XX}$ relative change)

638 then move to the left branch, if not then move to the right. At the ends of the branches are the
639 mean U_{CH_4} values associated with that path, and number of comparisons (n) for each terminal
640 node, and box and whisker plots. Box and whisker plots show median (solid line), 5th
641 percentile (bottom circle), 10th percentile (whisker), 25th percentile (bottom of box), 75th
642 percentile (top of box), 90th percentile (whisker), and 95th percentile (top circle).

643 Figure 8. Random Forest regression tree analysis for the land-use change (LUC) effects on
644 nitrous oxide (U_{N_2O}). U is the difference in greenhouse gas flux between the new and
645 previous land use. Nodes in the tree are moderating variables expressed as relative change
646 (RC) in percent, which was calculated as: $\text{new LU} - \text{old LU} / \text{old LU} \times 100$. Variables in this
647 tree include: soil ammonium (NH_4), soil nitrate (NO_3), and gravimetric water content (GWC).
648 To read the tree, at each node if the LUC effect is true (e.g. $< XX$ relative change) then move
649 to the left branch, if not then move to the right. At the ends of the branches are the mean
650 U_{N_2O} values associated with that path, number of comparisons (n) for each terminal node, and
651 box and whisker plots. Box and whisker plots show median (solid line), 5th percentile (bottom
652 circle), 10th percentile (whisker), 25th percentile (bottom of box), 75th percentile (top of box),
653 90th percentile (whisker), and 95th percentile (top circle).

654

655 **References Cited**

- 656 Akimoto H. 2003. Global air quality and pollution. *Science* (80) 302:1716–1719.
- 657 Arai H, Hadi A, Darung U, Limin SH, Takahashi H, Hatano R, Inubushi K. 2014. Land use
658 change affects microbial biomass and fluxes of carbon dioxide and nitrous oxide in
659 tropical peatlands. *Soil Sci Plant Nutr* 60:423–434.
- 660 Aronson EL, Allison SD. 2012. Meta-analysis of environmental impacts on nitrous oxide
661 release in response to N amendment. *Front Microbiol* 3:272.
- 662 Aronson EL, Helliker BR. 2010. Methane flux in non-wetland soils in response to nitrogen
663 addition: a meta-analysis. *Ecology* 91:3242–3251.
- 664 Ball BC, Scott A, Parker JP. 1999. Field N₂O, CO₂ and CH₄ fluxes in relation to tillage,
665 compaction and soil quality in Scotland. *Soil Tillage Res* 53:29–39.
- 666 Barton L, Wolf B, Rowlings D, Scheer C, Kiese R, Grace P, Stefanova K, Butterbach-Bahl
667 K. 2015. Sampling frequency affects estimates of annual nitrous oxide fluxes. *Sci Rep*
668 5:15912.
- 669 Benanti G, Saunders M, Tobin B, Osborne B. 2014. Contrasting impacts of afforestation on
670 nitrous oxide and methane emissions. *Agric For Meteorol* 198–199:82–93.
- 671 Bender M, Conrad R. 1992. Kinetics of CH₄ oxidation in oxic soils exposed to ambient air or
672 high CH₄ mixing ratios. *FEMS Microbiol Lett* 101:261–269.
- 673 Bodelier PLE, Laanbroek HJ. 2004. Nitrogen as a regulatory factor of methane oxidation in
674 soils and sediments. *FEMS Microbiol Ecol* 47:265–277.
- 675 Boeckx P, Van Cleemput O, Villaralvo I. 1997. Methane oxidation in soils with different
676 textures and land use. *Nutr Cycl Agroecosystems* 49:91–95.

- 677 Breiman L. 2001. Random Forests. *Mach Learn* 45:5–23.
- 678 Brussaard L, Caron P, Campbell B, Lipper L, Mainka S, Rabbinge R, Babin D, Pulleman M.
679 2010. Reconciling biodiversity conservation and food security: scientific challenges for
680 a new agriculture. *Curr Opin Environ Sustain* 2:34–42.
- 681 Carmo JB do, de Sousa Neto ER, Duarte-Neto PJ, Ometto JPHB, Martinelli LA. 2012.
682 Conversion of the coastal Atlantic forest to pasture: Consequences for the nitrogen cycle
683 and soil greenhouse gas emissions. *Agric Ecosyst Environ* 148:37–43.
- 684 Chapuis-Lardy L, Wrage N, Metay A, Chotte J-L, Bernoux M. 2007. Soils, a sink for N₂O?
685 A review. *Glob Chang Biol* 13:1–17.
- 686 Chen Y, Day SD, Shrestha RK, Strahm BD, Wiseman PE. 2014. Influence of urban land
687 development and soil rehabilitation on soil–atmosphere greenhouse gas fluxes.
688 *Geoderma* 226–227:348–53.
- 689 Conrad R. 2009. The global methane cycle: recent advances in understanding the microbial
690 processes involved. *Environ Microbiol Rep* 1:285–292.
- 691 Conrad R, Rothfuss F. 1991. Methane oxidation in the soil surface layer of a flooded rice
692 field and the effect of ammonium. *Biol Fertil Soils* 12:28–32.
- 693 Cronk QCB, Fuller JL. 2014. *Plant invaders: the threat to natural ecosystems*. Routledge
- 694 Dale VH, Houghton RA, Hall CAS. 1991. Estimating the effects of land-use change on
695 global atmospheric CO₂ concentrations. *Can J For Res* 21:84–90.
- 696 Davidson EA. 1992. Sources of nitric oxide and nitrous oxide following wetting of dry soil.
697 56:95–102.
- 698 Davidson EA. 1993. Soil water content and the ratio of nitrous oxide to nitric oxide emitted

699 from soil. In: *Biogeochemistry of Global Change*. Springer. pp 369–86.

700 Dooley S, Treseder K. 2012. The effect of fire on microbial biomass: a meta-analysis of field
701 studies. *Biogeochemistry* 109:49–61.

702 Dunfield P. 2007. The Soil Methane Sink. In: Reay DS, Hewitt CN, Smith KA, Grace J,
703 editors. *Greenhouse Gas Sinks*. CABI. pp 152–170.

704 Erickson H, Keller M, Davidson AE. 2001. Nitrogen oxide fluxes and nitrogen cycling
705 during postagricultural succession and forest fertilization in the Humid Tropics.
706 *Ecosystems* 4:67–84.

707 Fierer N, Strickland MS, Liptzin D, Bradford MA, Cleveland CC. 2009. Global patterns in
708 belowground communities. *Ecol Lett* 12:1238–1249.

709 Firestone MK, Davidson EA. 1989. Microbiological basis of NO and N₂O production and
710 consumption in soil. *Exch trace gases between Terr Ecosyst Atmos* 47:7–21.

711 Firestone MK, Firestone RB, Tiedje JM. 1980. Nitrous oxide from soil denitrification: factors
712 controlling its biological production. *Science* 208:749–751.

713 Foley JA, DeFries R, Asner GP, Barford C, Bonan G, Carpenter SR, Chapin FS, Coe MT,
714 Daily GC, Gibbs HK. 2005. Global consequences of land use. *Science* (80-) 309:570–4.

715 Galbally I, Meyer CP, Wang Y-Pi, Kirstine W. 2010. Soil–atmosphere exchange of CH₄, CO,
716 N₂O and NO_x and the effects of land-use change in the semiarid Mallee system in
717 Southeastern Australia. *Glob Chang Biol* 16:2407–2419.

718 Gillam KM, Zebarth BJ, Burton DL. 2008. Nitrous oxide emissions from denitrification and
719 the partitioning of gaseous losses as affected by nitrate and carbon addition and soil
720 aeration. *Can J Soil Sci* 88:133–143.

721 Godfray HCJ, Beddington JR, Crute IR, Haddad L, Lawrence D, Muir JF, Pretty J, Robinson
722 S, Thomas SM, Toulmin C. 2010. Food Security: The Challenge of Feeding 9 Billion
723 People. *Science* 327:812–818.

724 van Groenigen KJ, Osenberg CW, Hungate BA. 2011. Increased soil emissions of potent
725 greenhouse gases under increased atmospheric CO₂. *Nature* 475:214–216.

726 Guardia G, Abalos D, García-Marco S, Quemada M, Alonso-Ayuso M, Cárdenas LM, Dixon
727 ER, Vallejo A. 2016. Effect of cover crops on greenhouse gas emissions in an irrigated
728 field under integrated soil fertility management. *Biogeosciences* 13:5245–5257.

729 Guo LB, Gifford RM. 2002. Soil carbon stocks and land use change: a meta analysis. *Glob*
730 *Chang Biol* 8:345–360.

731 Gurevitch J, Hedges L V. 1999. Statistical issues in ecological meta-analyses. *Ecology*
732 80:1142–1149.

733 Hansen MC, Potapov P V, Moore R, Hancher M, Turubanova SA, Tyukavina A, Thau D,
734 Stehman S V, Goetz SJ, Loveland TR, Kommareddy A, Egorov A, Chini L, Justice CO,
735 Townshend JRG. 2013. High-resolution global maps of 21st-Century forest cover
736 change. *Science* 342:850–853.

737 Harriss RC, Sebacher DI, Day FP. 1982. Methane flux in the Great Dismal Swamp. *Nature*
738 297:673–674.

739 Hendrickson OQ, Chatarpaul L, Burgess D. 1989. Nutrient cycling following whole-tree and
740 conventional harvest in northern mixed forest. *Can J For Res* 19:725–35.

741 Hiltbrunner D, Zimmermann S, Karbin S, Hagedorn F, Niklaus PA. 2012. Increasing soil
742 methane sink along a 120-year afforestation chronosequence is driven by soil moisture.

743 Glob Chang Biol 18:3664–3671.

744 Johnson DW. 1992. Effects of forest management on soil carbon storage. In: Natural Sinks of
745 CO₂. Springer, Dordrecht. pp 83–120

746 Jungkunst HF, Meurer KHE, Jurasinski G, Niehaus E, Günther A. 2018. How to best address
747 spatial and temporal variability of soil-derived nitrous oxide and methane emissions. J
748 Plant Nutr Soil Sci 181:7–11.

749 Kaye JP, Burke IC, Mosier AR, Pablo Guerschman J. 2004. Methane and nitrous oxide fluxes
750 from urban soils to the atmosphere. Ecol Appl 14:975–981.

751 Kaye JP, Hart SC. 1997. Competition for nitrogen between plants and soil microorganisms.
752 Trends Ecol Evol 12:139–143.

753 Keller M, Mitre ME, Stallard RF. 1990. Consumption of atmospheric methane in soils of
754 central Panama: Effects of agricultural development. Global Biogeochem Cycles 4:21–
755 27.

756 Keller M, Reiners WA. 1994. Soil-atmosphere exchange of nitrous oxide, nitric oxide, and
757 methane under secondary succession of pasture to forest in the Atlantic lowlands of
758 Costa Rica. Global Biogeochem Cycles 8:399–409.

759 Keller M, Veldkamp E, Weitz AM, Reiners WA. 1993. Effect of pasture age on soil trace-gas
760 emissions from a deforested area of Costa Rica. Nature 365:244–246.

761 Kessavalou A, Doran JW, Mosier AR, Drijber RA. 1998. Greenhouse gas fluxes following
762 tillage and wetting in a wheat-fallow cropping system. J Environ Qual 27:1105–1116.

763 Knief C. 2015. Diversity and habitat preferences of cultivated and uncultivated aerobic
764 methanotrophic bacteria evaluated based on pmoA as molecular marker. Front

765 Microbiol 6(1346):1-38.

766 Kolb S. 2009. The quest for atmospheric methane oxidizers in forest soils. Environ Microbiol
767 Rep 1:336–346.

768 Koricheva J, Gurevitch J. 2014. Uses and misuses of meta-analysis in plant ecology. J Ecol
769 102:828–844.

770 Kravchenko AN, Robertson GP. 2015. Statistical Challenges in Analyses of Chamber-Based
771 Soil CO and N₂O Emissions Data. Soil Sci Soc Am J 79:200–2911.

772 Lauber CL, Hamady M, Knight R, Fierer N. 2009. Pyrosequencing-based assessment of soil
773 pH as a predictor of soil bacterial community structure at the continental scale. Appl
774 Environ Microbiol 75:5111–20.

775 van Lent J, Hergoualc’h K, Verhot LV. Reviews and syntheses: Soil N₂O and NO emissions
776 from land use and land use change in the tropics and subtropics: a meta-analysis.
777 12:7299–7313.

778 Levy PE, Gray A, Leeson SR, Gaiawyn J, Kelly MPC, Cooper MDA, Dinsmore KJ, Jones
779 SK, Sheppard LJ. 2011. Quantification of uncertainty in trace gas fluxes measured by
780 the static chamber method. Eur J Soil Sci 62:811–21.

781 Liaw A, Wiener M. 2002. Classification and regression by randomForest. R news 2:18–22.

782 Linn DM, Doran JW. 1984. Effect of water-filled pore space on carbon dioxide and nitrous
783 oxide production in tilled and nontilled soils. Soil Sci Soc Am J 48:1267–1272.

784 Liu J, Jiang P, Li Y, Zhou G, Wu J, Yang F. 2011. Responses of N₂O flux from forest soils to
785 land use change in subtropical China. Bot Rev 77:320–325.

786 Liu L, Greaver TL. 2009. A review of nitrogen enrichment effects on three biogenic GHGs:

787 the CO₂ sink may be largely offset by stimulated N₂O and CH₄ emission. *Ecol Lett*
788 12:1103–1117.

789 Livesley SJ, Grover S, Hutley LB, Jamali H, Butterbach-Bahl K, Fest B, Beringer J, Arndt
790 SK. 2011. Seasonal variation and fire effects on CH₄, N₂O and CO₂ exchange in savanna
791 soils of northern Australia. *Agric For Meteorol* 151:1440–1452.

792 Mapanda F, Mupini J, Wuta M, Nyamangara J, Rees RM. 2010. A cross-ecosystem
793 assessment of the effects of land cover and land use on soil emission of selected
794 greenhouse gases and related soil properties in Zimbabwe. *Eur J Soil Sci* 61:721–733.

795 Mariani L, Chang SX, Kabzems R. 2006. Effects of tree harvesting, forest floor removal, and
796 compaction on soil microbial biomass, microbial respiration, and N availability in a
797 boreal aspen forest in British Columbia. *Soil Biol Biochem* 38:1734–44.

798 McDaniel MD, Kaye JP, Kaye MW. 2014a. Do “hot moments” become hotter under climate
799 change? Soil nitrogen dynamics from a climate manipulation experiment in a post-
800 harvest forest. *Biogeochemistry* 121:339–354.

801 McDaniel MD, Tiemann LK, Grandy AS. 2014b. Does agricultural crop diversity enhance
802 soil microbial biomass and organic matter dynamics? A meta-analysis. *Ecol Appl*
803 24:560–570.

804 McDaniel MD, Simpson RR, Malone BP, McBratney AB, Minasny B, Adams MA. 2017.
805 Quantifying and predicting spatio-temporal variability of soil CH₄ and N₂O fluxes from
806 a seemingly homogeneous Australian agricultural field. *Agric Ecosyst Environ* 240:182–
807 193.

808 Meurer KHE, Franko U, Stange CF, Rosa JD, Madari BE, Jungkunst HF. 2016. Direct
809 nitrous oxide (N₂O) fluxes from soils under different land use in Brazil—a critical

810 review. *Environ Res Lett* 11:23001.

811 Mueller ND, Gerber JS, Johnston M, Ray DK, Ramankutty N, Foley JA. 2012. Closing yield
812 gaps through nutrient and water management. *Nature* 490:254–257.

813 Myhre G, Shindell D, Bréon FM, Collins W, Fuglestedt J, Huang J, Koch D, Lamarque JF,
814 Lee D, Mendoza B. 2013. Anthropogenic and natural radiative forcing. *Clim Chang* 423.

815 Nazaries L, Tate KR, Ross DJ, Singh J, Dando J, Saggar S, Baggs EM, Millard P, Murrell
816 JC, Singh BK. 2011. Response of methanotrophic communities to afforestation and
817 reforestation in New Zealand. *ISME J* 5:1832–1836.

818 Neill C, Steudler PA, Garcia-Montiel DC, Melillo JM, Feigl BJ, Piccolo MC, Cerri CC.
819 2005. Rates and controls of nitrous oxide and nitric oxide emissions following
820 conversion of forest to pasture in Rondônia. *Nutr Cycl Agroecosyst* 71:1–15.

821 Nyawira S-S, Nabel JEMS, Don A, Brovkin V, Pongratz J. 2016. Soil carbon response to
822 land-use change: Evaluation of a global vegetation model using meta-data.
823 *Biogeosciences* 13:5661–75.

824 Philibert A, Loyce C, Makowski D. 2012. Assessment of the quality of meta-analysis in
825 agronomy. *Agric Ecosyst Environ* 148:72–82.

826 Power AG. 2010. Linking ecological sustainability and world food needs. *Environ Dev*
827 *Sustain* 1:185–196.

828 Pratscher J, Dumont MG, Conrad R. 2011. Assimilation of acetate by the putative
829 atmospheric methane oxidizers belonging to the USC α clade. *Environ Microbiol*
830 13:2692–2701.

831 Priemé A, Christensen S. 1999. Methane uptake by a selection of soils in Ghana with

832 different land use. *J Geophys Res Atmos* 104:23617–23622.

833 Priemé A, Christensen S, Dobbie KE, Smith KA. 1997. Slow increase in rate of methane
834 oxidation in soils with time following land use change from arable agriculture to
835 woodland. *Soil Biol Biochem* 29:1269–1273.

836 Raich JW, Schlesinger WH. 1992. The global carbon dioxide flux in soil respiration and its
837 relationship to vegetation and climate. *Tellus B* 44:81–99.

838 Reay DS, Hewitt CN, Smith KA. 2007. Nitrous Oxide: Importance, Sources and Sinks. In:
839 Reay DS, Hewitt CN, Smith KA, Grace J, editors. *Greenhouse Gas Sinks*. Cambridge,
840 MA: CABI. pp 201–206.

841 Reiners WA, Bouwman AF, Parsons WFJ, Keller M. 1994. Tropical rain forest conversion to
842 pasture: Changes in vegetation and soil properties. *Ecol Appl* 4:363–377.

843 Robertson GP, Paul EA, Harwood RR. 2000. Greenhouse gases in intensive agriculture:
844 contributions of individual gases to the radiative forcing of the atmosphere. *Science*
845 289:1922–1925.

846 Rosenberg MS, Adams DC, Gurevitch J. 2000. *MetaWin : statistical software for meta-*
847 *analysis*. Sunderland, MA: Sinauer Associates

848 Saha D, Kemanian AR, Rau BM, Adler PR, Montes F. 2017a. Designing efficient nitrous
849 oxide sampling strategies in agroecosystems using simulation models. *Atmos Environ*
850 155:189–198.

851 Saha D, Rau BM, Kaye JP, Montes F, Adler PR, Kemanian AR. 2017b. Landscape control of
852 nitrous oxide emissions during the transition from conservation reserve program to
853 perennial grasses for bioenergy. *Glob Change Biol Bioenergy* 9:783–795.

854 Sainju UM, Caesar-TonThat T, Lenssen AW, Barsotti JL. 2012. Dryland soil greenhouse gas
855 emissions affected by cropping sequence and nitrogen fertilization. *Soil Sci Soc Am J*
856 76:1741–1757.

857 Scheer C, Wassmann R, Kienzler K, Ibragimov N, Lamers JPA, Martius C. 2008. Methane
858 and nitrous oxide fluxes in annual and perennial land-use systems of the irrigated areas
859 in the Aral Sea Basin. *Glob Chang Biol* 14:2454–2468.

860 Scheffer M, Carpenter S, Foley JA, Folke C, Walker B. 2001. Catastrophic shifts in
861 ecosystems. *Nature* 413:591–596.

862 Schimel JP, Bennett J. 2004. Nitrogen mineralization: challenges of a changing paradigm.
863 *Ecology* 85:591–602.

864 Shcherbak I, Millar N, Robertson GP. 2014. Global metaanalysis of the nonlinear response of
865 soil nitrous oxide (N₂O) emissions to fertilizer nitrogen. *Proc Natl Acad Sci* 111:9199–
866 9204.

867 Šimek M, Cooper JE. 2002. The influence of soil pH on denitrification: progress towards the
868 understanding of this interaction over the last 50 years. *Eur J Soil Sci* 53:345–354.

869 Smith KA, Dobbie KE, Ball BC, Bakken LR, Sitaula BK, Hansen S, Brumme R, Borken W,
870 Christensen S, Priemé A, Fowler D, Macdonald JA, Skiba U, Klemedtsson L, Kasimir-
871 Klemedtsson A, Degórska A, Orlanski P. 2000. Oxidation of atmospheric methane in
872 Northern European soils, comparison with other ecosystems, and uncertainties in the
873 global terrestrial sink. *Glob Chang Biol* 6:791–803.

874 Solomon S. 2007. *Climate change 2007-the physical science basis: Working group I*
875 contribution to the fourth assessment report of the IPCC. Cambridge University Press

876 Stehfest E, Bouwman L. 2006. N₂O and NO emission from agricultural fields and soils under
877 natural vegetation: summarizing available measurement data and modeling of global
878 annual emissions. *Nutr Cycl Agroecosystems* 74:207–228.

879 Stekhoven DJ, Bühlmann P. 2011. MissForest—non-parametric missing value imputation for
880 mixed-type data. *Bioinformatics* 28:112–118.

881 Steudler PA, Bowden RD, Melillo JM, Aber JD. 1989. Influence of nitrogen fertilization on
882 methane uptake in temperate forest soils. *Nature* 341:314-316.

883 Steudler PA, Melillo JM, Bowden RD, Castro MS, Lugo AE. 1991. The effects of natural and
884 human disturbances on soil nitrogen dynamics and trace gas fluxes in a Puerto Rican wet
885 forest. *Biotropica*:356–363.

886 Steudler PA, Melillo JM, Feigl BJ, Neill C, Piccolo MC, Cerri CC. 1996. Consequence of
887 forest-to-pasture conversion on CH₄ fluxes in the Brazilian Amazon Basin. *J Geophys*
888 *Res Atmos* 101:18547–18554.

889 Sullivan BW, Selmants PC, Hart SC. 2013. Does dissolved organic carbon regulate biological
890 methane oxidation in semiarid soils? *Glob Chang Biol* 19:2149–2157.

891 Tate KR. 2015. Soil methane oxidation and land-use change – from process to mitigation.
892 *Soil Biol Biochem* 80:260–272.

893 Tate KR, Ross DJ, Scott NA, Rodda NJ, Townsend JA, Arnold GC. 2006. Post-harvest
894 patterns of carbon dioxide production, methane uptake and nitrous oxide production in a
895 *Pinus radiata* D. Don plantation. *For Ecol Manage* 228:40–50.

896 Tonitto C, David MB, Drinkwater LE. 2006. Replacing bare fallows with cover crops in
897 fertilizer-intensive cropping systems: A meta-analysis of crop yield and N dynamics.

- 898 Agric Ecosyst Environ 112:58–72.
- 899 Velthof GL, Jarvis SC, Stein A, Allen AG, Oenema O. 1996. Spatial variability of nitrous
900 oxide fluxes in mown and grazed grasslands on a poorly drained clay soil. *Soil Biol*
901 *Biochem* 28:1215–1225.
- 902 Venterea RT, Burger M, Spokas KA. 2005. Nitrogen oxide and methane emissions under
903 varying tillage and fertilizer management . *J Environ Qual* 34:1467–1477.
- 904 Verchot L V, Davidson EA, Cattânio JH, Ackerman IL. 2000. Land-use change and
905 biogeochemical controls of methane fluxes in soils of eastern Amazonia. *Ecosystems*
906 3:41–56.
- 907 Vilà M, Espinar JL, Hejda M, Hulme PE, Jarošík V, Maron JL, Pergl J, Schaffner U, Sun Y,
908 Pyšek P. 2011. Ecological impacts of invasive alien plants: a meta-analysis of their
909 effects on species, communities and ecosystems. *Ecol Lett* 14:702–708.
- 910 Wang Y, Guo J, Vogt RD, Mulder J, Wang J, Zhang X. 2018. Soil pH as the chief modifier
911 for regional nitrous oxide emissions: New evidence and implications for global
912 estimates and mitigation. *Glob Chang Biol* 24:617–626.
- 913 Wang Z-P, Ineson P. 2003. Methane oxidation in a temperate coniferous forest soil: effects of
914 inorganic N. *Soil Biol Biochem* 35:427–433.
- 915 Weier KL, Doran JW, Power JF, Walters DT. 1993. Denitrification and the dinitrogen/nitrous
916 oxide ratio as affected by soil water, available carbon, and nitrate. *Soil Sci Soc Am J*
917 57:66–72.
- 918 Wohl E. 2013. Wilderness is dead: Whither critical zone studies and geomorphology in the
919 Anthropocene? *Anthropocene* 2:4–15.

920 **References Used in the Meta-analysis (also see Table S1)**

- 921 Allen DE, Mendham DS, Bhupinderpal-Singh, Cowie A, Wang W, Dalal RC, Raison RJ.
922 2009. Nitrous oxide and methane emissions from soil are reduced following
923 afforestation of pasture lands in three contrasting climatic zones. *Soil Res* 47 :443–58.
- 924 Arai H, Hadi A, Darung U, Limin SH, Takahashi H, Hatano R, Inubushi K. 2014. Land use
925 change affects microbial biomass and fluxes of carbon dioxide and nitrous oxide in
926 tropical peatlands. *Soil Sci Plant Nutr* 60:423–34.
- 927 Attard E, Recous S, Chabbi A, De Berranger C, Guillaumaud N, Labreuche J, Philippot L,
928 Schmid B, Le Roux X. 2011. Soil environmental conditions rather than denitrifier
929 abundance and diversity drive potential denitrification after changes in land uses. *Glob*
930 *Change Biol* 17:1975–89.
- 931 Bárcena TG, D’Imperio L, Gundersen P, Vesterdal L, Priemé A, Christiansen JR. 2014.
932 Conversion of cropland to forest increases soil CH₄ oxidation and abundance of CH₄
933 oxidizing bacteria with stand age. *Appl Soil Ecol* 79:49–58.
- 934 Benanti G, Saunders M, Tobin B, Osborne B. 2014. Contrasting impacts of afforestation on
935 nitrous oxide and methane emissions. *Agr Forest Meteorol* 198–199:82–93.
- 936 Boeckx P, Van Cleemput O, Villaralvo I. 1997. Methane oxidation in soils with different
937 textures and land use. *Nutr Cycl Agroecosys* 49:91–5.
- 938 Borken W, Xu Y-J, Beese F. 2003. Conversion of hardwood forests to spruce and pine
939 plantations strongly reduced soil methane sink in Germany. *Glob Change Biol* 9:956–
940 66.
- 941 Carmo JB do, de Sousa Neto ER, Duarte-Neto PJ, Ometto JPHB, Martinelli LA. 2012.
942 Conversion of the coastal Atlantic forest to pasture: Consequences for the nitrogen cycle

943 and soil greenhouse gas emissions. *Agr Ecosyst Environ* 148:37–43.

944 Chan ASK, Parkin TB. 2001a. Effect of land use on methane flux from soil. *J Env Qual* 30:
945 786-797.

946 Chan ASK, Parkin TB. 2001b. Methane oxidation and production activity in soils from
947 natural and agricultural ecosystems. *J Env Qual* 30: 1896-1903.

948 Chen Y, Day SD, Shrestha RK, Strahm BD, Wiseman PE. 2014. Influence of urban land
949 development and soil rehabilitation on soil–atmosphere greenhouse gas fluxes.
950 *Geoderma* 226–227:348–53.

951 Costa KH, Groffman PM. 2013. Factors regulating net methane flux by soils in urban forests
952 and grasslands. *Soil Sci Soc Am J* 77:850–855.

953 Coutinho RP, Urquiaga S, Boddey RM, Alves BJR, Torres AQA, Jantalia CP. 2010. Estoque
954 de carbono e nitrogênio e emissão de N₂O em diferentes usos do solo na Mata Atlântica
955 . *Pesquisa Agropecuária Brasileira* 45:195–203.

956 Dobbie KE, Smith KA, Prieme´ A, Christensen S, Degorska A, Orlanski P. 1996. Effect of
957 land use on the rate of methane uptake by surface soils in Northern Europe. *Atmos*
958 *Environ* 30:1005–1011.

959 Dörr N, Glaser B, Kolb S. 2010. Methanotrophic communities in Brazilian Ferralsols from
960 naturally forested, afforested, and agricultural sites. *Appl Env Microbiol* 76 :1307–
961 1310.

962 Erickson H, Keller M, Davidson AE. 2001. Nitrogen Oxide Fluxes and Nitrogen Cycling
963 during Postagricultural Succession and Forest Fertilization in the Humid Tropics.
964 *Ecosystems* 4:67–84.

965 Fernandes SAP, Bernoux M, Cerri CC, Feigl BJ, Piccolo MC. 2002. Seasonal variation of
966 soil chemical properties and CO₂ and CH₄ fluxes in unfertilized and P-fertilized pastures
967 in an Ultisol of the Brazilian Amazon. *Geoderma* 107:227–241.

968 Galbally I, Meyer CP, Wang Y-Pi, Kirstine W. 2010. Soil–atmosphere exchange of CH₄,
969 CO, N₂O and NO_x and the effects of land-use change in the semiarid Mallee system in
970 Southeastern Australia. *Glob Change Biol* 16:2407–2419.

971 Goldman MB, Groffman PM, Pouyat R V, McDonnell MJ, Pickett STA. 1995. CH₄ uptake
972 and N availability in forest soils along an urban to rural gradient. *Soil Biol Biochem*
973 27:281–286.

974 Grover SPP, Livesley SJ, Hutley LB, Jamali H, Fest B, Beringer J, Butterbach-Bahl K, Arndt
975 SK. 2012. Land use change and the impact on greenhouse gas exchange in north
976 Australian savanna soils. *Biogeosciences* 9:423–437.

977 Hiltbrunner D, Zimmermann S, Karbin S, Hagedorn F, Niklaus PA. 2012. Increasing soil
978 methane sink along a 120-year afforestation chronosequence is driven by soil moisture.
979 *Glob Change Biol* 18:3664–3671.

980 Hu R, Kusa K, Hatano R. 2001. Soil respiration and methane flux in adjacent forest,
981 grassland, and cornfield soils in Hokkaido, Japan. *Soil Sci Plant Nutr* 47:621–627.

982 Hudgens DE, Yavitt JB. 1997. Land-use effects on soil methane and carbon dioxide fluxes in
983 forests near Ithaca, New York. *Ecoscience* 4:214–222.

984 Hütsch BW, Webster CP, Powlson DS. 1994. Methane oxidation in soil as affected by land
985 use, soil pH and N fertilization. *Soil Biol Biochem* 26:1613–22.

986 Inubushi K, Hadi A, Okazaki M, Yonebayashi K. 1998. Effect of converting wetland forest to

987 sago palm plantations on methane gas flux and organic carbon dynamics in tropical peat
988 soil. *Hydrol Proc* 12:2073–2080.

989 Ishizuka S, Iswandi A, Nakajima Y, Yonemura S, Sudo S, Tsuruta H, Murdiyarso D. 2005.
990 The variation of greenhouse gas emissions from soils of various land-use/cover types in
991 Jambi province, Indonesia. *Nutr Cycl Agroecosys* 71:17–32.

992 Kaye JP, Burke IC, Mosier AR, Pablo Guerschman J. 2004. Methane and nitrous oxide fluxes
993 from urban soils to the atmosphere. *Ecol Appl* 14:975–981.

994 Keller M, Mitre ME, Stallard RF. 1990. Consumption of atmospheric methane in soils of
995 central Panama: Effects of agricultural development. *Glob Biogeochem Cycl* 4:21–27.

996 Keller M, Reiners WA. 1994. Soil-atmosphere exchange of nitrous oxide, nitric oxide, and
997 methane under secondary succession of pasture to forest in the Atlantic lowlands of
998 Costa Rica. *Glob Biogeochem Cycl* 8:399–409.

999 Keller M, Veldkamp E, Weitz AM, Reiners WA. 1993. Effect of pasture age on soil trace-gas
1000 emissions from a deforested area of Costa Rica. *Nature* 365:244–6.

1001 Lessard R, Rochette P, Topp E, Pattey E, Desjardins RL, Beaumont G. 1994. Methane and
1002 carbon dioxide fluxes from poorly drained adjacent cultivated and forest sites. *Can J Soil*
1003 *Sci* 74:139–146.

1004 Levine UY, Teal TK, Robertson GP, Schmidt TM. 2011. Agriculture’s impact on microbial
1005 diversity and associated fluxes of carbon dioxide and methane. *ISME J* 5:1683–1691.

1006 Liu J, Jiang P, Li Y, Zhou G, Wu J, Yang F. 2011. Responses of N₂O flux from forest soils
1007 to land use change in subtropical China. *The Bot Rev* 77:320–5.

1008 Livesley SJ, Idczak D, Fest BJ. 2013. Differences in carbon density and soil CH₄/N₂O flux

1009 among remnant and agro-ecosystems established since European settlement in the
1010 Mornington Peninsula, Australia. *Sci Tot Environ* 465:17–25.

1011 Livesly SJ, Kiese R, Miehle P, Weston CJ, Butterbach-Bahl K, Arndt SK. 2009. Soil–
1012 atmosphere exchange of greenhouse gases in a *Eucalyptus marginata* woodland, a
1013 clover-grass pasture, and *Pinus radiata* and *Eucalyptus globulus* plantations. *Glob*
1014 *Change Biol* 15:425–440.

1015 Macdonald JA, Eggleton P, Bignell DE, Forzi F, Fowler D. 1998. Methane emission by
1016 termites and oxidation by soils, across a forest disturbance gradient in the Mbalmayo
1017 Forest Reserve, Cameroon. *Glob Change Biol* 4:409–418.

1018 Maljanen M, Liikanen A, Silvola J, Martikainen PJ. 2003. Methane fluxes on agricultural and
1019 forested boreal organic soils. *Soil Use Manage* 19:73–79.

1020 Mapanda F, Mupini J, Wuta M, Nyamangara J, Rees RM. 2010. A cross-ecosystem
1021 assessment of the effects of land cover and land use on soil emission of selected
1022 greenhouse gases and related soil properties in Zimbabwe. *Euro J Soil Sci* 61:721–733.

1023 Melillo JM, Steudler PA, Feigl BJ, Neill C, Garcia D, Piccolo MC, Cerri CC, Tian H. 2001.
1024 Nitrous oxide emissions from forests and pastures of various ages in the Brazilian
1025 Amazon. *J Geophys Res: Atmosph* 106:34179–34188.

1026 Menyailo OV, Hungate BA, Abraham W-R, Conrad R. 2008. Changing land use reduces soil
1027 CH₄ uptake by altering biomass and activity but not composition of high-affinity
1028 methanotrophs. *Glob Change Biol* 14:2405–2419.

1029 Merino A, Pérez-Batallón P, Macías F. 2004. Responses of soil organic matter and
1030 greenhouse gas fluxes to soil management and land use changes in a humid temperate
1031 region of southern Europe. *Soil Biol Biochem* 36:917–925.

- 1032 de Moraes JFL, Volkoff B, Cerri CC, Bernoux M. 1996. Soil properties under Amazon forest
1033 and changes due to pasture installation in Rondônia, Brazil. *Geoderma* 70:63–81.
- 1034 Mosier A, Schimel D, Valentine D, Bronson K, Parton W. 1991. Methane and nitrous oxide
1035 fluxes in native, fertilized and cultivated grasslands. *Nature* 350:330–332.
- 1036 Mosier AR, Parton WJ, Valentine DW, Ojima DS, Schimel DS, Heinemeyer O. 1997. CH₄
1037 and N₂O fluxes in the Colorado shortgrass steppe: 2. Long-term impact of land use
1038 change. *Glob Biogeochem Cycl* 11:29–42.
- 1039 Nazaries L, Tate KR, Ross DJ, Singh J, Dando J, Sagggar S, Baggs EM, Millard P, Murrell
1040 JC, Singh BK. 2011. Response of methanotrophic communities to afforestation and
1041 reforestation in New Zealand. *ISME J* 5:1832–1836.
- 1042 Neill C, Piccolo MC, Steudler PA, Melillo JM, Feigl BJ, Cerri CC. 1995. Nitrogen dynamics
1043 in soils of forests and active pastures in the western Brazilian Amazon Basin. *Soil Biol*
1044 *Biochem* 27:1167–1175.
- 1045 Nykanen H, Alm J, Lang K, Silvola J, Martikainen PJ. 1995. Emissions of CH₄, N₂O and
1046 CO₂ from a virgin fen and a fen drained for grassland in Finland. *J Biogeogr* 22:351–7.
- 1047 Ojima DS, Valentine DW, Mosier AR, Parton WJ, Schimel DS. 1993. Effect of land use
1048 change on methane oxidation in temperate forest and grassland soils. *Chemosphere*
1049 26:675–685.
- 1050 Pendall E, Schwendenmann L, Rahn T, Miller JB, Tans PP, White JWC. 2010. Land use and
1051 season affect fluxes of CO₂, CH₄, CO, N₂O, H₂ and isotopic source signatures in
1052 Panama: evidence from nocturnal boundary layer profiles. *Glob Change Biol* 16:2721–
1053 2736.

- 1054 Powlson DS, Goulding KWT, Willison TW, Webster CP, Hütsch BW. 1997. The effect of
1055 agriculture on methane oxidation in soil. *Nutr Cycl Agroecosys* 49:59–70.
- 1056 Price S, Whitehead D, Sherlock R, McSeveny T, Rogers G. 2010. Net exchange of
1057 greenhouse gases from soils in an unimproved pasture and regenerating indigenous
1058 *Kunzea ericoides* shrubland in New Zealand. *Soil Res* 48:385–394.
- 1059 Priemé A, Christensen S, Dobbie KE, Smith KA. 1997. Slow increase in rate of methane
1060 oxidation in soils with time following land use change from arable agriculture to
1061 woodland. *Soil Biol Biochem* 29:1269–1273.
- 1062 Priemé A, Christensen S. 1999. Methane uptake by a selection of soils in Ghana with
1063 different land use. *J Geophys Res: Atmosph* 104:23617–23622.
- 1064 Reay DS, Radajewski S, Murrell JC, McNamara N, Nedwell DB. 2001. Effects of land-use
1065 on the activity and diversity of methane oxidizing bacteria in forest soils. *Soil Biol*
1066 *Biochem* 33:1613–1623.
- 1067 Reiners WA, Bouwman AF, Parsons WFJ, Keller M. 1994. Tropical Rain Forest Conversion
1068 to Pasture: Changes in Vegetation and Soil Properties. *Ecol Appl* 4:363–377.
- 1069 Robertson GP, Paul EA, Harwood RR. 2000. Greenhouse gases in intensive agriculture:
1070 contributions of individual gases to the radiative forcing of the atmosphere. *Science*
1071 289:1922–1925.
- 1072 Ruan L, Philip Robertson G. 2013. Initial nitrous oxide, carbon dioxide, and methane costs of
1073 converting conservation reserve program grassland to row crops under no-till vs.
1074 conventional tillage. *Glob Change Biol* 19:2478–2489.
- 1075 Scheer C, Wassmann R, Kienzler K, Ibragimov N, Lamers JPA, Martius C. 2008. Methane

1076 and nitrous oxide fluxes in annual and perennial land-use systems of the irrigated areas
1077 in the Aral Sea Basin. *Glob Change Biol* 14:2454–2468.

1078 Simona C, Ariangelo DPR, John G, Nina N, Ruben M, José SJ. 2004. Nitrous oxide and
1079 methane fluxes from soils of the Orinoco savanna under different land uses. *Glob*
1080 *Change Biol* 10:1947–1960.

1081 Singh BK, Tate KR, Kolipaka G, Hedley CB, Macdonald CA, Millard P, Murrell JC. 2007.
1082 Effect of Afforestation and Reforestation of Pastures on the Activity and Population
1083 Dynamics of Methanotrophic Bacteria. *Appl Environ Microbiol* 73:5153–5161.

1084 Singh BK, Tate KR, Ross DJ, Singh J, Dando J, Thomas N, Millard P, Murrell JC. 2009. Soil
1085 methane oxidation and methanotroph responses to afforestation of pastures with *Pinus*
1086 *radiata* stands. *Soil Biol Biochem* 41:2196–2205.

1087 Steudler PA, Melillo JM, Feigl BJ, Neill C, Piccolo MC, Cerri CC. 1996. Consequence of
1088 forest-to-pasture conversion on CH₄ fluxes in the Brazilian Amazon Basin. *J Geophys*
1089 *Res: Atmosph* 101:18547–54.

1090 Suwanwaree P, Robertson GP. 2005. Methane oxidation in forest, successional, and no-till
1091 agricultural ecosystems. *Soil Sci Soc Am J* 69:1722–1729.

1092 Tang X, Liu S, Zhou G, Zhang D, Zhou C. 2006. Soil-atmospheric exchange of CO₂, CH₄,
1093 and N₂O in three subtropical forest ecosystems in southern China. *Glob Change Biol*
1094 12:546–560.

1095 Tate KR, Ross DJ, Saggarr S, Hedley CB, Dando J, Singh BK, Lambie SM. 2007. Methane
1096 uptake in soils from *Pinus radiata* plantations, a reverting shrubland and adjacent
1097 pastures: Effects of land-use change, and soil texture, water and mineral nitrogen. *Soil*
1098 *Biol Biochem* 39:1437–1449.

- 1099 Veldkamp E, Purbopuspito J, Corre MD, Brumme R, Murdiyarso D. 2008. Land use change
1100 effects on trace gas fluxes in the forest margins of Central Sulawesi, Indonesia. *J*
1101 *Geophys Res: Biogeosci* 113:1–11.
- 1102 Verchot L V, Davidson EA, Cattânio H, Ackerman IL, Erickson HE, Keller M. 1999. Land
1103 use change and biogeochemical controls of nitrogen oxide emissions from soils in
1104 eastern Amazonia. *Glob Biogeochem Cycl* 13:31–46.
- 1105 Vitousek P, Matson P, Volkman C, Maass JM, Garcia G. 1989. Nitrous oxide flux from dry
1106 tropical forests. *Glob Biogeochem Cycl* 3:375–382.
- 1107 Werling BP, Dickson TL, Isaacs R, Gaines H, Gratton C, Gross KL, Liere H, Malmstrom
1108 CM, Meehan TD, Ruan L, Robertson BA, Robertson GP, Schmidt TM, Schrottenboer
1109 AC, Teal TK, Wilson JK, Landis DA. 2014. Perennial grasslands enhance biodiversity
1110 and multiple ecosystem services in bioenergy landscapes. *Proc Nat Acad Sci* 111:1652–
1111 1657.
- 1112